

ACTION MINUTES OF THE HERITAGE PRESERVATION COMMISSION
CITY OF SAINT PAUL, MINNESOTA
Lower Level - Room 41, City Hall/Court House, 15 West Kellogg Boulevard

April 23, 2015

Present: Richard Dana, Matt Hill, Renee Hutter Barnes, Barbara Bezat, Robert Ferguson, Bill Lightner, Matt Mazanec, David Riehle, Steve Trimble, Diane Trout-Oertel, David Wagner
Absent: Amy Meller (excused)
Staff Present: Amy Spong, Christine Boulware, Bill Dermody, Allison Suhan,

PUBLIC HEARING/DESIGN REVIEW

I. Call to Order - 5:03pm

II. Approval of the Agenda -

*Commissioner Riehle moved to approve the agenda. Commissioner Hill seconded the motion. **Motion passed 11-0***

III. Conflicts of Interest - None stated.

IV. Public Hearing/Permit Review

A. 344 Summit Avenue, Hill Heritage Preservation District, by John Rupp, Commonwealth Properties, Inc., for permits to widen and add sidewalks, alter the grade, alter the front porch, and enclose a basement window on the front elevation for an elevated path to the property. **File #15-012** (Spong, 266-6714)
Laid over from the November 20, 2014 and January 22, 2015 public hearings.

Commissioner Riehle moved to adopt staff recommendations. Commissioner Bezat seconded the motion. Commissioner Lightner amended to allow grade change in 1A. Commissioner Riehle withdrew the motion.

Commissioner Mazanec moved to approve the application based on staff recommendations. Commissioner Trimble seconded the motion. Commissioner Lightner proposed a friendly amendment to strike the first sentence of 1.A. Commissioner Mazanec denied the friendly amendment.

*Commissioner Lightner moved to amend the following staff recommendations: that condition 1.A. reads "the basement window may be blocked in (with an approved material) provided there is a reveal/recess from the stone wall to recall the original window opening. This area will be properly graded and protected from drainage," strike the last sentence of 1.C. that reads "The railing shall not be a solid structure but rather supported by posts," and add that a drainage plane shall be installed to protect the stone. Commissioner Ferguson seconded the amendment. **Motion failed 5-6, Chair Dana voted against the amendment***

Motion to accept staff recommendations. 4-5, Justin abstains. Motion fails.

*Commissioner Riehle proposed a recess. Commissioner Wagner seconded the motion. **Motion failed 4-6.***

Commissioner Wagner moved to accept the applicant's proposal with the following conditions and provision of onsite design review:

1. The proposed location of a ramp along the front/primary elevation is accepted,

however, the following conditions apply:

- a. An appropriate drainage plane will be added along the above grade stone and this will be detailed and updated in revised plans.
 - b. In this case, visual screening of the ramp will be allowed to be the existing mature shrubs. If the shrubs are damaged during the ramp construction, then replacement shrubs shall be required of an appropriate size and be maintained as screening. Prior to any work, the applicant shall schedule an on-site meeting with a landscape designer/arborist, an HPC sub-committee and staff to discuss the viability of the existing shrubs and the proposed ramp construction and concur on necessary steps that can be taken to improve their retention and/or replacement.
 - c. The stone removed to accommodate the opening for the ramp shall be stored in a dry and secure location at the site with photo documentation before, during and after removal. The final treatment for the "cut" stone edges shall be submitted to staff for review and approval.
2. All final materials, colors and products specifications shall be submitted to staff for final review and approval.
 3. A full size copy of the final construction plans submitted to the Department of Safety and Inspections for city permits shall also be submitted to HPC staff.
 4. The HPC stamped approved construction level plans shall remain onsite for the duration of the project.
 5. Any changes or revisions to the approved HPC plans and city permits shall be submitted to the HPC and/or staff for review and approval.

*Commissioner Hill seconded the motion. **Motion passed 6-4.***

B. 543 James Avenue, Schmidt Brewing Company Heritage Preservation District, by David Haider, Urban Organics, for city permits to replace the roof, enclose portions of the south and north walls, plant a green wall on the south and paint. **File #15-026** (Dermody, 266-6617)

*Commissioner Hill moved to adopt staff recommendations. Commissioner Wagner seconded the motion. **Motion passed 9-0.***

C. 485 Dayton Avenue, Hill Heritage Preservation District, by Bruce Nelson, for a building permit to construct a balustrade and install decking atop the front porch. **File #15-027** (Boulware, 266-6715)

*Commissioner Bezat moved to approve staff recommendations. Commissioner Mazanec seconded the motion. **Motion passed 9-0.***

D. 955 Summit Avenue, Hill Heritage Preservation District, by Jerry Quicksell, Quicksell Brothers Builders, for city permits to construct a rear addition that roughly measures 33' by 46' by 25' tall. **File #15-028** (Spong, 266-6714)

*Commissioner Bezat moved to approve staff recommendations with an addition to finding 6 with a suggestion to add a reveal or brick design where the new portion meets the original. Commissioner Ferguson seconded the motion. **Motion passed 9-0.***

V. New Business- None.

VI. Chair Announcements

Commissioner Riehle brought a Labor History pamphlet for commissioners to review. There will be house tours on Saturday and Sunday- several in Dayton's Bluff and Commissioner Riehle will be at 702 East Third Street for the tour.

VII. Staff Announcements –

1. 688 and 698 4th Street are on home tour.
2. 321 Irvine has done engineering revisions that will reduce their footprint. They can't go into bluff as much so now the back is cantilevered. Reviewing will be done at staff level. One chimney also went away.
3. Amy spoke with Save Our St. Paul Neighborhoods yesterday. Main focus is the teardowns and new construction in Mac/Groveland and Highland. There is a diverse group of people in the organization. She spoke about existing ordinance and tools, what are we looking and what are we not looking at but could be. They are very anxious for something to be done and figuring out how to move forward through a grassroots effort.
4. Amy led the Old Home Certified course for PAM this morning. It is the fourth time her or Christine has done this. First time the EAW rules have been presented to them. Staff is working on getting accurate EAW information out and available for the public.

Adjourn 8:54 pm

Submitted by A. Suhan