



CITY OF SAINT PAUL
Mayor Christopher B. Coleman

400 City Hall Annex
25 West 4th Street
Saint Paul, Minnesota 55102
www.stpaul.gov/parks

Telephone: 651-266-6400
Facsimile: 651-292-7405

The Most Livable
City in America

Lilydale Regional Park Open House April 5, 2011

Comments:

Choices: Timber Arch Bridge, Brick Gateway at Location “b”, Stone Shelter Design. Like the idea of 8/4 tables in shelters with large shelter close to parking lot and fishing pier Stonework fits in beautifully with surroundings and will be much more durable when flooded if used in a shelter close to boat launch and fishing piers thus likely to get wet.

Why does the shelter/parking/rest area need to be so large scale. I think it could be scaled down and still accommodate after school youth programming and school field trips. It looks like it is made for tour busses and I don't like that feel.

The fewer the buildings the better. The less blacktop parking lots the better. If people want to go picnic they can go to Harriet Island. Good idea having bike lanes on road. The existing bike trails are very dangerous since they combine pedestrian with bikes on narrow curvy path. Should be set up to prohibit night events. Why take on more maintenance and security costs when funding is getting less available?

Gateway Treatment – I like the stone gateway option the best Shelters) I like the stone treatment the best I worry about it being easy to climb. How about just making a vertical face with the stone? Minimalist on structure. This is a natural park. Don't make the structures too flashy but fit them into the landscape.

I am excited to see progress in developing this park into a great place to visit. I recently started hiking around Lilydale and can imagine that any of these designs would be wonderful. I appreciate the sensitive approach – keeping the gathering area condensed with the opportunity to learn and hike from there and the parking seems to be well designed and unobtrusive. It is a unique park and the designs all reflect that! Great job! If I have to choose one design for the shelter it would be the large stone one or a variation of that.

I like the limestone models the best. Think they blend in better with the area I would say after that the brick but all designs nice. Will there be a gateway coming from the south? Trail by trestle. You said not much change. Will the blind spots be addressed? The bike path line of vision by the trestle is pretty bad.



CAPRA Accreditation

An Affirmative Action Equal Opportunity Employer



National Gold Medal Award

I am very pleased with the new road alignment. I like the meandering road. The changing views it creates shorter driver site line. Entrance sign – the stone sign with the vertical post is my favorite. It looks like it has always been there. The building design – stone with the tile roof is my favorite. I like the irregular corner supports. The tree limb look truss is great.

I'm sorry to see so much money spent on the gateway sign. When that money could be used for other needed amenities in the parks. OF the three picnic shelter designs green roof concept is far and away the most attractive and appropriate for the 'feel' we want in Lilydale. Parking – amount of parking and distribution of lots seems about right. I strongly feel large shelter should NOT be used for picnic RENTALS.

Concerns: Tile roof vs. green roof – cost? Maintain property? Security? Lighting, motion, timers? Structure, etc. already approved, or is there an option to leave as is and possibly improve bike trails? Who is funding? 1 restroom – shouldn't it be more centrally located?

Like entryway closer to beginning of park. First or second spot. Want to keep park wild and scenic – less buildings. Prefer design with green roof. Smaller visual impact and great opportunities for environmental education. When will trails be designed?

I like the gateway entrance at north. Since I believe you are intending to use this as potential education location, (low impact camping, etc.) I like idea of "green roof" to maximize learning potential. For next phase going south: as a boater on the Mississippi River we need a dock into the river such as Fort Snelling State park except better like Lake Billesby consider spray off for weed control.)

What you are doing is so welcome and I think you. I enjoy the park at least once a week. Please do not forget the Community along Highway 13 along Annapolis. We cannot access the Bruce Vento Trail! There is an extremely decrepit, ugly, obsolete chain link fence. It tells us "we don't have you in mind" Our homes are closer to the park than any others. My first choice, remove the fence entirely. Please consider immediately opening the gate. Thanks.

I like the historic shelters best after seeing photos of the old brickyard and buildings and as you can see the bricks in the trail to the bluff. – it seems appropriate to draw attention to this history of the site. Every park has natural stone, but no other St. Paul park has this history. Call it out! Lilydale road, no matter how curvy it is, will be always the most efficient route by car to I35-# from the West Side. Do not design around cars as they will remain. Ensure that cars, bikes and pedestrian have their own space to safely travel. Don't put multiple uses on the same space!

The limestone schematic is the winner for the design of the shelter and restrooms. Second is the brick. The metal concept is inappropriate for a park of this nature. The park entrance design is best met with the stone concept. NO metal.

Thank you for all your time! All the designs are amazing!!

I live in Cathedral Hill. I bike and hike in the area seeking quietude, relaxation, natural setting and getting away from cars. Restrooms definitely needed for those of us over 50. With clear access from trail – open through spring and fall if not winter. I very much like the flat, rather than the arch wood bridge if it will work. It provides a north woods feel of simplicity and massive native timbers with less drawing attention to itself, away from the setting. Entrance structure. Prefer stone and timber design. All are ok. Shelter do not care

for brick option. Very beautiful but overly refined for this location and not “Minnesota” Steel option is jarring, especially obtuse angled poles. Not calming like I would like to feel when in the park. Top heavy. A bit contrived. Prefer Stone option. Very creative, random, natural and may be fun if kids can climb on stone. Fits the location but wonder if it is overdone. Do the massive piles of stone serve a purpose? Lone benches with seat backs along the river or lake are highly valued for resting, reading and lunching while on a long hike or bike trip. I do not favor bike trail adjacent to road at all except where necessary due to space limits.

The drawings depict a sensitive approach to a preservation focus associated with the park. While this may be a contemporary approach, the plans may be a non-responsive understatement to a broader recreational perspective and public need. The park can be utilized at a higher level and I believe this will be realized over time as people become familiar using the park. To be contemporary to existing perspectives but to allow Lilydale the opportunity to be adaptive to future recreational and educational needs is imperative. Allow the plans to accommodate broader needs subject to due process but don't let perspectives of 2011 be the perspective that must be maintained in the future. I believe the park can serve more users and not impact natural resources. People will not be crowded and the land will be even more appreciated.

Notes on Boards:

Lilydale Road and Pickerel Clearing – Illustrative Plan:

- Keep criterion race in summer – it's a great way to get folks to St. Paul.
- Keep bikers and cars separated as much as possible.
- Roadway with 2 traffic and 2 bike lanes way too wide. Better – combine bike and walkway into one trail.
- Tressel area is a huge blind spot currently.
- Ensure conflicting interests (walkers, bikers, and motorists) have enough space to safely travel. I will still use a curvy road to commit as it is the most efficient route.
- I hope the bike lanes next to the road are at least ok to ensure safety.
- Need to provide link for river canoeists into Lilydale – river canoe landing and trails to facilities they need.
- Canoe launch on river side also please link to park across river.
- In an era of sustainability and fiscal limitations, I am concerned by the lack of a NO BUILD alternative.
- Linking bike trail to boat launch is great, especially for viewing launches.
- Trails should have been park of this project.
- Have biking (separate) and walking trail cross at T-intersection with 3-way stop sign.
- FYI – consider wildlife (otter) crossing in road design.

Pickerel Clearing:

- Vegetation – make sure the parking lot is visible from the road. Much safer that way.
- This may be the most logical place for large shelter – but won't it flood here?
- I would suggest that each of the pavilions be a little larger 8 & 4 tables rather than 6 & 2. Allow larger and multiple groups to use this regional park facility.

Timber Bridge Options:

- Traverse Deck:
 - Yes!
 - Like!
 - Design a limestone crib-stone bridge.

- Favorite bridge – flat timber structure.
- Timber Arch:
 - No way, too much.
 - Timber bridge – the best and most appropriate for this park.

Riverside Plan:

(No Comments)

BRICK OPTION

Gateway:

- Looks nice today, it will look dated very soon.
- Like the stone and brick – reminder of old brickyards.
- I like the use of brick better than limestone because it's more original. Lots of other places use limestone – it's over-used in design these days.
- Brick is more historic and native to Lilydale. It's the least pretentious more humble.
- This is beautiful!

Six Table Shelter:

- Building one larger shelter only and locate small storage/restroom building nearby.
- Like simplicity.
- “Outdoor classroom” consideration is excellent here.
- Yes! Keep “carry-in” access.
- Roofline looks too much like goofy concrete mushrooms in Cherokee Park.
- First choice for shelter.
- My favorite.
- Simple – nice, uses brick which is how Lilydale got started – with the brickyards. My favorite.

Restroom/Storage and Two Table Shelter:

- Asian in appearance – boring.
- Get rid of the brick fire stack.
- Like historic concept and play with materials and shapes.
- Love this but I don't like the pointy top.
- Doesn't fit in as well – design-wise.

STONE OPTION

Gateway:

- Stone gateway and shelters!
- I love the use of limestone.
- #1 best design.
- Replace timber with brick pier.
- My favorite sign.
- Best because it's least obtrusive.
- Nice – inviting.
- This lettering on this version needs more bold contrast to be read from a car driving past.
- Nice! Original and appropriate to site. Best design.

Six Table Shelter:

- How about a rusty steel roof?
- Love the log bracing for a natural feel/look.

- I like all designs – very site appropriate.
- Favorite building design.
- Too complicated – too “craftsman”-like.
- Love the limestone structure style but feel here is a bit massive.
- Roof a little overbearing – too massive.
- Love the stone – are you concerned about kids climbing these structures?

Restroom/Storage and Two Table Shelter:

- #1 – beautiful design
- Ties into other area projects so well.
- Limestone is very attractive – try to use less stone a smaller footprint.
- Most generic design – doesn’t create a unique image for the park. Looks like any MN park design.
- I would prefer the limestone and wood.
- Asking for people climbing on the roof.
- Looks like every other park structure – not impressed. Call out the history of this unique park by using the brick structure.
- Much prefer this design and use of stone and wood. Of the three, this blends in best with the spirit of the place.
- My favorite (but I really like them all)!
- Love the stone.
- Why does the roofline seem too massive to me?

STEEL OPTION

Six Table Shelter Area Plan:

- I like the circular shape.

Six Table Shelter:

- Option three for two (total) structures my choices, but skip the green roof as it will be tough to maintain.
- Green roof is a waste of funds. Also, I don’t like the design.
- I like the innovative design. Reminiscent of Norwegian stubble.
- Expensive to maintain.
- Too high tech, masculine – not inviting.

Restroom/Storage and Two Table Shelter:

- Like this design – even without green roof if that’s a maintenance issue.
- Like this but please consider practical maintenance (e.g. community garden).
- What these drawings don’t show is how this will blend in with its surroundings – almost camouflaged.
- Like the materials also the openness. Do green roofs hold up?
- Green roof on an open structure is a great addition to park and park imagery.
- I like this design a lot but the tiny windows make the building look like a jail.

This constitutes my understanding of items discussed and decisions reached. If there are any omissions or discrepancies, please notify the author in writing.