Dayton's Bluff Historic District Guidelines:

Sec. 74.87. General Principles:

1. All work should be of a character and quality that maintains the distinguishing features of the building and the environment. The removal or alteration of distinctive architectural features should be avoided as should alterations that have no historical basis and which seek to create an earlier appearance. The restoration of altered original features, if documentable, is encouraged.

2. Changes which may have taken place in the course of time are evidence of the history and development of a building, structure, or site and its environment. These changes may have acquired significance in their own right, and this significance shall be recognized and respected.

3. Deteriorated architectural features should be repaired rather than replaced whenever possible. In the event of replacement, new materials should match the original in composition, design (including consideration of proportion, texture and detail), color and overall appearance.

4. New additions or alterations to structures should be constructed in such a manner that if such additions or alterations were to be removed in the future, the form and integrity of the original structure would be unimpaired.

5. The impact of alterations or additions on individual buildings as well as on the surrounding streetscape will be considered; major alterations to buildings which occupy a corner lot or are otherwise prominently sited should be avoided.

6. New construction should be compatible with the historic and architectural character of the district.

Sec. 74.90(i) Moving of structures.

Proposals for moving structures out of the Dayton's Bluff Historic District are reviewed using the guidelines for demolition. Proposals for moving structures onto property located within the district are reviewed using the guidelines for new construction as well as guidelines for restoration and rehabilitation. Proposals for moving structures within the district are reviewed using guidelines for all of the above.

pp. 10-11: Wood Siding and Shingles

1. Repair. Wooden siding should be maintained with paint or stain. Deteriorated wooden siding should be replaced with new material resembling the original in width, thickness and profile, and texture. New siding should be identical to or compatible with the original. Siding should be installed horizontally except in those instances where vertical or diagonal siding was used on the original exterior. Appropriate corner boards, frieze boards, and drip caps and other features should be included with replacement siding.

2. Vinyl and Aluminum Siding; other Manufactured Products. Buildings originally clad in wooden siding should not be re-surfaced with brick, stucco, artificial stone or brick veneer, hardboard, or vinyl or aluminum siding. The Commission may consider the following exceptions to the installation of vinyl, metal, or hardboard siding on a case-by-case basis:

A. In cases where existing asphalt, asbestos, aluminum or vinyl siding is to be removed and where the underlying original siding and decorative features are found to be significantly deteriorated. Commission staff must conduct a site visit during the removal process and advise on appropriate treatment.

B. In the resurfacing of non-contributing buildings constructed after 1930.

C. In the resurfacing of existing or the construction of new garages, particularly when the garage is inconspicuously sited.

If vinyl, metal, or hardboard siding is used as described in A-C, it must be of a width appropriate to the style of the building, and all architectural details including window trim, wood cornices, and ornament must remain uncovered. Replacement siding may cover only one layer of existing siding. Window, entry and other trim must be built up so that it projects from the wall to the same extent as the original.

p. 12: Masonry Walls and Foundations

1. Repair. Deteriorated brick, stone, mortar, and other materials should be replaced with material used in the original construction or with materials that resemble the appearance of the original as closely as possible. The advice of a skilled mason should be sought for major repair projects.

2. Cleaning. Masonry cleaning should be conducted only to halt deterioration and by means such as low pressure water, soft brushes, and/or appropriate chemical treatment. Sandblasting or abrasive cleaning should not be used under any circumstances.

3. Repointing. Original mortar joint size and profile should be retained and/or reduplicated in repointing. Mortar mixtures should duplicate the original in lime, sand, and cement proportion and should duplicate the original mortar in color, texture, and strength.

4. Stucco Resurfacing. Repairs to stucco surfaces should duplicate the original in color and texture, if evidence exists. Very smooth or heavy-dashed surfaces should be avoided unless they were used on the original surface.

5. Painting. The original color and texture of masonry surfaces should be retained and unpainted stone, brick, and stucco surface should not be painted. The removal of paint from painted masonry surfaces should

only be attempted if unpainted surfaces are historically appropriate and if removal can be accomplished without damage to the masonry.

6. Resurfacing. Artificial stone, brick veneer, or vinyl or aluminum products should not be applied over masonry surfaces.

p. 13: Roofs and Chimneys

1. Roofing Materials. Original roofing materials which contribute to the character of the District such as tile or slate should be maintained and retained unless badly deteriorated. If partial or full re-roofing in tile, slate or asphalt is necessary, replacement roofing should match the old in composition, size, shape, and texture. Dark brown, dark gray, dark green, dark red, and "weathered wood" are among usually acceptable colors. Rolled roofing may be used only on flat or slightly sloped roofs which are not visible from the public way.

2. Alterations to roof shape--Front. The original roof type, slope and overhangs should be preserved. The roof shape at the front should not be altered except to restore it to the original documented appearance or to add architecturally compatible dormers. Documentation includes evidence of the former appearance of the building, or, in the case of pattern book houses, those of similar period and style. The shape of existing dormers should not be altered unless compatible with the original design.

3. Alterations to roof shape--Rear and Sides. Alterations to the roof shape at the sides or rear should be compatible with the architectural character of the building.

4. Skylights. Skylights should not be installed on the front roof plane. They should be flat and as close to the roof plane as possible. Bubble type skylights should not be installed.

5. Chimneys; Rebuilt. If rebuilding is necessary, original brick details such as decorative panels and coffers should be replicated.

6. Chimneys and Stovepipes. New chimneys and stovepipes should not be installed on the front roof plane.

pp. 14-15: Exterior Trim

1. Conservation. Exterior architectural features including finials, cornices, brackets, columns, balustrades and railings, and window and door moldings should be retained.

2. Documentation. Original trim details and other architectural features should be photographed or otherwise recorded before they are removed for repair or replacement. Deteriorated trim which is removed should be saved for use in making duplicates.

3. Repair and Replacement. New material used to repair or replace deteriorated trim or other features should match the original as closely as possible. Deteriorated trim which is unsalvageable should be replaced with trim identical or similar to the identical design. Simplified trim should approximate the old in design and placement.

4. New Trim. Details should not be added in an effort to make the building look older. However, in the case of some "pattern book" houses, the addition of certain trim details such as those typical at the gable and porch may be permitted if supported by photographs or pattern book sources.

p. 16: Porches and Steps

1. Conservation. Porches, steps, and handrails which are appropriate to the building and its development should be conserved and retained.

2. Repair and Replacement. Historic porches, steps, or handrails which require complete rebuilding or replacement should be reconstructed using historical research to determine an appropriate design. Reconstructions should be compatible with the period and style of the building in material, design, and detail. Concrete should not be used to replace wooden porch floors or steps.

3. Railings. The original spacing, section, and approximate profile of balusters should be maintained in replacement or repair. Unless historical evidence indicates, reconstruction should include a bottom rail and balusters should not be nailed directly to the step or deck. Wooden posts and railings should not be replaced with those of metal.

4. Posts and Columns. If replacement is necessary, porch posts and columns should be replaced with units which replicate the original material, size and scale. Turned, stamped, gouged or other elaborate features may be simplified if necessary. Wooden posts should not be replaced with metal posts or supports.

5. Enclosure. Unenclosed front porches should not be permanently enclosed.

6. Decks. Decks should be constructed only at the rear of the building or where most inconspicuous. Railings, steps, and other deck features and details should be compatible with the architectural character of the district.

7. Firestairs. The detailing of firestairs should be compatible with the period and style of the building. Firestairs should be located as inconspicuously as possible.

p. 18: Windows

1. Size and Shape. Existing windows and door openings should be retained. Window openings should not be enlarged or reduced to fit new units. New window openings should not be introduced into principal elevations.

2. Sash. The size and number of panes of glass in each sash should not be altered. New sash, if installed, should duplicate the existing or other appropriate models. Crank-out or sliding units are not appropriate replacements for single or double-hung sash.

3. Trim. Historic window casings or surrounds should be retained wherever possible; if replacement is necessary the original profile should be replicated.

4. Storm Windows. If combination metal storms are installed, they should have a baked enamel finish. Storm windows should not have vertical or horizontal divisions which conflict with the divisions of the sash.

5. Shutters and Blinds. Shutters and blinds should not be installed on buildings not originally designed for them. Where appropriate, shutters should appear to be operable and should be mounted to the window casing. Shutters should be constructed of wood.

6. Security Measures. Historic trim or other architectural features should not be removed for the installation of security bars or grills.

p. 19: Entries

1. Size and Shape. Entry openings should not be enlarged or reduced to fit a new door. New entry openings should not be introduced into principal elevations.

2. Trim. Original or historic features of the entry, including hoods, columns, sidelights and transoms should be retained. If replacement is necessary, trim details should be replicated.

3. Doors. Wherever possible, historic paneled doors (and hardware) should be repaired and weatherstripped rather than replaced. If replacement of original or historic doors is necessary, the replacement should duplicate or be compatible with the material, design, and hardware of the older door. Steel-covered, hollow-core doors should not be installed unless compatible with the appearance of the building. Historic trim should not be removed from the entry for the installation of steel doors.

4. Storm and Screen Doors. Storm doors should be compatible with the inner door shape and style. Simple designs are preferable to "ranch style" designs.

5. Sliding Glass Doors. Sliding glass doors should be confined to the rear of the building where not visible from the public way.

6. Security Measure. Historic trim or other architectural features should not be removed for the installation of security bars or grills.

pp. 20-21: ADDITIONS AND NEW CONSTRUCTION

Principal Buildings:

1. Massing and scale. New construction should conform to the massing, volume, height, facade proportions and scale of surrounding structures. The gross volume of any new structure should be visually compatible with the buildings and elements within the surrounding area. New dwellings and commercial buildings should be compatible with the height of existing adjacent buildings.

2. Materials and Details. Materials and details should relate to those of existing nearby buildings. Wood or masonry construction is typical for existing residential building in the district, while masonry is typical of commercial building. These materials are preferable to vinyl, metal, or hardboard siding. Imitative materials such as artificial stone or brick veneer should not be used. Materials will be reviewed to determine their appropriate use in relation to the overall design of the structure. The use of vinyl, metal, or hardboard siding will be considered by the Commission on a case-by-case basis. These materials may be permissible in new construction of principal buildings if appropriately detailed.

Building Elements:

1. Roofs. The gable and the hip roof are the primary historic roof forms in the District, with many variations and combinations. In new construction, the skyline or roof profile should relate to the predominant roof shape of nearby buildings. Highly visible secondary structure roofs should match the roof pitch of the main structure.

Roofing materials used on new buildings should be appropriate to the design of the building and the visibility of the roof.

Roof hardware such as skylights, vents, and metal pipe chimneys should not be placed on the front roof plane.

2. Windows and Entries. Vertically-oriented, single or double-hung sash are the predominant historic window type in the District. The proportion, size, rhythm and detailing of windows and entries should be compatible with that of existing nearby buildings. The rhythm of solids to voids created by openings in the facade of the new structure should be visually compatible with surrounding structures.

3. Porches and Decks. The front entry should be articulated with a design element such as a porch, portico, or landing which provides a transitional zone between the semi-public and public exterior zones and the private interior zone. This design element should be appropriately detailed and compatible with the size and scale of the building.

Decks should be constructed at the rear of the building and should be integrated into the overall design.

Decks should be appropriately detailed and should not be raised in a manner which makes them conspicuous.

Accessory Buildings:

Garages and other accessory buildings should be compatible with the overall design and materials of the existing buildings on the lot. New garages should be located off rear alleys wherever possible. Garages should not be attached to the front of the building and should only be attached if not visible from the public way.

p. 22: Site Considerations in New Construction:

1. Setback and Siting. The setback of new buildings in most residential and commercial areas should be compatible with the setback of existing adjacent areas.

2. Parking. Residential parking areas should be confined to the rear of existing or new buildings. Parking spaces should be screened from view from the public street by landscaping such as hedges, grade changes, or low fences.

3. Fences. Fences which allow some visual penetration of front yard space are preferable to complete enclosure. Fences of wrought iron or wood which enclose the front yard should be no higher than 3-1/2 feet. Cyclone fences should not be used to enclose front yards or the front half of side yards.

4. Retaining walls. Stone, brick, and split-face concrete block are preferable to landscape timber for the construction of retaining walls. Masonry retaining walls should be finished with caps or other appropriate details.

5. Public Improvements. New street and landscape improvements, lighting, street furniture, and signs should be compatible with the character of the historic district. The historic urban pattern of grid-plan streets should be retained and enhanced in improvement projects.

6. Signs. Sign materials and design should complement the materials and design of the building and adjacent buildings.

7. Views and Vistas. New buildings or other structures should not block key views and vistas of the river valley and the downtown skyline.

p. 23: Storefront Rehabilitation and Restoration:

1. Conservation. The original appearance of commercial buildings and storefronts should be conserved. Decorative features such as columns or brackets should be retained in repair or renovation projects. Storefronts should not obscure the basic architectural framework of the buildings which they occupy. Storefront designs should not reproduce styles of a period earlier than the building they occupy.

2. Masonry. Masonry and other original surfaces should be conserved. Brick should not be covered with stucco, shakes, or other veneer.

3. Windows. Windows should not be filled in with wood, brick, or any other material. Window sizes and shapes should be maintained if removal of original units is necessary.

4. Roofs and Parapets. The original roof-line including cornice, parapet, and other elements should be maintained.

5. Signs. Signs should be compatible with the character of the building and surrounding area. They should be appropriately sized and complement the building exterior; roof-top signs are inappropriate. Signs should not conceal architectural details or features. Materials should be compatible with the materials of the building to which they are attached. No part of the historic facade should be irreversibly damaged or altered in the installation of the sign.

6. Awnings. Awnings should be sized to fit the windows and storefront(s) behind them.

Fences (this and the next section appear in guidelines booklet but are not found, at least in same place, in Chapter 74):

1. Repair and Conservation. Existing historic fences or metal or wood should be repaired and conserved whenever possible. Repairs should be compatible with the original materials and design of the fence.

2. New Fences: General Character. New fences should be compatible with the architectural character, materials, and scale of the building and the surrounding streetscape.

3. Materials. Fences enclosing the front yard should be semi-transparent. Appropriate materials include wrought iron and painted wooden pickets. Complete enclosure by opaque fences is not appropriate.

4. Cyclone Fences. Cyclone fence should not be installed in front yards or in the front half of side yards.

Retaining Walls and Steps:

1. Repair and Conservation. Existing historic walls (and stairs, where applicable) of fieldstone, limestone, brick, or stucco should be repaired and conserved. Repairs should be compatible with adjoining masonry.

2. New Walls: General Character. New walls should be compatible with the architectural character and scale of the building and surrounding streetscape, including adjacent historic walls.

3. Materials. Limestone, brick, and split face concrete block are appropriate materials for the construction of new retaining walls. Concrete block should be of natural color. Landscape timber and concrete block with a round (striated) profile are not appropriate

Historic Hill District Guidelines (partial):

I. These guidelines are intended to be flexible as well as clear. When applying the guidelines, for example, the Commission will consider the particular merit of the building or area under review. It will also consider such factors as the expense and availability of historic materials and the economic impact of its decisions on property owners. The Commission will be considerate of clearly defined cases of economic hardship or deprivation of the owner of reasonable use of the property.

II. Restoration and Rehabilitation

A. General Principles:

The Historic Hill District design guidelines for restoration and rehabilitation are based on the ten standards for rehabilitation developed by the National Park Service, United States Department of the Interior. These standards are published in a 59-page pamphlet entitled The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings (Revised 1983), available for $2.00 for the Superintendent of Documents, U.S. Government Printing Office, Washington, D.C. 20402 (GPO stock number 024-005-01003-3). In addition to the standards themselves, the pamphlet contains examples of recommended approaches to rehabilitation. All projects that owners wish to be certified for purposes of Federal historic rehabilitation tax incentives are reviewed and evaluated by the State Historic Preservation Office for conformance with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation. The ten standards are as follows:

1. Every reasonable effort shall be made to provide a compatible use for a property which requires minimal alteration of the building, structure, or site and its environment, or to use a property for its originally intended purpose.

2. The distinguishing original qualities or character of a building, structure, or site and its environment shall not be destroyed. The removal or alteration of any historic material or distinctive architectural features should be avoided when possible.

3. All buildings, structures, and sites shall be recognized as products of their own time. Alterations that have no historical basis and which seek to create an earlier appearance shall be discouraged.

4. Changes which may have taken place in the course of time are evidence of the history and development of a building, structure, or site and its environment. Theses changes may have acquired significance in their own right, and this significance shall be recognized and respected.

5. Distinctive stylistic features or examples of skilled craftsmanship which characterize a building, structure, or site shall be treated with sensitivity.

6. Deteriorated architectural features shall be repaired rather than replaced, whenever possible. In the event replacement is necessary, the new material should match the material being replaced in composition, design, color, texture, and other visual qualities. Repair or replacement of missing architectural features should be based on accurate duplications of features, substantiated by historic, physical, or pictorial evidence rather than on conjectural designs or the availability of different architectural elements from other buildings or structures.

7. The surface cleaning of structures shall be undertaken with the gentlest means possible. Sandblasting and other cleaning methods that will damage the historic building materials shall not be undertaken.

8. Every reasonable effort shall be made to protect and preserve archaeological resources affected by, or adjacent to any project.

9. Contemporary design for alterations and additions to existing properties shall not be discouraged when such alterations and additions do not destroy significant historical, architectural or cultural material, and such design is compatible with the size, scale, color, material, and character of the property, neighborhood, or environment.

10. Wherever possible, new additions or alterations to structures shall be done in such a manner that if such alterations were to be removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the structure would be unimpaired.

B. Masonry and Foundation: Whenever possible, original masonry and mortar should be retained without the application of any surface treatment. Masonry should be cleaned only when necessary to halt deterioration and always with the gentlest method possible, such as low pressure water and soft natural bristle brushes. Brick and stone surfaces should not be sandblasted because it erodes the surface of the material and accelerates deterioration. Chemical cleaning products which could have an adverse chemical reaction with the masonry material should not be used.

Original mortar joint size and profile should be retained, and replacement mortar should match the original mortar in color and texture. Material and ingredient proportions similar to the original mortar should be used when repointing, with replacement mortar softer than the masonry units and no harder than the historic mortar. This will create a bond similar to the original and is necessary to prevent damage to the masonry units. Repointing with mortar of high portland cement content often creates a bond stronger than is appropriate for the original building materials, possibly resulting in cracking or other damage. Mortar joints should be carefully washed after set-up to retain the neatness of the joint lines and keep extraneous mortar off of masonry surfaces.

The original color and texture of masonry surfaces should be retained. While unpainted masonry surfaces should not be painted, paint should not be indiscriminately removed from masonry surfaces because some brick surfaces were originally meant to be painted.

C. Siding and Surface Treatment: Deteriorated siding materials should be replaced with material used in original construction or with materials that resemble the appearance of the old as closely as possible. Resurfacing frame buildings with new material such as artificial stone, artificial brick veneer, or asbestos and asphalt shingles is inappropriate and should not be done. Four-inch lap vinyl, metal, or hardboard siding may be used in some cases to resurface clapboard structures, especially structures categorized as non-contributive to the district, if well detailed, well designed and in keeping with the historic character of the structure. Ventilation must be carefully provided when using these products to prevent damage to the original wood fabric by trapping moisture. The width, pattern and profile of the original siding should be duplicated. Residing should not alter the profile of bordering trim such as drip caps, frieze boards and corner boards; if replacement is necessary, they should be matched.

Color is a significant design element, and paint colors should be appropriate to the period and style of the structure. Building permits are not required for painting, and although the Historic Preservation Commission may review and comment on paint color, paint color is not subject to Heritage Preservation Commission approval.

D. Roofs: Original roofing materials should be retained unless deteriorated. When partially reroofing, deteriorated roof coverings should be replaced with new materials that match the old in composition, size, shape and texture. When entirely reroofing, new materials which differ to such an extent from the old in composition, size, shape, color or texture that the appearance of the building is altered should not be used.

Wood shingles in the nineteenth century were often dipped in creosote to preserve them, giving them a very dark brown color. Victorians often stained wood shingles deep red or dark green to complement rather than match the color of the house. When asphalt shingles began to be used in the 1890's, the most common colors were solid, uniform, deep red and solid, uniform, dark green. A weathered-wood color may be acceptable for new asphalt shingles because it is neutral and blends in. Black may be acceptable for Colonial Revival houses built after the 1920's, but it should be avoided for Victorian houses.

The original roof type, slope, and overhangs should be preserved. New dormers may be acceptable in some cases if compatible with the original design. Modern skylights are a simple way to alter a roof to admit light and air without disrupting its plane surface, are less noticeable than dormers, and may also be acceptable. Skylights should be flat and as close to the roof plane as possible. They should not be placed on the front roof plane.

E. Windows and Doors: Existing window and door openings should be retained. New window and door openings should not be introduced into principal elevations. Enlarging or reducing window or door openings to fit stock window sash or new stock door sizes should not be done. The size of window panes or sash should not be altered. Such changes destroy the scale and proportion of the building.

Window sash, glass, lintels, sills, architraves, doors, pediments, hoods, steps and all hardware should be retained. Discarding original doors and door hardware, when they can be repaired and reused in place, should be avoided.

The stylistic period(s) a building represents should be respected. If replacement of window sash or doors is necessary, the replacement should duplicate the material, design and hardware of the older window sash or door. Inappropriate new window and door features such as aluminum storm and screen window combinations, plastic or metal strip awnings, or fake shutters that disturb the character and appearance of the building should not be used. Combination storm windows should have wood frames or be painted to match trim colors.

F. Porches and Exterior Architectural Features: Porches and steps which are appropriate to the building and its development should be retained. Porches and additions reflecting later styles of architecture are often important to the building's historical integrity and, whenever possible, should be retained. Porches and steps removed from the building should be reconstructed, using photographic documentation and historical research, to be compatible in design and detail with the period and style of the building. In replacing porch railings, it is important to maintain the original spacing, section and profile of the balustrades.

Decorative architectural features such as cornices, brackets, railings, and those around front doors and windows should be preserved. New material used to repair or replace, where necessary, deteriorated architectural features of wood, iron, cast iron, terra-cotta, tile and brick should match the original as closely as possible.

Shutters should not be used on buildings not designed for them. If used, they should be large enough to cover the entire window area, should be functional and operable, and should not look as if they were simply flat-mounted on the wall.

Deck and fire stair additions may be acceptable in some cases, but should be kept to the rear of buildings where they will be the most inconspicuous and detract the least from the historical context. The detailing of decks and exterior stairs should be compatible with the period and style of the building.

III. New Construction

A. General Principles: The basic principle for new construction in the Historic Hill District is to maintain the district's scale and quality of design. The Historic Hill District is architecturally diverse within an overall pattern of harmony and continuity. These guidelines for new construction focus on general rather than specific design elements in order to encourage architectural innovation and quality design while maintaining the harmony and continuity of the district. New construction should be compatible with the size, scale, massing, height, rhythm, setback, color, material, building elements, site design, and character of surrounding structures and the area.

B. Massing and Height: New construction should conform to the massing, volume, height and scale of existing adjacent structures. Typical residential structures in the Historic Hill District are 25 to 40 feet high. The height of new construction should be no lower than the average height of all buildings on both block faces; measurements should be made from street level to the highest point of the roofs. (This guideline does not supersede the City's Zoning Code height limitations.)

C. Rhythm and Directional Emphasis: The existence of uniform narrow lots in the Historic Hill naturally sets up a strong rhythm of buildings to open space. Historically any structure built on more than one lot used vertical facade elements to maintain and vary the overall rhythm of the street rather than interrupting the rhythm with a long monotonous facade. The directional expression of new construction should relate to that of existing adjacent structures.

D. Materials and Details: Variety in the use of architectural materials and details adds to the intimacy and visual delight of the district. But there is also an overall thread of continuity provided by the range of materials commonly used by turn-of-the-century builders and by the way these materials were used. This thread of continuity is threatened by the introduction of new industrial materials and the aggressive exposure of earlier materials such as concrete block, metal framing, and glass. The purpose of this section is to encourage the proper use of appropriate materials and details.

The materials and details of new construction should relate to the materials and details of existing nearby buildings.

Preferred roof materials are cedar shingles, slate and tile; asphalt shingles which match the approximate color and texture of the preferred materials are acceptable substitutes. Imitative materials such as asphalt siding, wood-textured metal or vinyl siding, artificial stone, and artificial brick veneer should not be used. Smooth four-inch lap vinyl, metal, or hardboard siding, when well installed and carefully detailed, may be acceptable in some cases. Materials, including their colors, will be reviewed to determine their appropriate use in relation to the overall design of the structure as well as to surrounding structures.

Color is a significant design element, and paint colors should relate to surrounding structures and the area as well as to the style of the new structure. Building permits are not required for painting and, although the Heritage Preservation Commission may review and comment on paint color, paint color is not subject to Heritage Preservation Commission approval.

E. Building Elements: Individual elements of a building should be integrated into its composition for a balanced and complete design. These elements for new construction should compliment existing adjacent structures as well.

1. Roofs. There is a great variety of roof treatment in the Historic Hill District, but gable and hip roofs are most common. The skyline or profile of new construction should relate to the predominant roof shape of existing adjacent buildings.

Most houses in the Historic Hill District have a roof pitch of between 9:12 and 12:12 (rise-to-run ratio). Highly visible secondary structure roofs should match the roof pitch of the main structure, and generally should have a rise-to-run ratio of at least 9:12. A roof pitch of at least 8:12 should be used if it is somewhat visible from the street, and a 6:12 pitch may be acceptable in some cases for structures which are not visible from the street.

Roof hardware such as skylights, vents, and metal pipe chimneys should not be placed on the front roof plane.

2. Windows and Doors. The proportion, size, rhythm and detailing of windows and doors in new construction should be compatible with that of existing adjacent buildings. Most windows on the Hill have a vertical orientation, with a proportion of between 2:1 and 3:1 (height to width) common. Individual windows can sometimes be square or horizontal if the rest of the building conveys the appropriate directional emphasis. Facade openings of the same general size as those in adjacent buildings are encouraged.

Wooden double-hung windows are traditional in the Historic Hill District and should be the first choice when selecting new windows. Paired casement windows, although not historically common, will often prove acceptable because of their vertical orientation. Sliding windows, awning windows, and horizontally oriented muntins are not common in the district and are generally unacceptable. Vertical muntins and muntin grids may be acceptable when compatible with the period and style of the building. Sliding glass doors should not be used where they would be visible from the street.

Although not usually improving the appearance of a building, the use of metal windows or doors need not necessarily ruin it. The important thing is that they should look like part of the building and not like raw metal appliances. Appropriately colored or bronze-toned aluminum is acceptable. Mill finish (sliver) aluminum should be avoided.

3. Porches and Decks: In general, houses in the Historic Hill District have roofed front porches, while in most modern construction the front porch has disappeared. Front porches provide a transitional zone between open and closed space which unites a building and its site, semiprivate spaces which help to define the spatial hierarchy of the district. They are a consistent visual element in the district and often introduce rhythmic variation, clarify scale or provide vertical facade elements. The porch treatment of new structures should relate to the porch treatment of existing adjacent structures. If a porch is not built, the transition from private to public space should be articulated with some other suitable design element.

Open porches are preferable, but screened or glassed-in porches may be acceptable if well detailed. Most, but not all, porches on the Hill are one story high. Along some streets where a strong continuity of porch size or porch roof line exists, it may be preferable to duplicate these formal elements in new construction. The vertical elements supporting the porch roof are important. They should carry the visual as well as the actual weight of the porch roof. The spacing of new balustrades should reflect the solid-to-void relationships of adjacent railings and porches. Generally, a solid-to-void proportion between 1:2 and 1:3 is common in the Historic Hill.

Decks should be kept to the rear of buildings, should be visually refined, and should be integrated into overall building design. A raised deck protruding from a single wall usually appears disjointed from the total design and is generally unacceptable.

F. Site

1. Setback. New buildings should be sited at a distance not more than 5% out-of-line from the setback of existing adjacent buildings. Setbacks greater than those of adjacent buildings may be allowed in some cases. Reduced setbacks may be acceptable at corners. This happens quite often in the Historic Hill area and can lend delightful variation to the street.

2. Landscaping. Typically, open space in the Historic Hill District is divided into public, semipublic, semiprivate and private space. The public space of the street and sidewalk is often distinguished from the semipublic space of the front yard by a change in grade, a low hedge or a visually open fence.

The buildings, landscaping elements in front yards, and boulevard trees together provide a "wall of enclosure" for the street "room". Generally, landscaping which respects the street as a public room is encouraged. Enclosures which allow visual penetration of semipublic spaces, such as wrought-iron fences, painted picket fences, low hedges or limestone retaining walls, are characteristic of most of the Historic Hill area. This approach to landscaping and fences is encouraged in contrast to complete enclosure of semipublic space by an opaque fence, a tall "weathered wood" fence or tall hedge rows. Cyclone fence should not be used in front yards or in the front half of side yards. Landscape timber should not be used for retaining walls in front yards.

For the intimate space of a shallow setback, ground covers and low shrubs will provide more visual interest and require less maintenance than grass. When lots are left vacant, as green space or parking area, a visual hole in the street "wall" may result. Landscape treatment can eliminate this potential problem by providing a wall of enclosure from the street. Boulevard trees mark a separation between the automobile corridor and the rest of the streetscape, and should be maintained.

3. Garages and Parking. If an alley is adjacent to the dwelling, any new garage should be located off the alley. Where alleys do not exist, garages facing the street or driveway curb cuts may be acceptable. Garage doors should not face the street. If this is found necessary, single garage doors should be used to avoid the horizontal orientation of two-car garage doors.

Parking spaces should not be located in front yards. Residential parking spaces should be located in rear yards. Parking lots for commercial uses should be to the side or rear of commercial structures and have a

minimum number of curb cuts. All parking spaces should be adequately screened from the street and sidewalk by landscaping. The scale of parking lots should be minimized and the visual sweep of pavement should be broken up by use of planted areas. The scale, level of light output, and design of parking lot lighting should be compatible with the character of the district.

G. Public Infrastructure

The traditional pattern of public streets, curbs, boulevards, and sidewalks in the area should be maintained. Distinctive features of public spaces in the area, such as brick alleys, stone slab sidewalks, granite curbs, and the early twentieth century lantern style street lights, should be preserved. The same style should be used when new street lights are installed. New street furniture such as benches, bus shelters, telephone booths, kiosks, sign standards, trash containers, planters and fences should be compatible with the character of the district.

Brick alleys and stone slab sidewalks generally should be maintained and repaired as necessary with original materials; asphalt and concrete patches should not be used. When concrete tile public sidewalks need to be replaced, new poured concrete sidewalks should be the same width as the exiting sidewalks and should be scored in a 2 foot square or 18 inch square pattern to resemble the old tiles; expansion joints should match the scoring. Handicap ramps should be installed on the inside of curbs as part of the poured concrete sidewalk; where there is granite curbing, a section should be lowered for the ramp.

Electric, telephone and cable TV lines should be placed underground or along alleys, and meters should be placed where inconspicuous.

H. Storefronts

Turn-of-the-century commercial buildings in the Hill District tend to follow the strict design order of the brick box with an open first floor storefront supporting an upper facade with a band of uniformly sized windows and a decorative cornice. Because commercial buildings are composed of similar parts, commercial blocks have a coherent, harmonious appearance. The traditional storefront is made up almost entirely of windows. This large glass area creates a visual openness that is part of the overall proportional system of the facade. Storefronts should be predominantly glass with the upper facades of commercial buildings being predominantly solid. Materials and design elements such as mansard roofs with wooden shingles, rough textured wood siding, artificial brick veneer, and aggregate material of stone and gravel are inappropriate and should not be used.

I. Signs

Generally, signs should be compatible with the character of the District and blend with the character of the structures on or near which they are placed. Signs should not conceal architectural detail, clutter the building's image, or distract from the unity of the facade, but rather should complement the materials of the related building and/or adjacent buildings. Surface design elements should not detract from or conflict with the related structure's age and design. No facade should be damaged in the application of signs, except for mere attachment.

IV. Moving of Structures

Proposals for moving structures out of the Historic Hill District are reviewed using the guidelines for demolition. Proposals for moving structures onto property located within the district are reviewed using the guidelines for new construction as well as guidelines for restoration and rehabilitation. Proposals for moving structures within the district are reviewed using guidelines for all of the above.

V. Demolition

When reviewing proposals for demolition of structures within the district, the Heritage Preservation Commission refers to Section 73.06 (i)(2) of the Saint Paul Legislative Code which states the following:

In the case of the proposed demolition of a building, prior to approval of said demolition, the commission shall make written findings on the following: the architectural and historical merit of the building, the effect of the demolition on surrounding buildings, the effect of any proposed new construction on the remainder of the building (in case of partial demolition) and on surrounding buildings, and the economic value or usefulness of the building as it now exists or if altered or modified in comparison with the value or usefulness of any proposed structures designated to replace the present building or buildings.

Irvine Park District Guidelines:

The following guidelines for design review will serve as the basis for the Heritage Preservation Commission's permit review decisions in the Irvine Park Heritage Preservation District. The guidelines define the most important elements of the Irvine Park district's unique physical appearance and state the best means of preserving and enhancing these elements in rehabilitation or new construction. These guidelines are not hard and fast regulations. They are flexible criteria. Their purpose is to provide assurance to property owners that permit review will be based on clear standards rather than the taste of individual Commission members. The guidelines will be interpreted with flexibility depending on the particular merit of the building or area under review. Consideration will be given to the unavailability of historical materials. When applying

the guidelines, the Commission will also be considerate of clearly defined cases of economic hardship or deprivation of the owner of reasonable use of his/her property.

A. Demolition

The Heritage Preservation Commission will follow the guidelines stated in the Heritage Preservation Ordinance (#16006), Section 6 (1)(2), when reviewing permit applications for demolition:

"In the case of proposed demolition of a building, prior to approval of said demolition, the Commission shall make written findings on the following: architectural and historical merit of building, the effect on surrounding buildings, the effect of any new proposed construction on the remainder of the building (in case of partial demolition), and on surrounding buildings, the economic value or usefulness of building as it now exists, or if altered or modified in comparison with the value of usefulness of any proposed structures designated to replace the present building or buildings."

B. House Moving

In evaluating proposals for moving of structures the following guidelines shall be used throughout the district:

I. Permits for moving a structure off property located within the Irvine Park district will be reviewed, using the guidelines for demolition.

II. Structures being moved into the Irvine Park district or structures whose relocation within the Irvine Park district has been approved (see Demolition), should be selected and sited in conformity with section C (below) and rehabilitated in accordance with section D (below). Special attention should be paid to the historical significance, architectural style and character or buildings moved into the district.

C. New Construction

New construction refers to totally new structures, moved-in structures, and new additions to existing structures undergoing restoration and rehabilitation. The Irvine Park Historic District is characterized by architecturally diverse structures oriented toward a common green space, the park. This diversity of styles within the district - Greek Revival, Neo-Classical, Italianate, Victorian Gothic and Queen Anne - illustrates the evolution of American architectural styles, tastes, and construction methods from 1850 to 1910. Though stylistically diverse, Irvine Park architecture demonstrates similar organization of massing, rhythm, materials, and building elements, which together express a harmony and continuity in the streetscape. New construction should incorporate the general massing, rhythm, materials and building elements of historic Irvine Park structures, and should be sensitive to the architectural styles evidenced in the Park.

In the evaluating proposals for new construction, the following guidelines shall be used throughout the District.

I Massing

New construction should conform to the massing of existing adjacent structures, respecting the height, volume, and scale of the neighborhood. Most district buildings are two or three stories high, three or four bays wide, and 20 to 40 feet high. The buildings around the park itself are examples of the extremes in massing - from the rambling, low-hipped roof Humphrey Willis house at 240 Ryan, to the solid, turreted peak of its neighbor, the Justus Ohage House at 59 Irvine Park. The height of new construction should be no lower than the average height of all buildings surrounding the park; measurements should be made from street level to the highest point of the roof.

II Rhythm

Rhythm on Irvine Park streets is created in several ways - uneven space between buildings, and average two and one-half stories height, the juxtaposition of jagged and subdued rooflines, a continuity of projections and porches, and a dominant vertical direction emphasized by the superposition of vertically oriented windows and doors. Because there are a variety of built forms in Irvine Park, flexibility as well as compatibility is possible, but the rhythm of new construction should be typical of the varying existing adjacent structures to maintain the overall rhythm of the street.

III Materials and Details

While most Irvine Park structures are wood-framed and clapboarded, variety in the use of architectural materials and details adds to the intimacy and visual delight of the district. When first confronted with this variety, it is easy to overlook the continuity provided by these 19th century building materials. This continuity is threatened by the availability of inappropriate materials and building parts in today's expanded marketplace. The purpose of this section is to encourage the proper use of appropriate materials and details. New construction materials and details should relate to materials and details of adjacent buildings. Materials imitating other materials are generally unacceptable.

Roofs of slate, cedar shakes and standing seam metal are preferred, but materials which match their approximate color and texture are acceptable substitutes.

Siding running diagonally is unacceptable. Imitative materials such as asphalt siding, wood-textured metal siding or artificial stone should not be used. Wooden four-inch or six-inch clapboard is preferred as a siding material.

Foundations, when exposed, should simulate the rock-faced limestone, brick or stone veneer in a running bond patter characteristic of the area. Concrete block foundations should be pigmented and rock-faced above grade, and may be smooth-faced only when underground.

IV. Building Elements

Individual elements of a building should be integrated into its composition for a balanced and complete design. The individual elements of new construction should complement existing neighboring structures.

a) Roofs and Chimneys

Gable, hipped and mansard roofs are the most common forms in Irvine park. These forms are used with great variety, offering several options for new construction roof profiles. Chimneys should be proportionate to the overall structural massing. For example, a building several stories high with a vertical emphasis and peaked roofline should display a tall, thin chimney, while a smaller, more rectangular structure should have a shorter, squarer chimney. Brick as a chimney material is encouraged, as are characteristic corbelling and horizontal bands. New roof and chimney designs should be compatible with existing adjacent structures.

b) Windows and Doors

The proportion, size, and detailing of windows and doors in new construction should relate to the facade opening of existing adjacent buildings.

Most windows in the district have vertical orientation, with a common proportion of between 2:1 and 3:1 (heigh to width). Wooden double-hung windows are traditional in the district, and are preferred for new construction. Window mullions should emphasize their vertical direction. Paned casement windows, although not common historically, will often be acceptable because of their vertical orientation. Horizontal sliding windows or awning windows are not common in the district, and because of their horizontal proportion, would usually be undesirable. Doors flanked by sidelights or pilasters and capped by fanlights or transoms are common in the district and desirable.

c) Porches

Many houses in Irvine Park have roofed front porches, while in most modern construction the front porch has disappeared. These porches are a consistent visual element in the district and often clarify rhythm and scale or provide vertical facade elements. The porch treatment of new structures should relate to the porch treatment of existing adjacent structures. It is preferred that porches be left open, but screened or glassed-in porches may be acceptable if well detailed. Most, but not all, porches in the Park district are one story high. Along some streets, where a strong continuity of porch size or porch roofline exists, it may be preferable to duplicate these formal elements in new construction. The vertical elements supporting the porch roof are important. They should look substantial enough to actually support the weight of the porch roof. If a porch is not built, the transition from private to public space should be articulated with some other suitable design element.

V. Site

Typically, open space in the park is divided into public, semi-public, and private space; that is, streets and sidewalks, front lawns, homes and backyards. The guidelines are concerned with private space only when it is visible from the street. Setback, site landscape, and ancillary buildings should be integrated with the total park environment.

a) Setback

Due to varying lot sizes, orientation, and type and date of construction, setbacks in the Irvine Park District vary considerably. Generally, new construction setback should be within 10% in line with existing adjacent buildings. However, reduced or extended setback can lend a delightful variation to the park, and will be considered on a case-by-case basis.

b) Landscaping

A central green is the outstanding asset of Irvine Park. Landscaping should respect the open feeling of the park, treating the park and street as a "public room." The public space of the street and sidewalk is often distinguished from the semi-public space of the front yard by a change in grade, a low hedge, or a visually open fence. The buildings and landscaping elements in front yards provide a "wall of enclosure" fro the street "room." Enclosures, though uncommon and generally not preferred in the district, should allow visual penetration of semi-public areas, through wrought-iron fences, low hedges, or limestone retaining walls. Cyclone fences, through visually transparent, may not be used because they violate the historic character of the District, both in their design and use of materials. This approach contrasts with complete enclosure by undesirable opaque fences, and all "weathered wood" fences or tall hedge rows.

c) Garages and Parking

New construction of garages should be similar to the overall design and materials of the building they accompany. If an alley is adjacent to the dwelling, a new garage should be located off this alley. Where alleys do not exist, one-lane drive ways curb-cuts may be acceptable. Garages should be located at the rear of the lot. Garage doors should not face the street. If this is necessary, single garage doors should be used to avoid the long horizontal proportions of double doors. Parking spaces should be adequately screened from the street and sidewalk by landscaping. Henceforth, there shall be no curb cuts on he street surrounding Irvine Park. Other ancillary buildings will not be permitted unless specifically approved.

D. Restoration and Rehabilitation

General Principles:

1. All work should be of a character and quality that maintains the distinguishing features of the building and the environment. The removal of architectural features is not permitted.

2. Deteriorated architectural features should be repaired rather than replaced whenever possible. In the event of replacement, new materials should match the original in composition, design, color, texture and appearance. Duplication of original design based on physical or pictorial evidence is preferable to using conjectural or 'period' designs or using parts of other buildings.

3. Distinctive stylistic features or examples of skilled craftsmanship characteristic of structures of a period should be treated sensitively. Furthermore, if changes in use of a building are contemplated, they should be accomplished with minimum alteration to the structure and fabric.

4. In general, it is expected that buildings will be restored to their original appearance. However, alterations to buildings are sometimes significant because they reflect the history of the building and neighborhood. This significance should be respected, and restoration to and "original" appearance may not always be desirable. All buildings should be recognized as products of their own time and not be altered to resemble buildings from another era.

In evaluating proposals for restoration or rehabilitation, the following guidelines shall be used throughout the district:

I Masonry and Foundation

Original masonry and mortar should be retained whenever possible without the application of any surface treatment. A similar material should be used to repair or replace, where necessary, deteriorated masonry. New masonry added to the structure or site, such as new foundations or retaining walls, should be compatible with the color, texture and bonding of original or existing masonry.

Masonry should be cleaned only when necessary to halt deterioration and always with the gentlest method possible, such as low pressure water and soft natural bristle brushes. Brick and stone surfaces should not be sandblasted. This method of cleaning erodes the hard surface of the material and accelerates deterioration. Chemical cleaning products which could have an adverse chemical reaction with the masonry material should not be used.

When repointing, it is important to use the same materials as the existing mortar. This includes matching the color, texture, and ingredient ratio of the original mortar mix, creating a bond similar to the original. Repointing with Portland cement mortar may create a bond stronger than is appropriate for the building materials, possibly resulting in cracking or other damage. The original mortar joint size and profile should also be retained.

The original or early color and texture of masonry surfaces should be retained. Paint should not be indiscriminately removed from masonry surface as some brick surfaces were originally meant to be painted.

II Siding and Surface Treatment

Deteriorated siding material should be replaced with material used in original construction or with materials that resemble the appearance of the old as closely as possible, spacing horizontal lines, or laps, to match the original. Resurfacing frame buildings with new material such as artificial stone, artificial brick veneer, or asbestos and asphalt shingles, is inappropriate.

III Roofs

The original roof shape should be preserved. Original roofing materials should be retained unless deteriorated. Wood shingled roofs should be restored either with the original type or a modern brand as approved. Slate roofs may substitute an asbestos product of similar appearance. Metal roofs may be restored with standing seam metal roofing.

When partially reroofing, deteriorated roof coverings should be replaced with new materials that match the old in composition, size, shape, color and texture. When entirely reroofing, new materials which differ to such an extent from the original in composition, size, shape, color or texture that the appearance of the building is altered should not be used.

IV Chimneys

Wherever portions of the existing chimneys are still in existence or wherever there are original photographs that clearly indicate the original design, the chimneys should be restored to their original condition. In the absence of any documentation, the chimneys shall be in keeping with chimney design of the period. They should generally be treated in a similar manner with horizontal brick banding, vertical panels and/or corbelled tops. The type of brick construction should also be consistent with the original, and can usually be determined by stripping stucco or examining the chimney in the attic or other part of the house.

V Windows and Doors

Unlike other districts, front, side, and rear elevations in Irvine Park are often visible from several angles. All elevations therefore become important and are read as a public view. New windows and door openings should not be introduced into the principal elevations. Existing window and door openings should be retained. Enlarging or reducing window and door openings by "blocking up" or "blocking down" to fit stock windows sash or new stock door sizes is unacceptable. The size of window panes or sash should not be altered. Such changes destroy the scale and proportion of the building.

The stylistic period or periods a building represents should be respected. Window sash, glass, lintels, sills, architraves, doors, pediments, hoods, steps, and all hardware should be retained, if possible. Discarding original doors and hardware, when they can be repaired and reused in place, should be avoided. If a replacement of window sash or door is necessary, the replacement should duplicate the material, design and hardware of the older window sash and door.

Wooden storm windows custom fabricated to resemble the inner window as closely as possible in shape and appearance are strongly encouraged. Standard mill finish aluminum combination windows will not be allowed.

VI Porches, Steps, Cornices, and Applied Architectural Features

Porches and steps which are appropriate to the building and its development should be retained. Porches and additions reflecting later styles of architecture are often important to the building's historical integrity and, if so, should be retained. Porches, steps and doorways which have been removed should be restored, if possible, through photo documentation and historical research. A similar material should be used to repair or replace, where necessary, deteriorated architectural features of wood, iron, cast iron, terra-cotta, tile and brick. Similar material should be used to replace missing architectural features such as cornices, brackets, railings and shutters, whenever possible.

E. Signs

This section of the Irvine Park District Design Guidelines is intended primarily for the few parts of the District which are commercially zoned. Generally, signs should be compatible with the character of the District, and blend with the character of the structures on or near which they are placed. In evaluating permit applications for signs, the following guidelines will be used:

I. Signs should not conceal architectural detail, clutter the building's image, or distract from the unity of the facade; but rather should complement the overall design.

II. Sign materials should complement the materials of the related building and/or the adjacent buildings. Surface design elements should not detract from or conflict with the related structure's age and design.

III. No facade should be damaged in the application of signs, except for mere attachment.

Lowertown Design Review Guidelines:

I. Introduction

The following guidelines for deign review will serve as the basis for the Heritage Preservation Commission's permit review decisions in the proposed Lowertown Heritage Preservation District. The guidelines define the most important elements of the Lowertown district's unique physical appearance and state the best means of preserving and enhancing these elements in rehabilitation or new construction. These guidelines are not hard and fast regulations. They are flexible criteria.[sic] Their purpose is to provide assurance to property owners that permit review will be based on clear standards rather than the taste of individual commission members. The guidelines will be interpreted with flexibility depending on the particular merit of the building, part of the building, or area under review. When applying the guidelines, the Commission will also be considerate of clearly defined cases of economic hardship or deprivation of the owner of reasonable use of his/her property. Decisions of the Heritage Preservation Commission are subject to appeal to the City Council within ten days by anyone affected by the decision.

II. New Construction

The basic principle for new construction in the Lowertown area is to maintain the scale and character of present buildings. New construction refers to totally new structures, moved-in structures and new additions to existing structures undergoing restoration and rehabilitation.

Architectural diversity is characteristic of Lowertown. When first confronted with this variety, it is easy to overlook the overall thread of continuity of the area. Generally, any structure should provide height, massing, setback, materials and rhythm compatible to surrounding structures. The reproduction of historic

design and details is expensive, artificial, and is recommended only for some cases of infill or small scale construction. Guidelines for new construction focus on general rather than specific design elements in order to encourage architectural innovation.

A. Setback - Siting

There should be no more than a 5% variation in setback from existing adjacent buildings. The proportion of built edge to open space should preserve the plane of the street wall, particularly along the streets facing Mears Park. And the Farmer's Market.

B. Massing, Volume and Height

The buildings of the district built before 1900 are generally small to medium in volume and up to seven stories in height. Sometimes several buildings are grouped. Buildings constructed after 1900 are generally large in volume and up to eight stories in height, with the Burlington Northern Building being 13 stories. The structures of the district are distinguished by their boxy profiles; preservation of this aspect is the most essential element for maintaining district unity. New construction should be compatible with the massing, volume, height, and scale of existing adjacent structures.

C. Rhythm and Directional Emphasis

The rhythm and directional emphasis in Lowertown can be found both in the relation of several buildings to each other, and in the relation of elements on a single building facade.

Rhythm between buildings is usually distinguished by slight variations in height, windows and doors, and details, including vertical and horizontal elements. Rhythm may, as in the case of Park Square Court, be accentuated by slight projections and recessions of the facade, causing the scale of the building to match that of its neighbors. The rhythm and directional emphasis of new construction should be compatible with that of existing adjacent structures.

D. Roofs, Caps, and Cornices

New roof, cap, and cornice designs should be compatible with existing adjacent structures. Generally, roofs in the district are flat. It is more important for roof edges to relate in size and proportion, than in detailing.

E. Materials and Details

The materials of new construction should relate to the materials and details of existing adjacent buildings. New buildings in the district should provide more detailing than typical modern commercial buildings, to respond to the surrounding buildings and to reinforce the human scale of the district. Walls of buildings in the district are generally of brick, or occasionally of stone. Walls are natural brick colors–dark red, yellow, and brown. When walls are painted, similar subdued colors are usually used.

F. Windows and Doors

Windows should relate to those of existing buildings in the district in terms of solid to opening ratio, distribution of window openings, and window setback. The proportion, size, and detailing of windows and doors in new construction should relate to that of existing adjacent buildings. Double-hung windows are traditional in the district, and are preferred for new construction. Window mullions should emphasize their vertical direction. Casement windows and horizontal sliding windows are not historically common, and because they were not usually used in commercial district are not preferred for new construction. Window and door frames should be wood, appropriately colored or bronze-toned aluminum or vinyl-clad.

G. Parking

Parking lots should be screened from street and sidewalk either by walls or plantings or both. If walls are used, their materials should be compatible with the walls of existing adjacent buildings. Walls should be at least 18" high. Walls or plantings should continue the planes of existing adjacent buildings.

H. Landscaping and Street Furniture

When lots are used for green space or parking, a visual hole in the street "wall" may result. Landscape treatment can eliminate this potential problem by providing a wall of enclosure for the street. Traditional street elements of the area, such as granite curbs, should be preserved. New street furniture should complement the scale and character of the area.

III. Restoration and Rehabilitation, General Principles:

1. All work should be of a character and quality that maintains the distinguishing features of the building and the environment. The removal of architectural features is not permitted.

2. Deteriorated architectural features should be repaired rather than replaced whenever possible. In the event of replacement, new materials should match the original in composition, design, color, texture and appearance. Duplication of original design based on physical or pictorial evidence is preferable to using conjectural or "period" designs or using part of other buildings.

3. Distinctive stylistic features or examples of skilled craftsmanship characteristic of structures of a period should be treated sensitively. Furthermore, if changes in use of a building are contemplated, they should be accomplished with minimum alteration to the structure and fabric.

4. In general, it is expected that buildings will be restored to their original appearance. However, alterations to buildings are sometimes significant because they reflect the history of the building and the district. This significance should be respected, and restoration to an 'original' appearance may not always be desirable. All buildings should be recognized as products of their own time and not be altered to resemble buildings from another era.

A. Masonry and Walls

Use of Materials:

Original masonry and mortar should be retained whenever possible without the application of any surface treatment. A similar material should be used to repair or replace, where necessary, deteriorated masonry. New masonry added to the structure or site, such as new foundations or retaining walls, should be compatible with the color, texture and bonding of original or existing masonry. Formstone, stucco, wood or metal siding, or paneling should not be used.

Cleaning:

Masonry should be cleaned only when necessary to halt deterioration or to remove graffiti and stains and always with the gentlest method possible such as low pressure water (under 300 psi) and soft bristle brushes. Brick and stone surface should not be sandblasted with dry or wet grit or other abrasives. This method of cleaning erodes the hard surface of the material and accelerates deterioration. Chemical cleaning products which could have and adverse chemical reaction with the masonry material such as acid on limestone or marble should not be used. Chemical solvents should not be used at all except for removing iron and oil stains. It is preferable to use water with a non-ionic biodegradable detergent. Mortar should be repointed and window frames should be caulked before cleaning. Waterproof or water repellent coatings or surface consolidation treatments should not be applied unless required to solve a specific technical problem that has been studied and identified. Coatings are frequently unnecessary, expensive, and can accelerate deterioration of the masonry.

Repointing:

Repointing should be done on those mortar joints where there is evidence of moisture problems or when sufficient mortar is missing to allow water to stand on the mortar joint. Using pneumatic hammers to remove mortar can seriously damage the adjacent brick. Vertical joints should be hand chiseled. When repointing, it is important to use the same materials as the existing mortar. This includes matching the color, texture, coefficients of expansion and contraction, and ingredient ratio of the original mortar mix, creating a bond similar to the original. A professional mortar analysis can give this information. Repointing with Portland cement mortar may create a bond stronger than is appropriate for the building materials, possibly resulting in cracking or other damage. Old mortar should be duplicated in joint size, method of application and joint profile.

Painting:

The original or early color and texture of masonry surfaces should be retained, including early signage wherever possible. Brick or stone surfaces may have been painted or whitewashed for practical and aesthetic reasons. Paint should not be indiscriminately removed from masonry surfaces as this may subject the building to damage and change its appearance.

B. Windows and Doors

Openings:

Existing window and door openings should be retained. New window and door openings should not be introduced into the principal elevations. Enlarging or reducing window or door opening to fit stock window sash or new stock door sizes should not be done. Infilling of window openings may be permissible on minor facades if standard sizes approximate the size and proportions of the opening. Generally, a minor facade will be considered as any facade not facing the street and not having the ornamentation and higher quality materials usually associated with street facades.

Panes, Sashes and Hardware:

It is desirable to retain original windows and doors, but they may need replacement for functional reasons. Replacement is clearly acceptable for functional reasons if new materials closely match original materials. Different materials may be acceptable on a case-by-case basis. Window panes should be two-way glass. No reflective or spandrel glass is permitted. The stylistic period or periods a building represents should be respected. Shutters are generally inappropriate in the district. Missing or irreparable windows should be replaced with new windows that match the original in material, size, general muntin and mullion proportion and configuration and reflective qualities of the glass. Replacement sash should not alter the setback relationship between window and wall. Heating and air conditioning units should not be installed in the window frames when the sash and frames may be damaged. Window installations should be considered only when all other viable heating and cooling systems would result in significant damage to historic materials. Window installations may be acceptable in minor facades.

Storm Windows:

Storm windows and doors should be compatible with the character of the building and should not damage

window and door frames, or require removal of original windows and doors. Exterior storm windows should be appropriate in size and color and should be operable.

Awnings and Canopies:

Awnings and canopies should not be used when they conceal richly detailed entries and windows. Aluminum or plastic awnings should not be used. Large or garish lettering should not be used on awnings.

Lintels, Arches, and Sills:

Lintels, sills, architraves, pediments, hoods and steps should be retained or repaired if possible. Existing colors and textures should be matched when repairing these elements.

Storefronts:

Existing storefronts should be retained and repaired including windows, sash, doors, transoms, signage, and decorative features where such features contribute to the architectural and historic character of the building. Where original or early storefronts no longer exist or are too deteriorated to save, the commercial character of the building should be retained through: (1) contemporary design which is compatible with the scale, design, materials, color and texture of the historic buildings; or (2) an accurate restoration of the storefront based on historical research and physical evidence. Storefronts or new design elements on the ground floor, such as arcades, should not be introduced which alter the architectural and historic character of the building and its relationship with the street or its setting or which cause destruction of significant historic fabric. Materials which detract from the historic or architectural character of the building, such as mirrored glass, should not be used. Entrances through significant storefronts should not be altered.

C. Roofs, Cornices and Details

Roof Shape:

The original roof shape should be preserved. New skylights and vents should be behind and below parapet level. When the roof is visible from street level, the original material should be retained if possible, otherwise it should be replaced with new material that matches the old in composition, size, shape, color, and texture.

Cornices and Other Details:

All architectural features that give the roof its essential character should be preserved or replaced. Similar material should be used to repair/replace deteriorating or missing architectural elements such as cornices, brackets, railings, shutters, steps and chimneys, whenever possible. The intricacy of detail is least important for new elements at or near the roof line. The same massing, proportions, scale and design theme as the original should be retained.

IV. Signs and Accessories

Signs should be compatible with the character of the District and blend wit/h the character of the structures on or near which they are placed. Signs should not conceal architectural detail, clutter the building's image, or distract from the unity of the facade but, rather, should complement the overall design.

A. Materials:

Sign materials should complement the materials of the related building and/or the adjacent buildings. Surface design elements should not detract from or conflict with the related structure's age and design in terms of identification symbol (logo), lettering, and related patterns or pictures. Materials used should be the same as those used for signs during the period of the building's construction, such as wood, wrought iron, steel, and metal grill work. Newer materials such as extruded aluminum and plastics may not be appropriate.

B. Types:

The sign type should enhance the building's design and materials. There are a number of types of signs which may be used: (1) single-faced; (2) projecting, double-faced; (3) three-dimensional; (4) painted wall signs; and (5) temporary signs. New billboards are not permitted in the Lowertown District.

C. Location and Method of Attachment:

There should be no sign above the cornice line or uppermost portion of a facade wall. Signs should not disfigure or conceal architectural details. Painted signs may be permissible on glass windows and doors. The facade should not be damaged in sign application, except for mere attachment. The method of attachment should respect the structure's architectural integrity and should become an extension of the architecture. Projecting signs should have a space separating them from the building. (Protection of architecture in method of attachment shall be regarded as a basis for granting variance of the normal zoning code prohibition against guy wire supports for projecting signs.)

D. Lighting:

Location of exterior lights should be appropriate to the structure. Signs should generally be lit from on the site. There should be no flashing, blinking, moving, or varying intensity lighting. Subdued lighting is preferred. Backlit fluorescent or exposed neon are generally inappropriate.

E. Grills, Exhaust Fans, etc.
Grills., exhaust outlets for air conditioners, bath and kitchen exhaust fans should be incorporated into filler panels, if possible. They may be painted the same color as the filler panel.

V. Demolition

The Heritage Preservation Commission will follow the guidelines stated in the Heritage Preservation Ordinance (#16006), Section 6 (1) (2), when reviewing permit applications for demolition:

"In the case of the proposed demolition of a building, prior to approval of said demolition, the Commission shall make written findings on the following: architectural and historical merit of building, the effect on surrounding buildings, the effect of any new proposed construction on the remainder of the building (in case of partial demolition), and on surrounding buildings, the economic value or usefulness of building as it now exists, or if altered or modified in comparison with the value or usefulness of any proposed structure designated to replace the present building or buildings."

Summit Avenue West District Guidelines (partial):

I. Intent and Purpose

The following Guidelines for Design Review will serve as the basis for the Heritage Preservation Commission's permit review decisions in the Summit Avenue West Heritage Preservation District. The guidelines define the most important elements of the Summit Avenue West District's unique physical appearance and set forth standards for preserving and enhancing these elements in rehabilitation or new construction.

The City of Saint Paul, a Certified Local Government in the National Historic Preservation Program, has agreed to conduct its design review of locally designated heritage preservation sites and districts according to the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation. The following guidelines have been reviewed and approved by the Minnesota State Historic Preservation Officer as containing criteria which will substantially achieve the purpose of preserving and rehabilitating buildings of significance to the district.

These guidelines are not hard and fast regulations. They are flexible criteria. Their purpose is to provide assurance to property owners that permit review will be based on clear standards rather than the taste of individual Commission members. The guidelines will be interpreted with flexibility depending of the particular merit of the building or area under review. Consideration will be given to the unavailability or expense of historical materials. When applying the guidelines the Commission will also be considerate of clearly defined cases of economic hardship or deprivation of the owner of reasonable use of the property.

II. Restoration and Rehabilitation

A. General Principles

1. All work should be of a character and quality that maintains the distinguishing features of the building and the environment. The removal or alteration of distinctive architectural features should be avoided.

2. Deteriorated architectural features should be repaired rather than replaced whenever possible. In the event of replacement, new materials should match the original in composition, design, color, texture and appearance. Duplication of original design based on physical or pictorial evidence is preferable to using conjectural of "period" designs or using parts of other buildings.

3. Distinctive stylistic features or examples of skilled craftsmanship characteristic of structures or a period should be treated with sensitivity.

4. Buildings should be used for their originally intended purpose or compatible uses which require minimum alteration of the building and its site.

5. In general, buildings should be restored to their original appearance. However, alterations to buildings since their construction are sometimes significant because they reflect the history of the building and neighborhood. This significance should be respected, and restoration to an "original" appearance may not be desirable in some cases. All buildings should be recognized as products of their own time and not be altered to resemble buildings from an earlier era.

6. Whenever possible, new additions or alterations to structures should be done in such a manner that if such additions or alterations were to be removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the structure would be unimpaired.

B. Walls and Foundations

1. Deteriorated surface materials should be replaced with material used in original construction or with materials that resemble the appearance of the old as closely as possible. Imitative materials such as artificial stone and artificial brick veneer should not be used.

2. Original masonry and mortar should be retained whenever possible without the application of any surface treatment. Masonry should be cleaned only when necessary to halt deterioration and always with the gentlest method possible, such as low pressure water and soft natural bristle brushes. Brick and stone surfaces should not be sandblasted. This method of cleaning erodes the surface of the material and

accelerates deterioration. Chemical cleaning products which could have an adverse chemical reaction with the masonry material should not be used.

3. Original mortar joint size and profile should be retained, and replacement mortar should match the original mortar in color and texture. Materials and ingredient proportions similar to the original mortar should be used when repointing, with replacement mortar softer than the masonry units and not harder than the historic mortar. This will create a bond similar to the original and is necessary to prevent damage to the masonry units. Repointing with mortar of high Portland cement content of ten creates a bond stronger than is appropriate for the original building materials, possible resulting in cracking or other damage. Mortar joints should be carefully washed after set-up to retain the neatness of the joint lines and keep extraneous mortar off of masonry surfaces.

4. The original color and texture of masonry surfaces should be retained. While unpainted masonry surfaces should not be painted, paint should not be indiscriminately removed from masonry surfaces because some brick surfaces were originally meant to be painted. Color is a significant design element, and paint colors should be appropriate to the period and style of the structure. Building permits are not required for painting and, although the Heritage Preservation Commission may review and comment on paint color, paint color is not subject to Heritage Preservation Commission approval.

C. Roofs and Chimneys

1. Original roofing materials should be retained unless deteriorated. When partially reroofing, deteriorated roof coverings should be replaced with new materials that match the old in composition, size, shape and texture. When entirely reroofing, new materials which differ to such an extent from the old in composition, size, shape, color or texture that the appearance of the building is altered should not be used. The predominant roof materials on west Summit are tile and asphalt shingles. Tile roofs are either red or green, generally to complement rather than match the color of the house. When asphalt shingles began to be used in the 1890s and early twentieth century, the most common colors were solid, uniform, deep red and solid, uniform, dark green. Dark brown, dark gray, and a weathered-wood color may also be acceptable for new asphalt shingles, and black may be acceptable for Colonial Revival houses built after the 1920s.

2. The original roof type, slope, and overhangs should be preserved. The shape of existing dormers should also be preserved. New dormers may be acceptable in some cases if compatible with the original design. Modern skylights are a simple way to alter a roof to admit light and air without disrupting its plane surface, are less noticeable than dormers, and may also be acceptable. Skylights should be flat and as close to the roof plane as possible. They should not be placed on the front roof plane.

3. Chimneys should be restored to their original condition. In the absence of historical documentation on the original design, chimney design should be in keeping with the period and style of the building.

D. Windows and Doors

1. Existing window and door openings should be retained. New window and door openings should not be introduced into principal elevations. Enlarging or reducing window or door openings to fit stock window sash or new stock door sizes should not be done. The size of window panes or sash should not be altered. Such changes destroy the scale and proportion of the building.

2. Window sash, glass, lintels, sills, architraves, doors, pediments, hoods, steps and all hardware should be retained. Discarding original doors and door hardware, when they can be repaired and reused in place, should be avoided.

3. The stylistic period(s) a building represents should be respected. If replacement of window sash or doors is necessary, the replacement should duplicate the material, design and hardware of the older window sash or door. Inappropriate new window and door features such as aluminum storm and screen window combinations, plastic or metal strip awnings, or fake shutters that disturb the character and appearance of the building should not be used. Combination storm windows should have wood frames or be painted to match trim colors.

E. Exterior Architectural Features

1. Porches and steps which are appropriate to the building and its development should be maintained or restored. Porches and steps removed from the building should be reconstructed to be compatible in design and detail with the period and style of the building. In general, front porches should not be enclosed, and precast steps should be avoided.

2. Decorative architectural features such as cornices, brackets, railings, and those around front doors and windows should be preserved. New material used to repair or replace, where necessary, deteriorated architectural features of wood, iron, cast iron, terra-cotta, tile and brick should match the original as closely as possible.

3. Shutters should not be used on buildings not designed for them. If used, they should be large enough to cover the entire window area, should be functional and operable, and should not look as if they were flat-mounted on the wall.

4. Deck and firestair additions may be acceptable in some cases, but should be kept to the rear of buildings where they will be the most inconspicuous and detract the least from the historical context. The detailing of decks and exterior stairs should be compatible with the period and style of the building.

III. New Construction

A. General Principles

The basic principle for new construction in the Summit Avenue West District is to maintain the scale and quality of design of the district. The Summit Avenue West District is architecturally diverse within an overall pattern of harmony and continuity. These guidelines for new construction focus on general rather than specific design elements in order to encourage architectural innovation and quality design while maintaining the harmony and continuity of the district. New construction should be compatible with the size, scale, massing, height, rhythm, setback, color, material, building elements, site design, and character of surrounding structures and the area.

B. Massing and Scale

New construction should conform to the massing, volume, height, facade proportions and scale of existing surrounding structures. The scale of the spaces between buildings and the rhythm of buildings to open space should also be carefully considered. New houses should be at least 25 feet high and relate to the height of existing adjacent houses. New college buildings should relate to nearby contributing college buildings; new college buildings with a smaller setback from Summit should have a correspondingly lower height.

C. Materials and Details

1. Variety in the use of architectural materials and details adds to the intimacy and visual delight of the district. But there is also an overall thread of continuity provided by the range of materials commonly used along Summit and by the way these materials are used. This thread of continuity is threatened by the introduction of new industrial materials and the aggressive exposure of earlier materials such as concrete block, metal framing, and glass. The materials and details of new construction should relate to the materials and details of existing nearby buildings.

2. Most buildings on Summit are built of high-quality materials, often with brick or stucco walls and asphalt or tile roofs. Most brick is red and tile roofs are either red or green. Vinyl, metal or hardboard siding is acceptable only for accessory structures which are not visible from Summit. Imitative materials such as artificial stone and artificial brick veneer should not be used. Materials will be reviewed to determine their appropriate use in relation to the overall design of the structure.

3. The materials and details of new college buildings should relate to the materials and details of nearby contributing college buildings. The Macalester College campus has buildings predominantly of red brick with concrete or sandstone trim. The [University] of St. Thomas presents cream-colored Kasota stone buildings to the Summit Avenue streetscape.

4. The color of materials should relate to surrounding structures and the area as well as to the style of the structure. Building permits are not required for painting and, although the Heritage Preservation Commission may review and comment on paint color, paint color is not subject to Heritage Preservation Commission approval.

D. Building Elements

Individual elements of a building should be integrated into its composition for a balanced and complete design. These elements of new construction should compliment existing adjacent structures as well.

1. Roofs

There is a great variety of roof treatment along Summit, but gable and hipped roofs are most common. The skyline or profile of new construction should relate to the predominant roof shape of existing nearby buildings.

The recommended roof pitch for gable roofs is 9:12 and in general the minimum appropriate pitch is 8:12. Highly visible secondary structure roofs should match the roof pitch of the main structure. A 6:12 pitch may be acceptable in some cases for secondary structures which are not visible from the street.

Roof hardware such as skylights, vents, and metal pipe chimneys should not be placed on the front roof plane.

2. Windows and Doors

The proportion, size, rhythm and detailing of windows and doors should be compatible with that of existing nearby buildings. Facade openings of the same general size as those in nearby buildings are encouraged. Sliding windows, awning windows, and horizontally oriented muntins are not common in the district and are generally unacceptable. Vertical muntins and muntin grids may be acceptable when compatible with the period and style of the building. Sliding glass doors should not be used where they would be visible from the street.

Although not usually improving the appearance of a building, the use of metal windows or doors need not necessarily ruin it. The important thing is that they should look like part of the building and not like raw metal appliances. Appropriately colored bronze-toned aluminum is acceptable. Mill finish (silver) aluminum should be avoided.

3. Porches and Decks

Front entrance ways should be articulated with a suitable design element to provide a transitional zone between the public outdoors and the private interior, and should be appropriate in detail to the size and style of the building. If front porches are constructed, they should generally not be enclosed.

Decks should be kept to the rear of the buildings, should be visually refined, and should be integrated into the overall building design. A raised deck protruding from a single wall usually appears disjointed from the total design and is generally unacceptable.

E. Site

1. Setback - Siting

New buildings should generally face Summit Avenue and be sited at a distance not more than 5% out-of-line from the front yard setback of existing adjacent buildings. Setbacks greater than those of adjacent buildings may be allowed in some cases.

2. Landscaping

The streetscape can be divided into three visual areas: public, semipublic, and private. Public space is provided by the publicly owned sidewalks, boulevards, streets, and medians. Semipublic space includes front yards and side yards on corners. While privately owned, this space is open to view by passers-by. Private space is generally that which lies behind the front face of the building. Buildings, landscaping elements in front yards, and boulevard trees provide a "wall of enclosure" for the street "room." Generally, landscaping which respects the street as a public room is encouraged. Boulevard trees mark a separation between the automobile corridor and the rest of the streetscape, and should be maintained. Front yard enclosures such as hedges or walls are not common along west Summit. When they are used, they should permit visual penetration of the semipublic space. Low hedges or limestone retaining walls and visually open fences, such as wrought iron, are preferred. Chain link fences, while visually transparent, should not be used in front yards or in the front half of side yards. Privacy fences, timber retaining walls, and high hedges are also inappropriate in front yards.

3. Garages and Parking

Parking spaces should not be located in front yards. Residential parking spaces should be located in rear yards. If an alley is adjacent to a dwelling, any new garage should be located off the alley.

Institutional parking lots should ideally be located behind buildings where they would not be visible from Summit Avenue. When this is not possible, parking lots should be set back at least as far as the building facades and screened from view from Summit by landscaping such as hedges, brick walls, and changes of grade that sink the parking from view. Shade trees should be planted between parking lots and the street, and plant materials should relate to the traditional character of the district. The scale, level of light output, and design of parking lot lighting should be compatible with the 16 foot high lantern style lights along Summit Avenue.

F. Public Infrastructure

Summit Avenue itself, a wide parkway with well-landscaped boulevards running continuously in a 200 foot right-of-way for 2 ½ miles from Lexington parkway to the Mississippi River, represents an early city planning effort to create an exclusive residential area and is of utmost importance to the significance and integrity of the Summit Avenue West Heritage Preservation District. The development of Summit Avenue as a wide parkway, along with the adoption in 1915 of an ordinance restricting Summit to one and two family residential, church, and school uses, helped to ensure the quality of development along the avenue. The pattern of Summit Avenue's boulevards and sidewalks should be maintained. Distinctive features of public spaces in the area, such as the early twentieth century lantern style street lights, should be preserved. New street furniture such as benches, sign standards, traffic signals and trash containers should be compatible with the character of the district. Electric, telephone and cable TV lines should be placed underground or along alleys, and meters should be placed where inconspicuous.

G. Signs

Signs should be compatible with the character of the district. Sign materials and design should complement the materials and design of the related building and/or adjacent buildings.

H. Moving of Structures

Proposals for moving structures out of the Summit Avenue West District are reviewed using the guidelines for demolition. Proposals for moving structures onto property located within the district are reviewed using the guidelines for new construction as well as guidelines for restoration and rehabilitation. Proposals for moving structures within the district are reviewed using guidelines for all of the above.

I. Demolition

Proposals for demolishing structures, while reviewed with special care by the Heritage Preservation Commission, are not necessarily in conflict with district guidelines. When reviewing proposals for demolition of structures within the district, the Heritage Preservation Commission refers to Section 73.06(1)(2) of the Saint Paul Legislative Code which states the following:

In the case of the proposed demolition of a building, prior to approval of said demolition, the commission shall make written findings on the following: the architectural and historical merit of the building, the effect of the demolition on surrounding buildings, the effect of any proposed new construction on the remainder of the building (in case of partial demolition) and on surrounding buildings, and the economic value or usefulness of the building as it now exists or if altered or modified in comparison with the value or usefulness of any proposed structures designated to replace the present building or buildings.