

## **ARTICLE VI. - HISTORIC LOWERTOWN HERITAGE PRESERVATION DISTRICT**

[Sec. 74.111. - Description of preservation district property.](#)

[Sec. 74-112. - Preservation program.](#)

### **Sec. 74.111. - Description of preservation district property.**

Pursuant to the authority contained in chapter 73 of the Saint Paul Legislative Code, and upon the recommendation of the heritage preservation commission of the city, and after having duly considered the matter at a public hearing held in accordance with said ordinances, the city council does hereby designate the following described property to be a heritage preservation district, to be known as the "Historic Lowertown Heritage Preservation District":

The boundaries of the Historic Lowertown Heritage Preservation District are as follows: Beginning at the corner of E. Seventh Street and Jackson Street, then northeasterly along the center line of E. Seventh Street to the intersection of E. Seventh Street and Broadway, the southeasterly along the center line of Broadway to the intersection of Broadway and Prince Street, then northeasterly along the center line of Prince Street to the intersection of Prince Street and Pine Street, then southeasterly along the center line of Pine Street to the intersection of Pine Street and Kellogg Boulevard, then southeasterly along the center line of Kellogg Boulevard to the intersection of Kellogg and Wacouta Street, then southeasterly along the extension of the center line of Wacouta for 450 feet, then southwesterly along a line parallel to Kellogg Boulevard for 200 feet, then northwesterly along a line parallel to the extension of the center line of Wacouta Street to the intersection with the center line of Kellogg Boulevard, then southwesterly along the center line of Kellogg and Jackson Street, then northwesterly along the center line of Jackson Street to the point of beginning.

Kittson Addition

Block 61, Lots 1-8

Hopkins Addition

Block 1, Lots 1-6

Block 2, Lots 1-12

Whitney and Smith's Addition

Block 5, Lots 1-6

Block 6, Lots 1-12

Block 7, Lots 1-12

Block 8, Lots 2-12

Block 9, Lots 3-10

Block 10

Block 11, Lots 1-12

Block 12, Lots 1-6

Block 13, Lots 1-6

Block 14, Lots 1-12

Block 15, Lots 1, 2, 3, 5 and 6

City of Saint Paul Addition

Block 2, Lots 6-9

Block 13, Lots 6-9

Block 28, Lots 1-12

Block 29, Lots 2, 3, 10 and 11

Drake's Rearrangement "A"

Lots A, B, C and D

Auditor's Subdivision No. 32

Block 1, Lots 1-11

Block 2, Lots 1-15

Ewing and Chutes Subdivision

Lots 1-4

Capitol Center No. 1

Block 4, Lots 1 and 2

Registered Land Survey #373

Tracts A-W

(Ord. No. 17120, § 1, 3-22-84)

**Sec. 74-112. - Preservation program.**

The preservation program for this heritage preservation district is stated as follows:

Historic Lowertown Heritage Preservation District

The following guidelines for design review will serve as the basis for the heritage preservation commission's permit review decisions in the Historic Lowertown Heritage Preservation District. The guidelines define the most important elements of the Lowertown District's unique physical appearance and state the best means of preserving

and enhancing these elements in rehabilitation or new construction. These guidelines are not hard and fast regulations. They are flexible criteria. Their purpose is to provide assurance to property owners that permit review will be based on clear standards rather than the taste of individual commission members. The guidelines will be interpreted with flexibility depending on the particular merit of the building or site under review. Consideration will also be given to availability of historical materials. When applying the guidelines the commission will also be considerate of clearly defined cases of economic hardship of deprivation of the owner or reasonable use of his/her property.

### Guidelines for Design Review

- I. *New construction.* The basic principle for new construction in the Lowertown area is to maintain the scale and character of present buildings. New construction refers to totally new structures, moved in structures, and new additions to existing structures undergoing restoration and rehabilitation.

Architectural diversity is characteristic of Lowertown. When first confronted with this variety, it is easy to overlook the overall thread of continuity of the area. Generally, any structure should provide height, massing, setback, materials and rhythm compatible to surrounding structures. The reproduction of historic design and details is expensive, artificial, and is recommended only for some cases of infill or other small scale construction. Guidelines for new construction focus on general rather than specific design elements in order to encourage architectural innovation.

A. *Setback—Siting.* There should be no major variation in setback from the building line. Minor variations for bays and entrances are permissible. The proportion of built edge to open space should preserve the plane of the street wall, particularly along the streets facing Mears Park and the Farmer's Market.

B. *Massing, volume and height.* The buildings of the district built before 1900 are generally small to medium in volume and up to seven (7) stories in height. Sometimes several buildings are grouped. Buildings constructed after 1900 are generally large in volume and up to eight (8) stories in height, with the Burlington Northern Building being thirteen (13) stories. The structures of the district are distinguished by their boxy profiles; preservation of this aspect is the most essential element for maintaining the unity of the district. New construction should be compatible with the massing, volume, height and scale of existing adjacent structures.

C. *Rhythm and directional emphasis.* The rhythm and directional emphasis is Lowertown can be found both in the relation of several buildings to each other and in the relation of the elements on a single building facade.

Rhythm between buildings is usually distinguished by slight variations in height, windows and doors, and details, including vertical and horizontal elements. Rhythm may, as in the case of Park Square Court, be accentuated by slight projections and recessions of the facade, causing the scale of the building to match that of its neighbors. The rhythm and directional emphasis of the new construction should be compatible with that of existing adjacent structures.

D. *Roofs, caps and cornices.* New roof, cap and cornice designs should be compatible with existing adjacent structures. Generally roofs in the district are flat. It is important for roof cornices and roof edges to relate in scale, proportion and detailing.

E. *Materials and detail.* The materials of new construction should relate to the materials and details of existing adjacent buildings. New buildings in the district should provide more detailing than typical modern commercial buildings, to respond to the surrounding buildings and to reinforce the human scale of the district. Walls of buildings in the district are generally of brick, or occasionally of stone. All non-masonry surfaces, if painted, should be of colors compatible with the masonry character of the district.

F. *Windows and doors.* Windows should relate to those of existing buildings in the district in terms of solid to opening ration, distribution of window openings, and window setback. In most of the buildings in the district, the area of openings is between 30% and 50% of the facade wall. The proportion, size and detailing of windows and doors in new construction should relate to that of existing adjacent buildings. Double-hung windows are traditional in the district, and are preferred for new construction. Window mullions should emphasize their vertical direction. Casement windows and horizontal sliding windows are not historically common, and because they were not usually used in commercial district are not preferred for new construction. Window and door frames should be wood, appropriately colored, or baked enamel finish aluminum or vinyl-clad.

G. *Parking.* Parking lots should be screened from street and sidewalk either by walls or plantings or both. If walls are used, their materials should be compatible with the walls of existing adjacent buildings. Walls should be at least eighteen (18) feet high. Walls or plantings should continue the planes of existing adjacent buildings.

H. *Landscaping and street furniture.* When lots are used for green space or parking, a visual hole in the street "wall" may result. Landscape treatment can eliminate this potential problem by avoiding a wall of enclosure for the street. Traditional street elements of the area, such as granite curbs, should be preserved. New street furniture should complement the scale and character of the area.

## II. *Restoration and rehabilitation.*

### General Principles for Restoration and Rehabilitation

- a. All work should be of a character and quality that maintain the distinguishing features of the building and the environment. The removal of architectural features is not permitted.
- b. Deteriorated architectural features such as cornices, chimneys and roof treatment, window and door openings, and exterior surface treatment should be repaired rather than replaced whenever possible. In the event of replacement, new materials should match the original in composition, design, color, texture and appearance. Duplication of the

original design based on physical or pictorial evidence is preferable to using conjectural or "period" designs or using part of other buildings.

c. Distinctive stylistic features or examples of skilled craftsmanship characteristic of structures of a period should be treated sensitively. Furthermore, if changes in use of a building are contemplated, they should be accomplished with minimum alteration to the structure and fabric.

d. In general it is expected that buildings will be restored to their original appearance. However, alterations to buildings are sometimes worthy of preservation because they reflect a significant period of history of the buildings and the district. This significance should be respected and restoration to an "original" appearance may not always be desirable. All buildings should be recognized as products of their own time and not be altered to resemble buildings from another era.

A. *Masonry and walls.*

a. Use of materials: Original masonry and mortar should be retained whenever possible without the application of any surface treatment. A similar material should be used to repair or replace, where necessary, deteriorated masonry. New masonry added to the structure or site, such as new foundations or retaining walls, should be compatible with the color, texture, and bonding of the original or existing masonry. Formstone, stucco, wood or metal siding or paneling should not be used.

b. Cleaning: Masonry should be cleaned only when necessary to halt deterioration or to remove graffiti and stains and always with the gentlest method possible such as low pressure water (under 300 psi) and soft bristle brushes. Brick and stone surfaces should not be sandblasted with dry or wet grit or other abrasives. This method of cleaning erodes the hard surface of the material and accelerates deterioration. Chemical cleaning products which could have an adverse chemical reaction with the masonry material such as acid on limestone or marble should not be used. It is preferable to use water with a non-ionic biodegradable detergent. Mortar should be repointed and window frames should be caulked before cleaning. Waterproof or water repellant coatings or surface consolidation treatments should not be applied unless required to solve a specific technical problem that has been studied and identified. Coatings are frequently unnecessary, expensive, and can accelerate deterioration of the masonry.

c. Repointing: Repointing should only be done on those mortar joints where there is evidence of moisture problems or when sufficient mortar is missing to allow water to stand on the mortar joint. Using pneumatic hammers to move mortar can seriously damage the adjacent brick. Vertical joints should be hand chiseled. When repointing, it is important to use the same materials as the existing mortar. This includes matching the color, texture, coefficients of expansion and contraction, and ingredient ratio of the original mortar mix, creating a bond similar to the original. A professional mortar analysis can give this information.

Repointing with Portland cement mortar may create a bond stronger than is appropriate for the building materials, possibly resulting in cracking or other damage. Old mortar should be duplicated in joint size, method of applications and joint profile.

d. Painting: The original or early color and texture of masonry surfaces should be retained. Brick or stone surfaces may have been painted or whitewashed for practical and aesthetic reasons. Paint should not be indiscriminately removed from masonry surfaces as this may subject the building to damage and change its appearance.

B. *Windows and doors.*

a. Openings: Existing window and door openings should be retained. New window and door openings should not be introduced into the principal visible elevations. Enlarging or reducing window or door openings to fit stock window sash or new stock door sizes should not be done. Infilling of window openings may be permissible on minor facades if standard sizes approximate the size and proportions of the opening. Generally, a minor facade will be considered as any facade not facing the street and not having the ornamentation and higher quality materials usually associated with street facades.

b. Panes, Sashes and Hardware: It is desirable to retain original windows and doors, but they may need replacement for functional reasons. Replacement is clearly acceptable for functional reasons if new materials closely match original materials. Different materials may be acceptable on a case-by-case basis. Window panes should be two-way glass. No reflective glass is permitted. The stylistic period or periods a building represents should be respected. Shutters are generally inappropriate in the district. Missing or irreparable windows should be replaced with new windows that match the original in material, size, general muntin and mullion proportion and configuration and reflective qualities of the glass. Replacement sash should not alter the setback relationship between window and wall. Heating and air conditioning units should not be installed in the window frames when the sash and frames may be damaged. Window installations should be considered only when all other viable heating and cooling systems would result in significant damage to historic materials. Window installations may be acceptable in minor facades.

c. Storm Windows: Storm windows and doors should be compatible with the character of the building and should not damage window and door frames, or require removal of original windows and doors. Exterior storm windows should be appropriate in size and color and should be operable.

d. Awnings and canopies: Awnings and canopies should not be used when they conceal richly detailed entries and windows. Aluminum or plastic awnings should not be used. Large and historically inappropriate lettering should not be used on awnings.

e. Lintels, arches and sills: Lintels, sills, architraves, pediments, hoods and steps should be retained or repaired if possible. Existing colors and textures should be matched when repairing these elements.

f. Storefronts: Existing storefronts should be retained and repaired including windows, sash, doors, transoms, signage, and decorative features where such features contribute to the architectural and historic character of the building. Where original or early storefronts no longer exist or are too deteriorated to save, the commercial character of the building should be retained through: 1) contemporary design which is compatible with the scale, design, materials, color and texture of the historic buildings; or 2) an accurate restoration of the storefront based on historical research and physical evidence. Storefronts or new design elements on the ground floor, such as arcades, should not be introduced which alter the architectural and historic character of the building and its relationship with the street or its setting or which cause the destruction of significant historic fabric. Materials which detract from the historic or architectural character of the building, such as mirrored glass, should not be used. Entrances through significant storefronts should not be altered.

C. *Roofs, cornices and details.*

a. Roof shape: The original roof shape should be preserved. New skylights and vents should be behind and below parapet level. When the roof is visible from street level, the original material should be retained if possible, otherwise it should be replaced with new material that matches the old in composition, size, shape, color and texture.

b. Cornices and other details: All architectural features that give the roof its essential character should be preserved or replaced. Similar material should be used to repair/replace deteriorating or missing architectural elements such as cornices, brackets, railings, shutters, steps and chimneys, whenever possible. The intricacy of detail is least important for new elements at or near the roof lines. The same massing, proportions, scale and design theme as the original should be retained.

III. *Signs and accessories.* Signs should be compatible with the character of the District, and blend with the character of the structures on or near which they are placed. Signs should not conceal architectural detail, clutter or detract from the intended facade; but rather complement the overall design of the building and the period in which it was built.

A. *Materials.* Sign materials should complement the materials of the related building and/or the adjacent buildings. Surface design elements should not detract from or conflict with the related structure's age and design in terms of identification symbol (logo), lettering, and related patterns or pictures. Materials used should be the same as those used for signs during the period of the building's construction, such as wood, wrought iron, steel, and metal grill work. Newer materials such as extruded aluminum and plastics may not be appropriate.

B. *Types.* The sign type should enhance the building's design and



materials. New billboards are not permitted in the Lowertown District.

C. *Location and method of attachment.* There should be no sign above the cornice line or uppermost portion of a facade wall. Signs should not disfigure or conceal architectural details. Painted signs of pedestrian scale may be permissible on glass windows and doors. The facade should not be damaged in sign application except for mere attachment. The method of attachment should respect the structure's architectural integrity and should become an extension of the architecture. Projecting signs should have a space separating them from the building. (Protection of architecture in method of attachment shall be regarded as a basis for granting variance of the normal zoning code prohibition against guy wire supports for projecting signs).

D. *Lighting.* Location of exterior lights should be appropriate to the structure. Signs should generally be lit from on the site. There should be no flashing, blinking, moving, or varying intensity lighting. Subdued lighting is preferred. Backlit fluorescent or exposed neon are generally inappropriate.

E. *Grills, exhaust fans, Etc.* Grills, exhaust outlets for air conditioners, bath and kitchen exhaust fans should be incorporated into filler panels and kept out of principal facades, if possible. They may be painted the same color as the filler panel.

IV. Demolition. The heritage preservation commission will follow the guidelines stated in the Heritage Preservation Ordinance (#16006), Section 6 (1) (2), when reviewing permit applications for demolition:

"In case of the proposed demolition of a building, prior to approval of said demolition, the commission shall make written findings on the following: architectural and historical merit of the building, the effect on surrounding buildings, the effect of any proposed construction on the remainder of the building (in case of partial demolition) and on surrounding buildings, the economic value or usefulness of building as it now exists, or if altered or modified in comparison with the value or usefulness of any propose structures designated to replace the present building or buildings."

(Ord. No. 17120, § 2, 3-22-84)