

SUMMARY MINUTES OF THE HERITAGE PRESERVATION COMMISSION
CITY OF SAINT PAUL, MINNESOTA
Lower Level – Room 41, City Hall/Court House, 15 West Kellogg Boulevard
April 24, 2014

Present: Barbara Bezat, Richard Dana, Robert Ferguson, Matt Hill, Renee Hutter, Bill Lightner, Amy Meller, Steve Trimble, Diane Trout-Oertel

Absent: Michael Justin, Matt Mazanec, David Riehle, David Wagner

Staff Present: Amy Spong, Christine Boulware, Bill Dermody, John Beaty

BUSINESS MEETING

- I. Call to Order** 5:04 pm
- II. Approval of the Agenda** Commissioner Trout-Oertel moved to approve the agenda; Commissioner Bezat seconded the motion.
- III. Conflicts of Interest** None were stated.
- IV. Chair's Announcements** None were stated.
- V. Staff Announcements** None were stated.
- VI. Discussion/Old Business**

A. Lowertown Ballpark, by the Department of Parks and Recreation, update on the adoption of a resolution regarding the 100% Design Development-level plans. (Spong 266-6714)

Staff summarized the resolution and noted that this discussion will be regarding the Commission's response to the design team's response to the resolution.

Staff summarized the changes that have been made by the design team.

Sarah Beimers, from the State Historic Preservation Office (SHPO), was present to represent the project.

Ms. Beimers discussed the history of the project review by SHPO and clarified the level to which each phase has been reviewed. Ms. Beimers noted that this process was out of the norm and some comments have not been received.

Chair Dana inquired as to if the lack of standard process and comment is problematic; Ms. Beimers responded that SHPO will be commenting on the consultation process.

Charlene Roise (Hess, Roise & Co.) and Logan Gerken (Ryan Companies) were present to represent the design team.

Ms. Roise agreed that the review process has been complicated.

Mr. Gerken responded to item No. 7 in the resolution and described the process they have since gone through to comply with this item through signage and other strategies.

Commissioner Dana requested that Mr. Gerken discuss new elements that have been added to the design; Mr. Gerken described the new additions and alterations that have been made to the design.

Commissioner Lightner requested confirmation that the ticket windows are recessed; Mr. Gerken confirmed. Commissioner Lightner noted that the lack of visibility does not allow for the full window effect.

Commissioner Lightner requested clarification on the seating wall; Mr. Gerken clarified the location and purpose of the seating wall.

Commissioner Lightner requested additional explanation of the stair tower; Mr. Gerken described additional details of the stair tower.

Commissioner Lightner inquired as to if art is intended to be installed on the large blank wall; Mr. Gerken noted that there will likely be decorative signage.

Commissioner Trout-Oertel requested that Mr. Gerken speak to the street wall on Broadway and the reinforcement of the street grid; Mr. Gerken discussed infrastructure constrictions at the site.

Commissioner Trout-Oertel requested that Mr. Gerken discuss how the entrance relates to 5th Street; Mr. Gerken described this relationship. Ms. Spong described additional elements that relate to the entrance and historic 5th Street and historic 4th Street.

Commissioner Hill noted concern with the City's involvement in the project and whether a community involvement plan will be adopted.

Chris Stark, from the Department of Parks and Recreation, was present to represent the City of Saint Paul.

Mr. Stark responded to Commissioner Hill's comments and stated that the City is committed to preserving the community through signage.

Commissioner Trimble inquired as to the involvement of the City and the Saints regarding operations once the ballpark has opened; Mr. Stark stated that the Saints will operate the ballpark while the city will be responsible for the dog park.

Chair Dana requested clarification of the design of the signage; Mr. Gerken described what is currently designed and noted that the design is not yet confirmed.

Chair Dana asked Ms. Beimers if she is clear on the concerns of the Commission; Ms. Beimers responded that she is.

VII. New Business

A. Saint Paul Bikeways Plan (Draft), by the Department of Public Works, adopt a resolution providing recommendations to the Mayor, City Council and Planning Commission. File #14-BIKE (Dermody 266-6617)

Ruben Collins, from the Department of Public Works, was present to present the plan.

Mr. Collins read aloud the Saint Paul Bikeways Plan.

Commissioner Trimble inquired as to what pedestrians gain from this plan; Mr. Collins responded that the intent of the plan is to have separate spaces for pedestrians and bike riders.

Commissioner Lightner requested confirmation that the proposal is for separate pedestrian and bike trails and marks in the street identifying bike lanes; Mr. Collins responded that this is the intent everywhere, but will be dependent on the location.

Mr. Collins noted that a goal of this plan is to encourage new bike riders and presented renderings of possible trail and street configurations for bikes and pedestrians. Mr. Collins noted the expected timeline of the plan.

Commissioner Trout-Oertel requested clarification of the Bicycle Boulevards; Mr. Collins clarified those bicyclists and automobiles would share the road.

Commissioner Trout-Oertel requested clarification of the difference between Bicycle Boulevards and Enhanced Shared Lanes; Mr. Collins clarified that Bicycle Boulevards would be implemented on low volume and Enhanced Shared Lanes would be implemented on high volume streets.

Commissioner Bezat inquired as to if there has been any community outreach for communities where there would be a potentially significant impact on their neighborhood; Mr. Collins discussed the level to which the community has been involved in the process.

Commissioner Lightner commented that he approves of the plan.

Commissioner Hill inquired as to when implementation of the plan is expected; Mr. Collins responded that the plan is to release the implementation chapter in June.

Commissioner Hill requested that Mr. Collins comment on the lack of trails north of Union Depot to the ballpark; Mr. Collins noted discussions that have taken place regarding trails in downtown and that the discussions will continue.

Commissioner Ferguson noted that he is a member of a community council that Mr. Collins visited to discuss this plan.

Commissioner Trout-Oertel suggested that there should be an effort to educate drivers.

Commissioner Trout-Oertel noted that Figure 4 is difficult to read on the plan; Mr. Collins clarified this section.

Commissioner Trimble noted that bicycles were present before automobiles and the original construction of most parks to accommodate bicycles.

Commissioner Trimble noted potential issues with the Forest Street trail being implemented on an existing pedestrian walkway; Mr. Collins noted that the intent of this plan is to be a long-term vision and changes will likely be made.

Ms. Spong relayed a question from Commissioner Wagner regarding the separation of parking lanes; Mr. Collins noted that this has been discussed, but no decisions have been made.

Chair Dana inquired as to if Mr. Collins has been working on this plan since its inception; Mr. Collins responded that the majority of the plan was completed by his predecessor.

Mr. Dermody summarized the draft resolution. Chair Dana emphasized that the intent is to ensure that the Commission is well represented and consulted throughout the process.

Mr. Collins discussed the process for the plan.

Commissioner Hutter moved to adopt the resolution; Commissioner Ferguson seconded the motion.

Chair Dana requested that each Commissioner express their support or lack thereof.

Commissioner Hill spoke in support of the plan and proposed amendments.

Commissioner Trimble referenced the future bikeway facilities and inquired as to if there are future plans for structures; Mr. Dermody noted that these are a reference to the bikeways and not built structures.

Commissioner Trimble inquired as to whether the Commission will review signage; Ms. Spong noted that the Commission does not typically review traffic signage.

Commissioner Bezat suggested that interpretive historic markers be implemented in the plan. A discussion was had regarding possible language to incorporate into the resolution.

Commissioner Bezat made a friendly amendment to include language regarding signage in the resolution; Commissioner Hutter and Commissioner Ferguson approved the amendment.

Commissioner Ferguson requested clarification on point 3 in the resolution; Ms. Spong clarified that this point is intended to ensure context and character be studied prior to the implementation of the trails and bikeways.

Commissioner Hill inquired as to if we are requiring studies that the Commission is obligated to fund the studies; Chair Dana noted that the Commission is in Commission to require the study, but not to implement them. Ms. Spong suggested that the language in the resolution be clarified regarding the studies.

Commissioner Hill made a friendly amendment to include HPC in point No. 2 of the resolution; Commissioner Hutter and Commissioner Ferguson approved the amendment.

The motion passed 8-0.

VIII. Public Hearing/Permit Review

A. 250 Sixth Street East - Cosmopolitan Building, Lowertown Heritage Preservation District, by Griffin Jameson, Kaas Wilson Architects, for a building permit to replace two fixed windows in a recessed storefront with metal panels. **File #14-019** (Boulware, 266-6715)

Staff read aloud the report recommending conditional approval of the proposal to replace two fixed windows in a recessed storefront with metal panels.

Staff presented photos of the property and the proposal.

Commissioner Lightner requested clarification of what would be seen if there is no obscuring film; Mr. Beaty noted that dry wall would be a possibility, but that there are other options.

Chair Dana inquired as to how far the venting will be protruding from the panel; Mr. Beaty responded that this is not known, but that it is suggested to be as minimal as possible.

Chair Dana inquired as to if this will be continued to be used as an entrance; Mr. Beaty responded that it is not.

Griffin Jameson and Ryan duPris were present to represent Kaas Wilson Architects.

Mr. Jameson clarified that there will be four protrusions that will be 2.5 inches from the metal panel and painted to match the frame.

Mr. Jameson clarified that this will be an entrance for the building. Mr. duPris added that it will be a secondary entrance.

Commissioner Trout-Oertel requested confirmation that only one door will be operable; Mr. Jameson confirmed that all three doors will technically be operable, but will not be accessible. A discussion was had regarding the visual appearance and code compliance of the doors.

Chair Dana requested a response to the staff recommendation to remove the awning; Mr. duPris responded that the owners have agreed to remove the awning.

Chair Dana noted the four protrusions from the panel and inquired as to their purpose; Mr. Jameson responded that they are for venting only. Mr. duPris noted that there may be five, and not four.

Commissioner Lightner inquired as to what will be put in place of the obscuring film; Mr. Jameson presented an image and described the plan install a back-painted drywall if it is acceptable to the owner.

Commissioner Meller requested clarification of the size of the transom panel; Mr. Jameson clarified by referencing images presented.

Commissioner Trout-Oertel inquired as to what the original storefront looked like; Mr. Jameson noted that there was previously a revolving door. A discussion was had regarding the transom and storefront configuration.

No written testimony was received and the public hearing was closed.

Commissioner Bezat moved to accept the staff recommendation; Commissioner Lightner seconded the motion with the amended language that a back-painted panel be installed and the inclusion of the condition that the awning be removed.

Commissioner Hutter spoke in support of the motion.

Commissioner Trout-Oertel spoke in support of the motion.

The motion passed 8-0.

B. 79 Western Avenue North, Historic Hill Heritage Preservation District, by Steve Stulz on behalf of AT&T, for a building permit to install nine telecommunications antennas, a 18' x 9' platform, a 12' x 16' equipment shelter, and associated equipment on the roof. **File #14-020** (Dermody, 266-6617).

Staff read aloud the report recommending conditional approval of the proposal to install nine telecommunications antennas, a 18' x 9' platform, a 12' x 16' equipment shelter, and associated equipment on the roof.

Staff presented images of the property and representation of the proposal.

Chair Dana requested confirmation that the proposed shelter is taller than the existing penthouse and inquired as to how big it is relative to the penthouse; Mr. Dermody confirmed and noted that dimensions are not available for the existing penthouse and estimated that it is approximately 1/5th the size of the existing penthouse.

A discussion was had regarding the views available of the proposed equipment and structure.

Steve Stulz, from AT&T, was present to represent the project.

Chair Dana requested confirmation that the structure is proposed in the location for aesthetic reasons; Mr. Stulz confirmed.

Commissioner Bezat requested confirmation that the recommendation for colors will be able to be fulfilled; Mr. Stulz responded that the structure can be painted and that painting the handrail and steps will be possible.

Chair Dana requested confirmation that the stairs and handrails will not be visible from the street; Mr. Stulz confirmed and noted the only visible portion will be the top of the structure.

No written testimony was received and the public hearing was closed.

Commissioner Trout-Oertel moved to approve the proposal and accept staff recommendations; Commissioner Hutter seconded the motion.

The motion passed 8-0.

Commissioner Trimble stated concern with the demolition of 260 Maria Avenue in the Dayton's Bluff Historic District without review by the Commission. A discussion was had regarding potential action that could be taken.

Commissioner Trout-Oertel noted that the Commission should retrieve a copy of a document supplied by Mr. Hosko during the meeting.

IX. Motion to Adjourn 7:41 pm

Submitted by R.Cohn