

**CITY OF SAINT PAUL
HERITAGE PRESERVATION COMMISSION STAFF REPORT**

FILE NAME: Verizon Downtown Small Cell Network
DATE OF APPLICATION: June 5, 2014
APPLICANT: Kate Schindler, Tetra Tech
OWNER: (Public Right-of-Way)
DATE OF HEARING: June 26, 2014
HPC SITE/DISTRICT: Central Library/James J. Hill Reference Library
CATEGORY: pivotal
CLASSIFICATION: building permit
STAFF INVESTIGATION AND REPORT: Bill Dermody
DATE: June 18, 2014

A. SITE DESCRIPTION:

The library was completed in 1917 as one three-story building housing two libraries. It was designed by Electus D. Litchfield of New York City, with the guidance of national library expert Charles C. Soule. The building is a fine example of North Italian Renaissance architecture; it is of a symmetrical design with seven bays and two pavilions. Exterior walls of Tennessee marble serve as a neutral background for the Palladian entries, arched windows, dentiled band courses, garland and swag frieze, and the heavy dentiled cornice, which created the rich Renaissance form of the building. The building fills an entire block, with the primary **façade** facing onto Rice Park. Kellogg Boulevard runs along the rear **façade**, the courtyard, and courtyard landscaping, with Market and Washington Streets framing the sides. A decorative stone balustrade surrounds the site.

B. PROPOSED CHANGES:

The application proposes to install a small cell telecommunication antenna and associated equipment adjacent to the Central Library/James J. Hill Reference Library at the northwest corner of Market Street and Kellogg Boulevard as part of a larger group of installations covering the downtown. The small cell antenna is a 2'-high "can" design atop an existing PA85-style (angular) street light of approximately 35' height, with conduit running about 2' down the pole to a pair of small RRU (Remote Radio Unit) boxes mounted on the vertical portion of the pole. All ground equipment is proposed to be located underground. The application refers to the installation as "D1/Dace".

C. BACKGROUND:

The applicant has been working with the Public Works Department on right-of-way permit requirements. The applicant aims to have the small cell antenna system installed and functioning before the MLB All-Star Game events commence (July 11).

D. GUIDELINE CITATIONS:

Preservation Program

The present exterior of the Saint Paul Public Library and the James Jerome Hill Reference Library should be preserved in a manner consistent with its original design intent. The stone balustrade surrounding the building site should be preserved. The Library's inner courtyard is of vital importance as the sole landscaped open space on the immediate thoroughfare (Kellogg Boulevard), and this garden also served as a foil for the building's unique window treatment. Maintaining this landscaping around the building, including the courtyard on the southern side is

encouraged.

The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation:

1. A property shall be used for its historic purpose or be placed in a new use that requires minimal change to the defining characteristics of the building and its site and environment.
2. The historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved. The removal of historic materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided.
3. Each property shall be recognized as a physical record of its time, place, and use. Changes that create a false sense of historical development, such as adding conjectural features or architectural elements from other buildings, shall not be undertaken.
4. Most properties change over time; those changes that have acquired historic significance in their own right shall be retained and preserved.
5. Distinctive features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a property shall be preserved.
6. Deteriorated historic features shall be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature shall match the old in design, color, texture, and other visual qualities and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features shall be substantiated by documentary, physical, or pictorial evidence.
7. Chemical or physical treatments, such as sandblasting, that cause damage to historic materials shall not be used. The surface cleaning of structures, if appropriate, shall be undertaken using the gentlest means possible.
8. Significant archeological resources affected by a project shall be protected and preserved. If such resources must be disturbed, mitigation measures shall be undertaken.
9. New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction shall not destroy historic materials that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features to protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment.
10. New additions and adjacent or related new construction shall be undertaken in such a manner that if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.

E. FINDINGS:

1. The property was listed on the National Register in 1975 and was locally designated as a Heritage Preservation Site in 1978. The Heritage Preservation Commission shall protect the architectural character of heritage preservation sites through review and approval or denial of applications for city permits for exterior work within designated heritage preservation sites §73.04.(4).
2. The proposed small cell telecommunication antenna labeled D1/Dace, along with its associated equipment, is located adjacent to the Central Library/James J. Hill Reference Library Heritage Preservation Site and within the Area of Potential Effect.
3. The proposed installation does not impact the balustrade or inner courtyard, or any other aspects of the site and its original design intent.
4. The proposed installation does not destroy historic materials that characterize the property and, if removed in the future, will not impair the historic property's essential form and integrity.

5. The 1996 Federal Telecommunications Act requires that local government regulations shall not prohibit or have the effect of prohibiting the provision of personal wireless services. The application proposes a means of wireless service provision, through a 2'-high "can" antenna upon an existing streetlight with ground equipment placed underground, that has much less impact on the property's historic character compared to other means of wireless service provision typically found in Saint Paul and surrounding cities.
6. The application materials present typical proposed street light pole elevations and photographs of an existing demonstration site. The materials do not present actual proposed elevations.
7. The proposal, as submitted, will not adversely affect the program for the preservation and architectural control of the Central Library/James J. Hill Reference Library Heritage Preservation Site (Leg. Code §73.06 (e)).

F. STAFF RECOMMENDATION:

Based on the findings, staff recommends approval of the application provided the following conditions are met:

1. Substantial conformance with application materials, including site plans, typical proposed street light pole elevations, and project description.
2. Final materials and details shall be submitted to HPC staff for review and approval.
3. Antennas, RRUs, and any other equipment placed on the street light pole shall be painted to match the pole.
4. Any revisions to the approved plans must be submitted to the HPC and/or staff for review.