#### SUMMARY MINUTES OF THE HERITAGE PRESERVATION COMMISSION

CITY OF SAINT PAUL, MINNESOTA

Lower Level – Room 41, City Hall/Court House, 15 West Kellogg Boulevard **April 8, 2010** 

**Present:** Robert Ferguson, Pat Igo, Rich Laffin, John Manning, Matt Mazanec, David Riehle,

Mark Thomas, Steve Trimble, Diane Trout-Oertel

**Absent:** Sherry Enzler (unexcused), April Haas (excused)

Staff Present: Christine Boulware, Michelle Wood

#### **BUSINESS MEETING**

**CALL TO ORDER:** 5:05 PM by John Manning (Chair)

- I. APPROVAL OF THE AGENDA Thomas Trout-Oertel, 9-0
- II. CONFLICTS OF INTEREST Laffin would recuse himself from item VII. B. and Manning would recuse himself from items VI.A. and VII.A (Igo would Chair those agenda items.)
- III. APPROVAL OF THE MEETING MINUTES Laid over to the May 13 meeting
  - A. March 11, 2010 Business Meeting
  - B. March 25, 2010 Public Hearing
- IV. CHAIR'S ANNOUNCEMENTS None
- V. STAFF ANNOUNCEMENTS
  - **A.** March Design Review Statistics (see attached)
- VI. OLD BUSINESS

**A. 2115 Summit Avenue, Summit Avenue West Historic District**, by Opus Northwest Construction, LLC, for permits to construct the new 225,000 sq. ft. Anderson Student Center at the northeast corner of Summit and Cretin Avenue. **File #10-017** (Spong, 266-6714) **Continued from the March 25, 2010 Public Hearing.** 

Staff gave a brief overview of the last meeting and read the findings and staff recommendation. Commissioner Laffin asked about updates from the last packet. Doug Hennes, University of Saint Thomas and Dan Young-Dixon from Opus submitted updated drawings of the garage doors for review and discussed the wall, mullions/muntins and scale of the entry. Young-Dixon explained that the wall was to address/control pedestrian flow and was only 2'-6" tall at Aquinas Hall. He added that the entries on Roach and Aquinas Halls are secondary entries. The entrance on Anderson is meant to be an entrance to the campus. The Cretin elevation landscaping plans and garage door design were discussed. Commissioner Trout-Oertel clarified that the applicant did not intend to "heavy-up" the mullions. Commissioner Laffin stated the design of the garage doors seemed appropriate and asked if the applicant would consider changing the windows with one light to two and two to four in order to accentuate verticality. The mullions are two inches wide. Laffin state the wall was a good attribute in allowing the lawn to be a public space.

Commissioner Trout-Oertel motioned to approve the application with the changes presented at the public hearing. Commissioner Laffin seconded the motion. Commissioner Meyer asked about the staff recommendations and clarification

about the tinted windows. Trout-Oertel clarified her motion as approval of the application with staff recommendations with revisions to 2.1 thicker mullions and muntins and striking 2.4. Laffin withdrew his seconding of the motion and Meyer then seconded the motion. Staff read revised recommendation for clarification. Trout-Oertel added that the sentence about the retaining wall should be stricken. Meyer offered a friendly amendment to remove the design review committee. Staff clarified and Meyer withdrew his amendment. Laffin asked for clarification about the design review committee process. Staff read the revised recommendation for clarification. The motion passed 8-0. Commissioners Meyer, Laffin and Haskamp volunteered to serve on the design review committee.

## VII. PUBLIC HEARING/PERMIT REVIEW

A. Summit Avenue at Cretin Avenue, Summit Avenue West Historic District, by University of Saint Thomas, for a permit to alter the radium of the boulevards and add/increase paving at all crossings. File #10-018 (Spong, 266-6714)

Staff read the report recommending conditional approval of the application. Doug Hennes, University of Saint Thomas and Dan Young-Dixon from Opus explained why the changes were proposed. They discussed the increased pedestrian loads with the proposed new student center and the recently built 700-stall parking ramp. The intersection landing pads are not adequate now and will need to handle the increased loads. They worked with SRF Consulting, neighborhood groups and Public Works on the pedestrian and traffic plan. They discussed the existing conditions at the intersection. Bump-outs were explored, but would not work with the bicycle lanes, so the boulevards were squared-off. The widths of the two median side walks and the staging areas were widened. Staff's suggestion of reducing the paved areas would not meet the need of the pedestrian load and the planted areas would not be practical. These areas were designed in cooperation with engineers to address safety concerns.

Commissioner Laffin had questions about student pedestrian patterns and standard sizes of walkways. The pedestrian analysis that was done as part of the EAW was discussed. Commissioner Meyer asked about the increase in volume of traffic. Hennes explained the changes in the campus uses and new construction. He added that they don't anticipate any further growth in the future. Commissioner Riehle asked about numbers of pedestrians in a 15 minute cycle. Young-Dixon responded that it was several hundred at a time (six times a day). Commissioner Trout-Oertel asked about the size of the walks on the east and west boulevards. Commissioner Laffin added the median shape will help with pedestrian safety. Commissioner Trimble asked if the sidewalk would have some pattern. Young-Dixon replied that it would have 5' by 5' squares. Commissioner Igo asked about the island on the plan, but it would be removed.

Leo Viktora, 2129 James Avenue, representative of WSNAC was present to speak and had handouts for the commissioners. He addressed questions about peak pedestrian traffic hours and stated the number is 560 people crossing the intersection in a 15 minute time period. He gave some specific recommendations discussed at the neighborhood caucus that were outlined in the handout. He stated they generally support the proposed changes and want to encourage the circular flow of pedestrian traffic at the intersection. He had requests for lighting in the medians and added some other concerns of neighbors not being considered at the meeting such as expanding the bus stop and incorporating signal lights co-located with street lights. Commissioner Laffin discussed materials that allow green to grow through or permeable pavers.

Commissioner Meyer motioned to approve the design as submitted. Commissioner Trout-Oertel seconded the motion. Commissioner Laffin offered a friendly

amendment for the applicant to consider the use of a green or permeable material that would soften the edges and keep pedestrians a little further away from the street. The friendly amendment was accepted. Commissioner Trimble suggested looking into a different material to break up the mass of concrete. Commissioner Laffin agreed and gave the example of materials that allow green to grow through or permeable pavers. Commissioner Meyer stated it should be more consistent with the other public sidewalks. The motion passed 8-0.

**B. 977 Summit Avenue, Hill Historic District,** by David Heide Design Studio, for a

building permit for complete renovation including, alteration of the front entrance and terrace, construction of two rear and side elevation additions, conversion of the tuckunder garages into living space and alteration of the driveway. Also proposed is removing the two-stall garage at the alley and constructing a four-stall garage and other site improvements. **File #10-019.** (Boulware, 266-9715). Staff read the report recommending conditional approval of the application. David Heide and Mark Nelson were present to represent the owners (in the audience) and discuss the project. Heide discussed the condition of the residence. He clarified that the two story addition has a flat roof, not hipped roof. There was clarification about treatment of the boulevard. Heide gave a detailed description of the front terrace materials and conditions and explained that the original configuration of the front steps was unknown. The proposal for the copper and glass hoods over the window wells was withdrawn. The owners request the front terrace be extended for more room at the front door and the proposal was shown in elevation and plan. Ghost lines of the missing front porch balustrade were shown and discussed along with the tile and 18" scoring. Green quarry tiles have been difficult to find. Heide clarified the roof tiles were glazed green, not painted. Commissioner Riehle asked how close the building was to be unsalvageable. Heide said the condition was worse than anticipated, but this has allowed for the owner/applicant to go for LEED Certification. Commissioner Trimble asked for some background on the balustrade design and material and appropriateness to the design of the house. Commissioner Trout-Oertel stated she felt the expansion of the terrace was well designed and asked about the orientation of the steps. She stated the design of the house would have had some symmetry to it. Chair Manning commented on the asymmetry of the design of the front elevation. Commissioner Ferguson commented that a characteristic of the style is playing symmetry off of asymmetry. Commissioner Haskamp asked about the requirement of a handrail at the steps and how it would be incorporated. Heide replied it would be wrought iron and not incorporated into the balustrade.

Commissioner Meyer recommended approval of the proposal striking staff recommendation numbers 2 and 3. Commissioner Igo seconded the motion. Finding number 4 was altered to remove the word "not" so the design of the steps/terrace would be in keeping with the style. The motion passed 8-0.

### VIII. NEW BUSINESS/DISCUSSION

- **A.** Review and approve Section 106 comment letter for the Phalen Arch Bridge. Withdrawn April 1, 2010.
- **B.** Comment on the draft 2010 Annual Report Trout-Oertel submitted edits to staff

### IX. COMMITTEE REPORTS

**A.** 3M Committee update (Trimble, Mazanec) – Trimble went to design workgroup meeting 5/30. The focus was remediation and historic presentation of what will be

demolished. Seventh & Mendota would be a green space area considered for interpretation (Mill City Museum Example). Claes Oldenburg idea for 3M tape dispenser sculpture was thrown out as an idea. Advisory Committee meeting will be in June.

- **B.** Public Safety Building update (Manning, Igo) nothing new to report
- **C.** Preservation Awards Committee (Igo, Laffin, Trout-Oertel) deadline is April 12 and the following week will be jury at Ostberg Architects.
- **D.** Public Art St. Paul Stewardship Committee (Laffin) Attended March 29 meeting and talked with Christine Podas-Larson. Discussed art/areas maintained by Public Art St. Paul and programs they put on. Asked if HPC would become partners with Public Art St. Paul in terms of maintaining public artwork and look for a new way to move forward with plans with the HPC, especially concerning Lowertown and the artist community that lives and works there.

# **X. ADJOURN**: 7:35

Submitted by: C. Boulware