

SAINT PAUL HERITAGE PRESERVATION COMMISSION 2011 ANNUAL REPORT

A LETTER FROM THE SAINT PAUL HERITAGE PRESERVATION COMMISSION

Championing historic preservation can feel like doing the bunny hop, or at least the version my sister taught me when I was a preschooler. We'd hop forward – and then we'd always take a hop back.

In 2011 we certainly took steps that moved us ahead. Take the designation of the Jacob Schmidt Brewing Company Historic District and its certification to the National Register of Historic Places; this work moved ahead quickly this year and will be key to the area's redevelopment, given the power of federal and state tax credits. And then there was the community-driven campaign to designate the old Victoria Theater on University Avenue as a St. Paul Heritage Preservation Site; the HPC voted for designation and the City Council affirmed that recommendation.

But then, just a couple miles to the west on the same street, we moved backward when the Porky's drive-in was lost, with the sign sold and the building moved. The restaurant had been identified as eligible for listing on the National Register; its demise triggered headlines and last-minute pilgrimages. Sometimes, though, when we jump in the wrong direction it gets little attention. That has happened with downtown St. Paul's Public Safety Building, which has been found eligible for designation, but which the city – the building's owner – plans to demolish. Even quieter have been a series of home demolitions declared nuisance properties and ordered for removal. Some of these homes are historic resources, considered important in maintaining neighborhood character.

A move in the right direction has been our reviews, which take up the bulk the time for HPC staff members and volunteers on the Commission. Almost 500 plans were reviewed during the 2011 fiscal year; this work is done with great care to follow our guidelines and protect our historic resources – while respecting the property owners who are working to make the best decisions they can. They have ranged from small home repairs to the massive Union Depot renovation.

And then there's the new survey work that we completed in 2011, which focused on filling important gaps in our knowledge of the historic resources in portions of three neighborhoods: Thomas-Dale, Payne-Phalen and West Seventh Street. This feels like a massive leap forward, one that neighborhood groups, city planners, preservationists and developers can put to good use.

There is always more work to be done, and sometimes we end up moving backward. But we know that thanks to its many supporters, preservation efforts in St. Paul are truly moving ahead.

Sincerely,



John Manning, Chair
Saint Paul Heritage Preservation Commission

A LOOK BACK AT 2011



**Jacob Schmidt Brewing Company
Main Complex**

Photo courtesy of Paul Clifford Larson



Porky's Drive-In

Photo courtesy of Preservation Alliance of Minnesota

SAINT PAUL HERITAGE PRESERVATION COMMISSION

2011 ANNUAL REPORT

PRESERVATION AWARDS

The Heritage Preservation Commission, in collaboration with the Saint Paul Chapter of the American Institute of Architects (AIA), held the 21st Annual Heritage Preservation Awards Ceremony on May 17th, 2011, in the Saint Paul City Hall Ramsey County Courthouse. Six awards were presented to individuals or organizations for their efforts to preserve historic buildings or to enhance the historic character of Saint Paul. Award recipients are listed throughout this report.



Giesen-Hauser Residence
827 Mound Street

Vote of Confidence Award
Nancy Ward, owner
Sandlund Consulting
Historic Saint Paul

James J. Hill House
240 Summit Avenue

Restoration Award
Minnesota Historical Society
James J. Hill House
MacDonald & Mack Architects
Mattson-Macdonald-Young
Building Restoration Corporation

Saint Paul Union Depot
Historic Structures Report
214 East Fourth Street

Cultural Heritage Award
Ramsey County Regional Railroad Authority
HGA Architects and Engineers
Beyer Blinder Belle Architects and Planners
Luken Architecture, P.A.

DESIGN REVIEW

The HPC protects buildings and districts designated for heritage preservation by reviewing all building permits and other exterior work for these areas. The HPC works with property owners to ensure that exterior changes are compatible with the original architectural design and materials of the buildings. The Commission has published design review guidelines for each district which facilitate the review of projects. The HPC also advises the City Council and Mayor on city-sponsored projects which will affect historic districts and sites.

The HPC reviewed 499 applications during 2011, 77 more than the 422 applications reviewed in 2010. Of these, 28 were reviewed by the Commission and 471 were reviewed and approved by staff. The HPC also conducted three pre-application reviews for new construction or rehabilitation projects, three historic resource reviews and four after-the-fact reviews.

Of the total applications reviewed, only one was denied by the HPC. An HPC decision can be appealed to the City Council by an applicant or other party, and for the fiscal year 2011, one decision was appealed. The City Council granted the appeal.

Applications Reviewed by Type*	STAFF	HPC	TOTALS
New Construction/Alteration Permits	54	17	71
Repair/Rehabilitation Permits	330	8	338
Fence/Retaining Wall Permits	40	0	40
Mechanical Permits	28	0	28
Sign/Awning Permits	9	2	11
Stucco Permits	5	0	5
Demolition Permits	5	1	6
Infrastructure	0	0	0
TOTALS	471	28	499

Applications Reviewed by District	STAFF	HPC	TOTALS
Dayton's Bluff	55	8	63
Historic Hill	296	5	301
Irvine Park	7	1	8
Schmidt	2	0	2
Lowertown	22	10	32
Summit Avenue West	61	1	62
University-Raymond	7	1	8
Individual Sites	21	2	23

*The primary permit type counted. An application may have more than one permit type reviewed.

SAINT PAUL HERITAGE PRESERVATION COMMISSION

2011 ANNUAL REPORT

SURVEY & DESIGNATION

The HPC recommended the Victoria Theater and the Jacob Schmidt Brewing Company Historic District to the City Council for designation consideration. The Victoria Theater became a Saint Paul Heritage Preservation Site on May 18th, 2011 and the Jacob Schmidt Brewing Company Historic District was locally designated on June 30th, 2011 and was certified by the National Park Service on September 29th, 2011.

In 2011 HPC, in partnership with Historic Saint Paul and the Ramsey County Historical Society, contracted with Mead & Hunt, Inc. to conduct an Historic Resources Inventory of portions of the Payne-Phalen, Thomas-Dale and West 7th Street neighborhoods. This project was the most ambitious survey work completed in Saint Paul in over 27 years. The survey identified 167 properties and five areas that meet at least one criteria for City of Saint Paul Heritage Preservation Sites and the National Register of Historic Places. These properties were recommended for intensive-level research and 57 newly surveyed properties were recommended as historic resources. Check out the studies at the following link on the HPC website: <http://ci.stpaul.mn.us/index.aspx?nid=750>

The HPC commented favorably on two properties proposed for listing on the National Register of Historic Places: the Charles Thompson Memorial Hall at 1824 Marshall Avenue and the Hamline United Methodist Church at 1514 Englewood Avenue.

HPC Staff submitted Legislative Hearing staff reports for approximately 80 Category III Vacant Buildings slated for repair or removal during the reporting period of 2011. For each property, HPC staff conducted an initial survey and made a recommendation to the Legislative Hearing Officer based on the historic preservation potential of the property.

ENVIRONMENTAL REVIEWS

In 2011 the Saint Paul HPC continued to participate in Section 106 reviews for properties that received funding through the United States Department of Energy (DOE) Energy Efficiency and Conservation Block Grant Program (EECBG). The HPC commented on the installation of six electric vehicle charging stations and one solar array in the city for impacts to historic resources. Staff's participation in the Central Corridor and Union Depot Multi-Modal Transit Center projects also continued in 2011.

PLANNING AND CONTINUING EDUCATION

During the year staff and HPC reached out to Saint Paul's District Councils, the Midway Chamber of Commerce Economic Development Committee, Ward 1 Development Committee and participated in an undergraduate Architecture course at the University of Minnesota's College of Design. Commissioner Ferguson served on the Greater Lowertown Master Plan Task Force and Commissioner Trimble continued to serve on the 3M Advisory Committee. Commissioners Ferguson, Thomas and Trout-Oertel Education Committee were nominated to the Education Committee, with a focus on revisions to the city's preservation ordinance.



Minnesota Building
46 East Fourth Street

Adaptive Reuse Award
MNB Development, LLC
Sand Companies, Inc.



Larry Millett
Individual Award



John Mannillo
Individual Award

SAINT PAUL HERITAGE PRESERVATION COMMISSION 2011 ANNUAL REPORT

CITY OF SAINT PAUL CHRISTOPHER B. COLEMAN, MAYOR

The Heritage Preservation
Commission
is staffed by the Department of Planning
and Economic Development
Cecile Bedor, *Director*
Donna Drummond, *Planning Director*

2011 HERITAGE PRESERVATION COMMISSION

Commissioners:

John Manning, Chair
Richard Laffin, AIA, Vice Chair
Matt Mazanec, Secretary
Richard Dana
Robert Ferguson
Jennifer Haskamp
Matt Hill
Renee Hutter
David Riehle
Mark S. Thomas, MD
Steve Trimble, RCHS
Diane Trout-Oertel, AIA

Outgoing:

Pat Igo & Lee Meyer, AIA

Staff:

Amy Spong
Christine Boulware

Interns:

Joey Larson
Becky Willging

FOR MORE INFORMATION:

Department of Planning and Economic
Development
1400 City Hall Annex
25 West Fourth Street
Saint Paul, Minnesota 55102
Tel: 651.266.9078
<http://www.stpaul.gov/hpc>

HERITAGE PRESERVATION COMMISSION MEMBERS & STAFF

Officers during the 2011 calendar year were Commissioner Manning, serving as Chair; Commissioner Laffin, serving as Vice-Chair; and Commissioner Mazanec, serving as Secretary. Commissioner Trimble served as a representative of the Ramsey County Historical Society Board and the three registered architects were Commissioners Laffin, Meyer and Trout-Oertel. The commission said goodbye to two members: Pat Igo and Lee Meyer. Three new members joined the commission last year: Richard Dana, Matt Hill and Renee Hutter.

Amy Spong and Christine Boulware continued to serve as staff to the HPC. Staff and Commissioners Dana, Ferguson, Hill and Hutter attended the 31st Annual Statewide Historic Preservation Conference in Faribault on September 22nd and 23rd.

ORGANIZATIONAL SUMMARY

The Heritage Preservation Commission (HPC) serves as an advisory body to the Mayor and the City Council on municipal heritage preservation matters. It was created by city ordinance in 1976 to protect and promote the heritage of the City of Saint Paul. The Commission consists of thirteen voting members who are residents of Saint Paul and are appointed by the Mayor with the advice and consent of the City Council. One of the members is a representative of the Ramsey County Historical Society and at present three of the members are professionally registered architects.

The City of Saint Paul is a Certified Local Government (CLG) in the national Historic Preservation Program. The City is certified as having a heritage preservation commission and program that meets federal and state standards. Saint Paul's status as a CLG confirms its commitment to support a qualified heritage preservation commission, maintain a system for the survey and inventory of historic properties, enforce appropriate state and local legislation for the designation and protection of historic properties and provide for public participation in its preservation program.



This annual report for the
Saint Paul Heritage Preservation Commission (HPC)
for the fiscal year 1 October 2010—30 September 2011,
has been prepared according to the guidelines outlined in
"Procedures for Applying For and
Maintaining Certified Local Government Status (CLG)."
CLG Status is administered by the
Minnesota State Historic Preservation Office (SHPO)
for the National Park Service.

