

CITY OF SAINT PAUL  
HERITAGE PRESERVATION COMMISSION STAFF REPORT

---

FILE NAME: 698 Fourth Street East (Fourth Street Preservation Project – Phase II)

DATE OF APPLICATION: July 22, 2013

APPLICANT: Paul Ormseth LLC

OWNER: City of Saint Paul – Housing and Redevelopment Authority (HRA)

DATE OF HEARING: August 8, 2013

HPC SITE/DISTRICT: Dayton's Bluff Heritage Preservation District

CATEGORY: Contributing

CLASSIFICATION: Building Permit

STAFF INVESTIGATION AND REPORT: Renee Cohn & Christine Boulware

DATE: August 1, 2013

---

**A. SITE DESCRIPTION:**

The one-and-one-half story, vernacular, Greek Revival influenced cottage at 698 Fourth Street East was constructed pre-1884. Ramsey County property records identify the date of construction as 1879. The frame residence has stucco over clapboard, a parged limestone foundation, and a front gable roof. The full-width, enclosed front porch has a hipped roof. The windows are primarily double-hung, with one piano-style window on the southwest elevation. The earliest permit on record for the property is from 1884 to construct a two-story, frame with peaked roof barn. Other historic building permits include: a 1905 permit to construct one 3' x 13' addition and one 8' x 8' addition, a 1929 permit to re-roof, and 1938 permits for various repairs, alterations, plumbing and plastering. The property is categorized as contributing to the Dayton's Bluff Heritage Preservation District.

**B. PROPOSED CHANGES:**

The applicant is proposing to rehabilitate the residence. Selective demolition will include all existing stucco, the front porch enclosure, and the second floor office window (NE elevation). The existing porch roof will be retained and a new porch will be constructed beneath it with wood columns, floors, and steps. The removal of the porch enclosure will expose an original picture and transom window, both of which will be rehabilitated. Other original windows and casings will be restored and new flush-mount aluminum storm/screen windows will be installed. The original wood siding, trim, historic details, fascia and soffit will be repair, repainted, and replaced where necessary with wood to match existing profiles and historic details. The rear one-story addition (originally stucco) will be sided with LP Smart Siding to match the existing house profiles and details. New asphalt shingles and aluminum gutters and downspouts will be installed. Basement awning windows, storms, and galvanized window wells will be installed to replace current glass block windows. The front entry doors will be preserved and a new side-entry door will be installed with a half-light. New aluminum storm doors will be installed. A new wood stoop and metal handrail will be installed on the side entry. The existing water table and skirt will be replaced with new wood to match the existing profiles. The existing limestone foundation will be re-pointed and repaired. Site work will consist of new retaining walls at the front and side property lines, and new concrete stairs will be built to the sidewalks. A detailed scope of work was submitted and is included in the packet.

**C. GUIDELINE CITATIONS:**

***Dayton's Bluff Heritage Preservation District Design Guidelines (1992)***

**Leg. Code § 74.87. General principles.**

- 1. All work should be of a character and quality that maintains the distinguishing features of the building and the environment. The removal or alteration of distinctive architectural features should be avoided as should alterations that have no historical basis and which seek to create an earlier appearance. The restoration of altered original features, if documentable, is encouraged.*

2. *Changes which may have taken place in the course of time are evidence of the history and development of a building, structure, or site and its environment. These changes may have acquired significance in their own right, and this significance shall be recognized and respected.*
3. *Deteriorated architectural features should be repaired rather than replaced whenever possible. In the event of replacement, new materials should match the original in composition, design (including consideration of proportion, texture and detail), color and overall appearance.*
4. *New additions or alterations to structures should be constructed in such a manner that if such additions or alterations were to be removed in the future, the form and integrity of the original structure would be unimpaired.*
5. *The impact of alterations or additions on individual buildings as well as on the surrounding streetscape will be considered; major alterations to buildings which occupy a corner lot or are otherwise prominently sited should be avoided.*
6. *New construction should be compatible with the historic and architectural character of the district.*

**Sec. 74.89. - Restoration and rehabilitation.**

**(a) Exterior surfaces—Walls and foundations:** *Masonry. In the 1860s and 1870s, a number of Saint Paul businessmen built elaborate limestone houses along the bluff. These houses are long gone, but several brick houses remain, and brick and stone are evident throughout the historic district in foundations and chimneys. Stone, brick and concrete were also used for lintels, sills and decorative trim. Improperly maintained or repair masonry can result in extensive water damage and eventual structural failure.*

**(1) Repair.** *Deteriorated brick, stone, mortar and other materials should be replaced with material used in the original construction or with materials that resemble the appearance of the original as closely as possible. The advice of a skilled mason should be sought for major repair projects.*

**(2) Cleaning.** *Masonry cleaning should be conducted only to halt deterioration and by means such as low-pressure water, soft brushes, and/or appropriate chemical treatment. Sandblasting or abrasive cleaning should not be used under any circumstances.*

**(3) Repointing.** *Original mortar joint size and profile should be retained and/or reduplicated in repointing. Mortar mixtures should duplicate the original in lime, sand and cement proportion and should duplicate the original mortar in color and texture.*

**(4) Stucco resurfacing.** *Repairs to stucco surfaces should duplicate the original in color and texture, if evidence exists. Smooth or heavy dashed surfaces should be avoided unless they were used on the original surface.*

**(5) Painting.** *The original color and texture of masonry surfaces should be retained and unpainted stone and brick surfaces should not be painted. The removal of paint from painted masonry surfaces should only be attempted if unpainted surfaces are historically appropriate and if removal can be accomplished without damage to the masonry.*

**(6) Resurfacing.** *Stucco, artificial stone, brick veneer, or vinyl or aluminum products should not be applied over masonry surfaces.*

**(b) Exterior surfaces—Walls: Wood sided.** *Wood building products, including siding, shingles and a great variety of decorative trim were used extensively by the nineteenth- and early twentieth-century builders of Dayton's Bluff. Wood contributes texture and detail to the historic district and is a durable, high-quality material with a long product life if properly maintained.*

**(1) Repair.** *Wooden siding should be maintained with paint or stain. Deteriorated wooden siding should be replaced with new material resembling the original in width, thickness and profile, and texture. New siding should be installed with the weather (exposed surface) identical to the original. Siding should be installed horizontally except in those instances*

where vertical or diagonal siding was used on the original exterior. Appropriate corner boards, frieze boards, drip caps and other features should be included with replacement siding.

**(2) Vinyl and aluminum siding; other manufacture products.** Buildings originally clad in wooden siding should not be resurfaced with brick, stucco, artificial stone or brick veneer, hardboard, or vinyl or aluminum siding. The commission may consider the following exceptions to the installation of vinyl, metal or hardboard siding on a case-by-case basis:

- a. In cases where existing asphalt, asbestos, aluminum or vinyl siding is to be removed and where the underlying original siding and decorative features are found to be significantly deteriorated. Commission staff must conduct a site visit during the removal process and advise on appropriate treatment.
- b. In the resurfacing of noncontributing building constructed after 1930.
- c. In the resurfacing or existing or construction of new garages, particularly when the garage is inconspicuously sited.

If vinyl, metal or hardboard siding is used as described in A-C, it must be of a width appropriate to the style of the building, and all architectural details including window trim, wood cornices and ornament must remain uncovered. Replacement siding may cover only one layer of existing siding. Trim must be built up so that it projects from the new siding to the same extent as the original.

**(3) Shingles.** Buildings originally clad in horizontal wooden siding should not be resurfaced with shingles of wood or other material. Wooden shingles used for cladding material or decoration, such as in the gable ends, should be conserved and retained. If replacement is necessary, shingles should replicate the original in width, pattern, thickness, profile, texture and weather (lap).

**(4) Decorative siding treatments.** Decorative siding treatments, such as paneled herringbone patterns used in the gable ends, should be retained in repair or resurfacing.

**(5) Painting.** Exterior wooden surfaces should be maintained with appropriate paint or stain. Color choice is not subject to heritage preservation commission approval. However, exterior paint colors should be appropriate to the period and style of the historic building. Stained shingles in most cases should not be painted.

**(c) Roofs and chimneys.** The shape, texture and color of the roof are important design features of any building. Gable and hipped roofs are most common in the historic district. Many of the early building of Dayton's Bluff were roofed in cedar shingles and reroofed with asphalt shingles. Properly selected, modern asphalt roofing materials are compatible with the appearance of historic buildings.

**(1) Roofing materials.** Original roofing materials which contribute to the character of the district such as tile and slate should be maintained and retained unless badly deteriorated. If partial reroofing in tile, slate or asphalt is necessary, replacement roofing should match the old in composition, size, shape and texture. New roofing material should be appropriate to the character of the building in composition, size, shape and texture. Dark brown, dark gray and "weathered wood" are among usually acceptable colors. Rolled roofing may be used only on flat or slightly sloped roofs which are not visible from the public way.

**(2) Alterations to roof shape—Front.** The original roof type, slope and overhangs should not be preserved. The roof shape at the front should not be altered except to restore it to the original documented appearance or to add architecturally compatible dormers.

Documentation includes evidence of the former appearance of the building, or, in the case of pattern book houses, those of similar period and style. The shape of existing dormers should not be altered unless compatible with the original design.

**(3) Alterations to roof shape—Rear.** Alterations to the roof shape at the sides or rear should be compatible with the architectural character of the building.

**(4) Skylights.** Skylights should not be installed on the front roof plane. They should be flat and as close to the roof plane as possible. "Bubble"-type skylights should not be installed.

**(5) Rebuilt chimneys.** *If rebuilding is necessary, original brick details such as decorative panels and coffers should be replicated. In the absence of evidence of the original appearance of the chimney, repair or rebuilding should be compatible with the building style or type.*

**(6) Chimneys and stovepipes.** *New chimneys and stovepipes should not be installed on the front roof plane.*

**(d) Windows and entries:**

**(1) Windows:** *Many of the historic windows of Dayton's Bluff have double-hung sash and vertical orientation. Windows are important design elements and establish the visual rhythm, balance and general character of the facade. Any alteration, including removal of moldings or changes in window size or type, can have a significant and often detrimental effect on the appearance of the building as well as on the surrounding streetscape.*

- a. Size and shape.** *Existing window openings should be retained. Window openings should not be enlarged or reduced to fit new units. New window openings should not be introduced into principal elevations.*
- b. Sash.** *The size and number of panes of glass in each sash should not be altered. New sash, if installed, should duplicate the existing or other appropriate historic models. Crank-out or sliding units are not appropriate replacement for double-hung sash.*
- c. Trim.** *Historic window casings should be retained wherever possible; if replacement is necessary, the original profile should be replicated.*
- d. Storm windows.** *If combination metal storms are installed, they should have a baked-enamel finish. Storm windows should not have vertical or horizontal divisions which conflict with the divisions of the sash.*
- e. Shutters and blinds.** *Shutters and blinds should not be installed on buildings not originally designed for them. Where appropriate, shutters should appear to be operative and should be mounted to the window casing. Shutters should be constructed of wood.*
- f. Security measures.** *Historic trim or other architectural features should not be removed for the installation of security bars or grills.*

**(2) Entries:** *The entry—including the door, door surround and sometimes sidelights and a transom—is usually the focal point of the facade. The size of the entry is directly related to the mass and scale of the building. As with windows, any alteration to size, shape or trim details can have a detrimental effect on exterior appearance.*

- a. Size and shape.** *All historic entry components should be retained. Entry opening should not be enlarged or reduced to fit a new door. New entry openings should not be introduced into principal elevations.*
- b. Trim.** *Original or historic features of the entry, including hoods, columns, sidelights and transoms, should be retained. If replacement is necessary, historic trim details should be replicated.*
- c. Doors.** *Wherever possible, historic paneled doors (and hardware) should be repaired and weatherstripped rather than replaced. If replacement of original or historic doors is necessary, the replacement should duplicate or be compatible with the material, design and hardware of the older door. Steel-covered hollow core doors should not be installed unless compatible with the appearance of the house. Historic trim should not be removed from the entry for the installation of steel doors.*
- d. Storm and screen doors.** *Storm doors should be compatible with the inner door in shape and style. Simple designs are preferable to "ranch style" designs.*
- e. Sliding glass doors.** *Sliding glass doors should be confined to the rear of the building where not visible from the public way.*
- f. Security measures.** *Historic trim or other architectural features should not be removed for the installation of security bars or grills.*

**(e) Porches and steps.** Most of the houses and rowhouses built in the Dayton's Bluff Historic District before 1920 had unenclosed front porches. The porch usually stretched across the full width of the front facade, but in some cases only covered the entry. Since porches and steps are exposed to the weather and receive hard use, some buildings have had a succession of replacements which reflect different styles of architecture.

**(1) Conservation.** Porches, steps and handrails which are appropriate to the building and its development should be conserved and retained.

**(2) Repair and replacement.** Historic porches, steps or handrails which require complete rebuilding or partial replacement should be reconstructed using historical research to determine an appropriate design. Reconstructions should be compatible with the period and style of the building in material, design and detail. Concrete should not be used to replace wooden porch floors or steps.

**(3) Railings.** The original spacing, section and profile of balusters should be maintained in replacement or repair. Unless historical evidence indicates, reconstruction should include a bottom rail and balusters should not be nailed directly to the step or deck. Wooden posts and railings should not be replaced with those of metal.

**(4) Posts and columns.** If replacement is necessary, porch posts and columns should be replaced with units which replicate the original material, size and scale. Elaborate details such as turning, gouging or stamping may be simplified if necessary. Wooden posts or railings should not be replaced with metal posts or railings.

**(5) Enclosure.** Unenclosed front porches should not be permanently enclosed.

**(6) Decks.** Decks should be constructed only at the rear of the building or where most inconspicuous. Railings, steps and other deck details should be compatible with the architectural character of the building.

**(7) Firestairs.** The detailing of firestairs should be compatible with the period and style of the building. Firestairs should be located as inconspicuously as possible.

**(f) Exterior trim and architectural features.** Exterior trim includes the decorative and sometimes functional elements of the exterior which contribute to the proportion, texture and detail of the building. A great variety of machine-made trim was added to even the simplest wooden houses of Dayton's Bluff, while iron, cast iron, terra cotta, tile and brick can be seen on masonry examples.

**(1) Conservation.** Exterior architectural features including finials, cornices, brackets, columns, balustrades and railing, and window and door moldings should be retained.

**(2) Documentation.** Original trim details and other architectural features should be photographed or otherwise recorded before they are removed for repair or replacement. Deteriorated trim which is removed should be saved for use in making duplicates.

**(3) Repair and replacement.** New material used to repair or replace deteriorated trim or other features should match the original as closely as possible. Deteriorated trim which is unsalvageable should be replaced with trim identical or similar to the original design. Simplified trim should approximate the old in design and placement.

**(4) New trim.** Details should not be added in an effort to make the building look older. However, in the case of some "pattern book" houses, the addition of certain trim details such as those typical at the gable and porch may be permitted if supported by historic photos or pattern book sources.

**(C.F. 92-900, § 2(I)(A), 7-23-92)**

**Sec. 74.90. - New construction and additions.**

**(b) General guidelines:**

**(1) Site evaluation.** Existing historic buildings and landscape features should be retained and rehabilitated in plans for redevelopment.

**(2) General character.** *New construction should reinforce the historic architectural and visual character of the area. Specifically, it should refer to the traditional two- and three-story dwelling and commercial building module and typical setbacks already established in the district and in the adjacent area.*

**(3) Pedestrian circulation and parking.** *New construction should be oriented toward streets which are inviting environments for pedestrians. Parking areas should be placed at the rear of buildings wherever possible or screened with landscaping, low walls or appropriately detailed fences.*

**(4) Views and vistas.** *Exceptional views of the city and river valley provided from the public way should not be obstructed by new buildings or structures.*

**(c) Principal buildings; additions:**

**(1) Massing and scale.** *New construction should conform to the massing, volume, height, facade proportions and scale of surrounding structures and also comply with existing zoning regulations. The gross volume of any new structure should be visually compatible with the buildings and elements within the surrounding area. New dwellings and commercial buildings should be compatible with the height of existing adjacent buildings.*

**(2) Materials and details.** *Materials and details should relate to those of existing nearby buildings. Wood or masonry construction is typical for existing residential buildings in the district, while masonry is typical of commercial buildings. These materials are preferable to vinyl, metal or hardboard siding. Imitative materials such as artificial stone or brick veneer should not be used. Materials will be reviewed to determine their appropriate use in relation to the overall design of the structure. The use of vinyl, metal or hardboard siding will be considered by the commission on a case-by-case basis. These materials may be permissible in new construction of principal buildings if appropriately detailed.*

**(d) Building elements:**

**(1) Roofs.** *The gable and hip roof or their variants are the primary historic roof forms in the district, with many variations and combinations. In new construction, the skyline or roof profile should relate to the predominant roof shape of nearby buildings. Highly visible secondary structure roofs should be compatible with the roof pitch, color and material of the main structure.*

*The roofing materials used on new buildings should be appropriate to the design of the building and the visibility of the roof.*

*Roof hardware such as skylights, vents and metal pipe chimneys should not be placed on the front roof plane.*

**(2) Windows and entries.** *Vertically oriented, double-hung sash are the predominant historic window type in the district. The proportion, size, rhythm and detailing of windows and entries should be compatible with that of existing nearby buildings. The rhythm of solids to voids created by openings in the facade of the new structure should be visually compatible with surrounding structures.*

**(3) Porches and decks.** *Porches are a standard feature of many historic houses in the district and whether enclosed or unenclosed they are an important part of the streetscape. In new construction, the front entry should be articulated with a design element such as a porch, portico or landing which provides a transitional zone between the semipublic and public exterior zones and the private interior zone. This design element should be appropriately detailed and compatible with the size and scale of the building.*

*Decks should be constructed at the rear of the building and should be integrated into the overall design. Decks should be appropriately detailed and should not be raised in a manner which makes them conspicuous.*

**(e) Accessory buildings.** *Garages and other accessory buildings should be compatible with the overall design and materials of the existing building on the lot. New garages should*

*be located off rear alleys wherever possible. Garages should not be attached to the front of the building and should only be attached if not visible from the public way.*

**(f) Site considerations:**

**(1) Setback and siting.** *The setback of new buildings in most residential and commercial areas should be compatible with the setback of existing adjacent buildings.*

**(2) Parking.** *Residential parking areas should be confined to the rear of existing or new buildings. Parking spaces should be screened from view from the public street by landscaping such as hedges, grade changes or low fences.*

**(3) Fences.** *Fences which allow some visual penetration of front yard space are preferable to complete enclosure. Fences of wrought iron or wood which enclose the front yard should be no higher than three and one-half (3½) feet. Cyclone fences should not be used to enclose front yards in the front half of side yards.*

**(4) Retaining walls.** *Stone, brick and split face concrete block are preferable to landscape timber for the construction of retaining walls. Masonry retaining walls should be finished with caps or appropriate details.*

**(5) Public improvements.** *New street and landscape improvements, lighting, street furniture and signs should be compatible with the character of the historic district. The historic urban pattern of gridplan streets should be retained and enhanced in improvement projects.*

**(6) Signs.** *Sign materials and design should complement the materials and design of the building and adjacent buildings. (See also: Storefront Guidelines.)*

**(7) Views and vistas.** *New buildings or other structures should not block key views and vistas of the river valley and the downtown skyline.*

**(j) Demolition.** *Demolition permits will be reviewed on a case-by-case basis and will be determined by the category of building (pivotal, contributing and noncontributing) and its importance to the district, the structural condition of the building and the economic viability of the structure.*

**(C.F. 92-900, § 2(I)(B), 7-23-92)**

**D. FINDINGS:**

1. The Period of Significance for the Dayton's Bluff Heritage Preservation District is approximately 1860 – 1929, and this property is categorized as contributing to the Dayton's Bluff Historic District.
2. On July 23, 1992, the Dayton's Bluff Heritage Preservation District was established under Ordinance No. 17942 (Council File #92-900). The Heritage Preservation Commission shall protect the architectural character of heritage preservation sites through review and approval or denial of applications for city permits for exterior work within designated heritage preservation sites §73.04.(4).
3. **Masonry:** Currently the foundations are parged. If the parging is proposed for removal final details- including mortar specification, replacement material, and joint profile- will need to be submitted for staff review and approval. Staff should be called on a site visit to advise on appropriate treatments for the foundation.
4. **Windows:**
  - A. The proposal to repair existing windows as needed and replace elements as necessary to match the existing complies with the general principal which states: “*Deteriorated architectural features should be repaired rather than replaced whenever possible. In the event of replacement, new materials should match the original in composition, design (including consideration of proportion, texture and detail), color and overall appearance.*”
  - B. The existing office window is not original to the property, and is located in an area that the original staircase once occupied. The proposal to remove and infill the second floor

office window does not comply with the guideline that states “*existing windows and door openings should be retained,*” however the loss of this window will not result in loss of historic materials and the infill of the wood siding to match the elevation is appropriate for the property.

C. The existing piano window is on a non-original, but early addition to the residence and is not an original feature of the property. Details on the interior trim show that the opening may have been divided into multiple fixed-lights or in-swing casements. The installation of a new, three-light window in the existing piano window opening complies with the guideline as they are not proposed on the primary elevation and are of an appropriate style and size.

D. New full-screen, flush-mount aluminum combination windows comply with the guideline which states: “*Storm windows should not have vertical or horizontal divisions which conflict with the divisions of the sash.*” Final details, including material finish, will need to be submitted for staff review and approval. Aluminum combination windows will need to have a painted finish.

E. The existing basement glass block windows are not original or historically appropriate for this property; the replacement with awning windows complies with the guideline so long as the windows are appropriately detailed.

D. The rehabilitation of the picture and transom window on the primary elevation complies with the general principle for architectural features. Final details will need to be submitted to HPC staff for review and approval.

**5. Doors:**

A. The proposal to preserve the front entry doors complies with the guideline which states, “*historic paneled doors (and hardware) should be repaired and weatherstripped rather than replaced*”.

B. The proposal to install a new side entry half-light door complies with the guidelines that states: “*If replacement of original or historic doors is necessary, the replacement should duplicate or be compatible with the material, design, and hardware of the older door.*” Style and dimension details not yet been submitted, however full-view, three-quarter- and half-light aluminum storm doors with a painted finish comply with the guidelines. Final design details will need to be submitted to HPC staff for final review and approval.

**6. Siding & Trim:**

A. The proposal to remove the non-original stucco layers, and repair the original wood siding, will not have a negative impact on the property. The replacement of the wood water table complies with the guideline that states “*deteriorated wooden siding should be replaced with new material resembling the original in width, thickness and profile, and texture and appropriate corner boards, frieze boards, drip caps and other features should be included with replacement siding.*”

B. LP Smart Siding will be installed on a rear, non-original addition (likely related to the 1938 permits) and complies with the guideline that states “*new siding should be identical to or compatible with the original*”. The LP Smart Siding will need to have a smooth texture, and a width and profile matching the original wood siding on the original portions of the residence. Final details will need to be submitted to HPC staff for final review and approval.

**7. Front Porch:** The removal of non-historic portions of the front porch will not have a negative impact, as those changes appear to have occurred after the period of, and are not considered contributing elements to the building. Removal of the non-historic portions will reveal a historic picture and transom window. HPC staff was unable to locate any historic photos of the building. The guideline states, “*Historic porches, steps, or handrails which require complete rebuilding or replacement should be reconstructed using historical research to determine an appropriate design. Reconstructions should be compatible with*

*the period and style of the building in material, design, and detail.*” A site visit to view the property after removal of the non-historical elements shall be scheduled so that HPC staff can document and discuss appropriate treatment for the reconstruction and design of the open front porch.

8. **Side Entry Stoop:** The proposed wood stoop is located at the side of the building and the *railings, steps, and other deck features and details* appear to be generally compatible with the design of the house. Final detailed plans will be necessary to determine compatibility.
9. **Roof:** The proposal to repair/replace the roof shingles complies with the guideline so long as the shingles and metal flashing/valleys/drip-edge are of a traditional color as outlined in the design review guidelines.
10. **Gutters & Downspouts:** Details on the style and location of the new gutters and downspouts were not submitted. A K-style or half-round gutter would be appropriate so long as decorative detail were not altered or obscured by the installation.
11. **Demolition:** The removal of the non-original stucco, non-original windows and the concrete retaining wall and stoops complies with the guidelines, as these materials were constructed after the Period of Significance for the Dayton’s Bluff Heritage Preservation District.
12. **New Construction:**
  - A. Final details for the new front porch are not yet known, as exploratory demolition has not yet commenced. The design of the porch will need to be guided by physical evidence on the residence. The plans submitted are a placeholder.
  - B. The construction of a new retaining wall will comply with the guidelines so long as the wall materials are rock-faced, a limestone color, and have squared corners and a cap. The guideline states: *“Stone, brick and split face concrete block are preferable to landscape timber for the construction of retaining walls. Masonry retaining walls should be finished with caps or appropriate details.”*
13. This proposal to rehabilitate the residence at 698 Fourth Street East will not adversely affect the Program for the Preservation and architectural control of the Dayton’s Bluff Historic District (Leg. Code §73.06 (e)) so long as the conditions are met.

**E. STAFF RECOMMENDATION:** Based on the findings staff recommends approval of the building permit application provided the following condition(s) are met:

1. HPC staff shall be contacted to visit the site to view what is found underneath the non-original siding once it has been removed; staff shall document shadow lines and details. Staff will consult on how to proceed with the design details such as porch roofs, columns and handrail designs as well as any decorative detail/features. The applicant shall submit a detailed drawing for final review and approval based on any physical evidence found during the site visit and discussion with HPC staff.
2. A site visit to view the property after removal of the non-historical elements shall be scheduled so that staff can document and discuss appropriate treatment for the reconstruction and design of the open front porch. Final details and material specification for the new porch shall be submitted to HPC staff for final review and approval.
3. Final details and material specification for the new retaining wall and other hardscaping shall be submitted to HPC staff for final review and approval.
4. The roof shingles shall be medium-to-dark brown or gray; dark red or dark green is also a traditional asphalt shingle color. Any new vents installed on the roof shall be a dark color to blend in with the shingle color which shall be submitted to HPC staff for final review and approval.
5. Final window and combination storm window specifications and details shall be submitted to HPC staff for final review and approval.
6. Final door and storm door specifications and details shall be submitted to staff for final review and approval.
7. All new wood surfaces shall be painted within one year of permit issuance.

8. All final materials and details shall be submitted to the HPC and/or staff for final review and approval.
9. Any revisions to the approved plans shall be reviewed and approved by the HPC and/or staff.
10. The HPC stamped approved plans shall remain on site for the duration of the project.

**F. ATTACHMENTS:**

1. HPC Design Review Application
2. Scope of Work
3. Floor Plans and Elevations
4. Photos