

SUMMARY MINUTES OF THE HERITAGE PRESERVATION COMMISSION
CITY OF SAINT PAUL, MINNESOTA
Lower Level – Room 41, City Hall/Court House, 15 West Kellogg Boulevard
November 7, 2013

Present: Barbara Bezat, Robert Ferguson, Diane Trout-Oertel, Michael Justin, Richard Laffin, William Lightner, Richard Dana, David Riehle, Steve Trimble, David Wagner

Absent: Matt Hill (excused), Matt Mazanec (excused), Renee Hutter-Barnes (not excused)

Staff Present: Amy Spong, Christine Boulware, John Beaty

PUBLIC HEARING/DESIGN REVIEW

I. Call to Order 5:02pm

II. Approval of the Agenda Ms. Boulware stated that Item VIII. C has been removed from the agenda as the applicant had requested a continuance.

III. Conflicts of Interest None were stated.

IV. Chair's Announcements

A. Chair Laffin discussed the talk he had given to the Ramsey Hill Association.

B. Chair Laffin announced that he will step down as Chair at the end of this year and will no longer serve on the Commission. He also announced Commissioner Hutter-Barnes will remain on the Commission, but will step down as Secretary.

V. Staff Announcements

A. Ms. Spong announced that an application has been submitted for the Legacy Grant for the building at 25 Empire Drive. She noted that the Legacy Grant award will be announced on December 19th.

Commissioner Riehle noted that he had spoken to some past railroad workers who would be interested in the rehabilitation of the building.

VI. Approval of the meeting minutes Commissioner Dana motioned to approve the meeting minutes; Commissioner Bezat seconded the motion.

A. October 10, 2013 Business Meeting (laid over from October 24)

B. October 24, 2013 Public Hearing/Permit Review

VII. Old Business

A. Ms. Spong updated the Commission on the status of the National Register Nominations that were submitted for public comment in the previous meeting. She noted support from the Mayor Coleman for the nomination of the Minnesota Milk Building and Euclid Flats.

VIII. Public Hearing/Permit Review

A. 1065 Summit Avenue, Hill Historic District, by Willin Consultants Inc. for Sprint, for a permit to install new antennas and telecommunication equipment on the roof. File #14-004 (Boulware, 266-6715) **Continued from the October 24, 2013 Public Hearing**
Ms. Boulware discussed the background of this project.

Ms. Boulware read aloud a letter from Shannon West (Willins Consultants, Inc.) supporting staff recommendation of the application.

Ms. Boulware read aloud a letter from Jordan Meneses Reyes (RF Engineering) which described the technical conditions of the antennas supporting the original proposal from the applicant.

Commissioner Lightner inquired as to if the height of the antenna will be addressed.

Chair Laffin reopened the Public Hearing.

John Knappek, a representative of Willin Consultants and Sprint, was present to represent the application.

Mr. Knappek corrected the letter from Shannon West, and noted that the radio-frequency engineers would prefer to not increase the setback of the antennas.

Shakeel A. Rana, a radio-frequency engineer, was present to address questions from the Commission.

Mr. Rana described the "one-by-five" rule and stated that for every five feet that the antenna is moved back, it must be raised by one foot. He suggested that moving the antenna back would jeopardize the coverage.

Mr. Rana noted that all four points submitted by Mr. Dermody had been considered, and the movement of sector would be acceptable.

Chair Laffin inquired as to what area of coverage would be impacted; Mr. Rana noted that the change would primarily impact the in-building coverage on the surrounding properties.

Ms. Spong suggested that the Commission should discuss the antennas being at three individual places versus two at one place and the proposed false vent covers. Ms. Boulware noted that State Historic Preservation Office (SHPO) requested the false stack covers.

Mr. Knappek noted that the antennas have particular mounts and inquired as to if there should be a shroud installed; Ms. Boulware noted that this should be painted a dark color.

Commissioner Dana requested confirmation that the Commission is satisfied without anything covering the antennas, and that SHPO will require a cover; Ms. Spong confirmed.

Ms. Spong inquired as to if the Commission were to require the antenna in question be separated, would SHPO would approve; Ms. Boulware referred to a letter from April 25th and noted that there was nothing specific written regarding clustering, but the current plans had been approved in a letter on June 9th.

Chair Laffin inquired as to if the Commission believes that the location of sector three on the southeast corner or the southwest corner would be more intrusive; Commissioner Dana stated support for the location to be on the southwest corner.

Commissioner Wagner inquired as to if there are images available of the antennas; Ms. Boulware noted the representations that had been presented at the previous meeting.

Commissioner Wagner inquired as to the total height of the antenna; Ms. Boulware stated she had measured 9-feet, 3-inches.

No written testimony was received and the Public Hearing was closed.

Commissioner Trout-Oertel moved to approve the application with staff recommendation, with the exception of recommendation number one; Commissioner Wagner seconded the motion.

Commissioner Dana made a friendly amendment that a condition should be included that states sector three shall be located on the southwest corner of the building.

Commissioner Trout-Oertel requested that the Commission discuss as to whether this condition would be an improvement.

Commissioner Lightner, Chair Laffin, and Commissioner Bezat expressed agreement.

Commissioner Trout-Oertel accepted the friendly amendment; Commissioner Wagner seconded.

Staff requested direction for a setback requirement for the move to the southwest corner.

Commissioner Lightner made a friendly amendment to include a ten-foot setback.

Commissioner Trout-Oertel accepted the friendly amendment; Commissioner Wagner seconded.

Commissioner Dana stated disapproval of the false vent covers.

Motion passed 9 - 0.

B. 470 Selby Avenue, Hill Historic District, by DeMars Signs and the Curling Club, for a sign permit to install a replica neon sign that reads "The Curling Club." **File #14-005** (Spong, 266-6714)

Staff read aloud the report recommending conditional approval of the application for sign permit to install a replica neon sign that reads "The Curling Club".

Ms. Spong discussed the possible relocation of the existing flag and flagpole and presented photos of the site.

Commissioner Dana noted typos in the staff report.

Commissioner Dana inquired as to if the attachment type will be a decision that staff can make; Ms. Spong noted that it could depending on discussions with the sign maker.

Erik Ordway (a board member of the Saint Paul Curling Club), Tim Olson (a representative from DeMars Signs), and Tim McMahon (a member of, and historian for the Saint Paul Curling Club) were present to speak on behalf of the application.

Mr. Ordway discussed the origin of the current sign proposal based on historic evidence and noted support of the application.

Chair Laffin noted the replication of the original sign and requested the location of the sign be addressed; Mr. Olson discussed the proposed sign location and attachment method of the sign so as not to obstruct the current entry details.

Commissioner Dana inquired as to if the original sign was located to the side of the entry; Mr. Ordway suggested that this understanding may be due to the perspective of the photo and that the original attachments are located above the arch at the entrance.

Commissioner Wagner inquired as to the intention of the flagpole; Mr. Ordway stated that their intention is to not remove the flagpole.

Commissioner Dana inquired as to if the flag will obstruct the sign; Mr. Ordway suggested that it would not. Commissioner Wagner agreed that there would be no obstruction.

Commissioner Ferguson inquired as to the possibility of a clear tube of red light; Mr. Olson replied that this is neon and that the red color is due to chemical reactions. Mr. Ordway stated agreement with the staff recommendation that the tube be clear.

Commissioner Bezat requested confirmation on the possibility of the decorative hanger; Mr. Olson discussed the practical issues of the hanger. Mr. Ordway discussed the decision for the modern style hanger. A discussion was had regarding the location and projection of the hanger.

Commissioner Lightner inquired as to the possible need for additional support infrastructure to hang the sign; Mr. Olsen stated that he would have to speak to the engineer.

Commissioner Lightner noted some issues that may arise from additional support infrastructure; Ms. Spong discussed possibilities that may be discussed.

Ms. Spong read aloud a letter from Charles Linden citing issues regarding water and ice falling from the building to the sidewalk.

Ms. Spong read aloud a letter from Jim Buscher stating support for the proposal and issues regarding ice and safety around the building.

Ms. Spong read aloud a letter from Mary Morris stating lack of support of the proposal.

The Public Hearing was closed.

Commissioner Riehle moved to accept the staff recommendation and approve the application; Commissioner Ferguson seconded the motion.

Commissioner Riehle stated support for the application and the use of neon in the sign.

Commissioner Ferguson stated support for the application and to historic appropriateness for the site.

C. ~~23 Empire Drive, Jackson Street Shops Historic District~~, by Dan Regan, 23 Empire LLC, for a sign permit to install signage at the west entrance canopy, on the south elevation of the building and construct two monument signs. **~~File #14-006~~** (Boulware, 266-6715) **Continuance requested by applicant.**

IX. New Business

A. Ms. Spong announced that she has been asked to produce a mobile workshop for the Railvolution Conference in October 2014 regarding transportation-oriented development and historic preservation.

B. Commissioner Trimble stated discomfort with the level of trust necessary in order to review telecom applications and asked if expert testimony could be provided.

Ms. Spong noted that there have been discussions regarding providing information and education for staff and the Commission. Ms. Boulware described the process staff follows for telecom applications.

Commissioner Riehle suggested that there be a review of the process for these reviews.

Commissioner Bezat noted the specificity of each application and the opportunity to consult other experts.

C. Commissioner Riehle discussed existing ghost signs on buildings throughout St. Paul and concern about the loss of these historic signs. Ms. Spong and Ms. Boulware discussed existing protections.

X. Committee Reports

A. Commission Trout-Oertel inquired as to other Commissioners would be interested in joining the Education Committee. Logistics of the Committee meetings were discussed.

B. Commissioner Trimble discussed a current agreement with Metro State and the surrounding community regarding the location of the student center.

C. A discussion was had regarding a discussion had at a Historic St. Paul meeting for Preserve Frogtown regarding heritage preservation districts.

D. Commissioner Wagner announced that his wife had won an award for the Best History Article in Minnesota.

XI. Motion to Adjourn 6:38pm

Submitted by R.Cohn