CITY OF SAINT PAUL
HERITAGE PRESERVATION COMMISSION STAFF REPORT

FILE NAME: 362 Maria Avenue
DATE OF APPLICATION: August 1, 2013
APPLICANT: BB Housing Associates
OWNER: City of Saint Paul – Housing and Redevelopment Authority (HRA)
DATE OF HEARING: August 22, 2013
HPC SITE/DISTRICT: Dayton's Bluff Heritage Preservation District
CATEGORY: Contributing
CLASSIFICATION: Building Permit
STAFF INVESTIGATION AND REPORT: Christine Boulware
DATE: August 14, 2013

A. SITE DESCRIPTION:

The construction of the Hamilton Evans House at 362 Maria Avenue predates building permits and is listed in the 1883 city directory. It is a one- and one-half story, framed cottage with asbestos siding over the clapboard, frieze and cornerboards. The inventory form states that there is original fenestration on the front and side elevations and "horizontally grooved window casings to suggest the rudiments of a classical style." The property is categorized as contributing to the Dayton's Bluff Heritage Preservation District.

B. PROPOSED CHANGES:

The applicant is proposing to rehabilitate the property. Exterior work will include:

- Installing a new bituminous driveway and parking pad
- Removing and replacing the front and side walkways
- Installing new gutters and downspouts
- Constructing a new front porch based on remaining physical evidence
- Removing the non-historic siding on the front elevation and either repairing or replacing th e original siding and trim with LP siding with a 4.5" reveal
- Replacing exterior doors with period appropriate styles

A detailed scope of work was submitted and included in the packet.

C. BACKGROUND:

In 2007, a previous owner installed white, double-hung, vinyl replacement windows at the residence where wood, double-hung windows with one-over-one and two-over-two divided-lite configurations existed. All of the window and door trim was wrapped with aluminum, new doors and a new storm door on the front elevation were installed. The soffit and fascia were wrapped with aluminum that matches the wrapping on the window and door trim. The work was completed without HPC review and approval or a building permit.

D. GUIDELINE CITATIONS:

Dayton's Bluff Heritage Preservation District Design Guidelines (1992)
Leg. Code § 74.87. General principles.

1. *All work should be of a character and quality that maintains the distinguishing features of the building and the environment. The removal or alteration of distinctive architectural features should be avoided as should alterations that have no historical basis and which seek to create an earlier appearance. The restoration of altered original features, if documentable, is encouraged.*
2. *Changes which may have taken place in the course of time are evidence of the history and development of a building, structure, or site and its environment. These changes may have acquired significance in their own right, and this significance shall be recognized and respected.*

3. *Deteriorated architectural features should be repaired rather than replaced whenever possible. In the event of replacement, new materials should match the original in composition, design (including consideration of proportion, texture and detail), color and overall appearance.*
4. *New additions or alterations to structures should be constructed in such a manner that if such additions or alterations were to be removed in the future, the form and integrity of the original structure would be unimpaired.*
5. *The impact of alterations or additions on individual buildings as well as on the surrounding streetscape will be considered; major alterations to buildings which occupy a corner lot or are otherwise prominently sited should be avoided.*
6. *New construction should be compatible with the historic and architectural character of the district.*

Sec. 74.89. - Restoration and rehabilitation.

(a) Exterior surfaces—Walls and foundations: *Masonry. In the 1860s and 1870s, a number of Saint Paul businessmen built elaborate limestone houses along the bluff. These houses are long gone, but several brick houses remain, and brick and stone are evident throughout the historic district in foundations and chimneys. Stone, brick and concrete were also used for lintels, sills and decorative trim. Improperly maintained or repair masonry can result in extensive water damage and eventual structural failure.*

(1) Repair. *Deteriorated brick, stone, mortar and other materials should be replaced with material used in the original construction or with materials that resemble the appearance of the original as closely as possible. The advice of a skilled mason should be sought for major repair projects.*

(2) Cleaning. *Masonry cleaning should be conducted only to halt deterioration and by means such as low-pressure water, soft brushes, and/or appropriate chemical treatment. Sandblasting or abrasive cleaning should not be used under any circumstances.*

(3) Repointing. *Original mortar joint size and profile should be retained and/or reduplicated in repointing. Mortar mixtures should duplicate the original in lime, sand and cement proportion and should duplicate the original mortar in color and texture.*

(4) Stucco resurfacing. *Repairs to stucco surfaces should duplicate the original in color and texture, if evidence exists. Smooth or heavy dashed surfaces should be avoided unless they were used on the original surface.*

(5) Painting. *The original color and texture of masonry surfaces should be retained and unpainted stone and brick surfaces should not be painted. The removal of paint from painted masonry surfaces should only be attempted if unpainted surfaces are historically appropriate and if removal can be accomplished without damage to the masonry.*

(6) Resurfacing. *Stucco, artificial stone, brick veneer, or vinyl or aluminum products should not be applied over masonry surfaces.*

(b) Exterior surfaces—Walls: Wood sided. *Wood building products, including siding, shingles and a great variety of decorative trim were used extensively by the nineteenth- and early twentieth-century builders of Dayton's Bluff. Wood contributes texture and detail to the historic district and is a durable, high-quality material with a long product life if properly maintained.*

(1) Repair. *Wooden siding should be maintained with paint or stain. Deteriorated wooden siding should be replaced with new material resembling the original in width, thickness and profile, and texture. New siding should be installed with the weather (exposed surface) identical to the original. Siding should be installed horizontally except in those instances where vertical or diagonal siding was used on the original exterior. Appropriate corner boards, frieze boards, drip caps and other features should be included with replacement siding.*

(2) Vinyl and aluminum siding; other manufacture products. *Buildings originally clad in wooden siding should not be resurfaced with brick, stucco, artificial stone or brick veneer, hardboard, or vinyl or aluminum siding. The commission may consider the following exceptions to the installation of vinyl, metal or hardboard siding on a case-by-case basis:*

- ***a.*** *In cases where existing asphalt, asbestos, aluminum or vinyl siding is to be removed and where the underlying original siding and decorative features are found to be significantly deteriorated. Commission staff must conduct a site visit during the removal process and advise on appropriate treatment.*
- ***b.*** *In the resurfacing of noncontributing building constructed after 1930.*
- ***c.*** *In the resurfacing or existing or construction of new garages, particularly when the garage is inconspicuously sited.*

If vinyl, metal or hardboard siding is used as described in A-C, it must be of a width appropriate to the style of the building, and all architectural details including window trim, wood cornices and ornament must remain uncovered. Replacement siding may cover only one layer of existing siding. Trim must be built up so that it projects from the new siding to the same extent as the original.

(3) Shingles. *Buildings originally clad in horizontal wooden siding should not be resurfaced with shingles of wood or other material. Wooden shingles used for cladding material or decoration, such as in the gable ends, should be conserved and retained. If replacement is necessary, shingles should replicate the original in width, pattern, thickness, profile, texture and weather (lap).*

(4) Decorative siding treatments. *Decorative siding treatments, such as paneled herringbone patterns used in the gable ends, should be retained in repair or resurfacing.*

(5) Painting. *Exterior wooden surfaces should be maintained with appropriate paint or stain. Color choice is not subject to heritage preservation commission approval. However, exterior paint colors should be appropriate to the period and style of the historic building. Stained shingles in most cases should not be painted.*

(c) Roofs and chimneys. *The shape, texture and color of the roof are important design features of any building. Gable and hipped roofs are most common in the historic district. Many of the early building of Dayton's Bluff were roofed in cedar shingles and reroofed with asphalt shingles. Properly selected, modern asphalt roofing materials are compatible with the appearance of historic buildings.*

(1) Roofing materials. *Original roofing materials which contribute to the character of the district such as tile and slate should be maintained and retained unless badly deteriorated. If partial reroofing in tile, slate or asphalt is necessary, replacement roofing should match the old in composition, size, shape and texture. New roofing material should be appropriate to the character of the building in composition, size, shape and texture. Dark brown, dark gray and "weathered wood" are among usually acceptable colors. Rolled roofing may be used only on flat or slightly sloped roofs which are not visible from the public way.*

(2) Alterations to roof shape—Front. *The original roof type, slope and overhangs should not be preserved. The roof shape at the front should not be altered except to restore it to the original documented appearance or to add architecturally compatible dormers. Documentation includes evidence of the former appearance of the building, or, in the case of pattern book houses, those of similar period and style. The shape of existing dormers should not be altered unless compatible with the original design.*

(3) Alterations to roof shape—Rear. *Alterations to the roof shape at the sides or rear should be compatible with the architectural character of the building.*

(4) Skylights. *Skylights should not be installed on the front roof plane. They should be flat and as close to the roof plane as possible. "Bubble"-type skylights should not be installed.*

(5) Rebuilt chimneys. *If rebuilding is necessary, original brick details such as decorative panels and coffers should be replicated. In the absence of evidence of the original appearance of the chimney, repair or rebuilding should be compatible with the building style*

or type.

(6) Chimneys and stovepipes. *New chimneys and stovepipes should not be installed on the front roof plane.*

(d) Windows and entries:

(1) Windows: *Many of the historic windows of Dayton's Bluff have double-hung sash and vertical orientation. Windows are important design elements and establish the visual rhythm, balance and general character of the facade. Any alteration, including removal of moldings or changes in window size or type, can have a significant and often detrimental effect on the appearance of the building as well as on the surrounding streetscape.*

- ***a. Size and shape.*** *Existing window openings should be retained. Window openings should not be enlarged or reduced to fit new units. New window openings should not be introduced into principal elevations.*
- ***b. Sash.*** *The size and number of panes of glass in each sash should not be altered. New sash, if installed, should duplicate the existing or other appropriate historic models. Crank-out or sliding units are not appropriate replacement for double-hung sash.*
- ***c. Trim.*** *Historic window casings should be retained wherever possible; if replacement is necessary, the original profile should be replicated.*
- ***d. Storm windows.*** *If combination metal storms are installed, they should have a baked-enamel finish. Storm windows should not have vertical or horizontal divisions which conflict with the divisions of the sash.*
- ***e. Shutters and blinds.*** *Shutters and blinds should not be installed on buildings not originally designed for them. Where appropriate, shutters should appear to be operative and should be mounted to the window casing. Shutters should be constructed of wood.*
- ***f. Security measures.*** *Historic trim or other architectural features should not be removed for the installation of security bars or grills.*

(2) Entries: *The entry—including the door, door surround and sometimes sidelights and a transom—is usually the focal point of the facade. The size of the entry is directly related to the mass and scale of the building. As with windows, any alteration to size, shape or trim details can have a detrimental effect on exterior appearance.*

- *a.* ***Size and shape.*** *All historic entry components should be retained. Entry opening should not be enlarged or reduced to fit a new door. New entry openings should not be introduced into principal elevations.*
- *b.* ***Trim.*** *Original or historic features of the entry, including hoods, columns, sidelights and transoms, should be retained. If replacement is necessary, historic trim details should be replicated.*
- *c.* ***Doors.*** *Wherever possible, historic paneled doors (and hardware) should be repaired and weatherstripped rather than replaced. If replacement of original or historic doors is necessary, the replacement should duplicate or be compatible with the material, design and hardware of the older door. Steel-covered hollow core doors should not be installed unless compatible with the appearance of the house. Historic trim should not be removed from the entry for the installation of steel doors.*
- *d.* ***Storm and screen doors.*** *Storm doors should be compatible with the inner door in shape and style. Simple designs are preferable to "ranch style" designs.*
- *e.* ***Sliding glass doors.*** *Sliding glass doors should be confined to the rear of the building where not visible from the public way.*
- *f.* ***Security measures.*** *Historic trim or other architectural features should not be removed for the installation of security bars or grills.*

(e) Porches and steps. *Most of the houses and rowhouses built in the Dayton's Bluff Historic District before 1920 had unenclosed front porches. The porch usually stretched*

across the full width of the front facade, but in some cases only covered the entry. Since porches and steps are exposed to the weather and receive hard use, some buildings have had a succession of replacements which reflect different styles of architecture.
(1) Conservation. *Porches, steps and handrails which are appropriate to the building and its development should be conserved and retained.*
(2) Repair and replacement. *Historic porches, steps or handrails which require complete rebuilding or partial replacement should be reconstructed using historical research to determine an appropriate design. Reconstructions should be compatible with the period and style of the building in material, design and detail. Concrete should not be used to replace wooden porch floors or steps.*
(3) Railings. *The original spacing, section and profile of balusters should be maintained in replacement or repair. Unless historical evidence indicates, reconstruction should include a bottom rail and balusters should not be nailed directly to the step or deck. Wooden posts and railings should not be replaced with those of metal.*
(4) Posts and columns. *If replacement is necessary, porch posts and columns should be replaced with units which replicate the original material, size and scale. Elaborate details such as turning, gouging or stamping may be simplified if necessary. Wooden posts or railings should not be replaced with metal posts or railings.*
(5) Enclosure. *Unenclosed front porches should not be permanently enclosed.*
(6) Decks. *Decks should be constructed only at the rear of the building or where most inconspicuous. Railings, steps and other deck details should be compatible with the architectural character of the building.*
(7) Firestairs. *The detailing of firestairs should be compatible with the period and style of the building. Firestairs should be located as inconspicuously as possible.*

(f) Exterior trim and architectural features. *Exterior trim includes the decorative and sometimes functional elements of the exterior which contribute to the proportion, texture and detail of the building. A great variety of machine-made trim was added to even the simplest wooden houses of Dayton's Bluff, while iron, cast iron, terra cotta, tile and brick can be seen on masonry examples.*
(1) Conservation. *Exterior architectural features including finials, cornices, brackets, columns, balustrades and railing, and window and door moldings should be retained.*
(2) Documentation. *Original trim details and other architectural features should be photographed or otherwise recorded before they are removed for repair or replacement. Deteriorated trim which is removed should be saved for use in making duplicates.*
(3) Repair and replacement. *New material used to repair or replace deteriorated trim or other features should match the original as closely as possible. Deteriorated trim which is unsalvageable should be replaced with trim identical or similar to the original design. Simplified trim should approximate the old in design and placement.*
(4) New trim. *Details should not be added in an effort to make the building look older. However, in the case of some "pattern book" houses, the addition of certain trim details such as those typical at the gable and porch may be permitted if supported by historic photos or pattern book sources.*
(C.F. 92-900, § 2(l)(A), 7-23-92)

Sec. 74.90. - New construction and additions.
(b) General guidelines:
(1) Site evaluation. *Existing historic buildings and landscape features should be retained and rehabilitated in plans for redevelopment.*
(2) General character. *New construction should reinforce the historic architectural and visual character of the area. Specifically, it should refer to the traditional two- and three-story dwelling and commercial building module and typical setbacks already established in the district and in the adjacent area.*

(3) Pedestrian circulation and parking. *New construction should be oriented toward streets which are inviting environments for pedestrians. Parking areas should be placed at the rear of buildings wherever possible or screened with landscaping, low walls or appropriately detailed fences.*

(4) Views and vistas. *Exceptional views of the city and river valley provided from the public way should not be obstructed by new buildings or structures.*

(c) Principal buildings; additions:

(1) Massing and scale. *New construction should conform to the massing, volume, height, facade proportions and scale of surrounding structures and also comply with existing zoning regulations. The gross volume of any new structure should be visually compatible with the buildings and elements within the surrounding area. New dwellings and commercial buildings should be compatible with the height of existing adjacent buildings.*

(2) Materials and details. *Materials and details should relate to those of existing nearby buildings. Wood or masonry construction is typical for existing residential buildings in the district, while masonry is typical of commercial buildings. These materials are preferable to vinyl, metal or hardboard siding. Imitative materials such as artificial stone or brick veneer should not be used. Materials will be reviewed to determine their appropriate use in relation to the overall design of the structure. The use of vinyl, metal or hardboard siding will be considered by the commission on a case-by-case basis. These materials may be permissible in new construction of principal buildings if appropriately detailed.*

(d) Building elements:

(1) Roofs. *The gable and hip roof or their variants are the primary historic roof forms in the district, with many variations and combinations. In new construction, the skyline or roof profile should relate to the predominant roof shape of nearby buildings. Highly visible secondary structure roofs should be compatible with the roof pitch, color and material of the main structure.*

The roofing materials used on new buildings should be appropriate to the design of the building and the visibility of the roof.

Roof hardware such as skylights, vents and metal pipe chimneys should not be placed on the front roof plane.

(2) Windows and entries. *Vertically oriented, double-hung sash are the predominant historic window type in the district. The proportion, size, rhythm and detailing of windows and entries should be compatible with that of existing nearby buildings. The rhythm of solids to voids created by openings in the facade of the new structure should be visually compatible with surrounding structures.*

(3) Porches and decks. *Porches are a standard feature of many historic houses in the district and whether enclosed or unenclosed they are an important part of the streetscape. In new construction, the front entry should be articulated with a design element such as a porch, portico or landing which provides a transitional zone between the semipublic and public exterior zones and the private interior zone. This design element should be appropriately detailed and compatible with the size and scale of the building.*

Decks should be constructed at the rear of the building and should be integrated into the overall design. Decks should be appropriately detailed and should not be raised in a manner which makes them conspicuous.

(e) Accessory buildings. *Garages and other accessory buildings should be compatible with the overall design and materials of the existing building on the lot. New garages should be located off rear alleys wherever possible. Garages should not be attached to the front of the building and should only be attached if not visible from the public way.*

(f) Site considerations:

***(1) Setback and siting**. The setback of new buildings in most residential and commercial areas should be compatible with the setback of existing adjacent buildings.*
***(2) Parking.** Residential parking areas should be confined to the rear of existing or new buildings. Parking spaces should be screened from view from the public street by landscaping such as hedges, grade changes or low fences.*
***(3) Fences.** Fences which allow some visual penetration of front yard space are preferable to complete enclosure. Fences of wrought iron or wood which enclose the front yard should be no higher than three and one-half (3½) feet. Cyclone fences should not be used to enclose front yards in the front half of side yards.*
***(4) Retaining walls.** Stone, brick and split face concrete block are preferable to landscape timber for the construction of retaining walls. Masonry retaining walls should be finished with caps or appropriate details.*
***(5) Public improvements.** New street and landscape improvements, lighting, street furniture and signs should be compatible with the character of the historic district. The historic urban pattern of gridplan streets should be retained and enhanced in improvement projects.*
***(6) Signs.** Sign materials and design should complement the materials and design of the building and adjacent buildings. (See also: Storefront Guidelines.)*
***(7) Views and vistas.** New buildings or other structures should not block key views and vistas of the river valley and the downtown skyline.*

***(j) Demolition.** Demolition permits will be reviewed on a case-by-case basis and will be determined by the category of building (pivotal, contributing and noncontributing) and its importance to the district, the structural condition of the building and the economic viability of the structure.*
(C.F. 92-900, § 2(l)(B), 7-23-92)

E. FINDINGS:

1. This property is categorized as contributing to the Dayton's Bluff Historic District.

2. On July 23, 1992, the Dayton's Bluff Heritage Preservation District was established under Ordinance No. 17942 (Council File #92-900). The Heritage Preservation Commission shall protect the architectural character of heritage preservation sites through review and approval or denial of applications for city permits for exterior work within designated heritage preservation sites §73.04.(4).

3. Exterior surfaces – Repair & Replacement: The proposal to remove the non-original siding on the front elevation will have a positive impact on the property. The wholesale replacement of original wood siding and trim does not comply with General Principle #3 and §74.89.(b)(2). The guideline states, *"In cases where existing asphalt, asbestos, aluminum or vinyl siding is to be removed and where the underlying original siding and decorative features are found to be significantly deteriorated. Commission staff must conduct a site visit during the removal process and advise on appropriate treatment."* If it is discovered that some or all of the siding is in a condition that warrants replacement, "deteriorated wooden siding should be replaced with new material resembling the original in width, thickness and profile, and texture; New siding should be identical to or compatible with the original; and new material used to repair or replace deteriorated trim or other features should match the original as closely as possible." *Appropriate corner boards, frieze boards, drip caps and other features should be included with replacement siding.* Composite/Fiber-cement siding and trim may be considered on a case-by-case basis for installation so long as the profile matches the historic siding and has a smooth texture. Sec. 74.89.(b)(1)

4. Entries: Details of the original entry are not known, as the first floor of the façade has been altered and openings have been reduced in size. The width of the transom above the door does provide a clue that the original entry was wider and may have been double-leaf door. The removal of the non-original siding will expose shadowlines and framing of the original

openings that will help to inform an appropriate entry size. §74.89 (d)(2)

5. Doors: The original doors no longer exist at the property. The front door shown on the plans does not have any glazing. The guideline states that replacement doors should duplicate or be compatible with the material, design and hardware of original or older doors. The design should also be appropriate for the style of the building. Paneled, half-lite doors and aluminum clad storm doors on the side elevation are *compatible with the appearance of the building* and comply with the guideline. More information about the new doors and storm/screen doors will need to be supplied for final review and approval. §74.89 (d)(2)
6. Front Porch: The removal of the non-historic front stoop will not have a negative impact, as those changes occurred after the period of significance and are not considered contributing elements to the building. Staff was unable to locate any historic photos of the building. The guideline states, "*Historic porches, steps, or handrails which require complete rebuilding or replacement should be reconstructed using historical research to determine an appropriate design. Reconstructions should be compatible with the period and style of the building in material, design, and detail."* A site visit to view the residence after removal of the non-historic elements shall be scheduled so that staff can discuss appropriate treatment for the reconstruction and design of the open front porch. §74.89 (e)(2)
7. Gutters & Downspouts: 5", seamless, aluminum gutters and 4" downspouts are proposed. Details on the style and location of the new gutters and downspouts were not submitted. A K-style or half-round gutter would be appropriate so long as decorative detail were not altered or obscured by the installation.
8. Front and Side Walkways: The replacement walkways respond to the location of entries on the house. The width of the new sidewalks should be consistent with the width of the new porch steps.
9. Parking Pad & Driveway: The parking is *confined to the rear* of the building and complies with the guideline. Due to the width and placement of the house and driveway on the lot, it would be difficult to screen the parking more than it is screened by the house. §74.90.(f)(2)
10. This proposal to rehabilitate the residence and install a parking pad at 362 Maria Avenue will not adversely affect the Program for the Preservation and architectural control of the Dayton's Bluff Historic District (Leg. Code §73.06 (e)) so long as the conditions are met.

F. STAFF RECOMMENDATION: Based on the findings staff recommends approval of the building permit application provided the following condition(s) are met:

1. HPC staff shall be contacted to visit the site to view what is found underneath the non-original siding once it has been removed. Staff will inform a design review committee of three commission members that the property is ready for a site visit. The design review committee members shall visit the site, make a determination about the condition of the siding and trim, and advise on its repair and/or replacement. The design review committee shall make written findings and recommendation on how to proceed with repair and/or re placement of the siding and trim. Staff shall document the condition of the siding and trim, any shadow lines, and details. Staff will consult on how to proceed with the design details such as porch roofs, columns, and entries as well as any decorative detail/features. The applicant shall submit a detailed drawing for final review and approval based on any physical evidence found during the site visit and discussion with HPC staff.
2. Final details for the front door, side door, and storm/screen doors shall be reviewed and approved by HPC staff. The five new windows shall be wood double-hung, with a two-over-two divided-light configuration. The front door shall be wood.
3. Final gutter and downspout details shall be submitted to HPC staff for final review and approval.
4. The front sideway width shall be adjusted to relate to the width of the front steps/porch bay.
5. All new wood surfaces shall be painted within one year of permit issuance.

6. All final materials and details shall be submitted to the HPC and/or staff for final review and approval.
7. Any revisions to the approved plans shall be reviewed and approved by the HPC and/or staff.
8. The HPC stamped approved plans shall remain on site for the duration of the project.

G. ATTACHMENTS:

1. HPC Design Review Application & Scope-of-Work
2. Floor Plans and Elevations
3. Photos