

Chapter 74. Heritage Preservation Districts and Programs*

***Cross references:** Building and housing, Title VI; zoning code, Title VIII; heritage preservation commission, Ch. 73.

ARTICLE I. IN GENERAL

Sec. 74.01. Hamline Playground Building preservation program.

(a) *Designation for heritage preservation.* Pursuant to the authority contained in Chapter 73 of the Saint Paul Legislative Code, upon the recommendation of the Heritage Preservation Commission of the City of Saint Paul, and after having duly considered the matter at a public hearing held in accordance with Chapter 73 of the Legislative Code, the Hamline Playground Building, 1564 Lafond Avenue, is designated for heritage preservation. The parcel on which the building sits is legally described as Lots 1 through 20 and alley, Block 4, Hamline Syndicate Addition No. 2 to Saint Paul.

(b) *Outline of preservation program.* The preservation program for the Hamline Recreation Center shall be as follows:

(1) The exterior of the Hamline Recreation Center should be preserved in a manner consistent with the original design intent. All work should be of a character and quality that maintains the distinguishing features of the building and the environment. Deteriorated architectural features should be repaired rather than replaced whenever possible. In the event of replacement, new materials should match the original in composition, design, color, texture and appearance, distinctive stylistic features or examples of skilled craftsmanship characteristic of structures of this period should be treated sensitively.

(2) The pink Kasota limestone exterior, multiple-pane windows, transom, front (northwest) exit stair arrangement, arched lower level door opening, chimney size and profile, roof profile and flagpole base are character-defining architectural elements worthy of preservation. Regular maintenance of the building, including necessary tuckpointing, is encouraged.

(c) *Record of legal description.* The city clerk shall record the legal description of the Hamline Playground Building with the Ramsey County recorder and the Ramsey County registrar of titles as required under Section 73.09 of this Legislative Code.

(C.F. No. 92-1194, §§ 1--3, 9-17-92)

Sec. 74.02. Oakland Cemetery preservation program.

(a) *Designation for heritage preservation.* Pursuant to the authority contained in Chapter 73 of the Saint Paul Legislative Code, upon the recommendation of the Heritage Preservation Commission of the City of Saint Paul, and after having duly considered the matter at a public hearing held in accordance with Chapter 73 of the Legislative Code, the Oakland Cemetery,

bounded by Sycamore, Sylvan and Jackson streets and Magnolia Avenue is designated for heritage preservation. The parcel is legally described at Plat #01893 (entire plat) and Blocks 1 and 2 of Dickerman's Addition to Saint Paul.

(b) *Outline of preservation program.* The preservation program for the Oakland Cemetery shall be as follows:

(1) This preservation program responds to the treatment of a landscape rather than a physical structure. Landscape, to a larger degree than buildings, is a continuous seamless realm. A building marks space by its walls and a landscape space is often less well-bounded. A landscape such as Oakland Cemetery has legal boundaries, but our visual (perceptual) sense of it is very much affected by the degree and quality of its built (walled) edges. A landscape is also continuous in time but, ironically, more changeable than most buildings.

(2) The integrity of Oakland Cemetery is largely manifested in its circulation network, its topography, its plants (particularly the native oaks that Cleveland hoped to preserve) and its major structures, including the late-nineteenth and early-twentieth century grave markers, monuments, memorial sculptures, mausoleums, and headstones and the Oakland Chapel (1924). The simple poetic quality of the site is conveyed by the quality of the original Cleveland and French design. The oak groves have stood the tests of time and disease that take down more exotic materials. The curvilinear lanes have defined the burial areas, and these have been filled with the history of the city. Such was the original intention of the designers, and it has been borne out. Retention of these elements is strongly encouraged.

(3) While many of the above issues are important to the preservation of the character of Oakland Cemetery, only those improvements requiring a building permit will be reviewed by the heritage preservation commission. Likely activities requiring review would be the rehabilitation or demolition of existing buildings, construction of new buildings and the erection or replacement of fences. The exterior of the Oakland Chapel should be preserved in a manner consistent with the building's original design intent. Improvements to the more recent maintenance shed should strive to increase compatibility with the character of the cemetery. New structures should be compatible with the scale, design and materials of the cemetery and adjoining structures and should be sited in a way compatible with the intent of Cleveland's design. Fencing and other improvements should be compatible with the scale and materials of the cemetery and with the intent of Cleveland's design. The heritage preservation commission will not regulate the design of grave markers, monuments, memorial sculptures, mausoleums or headstones, although it is encouraged that future elements of this type maintain the artistic quality of those found in the cemetery.

(4) In reviewing those items which require building permits, the heritage preservation commission will recognize the financial resources of the Oakland Cemetery Association and will consider the expense and availability of historic materials and the economic impact of its decisions on the Oakland Cemetery Association.

(c) *Record of legal description.* The city clerk shall record the legal description of the Oakland Cemetery with the Ramsey County recorder and the Ramsey County registrar of titles as required under Section 73.09 of this Legislative Code.

(C.F. No. 92-1246, §§ 1--3, 9-10-92)

Secs. 74.03--74.06. Reserved.

Sec. 74.06.1. Heritage Preservation District established, boundaries designated and

legal descriptions of preservation district properties.

(a) Pursuant to Legislative Code Chapter 73, upon the recommendation of the heritage preservation commission and after having duly considered the matter at a public hearing, the following described area is hereby designated the University-Raymond Heritage Preservation District: All of those properties, legally described in subsection 74.06.1(b), which front either the north or the south side of University Avenue beginning on the west end of the said district at Cromwell Avenue, and running east to a property, legally described below, located just east of Hampden Avenue.

(b) The University-Raymond Heritage Preservation District, generally described above, shall include the following legally described property:

Address: 731 Hampden Avenue

PIN: 322 923 120 028

Legal: HEWITTS OUT LOTS EX NLY 105 FT; LOT 83

Address: 771-777 Raymond Avenue

PIN: 292 923 340 017

Legal: AUDITOR'S SUBDIVISION NO. 4 ST. PAUL, MINN. S 3 FT OF LOT 27 AND ALL OF LOTS 25 AND LOT 26

Address: 2233 W. University Avenue

PIN: 322 923 110 014

Legal: HEWITTS OUT LOTS PART OF LOT 60 AND OF BERNHEIMER AVE VAC ADJ LYING SLY OF A L RUN FROM NELY COR OF SD LOT TO A PT ON E L OF HAMPDEN AVE 75 FT S OF S L OF CHARLES AVE AND ALL OF LOT 61

Address: 2242 W. University Avenue

PIN: 322 923 120 033

Legal: HEWITTS OUT LOTS NO PART OF VAC MYRTLE AVE ADJ & LOT 84

Address: 2250 W. University Avenue

PIN: 322 923 120 015

Legal: HEWITTS OUT LOTS NLY 105 FT OF LOT 83

Address: 2251 W. University Avenue

PIN: 322 923 120 003

Legal: HEWITTS OUT LOTS SWLY 60 FT OF LOT 59

Address: 2264 W. University Avenue

PIN: 322 923 120 032

Legal: HEWITTS OUT LOTS SUBJ TO ESMT; NELY 125 FT OF SELY 87 FT OF LOT 82

Address: 2274 W. University Avenue

PIN: 322 923 120 030

Legal: HEWITTS OUT LOTS SUBJ TO ESMT; NELY 150 FT LYING SELY OF NWLY 50 FT OF LOT 81 & NELY 150 FT LYINGNWLY OF SELY 87 FT OF LOT 82

Address: 2285 W. University Avenue

PIN: 292 923 430 084

Legal: HEWITTS OUT LOTS VAC ST ACCRUING & FOL; EX ALLEY & EX NLY 113 FT; LOT 55 ALSO THE SLY 197 FT OF LOTS 56, 57 & LOT 58

Address: 2288 W. University Avenue (Also known as 2288 Myrtle Avenue)

PIN: 322 923 120 035

Legal: HEWITTS OUT LOTS SUBJ TO ESMT; VAC STS ACCRUING & EX NELY 150 FT; LOTS 80 81

Address: 2295 W. University Avenue (Associated with 2309 W. University Avenue)

PIN: 292 923 430 085

Legal: HEWITTS OUT LOTS SUBJ TO ALLEY AND EX NELY 113 FT THE FOL SELY 60 FT OF LOT 53 AND ALL OF LOT 54

Address: 2309 W. University Avenue (Associated Addresses: 2324 Charles Avenue, 2341 University Avenue W., and 783 Hampden Avenue)

PINs: 292 923 430 069, 292 923 430 072, 292 923 430 073, 292 923 430 074

Legal: HEWITTS OUT LOTS PART N 69.5 FT OF LOT 58; HEWITTS OUT LOTS STREET AS VACATED IN DOC 1803121 ACCRUING & FOL; NE 113 FT OF LOT 52 & VAC LA SALLE ST BET & NELY 94.5 FT OF LOTS 53 THRU LOT 57

Legal: HEWITTS OUT LOTS SUBJ TO ALLEY AND EX NELY 113 FT THE FOL SELY 60 FT OF LOT 53 AND ALL OF LOT 54

Address: 2314 W. University Avenue

PIN: 322 923 230 040

Legal: HEWITTS OUT LOTS VAC ST ACCRUING IN DOC NO.2829884 & FOL EX NELY 75 FT; THE NWLY 1/2 OF LOT 79 ALSO; EX NWLY 9 FT OF SWLY 11 FT 2 IN OF NELY 94.5 FT & EX NELY 75 FT LYING SELY OF NWLY 83 FT; LOT 78

Address: 2324 W. University Avenue

PIN: 322 923 120 039

Legal: HEWITTS OUT LOTS VAC ST ACCRUING IN DOC NO.2829884 & FOL NWLY 9 FT OF SWLY 11 FT 2 IN OF NELY 94.5 FT OF LOT 78 & ALL OF LOT 77

Address: 2334 W. University Avenue

PIN: 322 923 120 023

Legal: HEWITTS OUT LOTS VAC ST ACCRUING IN DOC NO.2829884 & LOT 76

Address: 2341 W. University Avenue (Associated Addresses: 2324 Charles Avenue, 2309 W. University Avenue)

PIN: 292 923 430 068

Legal: HEWITTS OUT LOTS STREET AS VACATED IN DOC 1803121 ACCRUING & FOL; EX NELY 113 FT; LOT 52 & EX NELY 113 FT & EX SELY 60 FT; LOT 53

Address: 2345 W. University Avenue

PIN: 292 923 430 067

Legal: HEWITTS OUT LOTS SWLY 250 FT OF SELY 50 FT OF LOT 51

Address: 2356-2362 W. University Avenue

PIN: 292 923 430 075

Legal: HEWITTS OUT LOTS SUBJ TO AND WITH ESMT AND EX SWLY 140 FT THEREOF THE FOL LOT 73 AND EX SELY 25 FT OF NELY 140 FT LOT 74 AND EX NELY 140 FT THE NWLY 25 FT OF LOT 75

Address: 2363-73 W. University Avenue

PIN: 292 923 430 064, 292 923 430 062, 292 923 430 059

Legal: HEWITTS OUT LOTS SUBJ TO ESMTS & PARTY WALL & EX NELY 80 FT THE SELY 56 FT OF LOT 50; HEWITTS OUT LOTS SUBJ TO ESMTS & PARTY WALL THE SWLY 50 FT OF NELY 80 FT OF SELY 56 FT OF LOT 50; HEWITTS OUT LOTS SUBJ TO ESMTS & EX NELY 30 FT & EX SELY 56 FT; LOT 50; HEWITTS OUT LOTS EX NELY 80 12/100 FT OF SELY 22 52/100 FT SELY 35 FT OF LOT 49

Address: 2375 W. University Avenue

PIN: 292 923 430 058

Legal: HEWITTS OUT LOTS WLY 60 FT OF ELY 95 FT OF LOT 49

Address: 2383-87 W. University Avenue

PIN: 292 923 430 057

Legal: HEWITTS OUT LOTS EX NELY 170 FT MEASURED AT RA TO NELY L OF LOTS 48 AND 49 THE FOL WLY 5 FT OF LOT 49 AND ALL OF LOT 48

Address: 2383-87 W. University Avenue

PIN: 292 923 430 057

Legal: HEWITTS OUT LOTS EX NELY 170 FT MEASURED AT RA TO NELY L OF LOTS 48 AND 49 THE FOL WLY 5 FT OF LOT 49 AND ALL OF LOT 48

Address: 2388 W. University Avenue

PIN: 292 923 340 065

Legal: AUDITOR'S SUBDIVISION NO. 4 ST. PAUL, MINN. BEG AT NELY COR OF LOT 30 TH NWLY ON NELY L 33 42/100 FT TH SWLY PAR TO SWLY L OF SD LOT 65 125/1000 FT TH SELY PAR TO NELY L TO W L OF RAYMOND AVE TH N ON SD W L TO AFORESAID NELY COR OF LOT 30

Address: 2389-2401 W. University Avenue (Also known as: 759-765 Raymond Avenue)

PIN: 292 923 340 018

Legal: AUDITOR'S SUBDIVISION NO. 4 ST. PAUL, MINN. LOT 28

Address: 2390-2400 W. University Avenue (Also known as: 735 Raymond)

PIN: 292 923 340 064

Legal: AUDITOR'S SUBDIVISION NO. 4 ST. PAUL, MINN. SELY 50 FT OF NWLY 150 FT OF NELY 120 FT OF LOT 30 AND EX NWLY 150 FT AND EX SWLY 56 FT AND EX SELY 33 42/100 FT MEASURED ON NELY LOT L OF NELY 65 125/1000 FT MEASURED PAR WITH NWLY LOT L LOT 30

Address: 2402-2414 W. University Avenue

PIN: 292 923 340 062

Legal: AUDITOR'S SUBDIVISION NO. 4 ST. PAUL, MINN. EX SWLY 35 FT THE FOL THE NWLY 100 FT AND EX NELY 140 FT THE SELY 50 FT OF NWLY 150 FT OF

LOT 30

Address: 2418-2426 W. University Avenue

PIN: 292 923 340 058, 292 923 340 059, 292 923 340 060

Legal: AUDITOR'S SUBDIVISION NO. 4 ST. PAUL, MINN. SUBJ TO PARTY WALL AGREEMENT & ESMTS; EX NWLY 112.33 FT & EX W 57.8 FT OF S 162.95 FT OF E 94 FT; LOT 29; AUDITOR'S SUBDIVISION NO. 4 ST. PAUL, MINN. SUBJ TO PARTY WALL AGREEMENT & ESMTS & EX PART LYING SWLY OF NELY 137.05 FT; THE NWLY 112.33 FT OF LOT 29

Address: 2428-30-32 W. University Avenue

PIN: 292 923 340 057

Legal: AUDITOR'S SUBDIVISION NO. 4 ST. PAUL, MINN. SUBJ TO PARTY WALL AGREEMENT & ESMTS & EX PART LYING SWLY OF NELY 137.05 FT; THE NWLY 112.33 FT OF LOT 29

Address: 2429 W. University Avenue

PIN: 292 923 334 020

Legal: AUDITOR'S SUBDIVISION NO. 4 ST. PAUL, MINN. SWLY 25 FT OF LOT 11 & EX SELY 121.57 FT MOL THE SWLY 25 FT OF LOT 10 & ALL OF LOT 22

Address: 2441 W. University Avenue

PIN: 292 923 340 021

Legal: AUDITOR'S SUBDIVISION NO. 4 ST. PAUL, MINN. SELY 15 99/100 FT OF LOT 20 AND ALL OF LOT 21

Address: 2446 W. University Avenue (Also known as: 756 Pelham Boulevard)

PIN: 292 923 340 048

Legal: BAKER'S ADDITION TO THE CITY OF ST. PAUL, RAMSEY CO., MINN. VAC ALLEY ACCRUING & FOL; PART OF LOTS 6 & 7 NELY OF L RUN FROM PT 12 FT SWLY ON SELY L FROM NE COR OF LOT 7 TO PT ON WL OF & 26.73 FT FROM SW COR OF LOT 6 AS IN DOC 1412484 & ALL OF LOTS 1 THRU

Address: 2447 W. University Avenue

PIN: 292 923 340 022

Legal: AUDITOR'S SUBDIVISION NO. 4 ST. PAUL, MINN. NWLY 35 FT OF SELY 50 99/100 FT OF LOT 20

Address: 2451-2459 W. University Avenue

PIN: 292 923 340 023, 292 923 340 024

Legal: AUDITOR'S SUBDIVISION NO. 4 ST. PAUL, MINN. NWLY 100 FT OF SELY 150 99/100 FT OF LOT 20

Address: 2469 W. University Avenue

PIN: 292 923 340 025

Legal: AUDITOR'S SUBDIVISION NO. 4 ST. PAUL, MINN. SUBJ TO ESMTS THE SELY 75.9 OF LOT 19 & EX SELY 163.49 FT; LOT 20

Address: 2470-2512 W. University Ave.

PIN: 292 923 340 027

Legal: BAKER'S ADDITION TO THE CITY OF ST. PAUL, RAMSEY CO., MINN. LOTS 1 THRU LOT 6 BLK 6

Address: 2505 W. University Avenue

PIN: 292 923 340 080

Legal: CROMWELL PLACE SUBJ TO ALLEY; VAC ALLEY ACCRUING & IN AUD SUBD NO.4; EX SELY 75.99 FT LOT 19 & IN SD CROMWELL PLACE LOTS 1 THRU LOT 12 BLK 1

(C.F. No. 05-52, § 1, 2-23-05)

Sec. 74.06.2. Record of legal descriptions.

The city clerk shall record the legal description of the University-Raymond Commercial Historic District with the county recorder and the county registrar of titles as required under section 73.09 of the Saint Paul Legislative Code.

(C.F. No. 05-52, § 1, 2-23-05)

Sec. 74.06.3. Design review guidelines, purpose and intent.

(a) The following guidelines for design review serve as the basis for the heritage preservation commission's permit review decisions in the University-Raymond Commercial Historic District. The guidelines define the most important elements of the historic district's unique physical appearance and are intended to state the best means of preserving and enhancing these elements in rehabilitation or new construction. When applying the guidelines, the commission, in clearly defined cases of economic hardship, will also consider deprivation of the owners reasonable use of property.

(b) The commission shall conduct its design review for all projects in the district according to the secretary of the interior's "Standards for Rehabilitation" (1995). These standards shall be applied to all district projects in a reasonable manner and take into consideration their economic and technical feasibility. The ten (10) standards are:

(1) A property shall be used for its historic purpose or be placed in a new use that requires minimal change to the defining characteristics of the building and its site and environment.

(2) The historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved. The removal of historic materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided.

(3) Each property shall be recognized as a physical record of its time, place, and use. Changes that create a false sense of historical development, such as adding conjectural features or architectural elements from other buildings, shall not be undertaken.

(4) Most properties change over time; those changes that have acquired historic significance in their own right shall be retained and preserved.

(5) Distinctive features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a historic property shall be preserved.

(6) Deteriorated historic features shall be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature shall match the old in design, color, texture, and other visual qualities and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features shall be substantiated by

documentary, physical, or pictorial evidence.

(7) Chemical or physical treatments, such as sandblasting, that cause damage to historic materials shall not be used. The surface cleaning of structures, if appropriate, shall be undertaken using the gentlest means possible.

(8) Significant archeological resources affected by a project shall be protected and preserved. If such resources must be disturbed, mitigation measures shall be undertaken.

(9) New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction shall not destroy historic materials that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features to protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment.

(10) New additions and adjacent or related new construction shall be undertaken in such a manner that if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.

(c) Restoration and rehabilitation.

(1) *Masonry and walls.*

a. *Use of materials.* Original masonry and mortar should be retained whenever possible without the application of any surface treatment. A similar material should be used to repair or replace, where necessary, deteriorated masonry. New masonry added to the structure or site, such as new foundations or retaining walls, should be compatible with the color, texture and bonding of original or existing masonry. Formstone, stucco and wood or metal siding or paneling should not be used.

b. *Cleaning.* Masonry should be cleaned only when necessary to halt deterioration or to remove graffiti and stains and always with the gentlest method possible such as low pressure water (under 300 psi) and soft bristle brushes. Brick and stone surface should not be sandblasted with dry or wet grit or other abrasives. Abrasive cleaning methods can erode the hard surface of the material and accelerate deterioration. Chemical cleaning products which could have an adverse chemical reaction with the masonry material such as acid on limestone or marble should not be used. Chemical solvents should not be used at all except for removing iron and oil stains. It is preferable to use water with a non-ionic biodegradable detergent. Mortar should be repointed and window frames should be caulked before cleaning.

Waterproof or water repellent coatings or surface consolidation treatments should not be applied unless required to solve a specific technical problem that has been studied and identified and determined to comply with applicable design guidelines. In general, however, coatings are frequently unnecessary, expensive, and can accelerate deterioration of the masonry.

c. *Repointing.* Repointing should be done on those mortar joints where there is evidence of moisture problems or when mortar is missing to allow water to stand on the mortar joint. Using pneumatic hammers to remove mortar can seriously damage the adjacent brick and only motorized tools that do not damage brick should be used. Vertical joints should be hand chiseled. When repointing, it is important to use the same materials as the existing mortar. This includes matching the color, texture, coefficients of expansion and contraction, and ingredient ratio of the original mortar mix, creating a bond similar to the original. A professional mortar analysis can give this information. Repointing with Portland cement mortar may create a bond stronger than is appropriate for the building materials, possibly resulting in cracking or other damage. Old mortar should be

duplicated in joint size, method of application and joint profile.

d. *Painting.* The original or early color and texture of masonry surfaces should be retained, including early signage wherever possible. Brick or stone surfaces may have been painted or whitewashed for practical and aesthetic reasons and paint should not be indiscriminately removed from masonry surfaces as this may subject the building to damage and change its appearance. If masonry surfaces were not originally painted or ever intended to be painted, they should not be painted.

(2) *Windows and doors.*

a. *Openings.* Existing window and door openings should be retained. New window and door openings should not be introduced into the principal elevations. Enlarging or reducing window or door opening to fit stock window sash or new stock door sizes should not be done. Infilling of window openings or installing new openings may be permissible on secondary facades if standard sizes approximate the size and proportions of the opening. Generally, a secondary facade will be considered as any facade not facing the street and not having the ornamentation and higher quality materials usually associated with street facades.

b. *Panes, sashes and hardware.* It is desirable to retain original windows and doors, but they may need replacement for functional reasons. Replacement is clearly acceptable for functional reasons if new materials closely match original materials. Different materials may be acceptable on a case-by-case basis. Window panes should be two-way glass. No reflective or spandrel glass is permitted. The stylistic period or periods a building represents should be respected. Shutters are generally inappropriate in the district. Missing or irreparable windows should be replaced with new windows that match the original in material, size, general muntin and mullion proportion and configuration and reflective qualities of the glass. Replacement sash should not alter the setback relationship between window and wall.

Heating and air conditioning units should not be installed in the window frames when the sash and frames may be damaged. Window installations should be considered only when all other viable heating and cooling systems would result in significant damage to historic materials. Window installations may be acceptable in minor facades.

c. *Storm windows.* Storm windows and doors should be compatible with the character of the building and should not damage window and door frames, or require removal of original windows and doors. Exterior storm windows should be appropriate in size and color and should be operable.

d. *Awnings and canopies.* Awnings and canopies should not be used when they conceal richly detailed entries and windows. Aluminum or plastic awnings shall not be used. Large lettering or font styles inconsistent with the historical and architectural character shall not be used on awnings. Awnings should have a traditional shape such as a tent shape or be rounded when the opening is arched.

e. *Lintels, arches, and sills.* Lintels, sills, architraves, pediments, hoods and steps should be retained or repaired if possible. Existing colors and textures should be matched when repairing these elements.

f. *Storefronts.* Original or storefronts determined to have historical, architectural or engineering significance should be retained and repaired including windows, sash, doors, transoms, signage, and decorative features where such features

contribute to the architectural and historic character of the building. Where original or early storefronts no longer exist or are too deteriorated to save, the commercial character of the building should be retained through: (1) contemporary design which is compatible with the scale, design, materials, color and texture of the historic buildings; or (2) an accurate restoration of the storefront based on historical research and physical evidence. Storefronts or new design elements on the ground floor, such as arcades, should not be introduced which alter the architectural and historic character of the building and its relationship with the street or its setting or which cause destruction of significant historic fabric. Materials which detract from the historic or architectural character of the building, such as mirrored glass, should not be used. Entrances through significant storefronts should not be altered.

(3) *Roofs, cornices and other details.*

a. *Roof shape.* The original roof shape should be preserved. New skylights and vents should be behind and below parapet level. When the roof is visible from street level, the original material should be retained if possible, otherwise it should be replaced with new material that matches the old in composition, size, shape, color, and texture.

b. *Cornices and other details.* All architectural features that give the roof its essential character should be preserved or replaced. Similar material should be used to repair/replace deteriorating or missing architectural elements such as cornices, brackets, railings, shutters, steps and chimneys, whenever possible. If an accurate reconstruction of a missing cornice is not feasible, due to cost, structural issues or lack of pictorial documentation, then the intricacy of detail is least important for new elements at or near the roof line. The same massing, proportions, scale and design theme as the original should be retained.

(d) Signs and accessories.

(1) *Signs, generally.* Existing historic signs that reflect the development of the district should be preserved. These signs may be in the form of painted signs on buildings, surface mounted or projecting signs. New signs should be compatible with the character of the district and blend with the character of the structures on or near which they are placed. New signs should not conceal architectural detail, clutter the building's image, or distract from the unity of the facade but, rather, should complement the overall design.

a. *Materials.* Sign materials should complement the materials of the related building and/or the adjacent buildings. Surface design elements should not detract from or conflict with the related structure's age and design in terms of graphics, lettering, and related patterns or pictures. Materials used should be the same as those used for signs during the period of the building's construction, such as wood, wrought iron, steel, and metal grill work. Newer materials such as extruded aluminum and plastics may not be appropriate.

b. *Types.* The sign type should enhance the building's design and materials. There are a number of types of signs which may be used:

1. Single-faced;
2. Projecting, double-faced;
3. Three-dimensional;
4. Painted wall signs; and
5. Temporary signs.

c. *Location and method of attachment.* There should be no sign above the

cornice line or uppermost portion of a facade wall. Signs should not disfigure or conceal architectural details. Painted signs may be permissible on glass windows and doors. The facade should not be damaged in sign application, except for mere attachment. The method of attachment should respect the structure's architectural integrity and should become an extension of the architecture. Projecting signs should have a space separating them from the building (protection of architecture in method of attachment shall be regarded as a basis for granting variance of the normal zoning code prohibition against guy wire supports for projecting signs.)

d. *Lighting.* Location of exterior lights should be appropriate to the structure. Signs should generally be lit from on the site. There should be no flashing, blinking, moving, or varying intensity lighting. Subdued lighting is preferred. Backlit fluorescent or exposed neon are generally inappropriate.

(2) *Accessories.*

a. *Grills, exhaust fans, etc.* Grills, exhaust outlets for air conditioners, bath and kitchen exhaust fans should be incorporated into filler panels, if possible. They may be painted the same color as the filler panel.

(e) *New construction.*

(1) *Generally:* New construction refers to totally new structures, moved-in structures and new additions to existing structures. Any new construction should possess height, massing, setback, materials and rhythms compatible with surrounding structures. The reproduction of historic design and details is recommended only for limited cases of infill or small scale construction. Guidelines for new construction focus on general rather than specific design elements in order to encourage architectural innovation.

a. *Setback.* There are a variety of setbacks expressed in the University-Raymond Commercial Historic District. However, new setbacks should relate to adjacent historic buildings

b. *Massing, volume, height.* Most of the structures of the district are distinguished by their boxy profiles; preservation of this aspect is the most essential element for maintaining district unity. New construction should be compatible with the massing, volume, and height, of existing structures in the historic district.

c. *Rhythm.* The rhythm in the University-Raymond Commercial Historic District can be found both in the relation of several buildings to each other, and in the relation of elements on a single building facade. Rhythm between buildings is usually distinguished by slight variations in height, windows and doors, and details, including vertical and horizontal elements. Rhythm may be accentuated by slight projections and recessions of the facade, causing the scale of the building to match that of its neighbors. The rhythm of new construction should be compatible with that of existing structures.

d. *Roofs, cornices.* New roof, and cornice designs should be compatible with existing adjacent structures. Generally, roofs in the district are flat. It is more important for roof edges to relate in size and proportion, than in detailing.

e. *Materials and details.* Brick and pressed brick, Bedford stone and Mankato-Kasota stone, terra-cotta, ceramic tile, concrete, metal and glass are the most commonly used materials in the district.

The materials and details of new construction should relate to the materials and details of existing adjacent buildings. New buildings in the district should possess more detailing than typical modern commercial buildings, to respond to the

surrounding buildings and to reinforce the human scale of the district. Walls of buildings in the district are generally of brick with stone trim. They display the colors of natural clay, dark red, buff, and brown. When walls are painted, similar earthtones are usually used.

f. *Windows, doors.* Windows should relate to those of existing buildings in the district in the ratio of solid to void, distribution of window openings, and window setback. The proportion, size, style, function and detailing of windows and doors in new construction should relate to that of existing adjacent buildings. Window and door frames should be wood or bronze-finished aluminum.

g. *Parking.* The preferred location of parking lots is behind the buildings rather than in front or beside them. If street frontage is the only option, the lots should be screened from street and sidewalk either by walls or plantings or both. If walls are used, their materials should be compatible with the walls of existing adjacent buildings. Walls should be at least eighteen (18) inches high. Walls or plantings should be located to disrupt the street plane as little as possible.

h. *Landscaping, street furniture.* Traditional street elements of the area should be preserved. New street furniture and landscaping features should compliment the scale and character of the area.

(C.F. No. 05-52, § 2, 2-23-05)

Sec. 74.06.4. Guidelines for non-contributing and contemporary buildings.

(a) *Change to contributing status.* A building classified as non-contributing to the historic district but built within the period of significance established for the district that has been substantially altered may be reclassified as a contributing building, if it is returned to its original historic facade by means of restoration or replication.

(b) *Noncontributing and contemporary building additions and alterations.* Additions and alterations to noncontributing and contemporary buildings must be sympathetic and subordinate to original building and adjacent structures. These changes must help the original better fit its context. Guidelines for new construction shall apply to noncontributing and contemporary buildings.

(C.F. No. 05-52, § 2, 2-23-05)

Sec. 74.06.5. Demolition.

Proposals for demolishing structures, while reviewed with special care by the heritage preservation commission, are not necessarily in conflict with district guidelines. When reviewing proposals for demolition of structures within the district, the heritage preservation commission refers to subsection 73.06(i)(2) of the Saint Paul Legislative Code which states the following:

In the case of the proposed demolition of a building, prior to approval of said demolition, the commission shall make written findings on the following: the architectural and historical merit of the building, the effect of the demolition on surrounding buildings, the effect of any proposed new construction on the remainder of the building (in case of partial demolition) and on surrounding buildings, and the economic value or usefulness of the building as it now exists or if altered or modified in comparison with the value or usefulness of any proposed structures designated to replace the present building or buildings.

(C.F. No. 05-52, § 2, 2-23-05)

Secs. 74.07--74.20. Reserved.

ARTICLE II. SUMMIT AVENUE WEST HERITAGE PRESERVATION DISTRICT*

***Editor's note:** Being not specifically amendatory of the Code, Ord. No. 17716, adopted March 1, 1990, has been codified as Art. II to a new Ch. 74 at the discretion of the editor.

Division 1. Generally

Sec. 74.21. Description of preservation district property.

Pursuant to the authority contained in Chapter 73 of the Saint Paul Legislative Code, upon the recommendation of the heritage preservation commission of the city, and after having duly considered the matter at a public hearing held in accordance with Chapter 73, the council of the City of Saint Paul does hereby designate the following described property as the Summit Avenue West Heritage Preservation District (this description is arranged with the south side of Summit Avenue first from east to west, then the north side of Summit Avenue from east to west).

South Side, East to West

Oxford to Lexington: Summit Park Addition, Block 39, Lots 1--14, except the south 100 feet of Lots 1 and 2, the south 40 feet of Lots 9, 10 and 11, and the south 105 feet of the west half of Lot 12, Lot 13, and Lot 14.

Lexington to Ayd Mill Road: Manson and Simonton's Addition, Block 1, Lots 1--14 and Block 2, Lots 1--14.

Ayd Mill Road to Hamline: Stinson's Boulevard Addition, Block 1, Lots 1--9 and Block 2, Lots 1--15.

Hamline to Pascal: Wann's Addition, Block 1, Lots 1--14 and Block 4, Lots 1--15.

Pascal to Snelling: Summit View Addition, Block 1, Lots 1--9; Wann's Addition, Block 7, Lots 9--11; and Summit View, Block 2, Lots 1--12.

Snelling to Macalester Street: (unplatted Macalester College campus) block bounded by Summit, Snelling, Grand and Macalester, except the south 280 feet of the east 250 feet.

Macalester to Wheeler: Macalester Park, Block 1, Lots 1 and 2 and Block 2, Lots 1--11; and Elmer and Morrison's Addition, Block 2, Lots 1--4 and the vacated alley.

Wheeler to Fairview: Rearrangement of Block 3 of Macalester Park Addition, Block 3, Lots 1--8.

Fairview to Prior: Rosedale Park Addition, Block 1, Lots 1--26.

Prior to Cleveland: Rosedale Park Addition, Block 2, Lots 1--25.

Cleveland to Cretin: Groveland Addition, Block 1, Lots 1--15; Summit Wood (no block number), Lots 1--15.

Cretin to Mississippi River: Government Lot 3 (St. Paul Seminary campus), the area north of a line beginning at the west right-of-way of Cretin 410 feet south of Summit; thence west 785.89 feet; thence south 98.04 feet; thence west to the meander line of the east bank of the Mississippi River; thence north along the meander line to join the north boundary.

North Side, East to West

Lexington to Ayd Mill Road: Wright's Rear of Blocks 22, 23, 24 and 25 of Anna E. Ramsey's Addition, Block 2, Lots 15--28, Block 1, Lots 16--28, and the south 75 feet of Lot 15; and Anna E. Ramsey's Enlargement, Block 29, the south 47 feet of Lots 7 and 8.

Ayd Mill Road to Hamline: Anna E. Ramsey's Enlargement, Block 30, Lots 4--8 and Block 31, Lots 15--28.

Hamline to Pascal: Boulevard Addition #3, Block 1, Lots 8--14; Boulevard Addition #2, Block 14, Lots 8--14; and Boulevard Addition #1, Block 13, Lots 16--30.

Pascal to Snelling: Summit Avenue Addition, Block 10, Lots 1--6, the south 160 feet of the vacated Warwick Street between Blocks 9 and 10, Block 9, Lots 1--6, and Block 8, Lots 1--6; and Dobson's Rearrangement, Lots 1--3.

Snelling to Aldine: Thurston and Lambie's Addition, Block 4, Lots 11--19, and Block 3, Lots 3 and 4; P. V. Dwyer's Addition, Block 1, Lots 8--14; and Schroeder's Addition, Block 17, Lots 8--14.

Aldine to Fairview: Schroeder's Addition, Block 18, Lots 4--6; Walnut Grove, Lots 7--12; Hussey and Haskell's Addition, Block 2, Lots 4--6; Whitacre Place; and Egbert G. Handy's Addition, Block 7, Lots 13--24.

Fairview to Cleveland: Merriam Park Third Addition, Block 18, Lots 8--14; Block 17, Lots 13--24; Block 16, Lots 12--22; Block 15, Lots 8--14; Block 14, Lots 9--16; and Block 13, Lots 9--16.

Cleveland to Cretin: (unplatted College of St. Thomas campus) the south 227 feet of the block bounded by Summit, Cleveland, Selby and Cretin.

Cretin to Mississippi River: Kingston's Subdivision, Lots 1--20, except the north 123.56 feet of the east 20 feet of Lot 9, and the unplatted area south of a line beginning at the northernmost corner of the remainder of Lot 9 and proceeding west to the meander line of the east bank of the Mississippi River; thence south along the meander line to join the south boundary.

(Ord. No. 17716, § 1, 3-1-90)

Secs. 74.22--74.34. Reserved.

Division 2. Guidelines For Design Review

Sec. 74.35. Intent and purpose.

(a) The following guidelines for design review will serve as the basis for the heritage preservation commission's permit review decisions in the Summit Avenue West Heritage Preservation District. The guidelines define the most important elements of the Summit Avenue West District's unique physical appearance and set forth standards for preserving and enhancing these elements in rehabilitation or new construction.

(b) The City of Saint Paul, a certified local government in the National Historic Preservation Program, has agreed to conduct its design review of locally designated heritage preservation sites and districts according to the Secretary of the Interior's standards for rehabilitation. The

following guidelines have been reviewed and approved by the Minnesota State Historic Preservation Officer as containing criteria which will substantially achieve the purpose of preserving and rehabilitating buildings of significance to the district.

(c) These guidelines are not hard and fast regulations. They are flexible criteria. Their purpose is to provide assurance to property owners that permit review will be based on clear standards rather than the taste of individual commission members. The guidelines will be interpreted with flexibility depending on the particular merit of the building or area under review. Consideration will be given to the unavailability or expense of historical materials. When applying the guidelines the commission will also be considerate of clearly defined cases of economic hardship or deprivation of the owner of reasonable use of the property.

(Ord. No. 17716, § 2(1), 3-1-90)

Sec. 74.36. Restoration and rehabilitation.

(a) General Principles:

(1) All work should be of a character and quality that maintains the distinguishing features of the building and the environment. The removal or alteration of distinctive architectural features should be avoided.

(2) Deteriorated architectural features should be repaired rather than replaced whenever possible. In the event of replacement, new materials should match the original in composition, design, color, texture and appearance. Duplication of original design based on physical or pictorial evidence is preferable to using conjectural of "period" designs or using parts of other buildings.

(3) Distinctive stylistic features or examples of skilled craftsmanship characteristic of structures of a period should be treated sensitively.

(4) Buildings should be used for their originally intended purpose or compatible uses which require minimum alteration of the building and its site.

(5) In general, buildings should be restored to their original appearance. However, alterations to buildings since their construction are sometimes significant because they reflect the history of the building and neighborhood. This significance should be respected and restoration to an "original" appearance may not be desirable in some cases. All buildings should be recognized as products of their own time and not be altered to resemble buildings from an earlier era.

(6) Whenever possible, new additions or alterations to structures should be done in such a manner that if such additions or alterations were to be removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the structure would be unimpaired.

(b) Walls and Foundations:

(1) Deteriorated surface materials should be replaced with material used in original construction or with materials that resemble the appearance of the old as closely as possible. Imitative materials, such as artificial stone and artificial brick veneer, should not be used.

(2) Original masonry and mortar should be retained whenever possible without the application of any surface treatment. Masonry should be cleaned only when necessary to halt deterioration and always with the gentlest method possible, such as low pressure water and soft natural bristle brushes. Brick and stone surfaces should not be sandblasted. This method of cleaning erodes the surface of the material and accelerates deterioration. Chemical cleaning products which could have an adverse chemical reaction with the masonry material should not be used.

(3) Original mortar joint size and profile should be retained and replacement mortar should match the original mortar in color and texture. Materials and ingredient proportions similar to the original mortar should be used when repointing, with replacement mortar softer than the masonry units and no harder than the historic mortar. This will create a bond similar to the original and is necessary to prevent damage to the masonry units. Repointing with mortar of high Portland cement content often creates a bond stronger than is appropriate for the original building materials, possibly resulting in cracking or other damage. Mortar joints should be carefully washed after set-up to retain the neatness of the joint lines and keep extraneous mortar off of masonry surfaces.

(4) The original color and texture of masonry surfaces should be retained. While unpainted masonry surfaces should not be painted, paint should not be indiscriminately removed from masonry surfaces because some brick surfaces were originally meant to be painted. Color is a significant design element, and paint colors should be appropriate to the period and style of the structure. Building permits are not required for painting and, although the heritage preservation commission may review and comment on paint color, paint color is not subject to heritage preservation commission approval.

(c) *Roofs and Chimneys:*

(1) Original roofing materials should be retained unless deteriorated. When partially reroofing, deteriorated roof coverings should be replaced with new materials that match the old in composition, size, shape and texture. When entirely reroofing, new materials which differ to such an extent from the old in composition, size, shape, color or texture that the appearance of the buildings is altered should not be used. The predominant roof materials on west Summit are tile and asphalt shingles. Tile roofs are either red or green, generally to complement rather than match the color of the house. When asphalt shingles began to be used in the 1890s and early twentieth century, the most common colors were solid, uniform, deep red and solid, uniform, dark green. Dark brown, dark gray, and a weathered-wood color may also be acceptable for new asphalt shingles, and black may be acceptable for Colonial Revival houses built after the 1920s.

(2) The original roof type, slope and overhangs should be preserved. The shape of existing dormers should also be preserved. New dormers may be acceptable in some cases if compatible with the original design. Modern skylights are a simple way to alter a roof to admit light and air without disrupting its plane surface, are less noticeable than dormers, and may also be acceptable. Skylights should be flat and as close to the roof plane as possible. They should not be placed on the front roof plane.

(3) Chimneys should be restored to their original condition. In the absence of historical documentation on the original design, chimney design should be in keeping with the period and style of the building.

(d) *Windows and Doors:*

(1) Existing window and door openings should be retained. New window and door openings should not be introduced into principal elevations. Enlarging or reducing window or door openings to fit stock window sash or new stock door sizes should not be done. The size of window panes or sash should not be altered. Such changes destroy the scale and proportion of the building.

(2) Window sash, glass, lintels, sills, architraves, doors, pediments, hoods, steps and all hardware should be retained. Discarding original doors and door hardware, when they can be repaired and reused in place, should be avoided.

(3) The stylistic period(s) a building represents should be respected. If replacement of window sash or doors is necessary, the replacement should duplicate the material, design and hardware of the older window sash or door. Inappropriate new window and door features such as aluminum storm and screen window combinations, plastic or

metal strip awnings, or fake shutters that disturb the character and appearance of the building should not be used. Combination storm windows should have wood frames or be painted to match trim colors.

(e) *Exterior Architectural Features:*

(1) Porches and steps which are appropriate to the building and its development should be maintained or restored. Porches and steps removed from the building should be reconstructed to be compatible in design and detail with the period and style of the building. In general, front porches should not be enclosed and precast steps should be avoided.

(2) Decorative architectural features such as cornices, brackets, railings and those around front doors and windows should be preserved. New material used to repair or replace, where necessary, deteriorated architectural features of wood, iron, cast iron, terra-cotta, tile and brick should match the original as closely as possible.

(3) Shutters should not be used on buildings not designed for them. If used, they should be large enough to cover the entire window area, should be functional and operable, and should not look as if they were simply flat-mounted on the wall.

(4) Deck and firestair additions may be acceptable in some cases, but should be kept to the rear of buildings where they will be the most inconspicuous and detract the least from the historical context. The detailing of decks and exterior stairs should be compatible with the period and style of the building.

(Ord. No. 17116, § 2(2), 3-1-90)

Sec. 74.37. New construction.

(a) *General Principles:* The basic principle for new construction in the Summit Avenue West District is to maintain the scale and quality of design of the district. The Summit Avenue West District is architecturally diverse within an overall pattern of harmony and continuity. These guidelines for new construction focus on general rather than specific design elements in order to encourage architectural innovation and quality design while maintaining the harmony and continuity of the district. New construction should be compatible with the size, scale, massing, height, rhythm, setback, color, material, building elements, site design, and character of surrounding structures and the area.

(b) *Massing and Scale:* New construction should conform to the massing, volume, height, facade proportions and scale of existing surrounding structures. The scale of the spaces between buildings and the rhythm of buildings to open space should also be carefully considered. New houses should be at least twenty-five (25) feet high and relate to the height of existing adjacent houses. New college buildings should relate to nearby contributing college buildings; new college buildings with a smaller setback from Summit should have a correspondingly lower height.

(c) *Materials and Details:*

(1) Variety in the use of architectural materials and details adds to the intimacy and visual delight of the district. But there is also an overall thread of continuity provided by the range of materials commonly used along Summit and by the way these materials are used. This thread of continuity is threatened by the introduction of new industrial materials and the aggressive exposure of earlier materials such as concrete block, metal framing and glass. The materials and details of new construction should relate to the materials and details of existing nearby buildings.

(2) Most buildings on Summit are built of high-quality materials, often with brick or

stucco walls and asphalt or tile roofs. Most brick is red and tile roofs are either red or green. Vinyl, metal or hardboard siding is acceptable only for accessory structures which are not visible from Summit. Imitative materials such as artificial stone and artificial brick veneer should not be used. Materials will be reviewed to determine their appropriate use in relation to the overall design of the structure.

(3) The materials and details of new college buildings should relate to the materials and details of nearby contributing college buildings. The Macalester College campus has buildings predominantly of red brick with concrete or sandstone trim. The College of St. Thomas presents cream-colored Kasota stone buildings to the Summit Avenue streetscape.

(4) The color of materials should relate to surrounding structures and the area as well as to the style of the structure. Building permits are not required for painting and, although the heritage preservation commission may review and comment on paint color, paint color is not subject to heritage preservation commission approval.

(d) *Building Elements*: Individual elements of a building should be integrated into its composition for a balanced and complete design. These elements of new construction should compliment existing adjacent structures as well.

(1) *Roofs*. There is a great variety of roof treatments along Summit, but gable and hipped roofs are most common. The skyline or profile of new construction should relate to the predominant roof shape of existing nearby buildings.

The recommended pitch for gable roofs is 9:12 (rise-to-run ratio) and in general the minimum appropriate pitch is 8:12. Highly visible secondary structure roofs should match the roof pitch of the main structure. A 6:12 pitch may be acceptable in some cases for secondary structures which are not visible from the street.

Roof hardware such as skylights, vents and metal pipe chimneys should not be placed on the front roof plane.

(2) *Windows and doors*. The proportion, size, rhythm and detailing of windows and doors should be compatible with that of existing nearby buildings. Facade openings of the same general size as those in nearby buildings are encouraged. Sliding windows, awning windows and horizontally oriented muntins are not common in the district and are generally unacceptable. Vertical muntins and muntin grids may be acceptable when compatible with the period and style of the building. Sliding glass doors should not be used where they would be visible from the street.

Although not usually improving the appearance of a building, the use of metal windows or doors need not necessarily ruin it. The important thing is that they should look like part of the building and not like the raw metal appliances. Appropriately colored bronze-toned aluminum is acceptable. Mill finish (silver) aluminum should be avoided.

(3) *Porches and decks*. Front entrance ways should be articulated with a suitable design element to provide a transitional zone between the public outdoors and the private interior, and should be appropriate in detail to the size and style of the building. If front porches are constructed, they should generally not be enclosed.

Decks should be kept to the rear of the buildings, should be visually refined, and should be integrated into the overall building design. A raised deck protruding from a single wall usually appears disjointed from the total design and is generally unacceptable.

(e) *Site*:

(1) *Setback siting*. New buildings should generally face Summit Avenue and be sited at a distance not more than five (5) percent out-of-line from the front yard setback of existing adjacent buildings. Setbacks greater than those of adjacent buildings may be allowed in some cases.

(2) *Landscaping.* The streetscape can be divided into three (3) visual areas: public, semipublic and private. Public space is provided by the publicly owned sidewalks, boulevards, streets and medians. Semipublic space includes front yards and side yards on corners. While privately owned, this space is open to view by passersby. Private space is generally that which lies behind the front face of the building. Buildings, landscaping elements in front yards and boulevard trees provide a "wall of enclosure" for the street "room." Generally, landscaping which respects the street as a public room is encouraged. Boulevard trees mark a separation between the automobile corridor and the rest of the streetscape and should be maintained. Front yard enclosures such as hedges or walls are not common along west Summit. When they are used, they should permit visual penetration of the semipublic space. Low hedges or limestone retaining walls and visually open fences, such as wrought iron, are preferred. Chain link fences, while visually transparent, should not be used in front yards or in the front half of side yards. Privacy fences, timber retaining walls and high hedges are also inappropriate in front yards.

(3) *Garages and parking.* Parking spaces should not be located in front yards. Residential parking spaces should be located in rear yards. If an alley is adjacent to a dwelling, any new garage should be located off the alley.

Institutional parking lots should ideally be located behind buildings where they would not be visible from Summit Avenue. When this is not possible, parking lots should be set back at least as far as the building facades and screened from view from Summit by landscaping such as hedges, brick walls and changes of grade that sink the parking from view. Shade trees should be planted between parking lots and the street and plant materials should relate to the traditional character of the district. The scale, level of light output, and design of parking lot lighting should be compatible with the sixteen-foot-high, lantern-style lights along Summit Avenue.

(f) *Public infrastructure:* Summit Avenue itself, a wide parkway with well-landscaped boulevards running continuously in a 200-foot right-of-way for two and one-half (2 1/2) miles from Lexington Parkway to the Mississippi River, represents an early city planning effort to create an exclusive residential area and is of utmost importance to the significance and integrity of the Summit Avenue West Heritage Preservation District. The development of Summit Avenue as a wide parkway, along with the adoption in 1915 of an ordinance restricting Summit to one- and two-family residential, church and school uses, helped to ensure the quality of development along the avenue. The pattern of Summit Avenue's boulevards and sidewalks should be maintained. Distinctive features of public spaces in the area, such as the early twentieth century lantern-style street lights, should be preserved. New street furniture such as benches, sign standards, traffic signals and trash containers should be compatible with the character of the district. Electric, telephone and cable TV lines should be placed underground or along alleys and meters should be placed where inconspicuous.

(g) *Signs:* Signs should be compatible with the character of the district. Sign materials and design should complement the materials and design of the related building and/or adjacent buildings.

(Ord. No. 17116, § 2(3), 3-1-90)

Sec. 74.38. Moving of structures.

Proposals for moving structures out of the Summit Avenue West District are reviewed using the guidelines for demolition. Proposals for moving structures onto property located within the district are reviewed using the guidelines for new construction as well as guidelines for restoration and rehabilitation. Proposals for moving structures within the district are reviewed using guidelines for all of the above.

(Ord. No. 17116, § 2(4), 3-1-90)

Sec. 74.39. Demolition.

Proposals for demolishing structures, while reviewed with special care by the heritage preservation commission, are not necessarily in conflict with district guidelines. When reviewing proposals for demolition of structures within the district, the heritage preservation commission refers to Section 73.07(9)(b) of the Saint Paul Legislative Code which states the following:

"In the case of the proposed demolition of a building, prior to approval of said demolition the commission shall make written findings on the following: architectural and historical merit of the building, the effect of the demolition on surrounding buildings, the effect of any proposed new construction on the remainder of the building (in case of partial demolition) and on surrounding buildings, and the economic value or usefulness of the building as it now exists or if altered or modified in comparison with the value or usefulness of any proposed structures designated to replace the present building or buildings."

(Ord. No. 17116, § 2(5), 3-1-90)

Secs. 74.40--74.50. Reserved.

ARTICLE III. HERITAGE HILL HISTORIC PRESERVATION DISTRICT

Division 1. Generally

Sec. 74.51. Boundaries of district and legally described property therein.

(a) Pursuant to the authority contained in Chapter 73 of the Saint Paul Legislative Code, upon the recommendation of the Heritage Preservation Commission of the city, and after having duly considered the matter at a public hearing held in accordance with Chapter 73, the following described property is included within the designated Historic Hill Heritage Preservation District. The boundary of the district is as follows:

Beginning at the Intersection of Marshall Avenue and John Ireland Boulevard; south along John Ireland Boulevard to Summit Avenue; southeast along Old Kellogg Boulevard to College Avenue; southwest to the eastern end of Irvine Avenue; southwest on Irvine Avenue to Western Avenue; south on Western Avenue to Ramsey Street; southwest along the alley to Grand Avenue; northwest along Grand Avenue to Oakland Avenue; northwest on Oakland Avenue to the alley between Grand Avenue and Summit Avenue; west on the alley to Oxford Street; north on Oxford Street to Summit Avenue; west on Summit Avenue to Lexington Parkway; north on Lexington Parkway to the alley between Portland Avenue and Ashland Avenue; east on the alley to Victoria Street; south on Victoria Street to the alley between Holly Avenue and Portland Avenue; east on the alley to Avon Street; south on Avon Street to Portland Avenue; east on Portland Avenue to St. Albans Street; south on St. Albans Street to the alley between Portland Avenue and Summit Avenue; east along the alley to Dale Street; north on Dale Street to the alley between Selby Avenue and Dayton Avenue; west on the alley to Grotto Street; north on Grotto Street to the alley between Dayton Avenue and Marshall Avenue; east on the alley to Dale Street; north on Dale Street to a point mid-block between Marshall Avenue and Iglehart Avenue; east from this point to Kent Street; south on Kent Street to Marshall Avenue; east on Marshall Avenue to Mackubin Street; north on Mackubin Street to the alley

between Iglehart Avenue and Carroll Avenue; east on the alley to Arundel Street; south on Arundel Street to the alley between Selby Avenue and Laurel Avenue; east on the alley to the alley between Arundel Street and Western Avenue; north from this point to Selby Avenue; east on Selby Avenue to Western Avenue; north on Western Avenue to Marshall Avenue; east on Marshall Avenue to Virginia Street; south on Virginia Street to a point mid-block between Marshall Avenue and Dayton Avenue; east from this point to a point mid-block between Virginia Street and Farrington Street; north fifty and five-tenths (50.5) feet; east twenty-two (22) feet; north to Marshall Avenue; east on Marshall Avenue to Farrington Street; south on Farrington Street to a point mid-block between Marshall Avenue and Dayton Street; east from this point to Louis Street; south on Louis Street to Dayton Avenue; east on Dayton Avenue to the southwest corner of Summit Park; northeast from this point to Marshall Avenue; and east on Marshall Avenue to the point of beginning at the intersection of Marshall Avenue and John Ireland Boulevard.

(b) The Historic Hill Heritage Preservation District shall include the following legally described property:

Auditor's Subdivision No. 11;

Auditor's Subdivision No. 38;

Auditor's Subdivision No. 52;

Bryant's Addition: Block 3, Lots 8--14; Block 4; Block 5; Block 6, Lots 8--14; and parts of NE 1/4, Section 2, Township 28, Range 23, which are south of Portland Avenue, north of Summit Avenue, east and west of Block 5, Bryant's Addition and in said Bryant's Addition;

Bryant's Subdivision;

Cathedral Terrace Addition No. 2;

Cochran's Subdivision, Lots 1--12;

Dayton and Irvine's Addition: Block 69; Block 70, Lots 1--8; Blocks 72--80; Block 81, Lot 1, Lots 5--8, and Lot 2, except the west 29 feet of the north 66 feet; Block 82, Lots 5--6, the southeast part of Lot 7, the south 8.3 feet of Lot 16, the south 16.5 feet of Lots 13--15 and 24--25, Lots 26--39, and Lots 42--46; and Block 87;

Drakes Subdivision;

Fuller's Subdivision;

Goodkind Terrace;

Heather's Subdivision;

Holcombe's Addition: Block 1, Lots 10--18; Block 2, Lots 18--34; Block 3, Lots 1--15; Block 4, Lots 1--8; Block 15; and Block 16, Lots 16--30;

Mackubin and Marshall's Addition: Block 20, Lots 16--30; Block 21; and Block 26, Lots 16--30;

Otis' Rearrangement;

Portland Terrace;

H.M. Rice's Rearrangement;

W.C. Riley's Rearrangement;

Roger's Rearrangement;

Selby Block (Auditor's Subdivision No. 5);

Selby, McClung and Van Meter's Addition;

Steven's Rearrangement;

Summit Avenue Terrace;

Summit Bluff;

Summit Court;

Summit Park Addition: Block 1, Lots 1--13; Block 6, Lots 1--15; Block 7, Lots 1--14; Block 18, Lots 1--14; Block 20, Lots 15--28; Block 21; Block 22, Lots 1--14; Block 27, Lots 1--14; Block 28; Block 29, Lots 15--28; Block 32, Lots 15--28; Block 33; Block 34, Lots 1--14; Block 40; and Block 41, Lots 15--28;

Summit Terrace;

Terrace Park Addition: Block 2; Block 3; Block 4, Lots 1--10; and Block 8, Lots 1--7;

Thompson's Subdivision;

Thurston's Subdivision;

Wann's Subdivision;

Weed and Willius Rearrangement;

Woodland Park Addition: Blocks 1--10; Block 11, Lots 1--12; and Blocks 12--23.

(Ord. No. 17815, §§ 1, 2, 4-2-91)

Secs. 74.52--74.62. Reserved.

Division 2. Guidelines For Design Review

Sec. 74.63. Intent and purpose.

(a) The following guidelines for design review serve as the basis for the heritage preservation commission's permit review decisions in the Historic Hill Heritage Preservation District. The guidelines define the most important elements of the Hill District's unique architectural character and set forth standards for preserving and enhancing these elements in rehabilitation or new construction. Their purpose is to provide clear, written guidelines for use by property owners and by the commission in making permit review decisions.

(b) These guidelines are intended to be flexible as well as clear. When applying the guidelines, for example, the commission will consider the particular merit of the building or area under review. It will also consider such factors as the expense and availability of historic materials and the economic impact of its decisions on property owners. The commission will be considerate of clearly defined cases of economic hardship or deprivation of the owner of reasonable use of the property.

(c) The City of Saint Paul, a certified local government in the National Historic Preservation Program, conducts design review of locally designated heritage preservation sites and districts according to the Secretary of the Interior's *Standards for Rehabilitation*. The following guidelines have been reviewed and approved by the Minnesota State Historic Preservation Officer as containing criteria which will substantially achieve the purpose of preserving and rehabilitating buildings of significance to the district.

(Ord. No. 17815, § 3(l), 2, 4-2-91)

Sec. 74.64. Restoration and rehabilitation.

(a) *General Principles:* The Historic Hill District design guidelines for restoration and rehabilitation are based on the ten (10) standards for rehabilitation developed by the National Park Service, United States Department of the Interior. These standards are published in a 59-page pamphlet entitled *The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation and Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings* (Revised 1983), available for two dollars (\$2.00) from the Superintendent of Documents, U.S. Government Printing Office, Washington, D.C. 20402 (GPO stock number 024-005-01003-3). In addition to the standards themselves, the pamphlet contains examples of recommended approaches to rehabilitation. All projects that owners wish to be certified for purposes of federal historic rehabilitation tax incentives are reviewed and evaluated by the state historic preservation office for conformance with the secretary of the Interior's *Standards for Rehabilitation*. The ten (10) standards are as follows:

- (1) Every reasonable effort shall be made to provide a compatible use for a property which requires minimal alteration of the building, structure, or site and its environment, or to use a property for its originally intended purpose.
- (2) The distinguishing original qualities or character of a building, structure, or site and its environment shall not be destroyed. The removal or alteration of any historic material or distinctive architectural features should be avoided when possible.
- (3) All buildings, structures and sites shall be recognized as products of their own time. Alterations that have no historical basis and which seek to create an earlier appearance shall be discouraged.
- (4) Changes which may have taken place in the course of time are evidence of the history and development of a building, structure, or site and its environment. These changes may have acquired significance in their own right and this significance shall be recognized and respected.
- (5) Distinctive stylistic features or examples of skilled craftsmanship which characterize a building, structure or site shall be treated with sensitivity.
- (6) Deteriorated architectural features shall be repaired rather than replaced, whenever possible. In the event replacement is necessary, the new material should match the material being replaced in composition, design, color, texture and other visual qualities. Repair or replacement of missing architectural features should be based on accurate duplications of features, substantiated by historic, physical or pictorial evidence rather than on conjectural designs or the availability of different architectural elements from other buildings or structures.
- (7) The surface cleaning of structures shall be undertaken with the gentlest means possible. Sandblasting and other cleaning methods that will damage the historic building materials shall not be undertaken.
- (8) Every reasonable effort shall be made to protect and preserve archaeological resources affected by or adjacent to any project.
- (9) Contemporary design for alterations and additions to existing properties shall not be discouraged when such alterations and additions do not destroy significant historical, architectural or cultural material, and such design is compatible with the size, scale, color, material and character of the property, neighborhood or environment.
- (10) Wherever possible, new additions or alterations to structures shall be done in such a manner that if such alterations were to be removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the structure would be unimpaired.

(b) *Masonry and Foundations:*

- (1) Whenever possible, original masonry and mortar should be retained without the

application of any surface treatment. Masonry should be cleaned only when necessary to halt deterioration and always with the gentlest method possible, such as low-pressure water and soft natural bristle brushes. Brick and stone surfaces should not be sandblasted because it erodes the surface of the material and accelerates deterioration. Chemical cleaning products which could have an adverse chemical reaction with the masonry material should not be used.

(2) Original mortar joint size and profile should be retained and replacement mortar should match the original mortar in color and texture. Materials and ingredient proportions similar to the original mortar should be used when repointing, with replacement mortar softer than the masonry units and no harder than the historic mortar. This will create a bond similar to the original and is necessary to prevent damage to the masonry units. Repointing with mortar of high portland cement content often creates a bond stronger than is appropriate for the original building materials, possibly resulting in cracking or other damage. Mortar joints should be carefully washed after setup to retain the neatness of the joint lines and keep extraneous mortar off of masonry surfaces.

(3) The original color and texture of masonry surfaces should be retained. While unpainted masonry surfaces should not be painted, paint should not be indiscriminately removed from masonry surfaces because some brick surfaces were originally meant to be painted.

(c) *Siding and Surface Treatment:*

(1) Deteriorated siding materials should be replaced with material used in original construction or with materials that resemble the appearance of the old as closely as possible. Resurfacing frame buildings with new material such as artificial stone, artificial brick veneer, or asbestos and asphalt shingles is inappropriate and should not be done. Four-inch lap vinyl, metal or hardboard siding may be used in some cases to resurface clapboard structures, especially structures categorized as noncontributive to the district, if well detailed, well designed and in keeping with the historic character of the structure. Ventilation must be carefully provided when using these products to prevent damage to the original wood fabric by trapping moisture. The width, pattern and profile of the original siding should be duplicated. Residing should not alter the profile of bordering trim such as drip caps, frieze boards and corner boards; if replacement is necessary, they should be matched.

(2) Color is a significant design element and paint colors should be appropriate to the period and style of the structure. Building permits are not required for painting and, although the heritage preservation commission may review and comment on paint color, paint color is not subject to commission approval.

(d) *Roofs:*

(1) Original roofing materials should be retained unless deteriorated. When partially reroofing, deteriorated roof coverings should be replaced with new materials that match the old in composition, size, shape and texture. When entirely reroofing, new materials which differ to such an extent from the old in composition, size, shape, color or texture that the appearance of the building is altered should not be used.

(2) Wood shingles in the nineteenth century were often dipped in creosote to preserve them, giving them a very dark brown color. Victorians often stained wood shingles deep red or dark green to complement rather than match the color of the house. When asphalt shingles began to be used in the 1890's, the most common colors were solid, uniform, deep red and solid, uniform, dark green. A weathered-wood color may be acceptable for new asphalt shingles because it is neutral and blends in. Black may be acceptable for Colonial Revival houses built after the 1920's, but it should be avoided for Victorian houses.

(3) The original roof type, slope and overhangs should be preserved. New dormers may be acceptable in some cases if compatible with the original design. Modern skylights are a simple way to alter a roof to admit light and air without disrupting its plane surface, are less noticeable than dormers, and may also be acceptable. Skylights should be flat and as close to the roof plane as possible. They should not be placed on the front roof plane.

(e) *Windows and Doors:*

(1) Existing window and door openings should be retained. New window and door openings should not be introduced into principal elevations. Enlarging or reducing window or door openings to fit stock window sash or new stock door sizes should not be done. The size of window panes or sash should not be altered. Such changes destroy the scale and proportion of the building.

(2) Window sash, glass, lintels, sills, architraves, doors, pediments, hoods, steps and all hardware should be retained. Discarding original doors and door hardware, when they can be repaired and reused in place, should be avoided.

(3) The stylistic period(s) a building represents should be respected. If replacement of window sash or doors is necessary, the replacement should duplicate the material, design and hardware of the older window sash or door. Inappropriate new window and door features such as aluminum storm and screen window combinations, plastic or metal strip awnings, or fake shutters that disturb the character and appearance of the building should not be used. Combination storm windows should have wood frames or be painted to match trim colors.

(f) *Porches and Exterior Architectural Features:*

(1) Porches and steps which are appropriate to the building and its development should be retained. Porches and additions reflecting later styles of architecture are often important to the building's historical integrity and, whenever possible, should be retained. Porches and steps removed from the building should be reconstructed, using photographic documentation and historical research, to be compatible in design and detail with the period and style of the building. In replacing porch railings, it is important to maintain the original spacing, section and profile of the balustrades.

(2) Decorative architectural features such as cornices, brackets, railings, and those around front doors and windows should be preserved. New material used to repair or replace, where necessary, deteriorated architectural features of wood, iron, cast iron, terracotta, tile and brick should match the original as closely as possible.

(3) Shutters should not be used on buildings not designed for them. If used, they should be large enough to cover the entire window area, should be functional and operable, and should not look as if they were simply flat-mounted on the wall.

(4) Deck and firestair additions may be acceptable in some cases, but should be kept to the rear of buildings where they will be the most inconspicuous and detract the least from the historical context. The detailing of decks and exterior stairs should be compatible with the period and style of the building.

(Ord. No. 17815, § 3(II) 4-2-91)

Sec. 74.65. New construction.

(a) *General Principles:* The basic principle for new construction in the Historic Hill District is to maintain the district's scale and quality of design. The Historic Hill District is architecturally diverse within an overall pattern of harmony and continuity. These guidelines for new

construction focus on general rather than specific design elements in order to encourage architectural innovation and quality design while maintaining the harmony and continuity of the district. New construction should be compatible with the size, scale, massing, height, rhythm, setback, color, material, building elements, site design, and character of surrounding structures and the area.

(b) *Massing and Height:* New construction should conform to the massing, volume, height and scale of existing adjacent structures. Typical residential structures in the Historic Hill District are twenty-five (25) to forty (40) feet high. The height of new construction should be no lower than the average height of all buildings on both block faces; measurements should be made from street level to the highest point of the roofs. (This guideline does not supersede the city's zoning code height limitations.)

(c) *Rhythm and Directional Emphasis:* The existence of uniform narrow lots in the Historic Hill District naturally sets up a strong rhythm of buildings to open space. Historically any structure built on more than one (1) lot used vertical facade elements to maintain and vary the overall rhythm of the street rather than interrupting the rhythm with a long monotonous facade. The directional expression of new construction should relate to that of existing adjacent structures.

(d) *Material and Details:*

(1) Variety in the use of architectural materials and details adds to the intimacy and visual delight of the district. But there is also an overall thread of continuity provided by the range of materials commonly used by turn-of-the-century builders and by the way these materials were used. This thread of continuity is threatened by the introduction of new industrial materials and the aggressive exposure of earlier materials such as concrete block, metal framing and glass. The purpose of this section is to encourage the proper use of appropriate materials and details.

(2) The materials and details of new construction should relate to the materials and details of existing nearby buildings.

(3) Preferred roof materials are cedar shingles, slate and tile; asphalt shingles which match the approximate color and texture of the preferred materials are acceptable substitutes. Diagonal and vertical siding are generally unacceptable. Imitative materials such as asphalt siding, wood-textured metal or vinyl siding, artificial stone, and artificial brick veneer should not be used. Smooth four-inch lap vinyl, metal or hardboard siding, when well installed and carefully detailed, may be acceptable in some cases. Materials, including their colors, will be reviewed to determine their appropriate use in relation to the overall design of the structure as well as to surrounding structures.

(4) Color is a significant design element, and paint colors should relate to surrounding structures and the area as well as to the style of the new structure. Building permits are not required for painting and, although the heritage preservation commission may review and comment on paint color, paint color is not subject to commission approval.

(e) *Building Elements:* Individual elements of a building should be integrated into its composition for a balanced and complete design. These elements of new instruction should compliment existing adjacent structures as well.

(1) *Roofs:*

a. There is a great variety of roof treatment in the Historic Hill District, but gable and hip roofs are most common. The skyline or profile of new construction should relate to the predominant roof shape of existing adjacent buildings.

b. Most houses in the Historic Hill District have a roof pitch of between 9:12 and 12:12 (rise-to-run ratio). Highly visible secondary structure roofs should match the roof pitch of the main structure, and generally should have a rise-to-run ratio of at least 9:12. A roof pitch of at least 8:12 should be used if it is somewhat

visible from the street, and a 6:12 pitch may be acceptable in some cases for structures which are not visible from the street.

c. Roof hardware such as skylights, vents and metal pipe chimneys should not be placed on the front roof plane.

(2) *Windows and doors:*

a. The proportion, size, rhythm and detailing of windows and doors in new construction should be compatible with that of existing adjacent buildings. Most windows on the Hill have a vertical orientation, with a proportion of between 2:1 and 3:1 (height to width) common. Individual windows can sometimes be square or horizontal if the rest of building conveys the appropriate directional emphasis. Facade openings of

the same general size as those in adjacent buildings are encouraged.

b. Wooden double-hung windows are traditional in the Historic Hill District and should be the first choice when selecting new windows. Paired casement windows, although not historically common, will often prove acceptable because of their vertical orientation. Sliding windows, awning windows, and horizontally oriented muntins are not common in the district and are generally unacceptable. Vertical muntins and muntin grids may be acceptable when compatible with the period and style of the building. Sliding glass doors should not be used where they would be visible from the street.

c. Although not usually improving the appearance of building, the use of metal windows or doors need not necessarily ruin it. The important thing is that they should look like part of the building and not like raw metal appliances. Appropriately colored or bronze-toned aluminum is acceptable. Mill finish (silver) aluminum should be avoided.

(3) *Porches and decks:*

a. In general, houses in the Historic Hill District have roofed front porches, while in most modern construction the front porch has disappeared. Front porches provide a transitional zone between open and closed space which unites a building and its site, semiprivate spaces which help to define the spatial hierarchy of the district. They are a consistent visual element in the district and often introduce rhythmic variation, clarify scale or provide vertical facade elements. The porch treatment of new structures should relate to the porch treatment of existing adjacent structure. If a porch is not built, the transition from private to public space should be articulated with some other suitable design element.

b. Open porches are preferable, but screened or glassed-in porches may be acceptable if well detailed. Most, but not all, porches on the Hill are one (1) story high. Along some streets where a strong continuity of porch size or porch roof line exists, it may be preferable to duplicate these formal elements in new construction. The vertical elements supporting the porch roof are important. They should carry the visual as well as the actual weight of the porch roof. The spacing of new balustrades should reflect the solid-to-void relationships of adjacent railings and porches. Generally, a solid-to-void proportion between 1:2 and 1:3 is common in the Historic Hill.

c. Decks should be kept to the rear of buildings, should be visually refined, and should be integrated into overall building design. A raised deck protruding from a single wall usually appears disjointed from the total design and is generally unacceptable.

(f) *Site:*

(1) *Setback.* New buildings should be sited at a distance not more than five (5) percent out-of-line from the setback of existing adjacent buildings. Setbacks greater than those of adjacent buildings may be allowed in some cases. Reduced setbacks may be acceptable at corners. This happens quite often in the Historic Hill area and can lend delightful variation to the street.

(2) *Landscaping:*

a. Typically, open space in the Historic Hill District is divided into public, semipublic, semiprivate and private space. The public space of the street and sidewalk is often distinguished from the semipublic space of the front yard by a change in grade, a low hedge or a visually open fence. The buildings, landscaping elements in front yards, and boulevard trees together provide a "wall of enclosure" for the street "room." Generally, landscaping which respects the street as a public room is encouraged. Enclosures which allow visual penetration of semipublic spaces, such as wrought-iron fences, painted picket fences, low hedges or limestone retaining walls, are characteristic of most of the Historic Hill area. This approach to landscaping and fences is encouraged in contrast to complete enclosure of semipublic space by an opaque fence, a tall "weathered wood" fence or tall hedgerows. Cyclone fence should not be used in front yards or in the front half of side yards. Landscape timber should not be used for retaining walls in front yards.

b. For the intimate space of a shallow setback, ground covers and low shrubs will provide more visual interest and require less maintenance than grass. When lots are left vacant as green space or parking area, a visual hole in the street "wall" may result. Landscape treatment can eliminate this potential problem by providing a wall of enclosure for the street. Boulevard trees mark a separation between the automobile corridor and the rest of the streetscape and should be maintained.

(3) *Garages and parking:*

a. If an alley is adjacent to the dwelling, any new garage should be located off the alley. Where alleys do not exist, garages facing the street or driveway curb cuts may be acceptable. Garage doors should not face the street. If this is found necessary, single garage doors should be used to avoid the horizontal orientation of two-car garage doors.

b. Parking spaces should not be located in front yards. Residential parking spaces should be located in rear yards. Parking lots for commercial uses should be to the side or rear of commercial structures and have a minimum number of curb cuts. All parking spaces should be adequately screened from the street and sidewalk by landscaping. The scale of parking lots should be minimized and the visual sweep of pavement should be broken up by use of planted areas. The scale, level of light output and design of parking lot lighting should be compatible with the character of the district.

(g) *Public infrastructure:*

(1) The traditional pattern of public streets, curbs, boulevards and sidewalks in the area should be maintained. Distinctive features of public spaces in the area such as brick alleys, stone slab sidewalks, granite curbs and the early twentieth century lantern-style street lights should be preserved. The same style should be used when new street lights are installed. New street furniture such as benches, bus shelters, telephone booths, kiosks, sign standards, trash containers, planters and fences should be compatible with the character of the district.

(2) Brick alleys and stone slab sidewalks generally should be maintained and repaired

as necessary with original materials; asphalt and concrete patches should not be used. When concrete tile public sidewalks need to be replaced, new poured concrete sidewalks should be the same width as the existing sidewalks and should be scored in a two-foot square or 18-inch square pattern to resemble the old tiles; expansion joints should match the scoring. Handicap ramps should be installed on the inside of curbs as part of the poured concrete sidewalk; where there is granite curbing, a section should be lowered for the ramp.

(3) Electric, telephone and cable TV lines should be placed underground or along alleys, and meters should be placed where inconspicuous.

(h) *Storefronts:* Turn-of-the-century commercial buildings in the Hill District tend to follow the strict design order of the brick box with an open first floor storefront supporting an upper facade with a band of uniformly sized windows and a decorative cornice. Because commercial buildings are composed of similar parts, commercial blocks have a coherent, harmonious appearance. The traditional storefront is made up almost entirely of windows. This large glass area creates a visual openness that is part of the overall proportional system of the facade. Storefronts should be predominantly glass with the upper facades of commercial buildings being predominantly solid. Materials and design elements such as mansard roofs with wooden shingles, rough-textured wood siding, artificial brick veneer, and aggregate materials of stone and gravel are inappropriate and should not be used.

(i) *Signs:* Generally, signs should be compatible with the character of the district and blend with the character of the structures on or near which they are placed. Signs should not conceal architectural detail, clutter the building's image, or distract from the unity of the facade, but rather should complement the overall design. Sign materials should complement the materials of the related building and/or adjacent buildings. Surface design elements should not detract from or conflict with the related structure's age and design. No facade should be damaged in the application of signs, except for mere attachment.

(Ord. No. 17815, § 3(III), 4-2-91)

Sec. 74.66. Moving of structures.

Proposals for moving structures out of the Historic Hill District are reviewed using the guidelines for demolition. Proposals for moving structures onto property located within the district are reviewed using the guidelines for new construction as well as guidelines for restoration and rehabilitation. Proposals for moving structures within the district are reviewed using guidelines for all of the above.

(Ord. No. 17815, § 3(IV), 4-2-91)

Sec. 74.67. Demolition.

When reviewing proposals for demolition of structures within the district, the heritage preservation commission refers to Section 73.06(i)(2) of this Code, which states the following:

"In the case of the proposed demolition of a building, prior to approval of said demolition, the commission shall make written findings on the following: the architectural and historical merit of the building, the effect of the demolition on surrounding buildings, the effect of any proposed new construction on the remainder of the building (in case of partial demolition) and on surrounding buildings, and the economic value or usefulness of the buildings as it now exists or if altered or modified in comparison with the value or usefulness of any proposed structures designated to replace the present building or buildings."

(Ord. No. 17815, § 3(V), 4-2-91)

Secs. 74.68--74.75. Reserved.

**//St. Paul, Minnesota/CODE OF ORDINANCES City of SAINT PAUL, MINNESOTA
Codified through Council File No. 09-60, adopted June 3, 2009. (Supplement No. 79,
Update 1)/Title IX CITY PLANNING*/Chapter 74. Heritage Preservation Districts and
Programs***