

SUMMARY MINUTES OF THE HERITAGE PRESERVATION COMMISSION
CITY OF SAINT PAUL, MINNESOTA
Lower Level – Room 41, City Hall/Court House, 15 West Kellogg Boulevard
August 8, 2013

Present: Richard Dana, Robert Ferguson, Matt Hill, Michael Justin, Richard Laffin, Steve Trimble, Diane Trout-Oertel, Renee Hutter Barnes, David Riehle, Matt Mazanec, David Wagner

Absent: None

Staff Present: Christine Boulware, Amy Spong, Renee Cohn

BUSINESS MEETING

- I. **Call to Order** 5:02p
- II. **Approval of the Agenda** Commissioner Dana motioned to approve the agenda; Commissioner Hutter-Barnes seconded the motion.
- III. **Approval of the meeting minutes** Commissioner Dana motioned to approve the meeting minutes; Commissioner Ferguson seconded the motion.
 - A. May 9, 2013 Business Meeting
 - B. July 25, 2013 Public Hearing/Permit Review
- IV. **Chair's Announcements** None were stated.
- V. **Staff Announcements**
 - A. Staff announced that The 33rd Annual Statewide Historic Preservation Conference will be held Spetember 12-13, 2013 and that at least on Commission member is required to attend.
 - B. Staff shared the most recent proposal for the public alley between 350 Sibley Street North and 240 Fifth Street East and indicated that staff will be able to approve the proposal.
- VI. **Old Business**
 - A. **536 Holly Avenue, Hill Historic District**, by Josh Columb, Vertical Grain Builders LLC, for a building permit to demolish the one-stall garage and construct a 2.5 stall garage with a covered patio (1059 s.f.) at the rear of the property. **File #13-026** (Boulware, 266-6715). **This item was laid over from June 27th in order to assess condition of existing garage and look for ways to preserve existing while building a new garage.**

Staff read aloud the updated report recommending conditional approval of the application. Ms. Boulware noted the additional information and materials provided as requested by the Commission.

Commissioner Dana inquired as to staff involvement with the updated application; Ms. Boulware described the staff involvement.

Commissioner Wagner noted Finding #9 and inquired as to if this finding had changed from the previous staff report; staff noted that it had based on the newly acquired information. A discussion was had regarding the reasoning for this finding.

Commissioner Mazanec inquired as to if any existing windows will be retained; Ms. Boulware discussed the feasibility of retaining the existing windows and other building features.

Commissioner Wagner inquired as to if staff is recommending Scenario A, B, or C; staff confirmed the recommendation is to approve the existing proposal with some changes.

Commissioner Trout-Oertel inquired as to the windows; Ms. Boulware noted there was no indication from the applicant either way.

Connie Cook, applicant and owner, was present to discuss the proposal.

Ms. Cook presented the additional material and information that had been provided and discussed the studies that had been done that were represented in Scenarios A, B, and C.

Chair Laffin inquired as to the possibility of re-using the existing windows; Ms. Cook discussed the possibilities. Commissioner Mazanec noted the relationship of the garage windows to the windows on the main residence.

Chair Laffin inquired as to the selected overhead garage door; Ms. Cook noted the referenced design is diagrammatic.

Commissioner Dana inquired as to if the applicant is aware of the possibility of further review and approval of built elements by HPC staff; Ms. Cook responded that she was unaware, but will comply.

Commissioner Mazanec encouraged the re-use of the existing windows on the new garage; Ms. Cook responded that it will be considered.

Andrea Jepsen, a neighbor, was present to speak in support of the proposal.

No written testimony was received and the public hearing was closed.

Commissioner Riehle moved to adopt the staff recommendation to conditionally approve the updated application; Commissioner Dana seconded the motion.

Commissioner Mazanec proposed a friendly amendment to include a condition that the existing windows be included in the new design.

Commissioner Riehle did not accept the friendly amendment.

Commissioner Mazanec moved for a non-friendly amendment to include a condition that the existing windows be included in the new design; Commissioner Trimble seconded the motion.

The motion failed 3-7 (Ferguson, Hill, Justin, Riehle, Wagner, Hutter-Barnes, Dana).

Commissioner Trout-Oertel encouraged that attention be given to the garage doors.

The original motioned passed 10-0.

VII. Public Hearings/Permit Review

A. 295 Summit Avenue #3, Hill Historic District, by owner Mark Saliterman, for a demolition permit to raze the brick walled structure (coal house) at the back of the brick carriage house. HPC File #13-029 (Staff: Spong, 266-6714)

Chair Laffin stated that the applicant was not present at the meeting and proposed that the item be laid over to the next meeting.

Staff agreed with Chair Laffin's proposal and discussed the circumstances of the proposal.

The Commission voted to lay this item over 10-0.

B. 688 Fourth Street East, Dayton's Bluff Historic District, Paul Ormseth LLC, for permits to rehabilitate the residence, construct new front and side porches, and construct a one-and-one-half stall garage. HPC File #13-030 (Boulware, 266-6715)

Staff read aloud the report recommending conditional approval of the application.

Commissioner Riehle inquired as to the determination of the building as Italianate; a discussion was had regarding the features that represent the Italianate style.

Commissioner Wagner inquired as to if the street has been re-routed; Ms. Boulware noted the historic configuration of the street.

Paul Ormseth, the applicant and project architect, was present to speak of behalf of the proposal.

Chair Laffin inquired as to the intention for ventilation; Mr. Ormseth discussed the possibilities for ventilation.

Chair Laffin inquired as to the layout of the garage; Mr. Ormseth stated that there will be room for a car and storage.

Commissioner Riehle inquired as to the presence of asbestos; Mr. Ormseth confirmed that asbestos was found only in the interior of the building.

No written testimony was received and the public hearing was closed.

Commissioner Trout-Oertel moved to adopt the staff recommendation to conditionally approve the proposal; Commissioner Wagner seconded the motion.

A discussion was had regarding the Commission's approval of the entire project.

The motion passed 10-0.

C. 694-696 Fourth Street East, Dayton's Bluff Historic District, Paul Ormseth LLC, for permits to rehabilitate the double-house, install a new foundation, construct new front porches, install new windows, create new openings at the rear elevation, and construct a new retaining wall at the downhill side of the property. HPC File #13-031 (Dermody, 266-6617)

Staff read aloud the report recommending conditional approval of the application.

A discussion was had regarding the existing rear stairs.

Commissioner Mazanec inquired as to the intentions for the visibility of the front foundation; Ms. Boulware discussed the existing and possible site conditions in regards to the visible foundation.

Commissioner Riehle inquired as to the integrity of the basement; Ms. Boulware discussed the current integrity and the possibilities for improvement.

A discussion was had in regards to the vacancy and ownership of the building.

Commissioner Wagner inquired as to the visibility of the flat roof; Ms. Boulware noted that is likely not.

Commissioner Wagner inquired as to if the existing roof has a parapet; Mr. Boulware noted that there is a minor ridge cap.

Paul Ormseth, the applicant and project architect, was present to speak of behalf of the proposal.

Mr. Ormseth discussed the possibilities for the rehabilitation of the basement and foundation and the existing site conditions. A discussion was had regarding the possible foundation and basement conditions.

Commissioner Riehle inquired as to the lifespan of Platteville limestone; Mr. Ormseth discussed the lifespan.

Commissioner Wagner inquired as to the existing roof transition; Mr. Ormseth discussed the current roof condition and the possibilities for the future roof condition, noting possibilities for drainage.

A discussion was had regarding the design possibilities for the roof; Staff noted there is no physical historic evidence for design elements on the roof and noted decorative possibilities based on evidence from other properties.

Commissioner Dana inquired as to the decision to replace the basement; Mr. Ormseth discussed the cost considerations.

No written testimony was received and the public hearing was closed.

Commissioner Mazanec moved to adopt the staff recommendation to conditionally approve the proposal; Commissioner Hutter-Barnes seconded the motion.

The motion passed 10-0.

Commissioner Trimble left the meeting.

D. 698 Fourth Street East, Dayton's Bluff Historic District, Paul Ormseth LLC, for permits to rehabilitate the residence, reopen the front porch, and construct a new retaining walls at the front and side property lines. HPC File #13-032 (Boulware, 266-6715)

Staff read aloud the report recommending conditional approval of the application.

Chair Laffin inquired as to the consideration of installing a concrete-block wall as opposed to a poured concrete wall; Ms. Boulware discussed this consideration.

Chair Laffin inquired as to salvageable limestone on the retaining wall; Ms. Boulware suggested that there will be none.

Commissioner Mazanec inquired as to if there is a curb-cut on the property; Ms. Boulware stated that there currently is not.

Commissioner Wagner noted the loss of the office window and inquired as to the possibility of installing a new window on the same elevation; Ms. Boulware noted it will be dependant on what is existing on the original siding.

Paul Ormseth, the applicant and project architect, was present to speak of behalf of the proposal.

Commissioner Dana inquired as to the proposed timeline of the project; Mr. Ormseth discussed the timeline.

Commissioner Riehle inquired as to if the existing siding will be removed on 688, 694-696, and 698 4th Street East; Mr. Ormseth discussed the process.

Chair Laffin inquired as to the general condition of covered siding; Mr. Ormseth discussed the presumed conditions of the siding on the three properties.

No written testimony was received and the public hearing was closed.

Commissioner Dana moved to adopt the staff recommendation to conditionally approve the proposal; Commissioner Ferguson seconded the motion.

The motion passed 9-0.

VIII. Committee Reports

A. Education Committee (Ferguson, Oertel) - Commissioner Trout-Oertel discussed the status of the Education Committee.

IX. Motion to Adjourn 7:07p

Submitted by R.Cohn