

**CITY OF SAINT PAUL
HERITAGE PRESERVATION COMMISSION STAFF REPORT**

FILE NAME: Como Avenue--Wynne Avenue--Nagasaki Road Street Changes
DATE OF HPC MEETING: January 22, 2015
CLASSIFICATION: Street Name Changes
STAFF INVESTIGATION AND REPORT: Christine Boulware
DATE: January 15, 2015

A. BACKGROUND:

The Saint Paul Department of Parks and Recreation has requested the Heritage Preservation Commission review proposals to rename:

1) Horton Avenue, west of Lexington Parkway, to Como Avenue:

Saint Paul Parks and Recreation proposes that Horton Avenue between Lexington Parkway and Hamline Avenue be renamed to Como Avenue. Horton Avenue between Gateway Drive and Lexington Parkway would remain Horton Avenue.

According to the Department of Parks and Recreation, a survey of over 2,250 people at Como Park Conservatory, Como Park Zoo and online identified that the segments of roadway between Hamline Avenue and Lexington Parkway tend to generate confusion for both visitors and residents. It was recommended that Horton Avenue be renamed as Como Avenue.

There are no residential properties along this stretch, so the renaming will not create the need for re-addressing.

Today's Como Avenue runs east to Hamline and then the road becomes Horton; Como Avenue reconnects in McMurray Field Area and continues east to Capitol Heights.

2) Como Avenue, west of Lexington Parkway, to Wynne Avenue:

The renaming of Horton Avenue to Como Avenue necessitates that the existing Como Avenue segment through McMurray Field be renamed. The Department of Parks and Recreation has put forward the name Wynne Avenue which is currently located two blocks south of Como Avenue and originates at Hamline Avenue and extends west.

3) Gateway Drive, east of Lexington Parkway, to Nagasaki Road:

Saint Paul Parks and Recreation proposes that Gateway Drive be renamed to Nagasaki Road in recognition of the Saint Paul Nagasaki Sister City Committee (SPNSCC's) "60 Years of Friendship, 70 Years of Peace between Us" celebration in 2015.

As part of the celebration of the 60th anniversary as sister cities with Nagasaki, Japan, the SPNSCC requested a street name to recognize the importance of the relationship and to reestablish a Nagasaki Road in the city.

In 1962, Councilperson, Milton Rosen, first dedicated Nagasaki Road near Harriet Island and the river. With the renovation and revitalization of the Harriet Island area, Nagasaki Road disappeared. The City of Nagasaki has "Saint Paul Dori", the street, in recognition of the relationship, runs past the entrance to the Peace Park.

Gateway Drive is located in Como Regional Park, which is home to the Charlotte Partridge Ordway Memorial Japanese Garden (designed by Masami Matsuda of Nagasaki), Global Harmony Labyrinth, and holds the annual Japanese Lantern Lighting Festival and Cherry Tree planting.

B. ORDINANCE CITATIONS:

Chapter 73.04 (10) Street name changes. The commission shall review and comment on any

proposed name change for a city street which has had its current name for fifty (50) years or more prior to action on the name change by the city council. In their review of and recommendations on such street name changes, the commission shall utilize guidelines and criteria as adopted by the commission on April 14, 1988.

The resolution dated April 14, 1988 states the following:

...the Heritage Preservation Commission adopts the following criteria for HPC review of and recommendations on street name changes:

- 1. The relationship of both the existing and proposed names to the city's cultural, social, economic, and political history;*
- 2. The significance of both the existing and proposed names and their relationship to the location and prominence of the street; and*
- 3. The representation of both the existing and proposed names in the names of other places, buildings, and objects in St. Paul.*

C. FINDINGS:

- 1. *Legislative Code § 73.04(10) Street name changes.*** *The commission shall review and comment on any proposed name change for a city street which has had its current name for fifty (50) years or more prior to action on the name change by the city council. In their review of and recommendations on such street name changes, the commission shall utilize guidelines and criteria as adopted by the commission on April 14, 1988.*
- 2.** *The Heritage Preservation Commission adopted the following criteria for HPC review of and recommendations on street name changes:*
 - 1. The relationship of both the existing and proposed names to the city's cultural, social, economic, and political history;*
 - 2. The significance of both the existing and proposed names and their relationship to the location and prominence of the street; and*
 - 3. The representation of both the existing and proposed names in the names of other places, buildings, and objects in St. Paul.*
- 3. *The relationship of both streets to the city's cultural, social, economic, and political history.***

Note: The applicant submitted information citing several sources for the following information. These include records on file at the Department of Public Works, City Council ordinances, "*The City Itself a Work of Art: A Historical Evaluation of Como Park for the City of St. Paul, Minnesota*" by The 106 Group, and "*The Street Where You Live: A Guide to the Place Names of St. Paul*" by Don Empson.

Horton Avenue (shortening): is named for "Hiler H. Horton (1857-1906), born in Wisconsin, graduated from Washington University in St. Louis and moved to St. Paul in 1878 as a clerk in the law office of Cushman K. Davis. He served on the Board of Park Commissioners and was later a state senator. The name was established in 1885 in close proximity to the Como Park Zoo.

Horton Avenue was extended where Van Slyke Avenue was (from Lexington Parkway to Churchill Street) by the City Council in 1962 under Council File No. 208740.

Hiler H. Horton's service on the Board of Park Commissioners and political contributions on the State Senate demonstrates the relationship of the street name to the political and cultural history of Saint Paul.

Como Avenue (shifting): "Officially named in 1871, [Como Avenue] follows an early Rose Township road between St. Paul and Lake Como. The very first road to Lake

Como was a private road graded by Henry McKenty in the 1850s to entice potential customers to his lots for sale. The remnant of that 150-year-old road remains as an alley behind the houses numbered 716-806 Como Avenue. In the 1928 Hopkins atlas, the alley is labeled Como Lane.” pg. 58.

Como Avenue relates to Lake Como and the early settlement of this area. Although very little of the original road remains as Como Lane, the name still carries a social significance in its access, relationship and proximity to the H.W.S. Cleveland planned park.

Wynne Avenue (extending): “Platted west of Fairview in 1885 in St. Anthony Park, this street now exists only east of Fairview Avenue” (Empson).

Staff was unable to determine whether the street has any relationship to the city’s cultural, social, economic, or political history.

Gateway Drive (removing): The gateway to Como Park (Empson). In 1967, the City Council changed the road on the south side of Lake Como from E. Como Lake Drive to Gateway Drive (Council File No. 233210). In 1985, Gateway Drive was redone and extended around the south of Lake Como as it exists today and East Como Boulevard was eliminated. An 1895 St. Paul Board of Park Commissioners map shows the drive around Como Lake was Lake Drive. From the early H.W.S. Cleveland park plan to 1967, it appears the drive around the lake was always associated with the lake. Gateway Drive does not appear to have a strong relationship to the City’s cultural, social, economic, or political history; however, staff had limited information.

Nagasaki Road (reintroducing): This road was originally named in 1965 by the City Council on Harriet Island. The name was a tribute to Nagasaki, Japan, sister city of Saint Paul, and Nagasaki’s moral and economic merits were extolled in the council resolution initiating the name. The street was vacated in 1994 when the flood levee around Harriet Island Regional Park was refashioned” (Empson).

Nagasaki Road relates to the city’s relationship as a sister city to Nagasaki, Japan. It does not relate to the early development of the City and platting of the streets but the first naming is now 50 years old.

4. ***Significance of both streets and their relationship to the location and prominence of the street.***

Horton Avenue: The location of Horton Avenue at Como Park is due to Hiler H. Horton’s contribution to Saint Paul with the Board of Park Commissioners and as a state senator. The street name is significant and a small portion will remain.

Como Avenue: The significance of the relationship of Como Avenue at Como Park and Lake Como is prominent and evident geographically.

Wynne Avenue: Wynne Avenue is an established street just west of where the name change is proposed and the name change establishes this street east of Hamline, although not connected. The significance of Wynne with respect to introducing the name in Como Park (originally in St. Anthony Park) is not known.

Gateway Drive: Gateway Drive is the gateway to Como Park and Lake Como with access from the south east. There is little significance of Gateway Drive as there appears to be a lack of a strong relationship with the City’s cultural, social, economic, and political history. It does mark an entrance to Como Park.

Nagasaki Road: Reestablishing Nagasaki Road in the new location at Como Park ties in with the location of the Japanese Garden and events at the park.

5. The 106 Group report (1997) evaluated the existing and historical features of the whole

park and looked at the changes to roadways. The report didn't focus on the names of those roads but rather if there were roads intact with enough physical integrity as part of the most significance contexts and the period of significance. The area where Gateway Drive is proposed to Nagasaki was determined as not having significance given all the changes that have been done to the west and southeast sides of the Lake. East Lake Como Drive was determined significant and there are no name changes proposed. Horton Avenue was identified as not significant either because of lost physical integrity or missing parts. Other roadways within the Park that were determined significant are Midway Parkway, East Como Lake Drive, Estabrook, Nason and Kauffman drives.

6. ***The representation of both streets in the names of other places, buildings, and objects in St. Paul.***

Portion of Horton Avenue to Como Avenue: Horton Park, at 1383 Minnehaha Avenue West (at Hamline Avenue), is a mini-arboretum. The three-and-a-half-acre park was acquired in 1907. The name commemorates the death of Hiler H. Horton. There are also Horton Avenue Gates noted in the 1997 106 Group report that are missing significant features and lack integrity. A small section of Horton Avenue, east of Lexington Parkway is proposed to remain.

The name Como is found at Lake Como, Como Park, Como Zoo, Como Boulevard and Como Lane. All relate to the Park and Lake.

Portion of Como Avenue to Wynne Avenue: Wynne Avenue currently exists in close proximity to where it is proposed. Staff was unable to locate any places, buildings or objects in Saint Paul with the same name. The representation of Como Avenue is addressed above.

All of Gateway Drive to Nagasaki Road: Gateway Park (not city owned) was opened in 1993 at Energy Park Drive and Raymond Avenue. Gateway Trail is the local connection to the multiple-use Willard Munger State Trail system between St. Paul and Duluth. Gateway Village is a newer housing development on the south side of West Seventh Street between Norfolk Avenue, Davern Street, and Munster Avenue. There does not appear to be any relation between these locations other than name. Gateway is used to represent an entrance or start to various places.

Saint Paul has been a sister city to Nagasaki, Japan since 1955. Staff was unable to locate any places, buildings or objects in Saint Paul with the same name. There are other places that are associated with Japan and those are listed above in the Background section. There was an original Japanese Garden at Como Park but no longer exists.

6. The shortening of Horton Avenue, the shifting of Como Avenue, the extension of Wynne Avenue, the loss of Gateway Drive, and the reestablishment of Nagasaki Road will not have a negative impact on the city's cultural, social, economic, and political history in Saint Paul so long as the portion of Horton Avenue, east of Lexington Parkway remains.

D. STAFF RECOMMENDATION:

Based on the findings above, staff recommends the HPC adopt a resolution and forward on to the City Council providing their review and comment on the proposed street name changes requested by the Department of Park and Recreation. Further indicating the changes will not have a negative impact on the city's cultural, social, economic, and political history in Saint Paul so long as the portion of Horton Avenue, east of Lexington Parkway remains.