

**CITY OF SAINT PAUL  
HERITAGE PRESERVATION COMMISSION STAFF REPORT**

---

FILE NAME: 1890 Summit Avenue  
DATE OF APPLICATION: August 1, 2013  
APPLICANT: Bill Marzolf, owner/Meghan Kell, Kell Architects  
OWNER: Bill Marzolf  
DATE OF PUBLIC HEARING: August 22, 2013  
HPC SITE/DISTRICT: Summit Avenue West Historic District  
CATEGORY: Contributing  
CLASSIFICATION: Building permit  
STAFF INVESTIGATION AND REPORT: Bill Dermody  
DATE: August 15, 2013

---

**A. SITE DESCRIPTION:** The existing 2-story Colonial Revival house was built in 1926 and faces north toward Summit Avenue. It has a symmetrical front façade, a stucco finish, asphalt shingles upon a gabled roof, a projecting front entry porch with Tuscan columns, a frieze board on the full front and rear elevations, primarily double-hung 6-over-1 windows, a half-circle attic window, shutters, a blind fanlight and dentilled frieze above the front door, and a rear detached garage accessed via the alley. The house is categorized as contributing and the garage as non-contributing to the Summit Avenue West Historic District.

**B. PROPOSED CHANGES:** The applicant is proposing to construct an approximately 1,800 square foot addition to the rear of the house and remodel portions of the remaining side and rear elevations. A rear screened patio would be removed. No changes are proposed to the front façade. A new parking pad is shown on the site plan, but it is not part of this application.

The house addition and remodel include 2-story and 1-story massing, an additional brick chimney, several double-hung windows, several awning windows, an additional half-circle attic window, and a wood shade trellis upon an outdoor patio. The addition's roof uses asphalt shingles of "weathered wood" color, and the existing roof is being replaced to match. The windows are simulated divided lights with the exterior muntins constructed of aluminum. The addition has a stucco finish to match existing, a brick base to match existing, and a new frieze board on both the 1-story and 2-story portions.

**C. BACKGROUND**

Staff discussed the project with the architect on July 9, 2013 by phone. The site received several permits between 1994 and 2005 to repair the screened porch roof and repair the stucco façade.

**D. GUIDELINE CITATIONS:**

**Secretary of the Interior Standards for Rehabilitation**

1. *A property shall be used for its historic purpose or be placed in a new use that requires minimal change to the defining characteristics of the building and its site and environment.*
2. *The historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved. The removal of historic materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided.*

3. *Each property shall be recognized as a physical record of its time, place, and use. Changes that create a false sense of historical development, such as adding conjectural features or architectural elements from other buildings, shall not be undertaken.*
4. *Most properties change over time; those changes that have acquired historic significance in their own right shall be retained and preserved.*
5. *Distinctive features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a historic property shall be preserved.*
6. *Deteriorated historic features shall be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature shall match the old in design, color, texture, and other visual qualities and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features shall be substantiated by documentary, physical, or pictorial evidence.*
7. *Chemical or physical treatments, such as sandblasting, that cause damage to historic materials shall not be used. The surface cleaning of structures, if appropriate, shall be undertaken using the gentlest means possible.*
8. *Significant archeological resources affected by a project shall be protected and preserved. If such resources must be disturbed, mitigation measures shall be undertaken.*
9. *New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction shall not destroy historic materials that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features to protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment.*
10. *New additions and adjacent or related new construction shall be undertaken in such a manner that if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.*

### **Summit Avenue West District Guidelines**

#### **General Principles:**

1. *All work should be of a character and quality that maintains the distinguishing features of the building and the environment. The removal or alteration of distinctive architectural features should be avoided.*
2. *Deteriorated architectural features should be repaired rather than replaced whenever possible. In the event of replacement, new materials should match the original in composition, design, color, texture and appearance. Duplication of original design based on physical or pictorial evidence is preferable to using conjectural or "period" designs or using parts of other buildings.*
3. *Distinctive stylistic features or examples of skilled craftsmanship characteristic of structures or a period should be treated with sensitivity.*
4. *Buildings should be used for their originally intended purpose or compatible uses which require minimum alteration of the building and its site.*
5. *In general, buildings should be restored to their original appearance. However, alterations to buildings since their construction are sometimes significant because they reflect the history of the building and neighborhood. This significance should be respected, and restoration to an "original" appearance may not be desirable in some cases. All buildings should be recognized as products of their own time and not be altered to resemble buildings from an earlier era.*

6. *Whenever possible, new additions or alterations to structures should be done in such a manner that if such additions or alterations were to be removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the structure would be unimpaired.*

## **New Construction**

### *General Principles*

*The basic principle for new construction in the Summit Avenue West District is to maintain the scale and quality of design of the district. The Summit Avenue West District is architecturally diverse within an overall pattern of harmony and continuity. These guidelines for new construction focus on general rather than specific design elements in order to encourage architectural innovation and quality design while maintaining the harmony and continuity of the district. New construction should be compatible with the size, scale, massing, height, rhythm, setback, color, material, building elements, site design, and character of surrounding structures and the area.*

### *Massing and Scale*

*New construction should conform to the massing, volume, height, facade proportions and scale of existing surrounding structures. The scale of the spaces between buildings and the rhythm of buildings to open space should also be carefully considered. New houses should be at least 25 feet high and relate to the height of existing adjacent houses. New college buildings should relate to nearby contributing college buildings; new college buildings with a smaller setback from Summit should have a correspondingly lower height.*

### *Materials and Details*

*Variety in the use of architectural materials and details adds to the intimacy and visual delight of the district. But there is also an overall thread of continuity provided by the range of materials commonly used along Summit and by the way these materials are used. This thread of continuity is threatened by the introduction of new industrial materials and the aggressive exposure of earlier materials such as concrete block, metal framing, and glass. The materials and details of new construction should relate to the materials and details of existing nearby buildings.*

*Most buildings on Summit are built of high-quality materials, often with brick or stucco walls and asphalt or tile roofs. Most brick is red and tile roofs are either red or green. Vinyl, metal or hardboard siding is acceptable only for accessory structures which are not visible from Summit. Imitative materials such as artificial stone and artificial brick veneer should not be used. Materials will be reviewed to determine their appropriate use in relation to the overall design of the structure.*

*The materials and details of new college buildings should relate to the materials and details of nearby contributing college buildings. The Macalester College campus has buildings predominantly of red brick with concrete or sandstone trim. The [University] of St. Thomas presents cream-colored Kasota stone buildings to the Summit Avenue streetscape.*

*The color of materials should relate to surrounding structures and the area as well as to the style of the structure. Building permits are not required for painting and, although the Heritage Preservation Commission may review and comment on paint color, paint color is not subject to Heritage Preservation Commission approval.*

### *Building Elements*

*Individual elements of a building should be integrated into its composition for a balanced and complete design. These elements of new construction should complement existing adjacent structures as well.*

#### *Roofs*

*There is a great variety of roof treatment along Summit, but gable and hipped roofs are most common. The skyline or profile of new construction should relate to the predominant roof shape of existing nearby buildings.*

*The recommended roof pitch for gable roofs is 9:12 and in general the minimum appropriate pitch is 8:12. Highly visible secondary structure roofs should match the roof pitch of the main structure. A 6:12 pitch may be acceptable in some cases for secondary structures which are not visible from the street.*

*Roof hardware such as skylights, vents, and metal pipe chimneys should not be placed on the front roof plane.*

#### *Windows and Doors*

*The proportion, size, rhythm and detailing of windows and doors should be compatible with that of existing nearby buildings. Facade openings of the same general size as those in nearby buildings are encouraged. Sliding windows, awning windows, and horizontally oriented muntins are not common in the district and are generally unacceptable. Vertical muntins and muntin grids may be acceptable when compatible with the period and style of the building. Sliding glass doors should not be used where they would be visible from the street.*

*Although not usually improving the appearance of a building, the use of metal windows or doors need not necessarily ruin it. The important thing is that they should look like part of the building and not like raw metal appliances. Appropriately colored bronze-toned aluminum is acceptable. Mill finish (silver) aluminum should be avoided.*

#### *Porches and Decks*

*Front entrance ways should be articulated with a suitable design element to provide a transitional zone between the public outdoors and the private interior, and should be appropriate in detail to the size and style of the building. If front porches are constructed, they should generally not be enclosed.*

*Decks should be kept to the rear of the buildings, should be visually refined, and should be integrated into the overall building design. A raised deck protruding from a single wall usually appears disjointed from the total design and is generally unacceptable.*

#### *Site*

##### *Setback - Siting*

*New buildings should generally face Summit Avenue and be sited at a distance not more than 5% out-of-line from the front yard setback of existing adjacent buildings. Setbacks greater than those of adjacent buildings may be allowed in some cases.*

##### *Landscaping*

*The streetscape can be divided into three visual areas: public, semipublic, and private. Public space is provided by the publicly owned sidewalks, boulevards, streets, and medians. Semipublic space includes front yards and side yards on corners. While privately owned, this*

*space is open to view by passers-by. Private space is generally that which lies behind the front face of the building. Buildings, landscaping elements in front yards, and boulevard trees provide a "wall of enclosure" for the street "room." Generally, landscaping which respects the street as a public room is encouraged. Boulevard trees mark a separation between the automobile corridor and the rest of the streetscape, and should be maintained. Front yard enclosures such as hedges or walls are not common along west Summit. When they are used, they should permit visual penetration of the semipublic space. Low hedges or limestone retaining walls and visually open fences, such as wrought iron, are preferred. Chain link fences, while visually transparent, should not be used in front yards or in the front half of side yards. Privacy fences, timber retaining walls, and high hedges are also inappropriate in front yards.*

#### **Garages and Parking**

*Parking spaces should not be located in front yards. Residential parking spaces should be located in rear yards. If an alley is adjacent to a dwelling, any new garage should be located off the alley.*

*Institutional parking lots should ideally be located behind buildings where they would not be visible from Summit Avenue. When this is not possible, parking lots should be set back at least as far as the building facades and screened from view from Summit by landscaping such as hedges, brick walls, and changes of grade that sink the parking from view. Shade trees should be planted between parking lots and the street, and plant materials should relate to the traditional character of the district. The scale, level of light output, and design of parking lot lighting should be compatible with the 16 foot high lantern style lights along Summit Avenue.*

#### **Demolition**

*Proposals for demolishing structures, while reviewed with special care by the Heritage Preservation Commission, are not necessarily in conflict with district guidelines. When reviewing proposals for demolition of structures within the district, the Heritage Preservation Commission refers to Section 73.06(1)(2) of the Saint Paul Legislative Code which states the following:*

*In the case of the proposed demolition of a building, prior to approval of said demolition, the commission shall make written findings on the following: the architectural and historical merit of the building, the effect of the demolition on surrounding buildings, the effect of any proposed new construction on the remainder of the building (in case of partial demolition) and on surrounding buildings, and the economic value or usefulness of the building as it now exists or if altered or modified in comparison with the value or usefulness of any proposed structures designated to replace the present building or buildings.*

#### **E. FINDINGS:**

1. On March 1, 1990, the Summit Avenue West Heritage Preservation District was established under Ordinance No.17716, § 1. The Heritage Preservation Commission shall protect the architectural character of heritage preservation sites through review and approval or denial of applications for city permits for exterior work within designated heritage preservation sites §73.04.(4).
2. The house is categorized as contributing to the Summit Avenue West Historic District.
3. The continuous stucco-finished, two-story east façade does not conform to the principle that *new work shall be differentiated from the old*. Typically, a "reveal" would be provided so that the addition steps back from the original house and clearly indicates the point of transition. The west elevation steps down from two stories to one story at the transition, which provides differentiation. The east elevation transition is not as defined. The design shows the frieze and patio arbor around the new portion to differentiate the old from the

new.

4. **Massing and Scale** – The addition and remodel *conform to the massing, volume, height, facade proportions and scale* of the existing structure and surrounding structures. The *rhythm of buildings to open space* is not affected since the addition is in the rear.
5. **Materials and Details** - The materials and details of the proposed addition, including the stucco finish, simulated divided light windows, brick chimney, asphalt shingle roof, and wood frieze board *relate to the materials and details* of the existing structure.
6. **Building Elements** – The house’s individual elements are *integrated into its composition for a balanced and complete design that complement existing adjacent structures as well*
7. **Roof**– The existing gable roof is maintained. The house addition also uses a gable roof style and has a similar pitch. In the rear of the house, the second story roof and first story roof are connected, creating a long, continuous plane. The ridge of the addition’s roof is lower than the main roof, providing differentiation that complies with the guideline that *new work shall be differentiated from the old*.
8. **Windows and Doors** - *The proportion, size, rhythm and detailing of windows and doors* on the house addition are compatible with the existing house. The vertical orientation and double-hung nature of most of the new windows are consistent with the existing house. The fixed and awning-style windows on the addition are compatible in style with the existing house windows, given their divided light style and locations away from prominent street view. The new half-circle attic window appropriately mimics the existing one. Details were not submitted for the new rear door that would allow for full analysis.
9. **Landscaping** – The shade trellis is appropriately located in the rear of the house.
10. **Demolition** - *In the case of the proposed demolition of a building, prior to approval of said demolition, the commission shall make written findings on the following:*
  - a. *The architectural and historical merit of the building.* The house is classified as contributing, though the rear screened patio proposed to be demolished is not a character-defining feature.
  - b. *The effect of the demolition on surrounding buildings.* The removal of the screened patio and rear elevation details will not have a negative impact on the property and the Program for Preservation in the Summit Avenue West Historic District.
  - c. *The effect of any proposed new construction on the remainder of the building (in case of partial demolition) and on surrounding buildings.* Demolition of the rear screened patio will not detract from the house’s established form and will not remove any character-defining features.
  - d. *The economic value or usefulness of the building as it now exists or if altered or modified in comparison with the value or usefulness of any proposed structures designated to replace the present building or buildings.* Removal of the screened patio allows for the larger proposed addition.
11. The proposed house addition and remodel will not have an adverse effect on the Program for the Preservation and architectural control of the Summit Avenue West Heritage Preservation District (Leg. Code §73.06 (e)).

#### **F. STAFF RECOMMENDATION:**

Based on the findings, staff recommends approval of the building permit application subject to the following additional conditions:

1. All final materials, details and colors shall be reviewed and approved by HPC staff or the HPC.
2. Any revisions to the approved plans must be submitted to the HPC and/or staff for review.
3. The HPC stamped approved plans must be kept on site during the construction project.
4. The proposed parking pad shown on the site plan is not part of this approval and a separate application would be required for review and approval.

5. At the point on the east elevation that divides the existing house from the new addition, the addition shall be moved away from the side property line by at least 6” in order to create a “reveal” and more clearly differentiate old from new.

**G. ATTACHMENTS**

1. HPC Design Review Application
2. Architectural Exhibits