

CITY OF SAINT PAUL
HERITAGE PRESERVATION COMMISSION STAFF REPORT
*** AMENDED 2/15/21***

ADDRESS: 300 Ryan
APPLICANT: Tony O'Malley: Sharkey Design Build
DATE OF MEETING: February 22, 2021
HPC SITE/DISTRICT: Irvine Park Heritage Preservation District
DISTRICT PERIOD OF SIGNIFICANCE: 1848-1910
SITE CATEGORY: Vacant Lot **SAINT PAUL WARD:** 2 **DISTRICT COUNCIL:** 9
ZONING: RT1/RC4 **PROPOSAL:** Infill Construction
STAFF: George Gause

BACKGROUND

The structure at 302 Ryan Avenue was moved into the Irvine Park Heritage Preservation District after the period of significance. In September 2018, the Commission found the architectural and historic merit of the building to be poor and the building lacked integrity of location, setting, design, materials and feeling. The proposed demolition was also found to not have an adverse impact the surrounding historic buildings. The HPC unanimously approved the demolition of 302 Ryan. After the demolition, the lot was split forming 300 Ryan.

HPC PRE-APPLICATION:

The HPC pre-application meeting was held December 14, 2020. The meeting recording is available on the City of Saint Paul YouTube site, under the playlists tab-HPC.

Commission questions to staff

- There is a wide variety of structures in the area.*
- Is it OK to add a new window style into Irving Park?*
- What is going on with the other two lots?*
- Did the client want this particular styled structure or is this speculative?*

Applicant Comments

- Couple of homes in the area do have bay windows.*
- I can do whatever windows the Commission wants 1 over 1 or 6 over 1 windows.*

Commissioner Comments

- I like the design and the Bay window.*
- This is a modest neighborhood; design should focus on being a modest infill.*
- This design may be overwhelming for infill construction.*
- Detailing needs to be toned down.*
- This is a new building in a historic district focus on scale massing materials to fit into that context.*
- Simplify to an elegant design.*

PROPOSED WORK:

A new, single family residential structure with attached garage is proposed for the vacant lot.

Height	32' 10"	Siding Material	Cement Fiberboard
Width	29' 10"	Window Material	Fibrex Composite
Sq. Ft.	2,747	Roofing Material	Asphalt Shingle

- Continued -

1. Does the project conform with Saint Paul Legislative Code Chapter 74 standards?

The design does meet the Legislative Code Chapter 74 standards, except for the roof shape. The nested gable roof is not seen in Irvine Park, but does differentiate this as new construction as stated in the *Secretary of the Interiors Standards for Rehabilitation #9*. The district does contain other structures that are very tall.

Sec. 74.102(C) New Construction (Irvine Park Heritage Preservation District)

Guideline	Meets Guideline?	Comments
<p>New construction. <i>Though stylistically diverse, Irvine Park architecture demonstrates similar organization of massing, rhythm, materials, and building elements, which together express a harmony and continuity in the streetscape. New construction should incorporate the general massing, rhythm, materials and building elements of historic Irvine Park structures and should be sensitive to the architectural styles evidence in the Park.</i></p>	Yes	The developer has taken the comments from the HPC pre-app meeting and the neighborhood meeting and has focused on the specific architectural characteristics of the area, while keeping the design distinguishable from other historic structures.
<p>I. Massing. <i>New construction should conform to the massing of existing adjacent structures, respecting the height, volume, and scale of the neighborhood. Most district buildings are two (2) or three (3) stories high, three (3) or four (4) bays wide, and twenty (20) to forty (40) feet high. The height of new construction should be no lower than the average height of all buildings surrounding the park; measurements should be made from street level to the highest point of the roof.</i></p>	Yes	As designed, the structure will be approximately 3' taller than height of the neighboring structures. The height will conform to the height variables of Irving Park (a mix of heights) while staying within the context of Ryan Avenue.
<p>III. Materials and details. <i>While most Irvine Park structures are wood-framed and clapboarded, variety in the use of architectural materials and details adds to the intimacy and visual delight of the district. New construction materials and details should relate to materials and details of adjacent buildings.</i></p>	Yes	Cement fiberboard smooth lap siding is proposed for the structure.
<p>III. Materials and details. Roofs. <i>Roofs of slate, cedar shakes and standing seam metal are preferred, but materials which match their approximate color and texture are acceptable substitutes.</i></p>	Yes	Asphalt shingles <i>Timberline</i> Charcoal color are proposed.
<p>III. Materials and details. Siding. <i>Siding running diagonally is unacceptable. Imitative materials such as asphalt siding, wood-textured metal siding or artificial stone should not be used. Wooden four-inch or six-inch clapboard is preferred as a siding material.</i></p>	Yes	Horizontal 4" wood lap siding is proposed.
<p>IV. Building elements. a. Roofs and chimneys. <i>Gable, hipped and mansard roofs are the most common forms in Irvine Park. These forms are used with great variety, offering several options for new construction roof profiles. New roof and chimney designs should be compatible with existing adjacent structures.</i></p>	No	As proposed the nested gable on a hip roof is not found on contributing structures in Irvine Park. However, this element does distinguish this from historic contributing structures in the district.

<p><i>IV. Building elements. b. Windows and doors. The proportion, size and detailing of windows and doors in new construction should relate to the facade openings of existing adjacent buildings.</i></p>	<p>Yes</p>	<p>The developer has taken the comments from the HPC pre-app meeting and the neighborhood meeting and changed the proposed windows to a style that is found in the district.</p>
<p><i>V. Site. a. Setback. Due to varying lot sizes, orientation, and type and date of construction, setbacks in the Irvine Park District vary considerably. Generally, new construction setbacks should be within ten (10) percent in line with existing adjacent buildings.</i></p>	<p>Yes</p>	<p>According to the site plan, the proposed structure will match the setbacks of neighboring structures.</p>
<p><i>V. Site. c. Garages and parking. New construction of garages should be similar to the overall design and materials of the building they accompany. If an alley is adjacent to the dwelling, a new garage should be located off this alley. Where alleys do not exist, one-lane driveway curb-cuts may be acceptable. Garages should be located at the rear of the lot. Garage doors should not face the street.</i></p>	<p>Yes</p>	<p>This lot does not contain an alley. A one-lane drive will be installed along the southern edge of the property. Garage doors will face the neighboring lot.</p>

2. Was the public informed about the HPC application and was there any participation?

Notice letters were sent out to property owners within 100’ of the project property on February 8, 2021 which gave a description and a map location of the project.

HP staff organized a meeting between the developer and residents on January 21, 2021. The meeting recording is available on the City of Saint Paul YouTube site, under the playlists tab-HPC.

Neighbor Comments

- OK with roof style.*
- We will need to review a streetscape to see how this fits into with other neighboring houses.*
- Building seems to be too tall.*
- Will this new infill overwhelm the street?*
- Details don't match what we see on structures along Ryan Ave.*
- Context the builder should be looking at for this new infill is Ryan Ave.*

Developer Comments

- Details were based on the corner house (Ryan & Irvine Park)*
- No variances will be needed for this infill.*
- Windows will be Anderson 2 over 2 double-hung.*
- Will be removing the arch on the windows.*
- If we expose the foundation it will make the house taller.*

3. Does the Project adversely affect the Program for Preservation and architectural control under Code Section 73.06(e)?

No. Generally, the infill design does conform to the legislative code standards. The roof is different from what's found in the district, but it could also be said that it differentiates this design from historic contributing properties in the area. Materials conform to what we see in the district. Cement fiberboard and Fibrex composite (proposed for the windows) performs visually similar to wood products. The structure does match the highest structure on Ryan Avenue. It will not be so tall that it would overwhelm any of the surrounding structures and there are several very tall structures in the district.



Pre-Application Hearing



Current Application

STAFF RECOMMENDATIONS

Based on the draft resolution findings and 11 conditions, staff recommends approval of construction of the new single-family residential structure with attached garage.

STAFF REPORT ADDENDUM 2/15/21

In the original submittal documents an error was discovered concerning the height of the proposed structure. The developer corrected that issue with a new document set. While it shows the building will be 3 feet higher than the other structures on Ryan Ave, the height will still be within the range of what is found in Irving Park. The 3' height difference on the hip roof will be imperceivable to passersby. Foundation height has also been questioned since Ryan Avenue structures all contain 20-30 inches of exposed foundation and the proposed structure only 6 inches. The Irvine Park Guidelines do not address foundation height as a consideration.

Neighbors have asked questions about setback and lot coverage. Those items are the purview of zoning and not the HPC. The developer has assured staff that no zoning variances are required, and the construction will conform to the current zoning code. If a variance is required, a BZA meeting will be scheduled to address those issues.

SUGGESTED MOTION:

I move to adopt the draft resolution which approves construction of the new single-family residential structure with attached garage at 300 Ryan Avenue as per the findings of fact, presented testimony, submitted documentation and information provided in the staff report.

Motion Change
If the HPC decides to deny the motion, then draft finding #2 will need to be changed, further findings explaining the denial added and conditions #1-11 eliminated from the resolution.

- End -

CITY OF SAINT PAUL

HERITAGE PRESERVATION COMMISSION RESOLUTION

ADDRESS **300 Ryan Avenue**

DATE: **February 22, 2021**

Memorializing the Saint Paul Heritage Preservation Commission’s February 22, 2021 decision approving the construction of a single-family residential structure with attached garage on the vacant lot at 300 Ryan Avenue.

1. On April 20, 1982, the Irvine Park Heritage Preservation District was established under Ordinance No. 16909. The City of Saint Paul shall protect the architectural character of heritage preservation sites through review and authorization or denial of applications for city permits for exterior work within designated heritage preservation sites §73.04.(4).
2. The construction of a single-family residential structure with attached garage on the vacant lot at 300 Ryan Avenue will not adversely affect the Program for the Preservation and architectural control of the Irvine Park Heritage District **[§73.06 (e)]** so long as the conditions are met.

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED, the Heritage Preservation Commission approves the construction of a single-family residential structure with attached garage at 300 Ryan Avenue, subject to the following conditions:

1. Siding material to be smooth and free of knots, rough, unfinished appearance and other imperfections.
2. Any exposed concrete shall have a smooth finish, void of aggregate. Finish may include a light, one directional, broom finish.
3. Window and door glass shall be clear void of tint, color, or reflection.
4. Any metal, including flashing, valleys or drip edge, shall have a dark finish not glossy/shiny or a material that will achieve a dark patina within 24 months.
5. Roof material to be asphalt shingles installed in a traditional pattern.
6. Any venting shall be dark and have a low profile. Installation of venting is preferred on the non-visible portion of the roof.
7. Approval is written in conjunction with and referencing submitted application and approved plans. Conditions of this approval MAY supersede any contradictory notes or schedules found on project description or drawings. This approval is VOID if the approved description or plans are altered from the submitted application.
8. Work to be accomplished in accordance with submitted application and plans. Any deviation from is to be submitted to staff prior to construction.
9. All measurements and relationships of existing conditions and new construction shall be field checked for accuracy with submitted plans at the responsibility of the applicant. Inaccuracies or differences should be reported to HPC staff prior to commencement.
10. Work to be accomplished in accordance with all applicable zoning regulations and building codes, or Board of Zoning Appeals decision. This approval does not constitute or recommend a hardship for purposes of zoning review.
11. Further permits and approvals may be required. This approval signifies review and issuance based on the Heritage Preservation regulations and guidelines. No other city, state, or federal review and approval should be assumed or implied by this approval.

MOVED BY:

SECONDED BY:

IN FAVOR

AGAINST

ABSTAIN

Decisions of the Heritage Preservation Commission are final, subject to appeal to the City Council within 14 days by anyone affected by the decision. This resolution does not obviate the need for meeting applicable building and zoning code requirements, and does not constitute approval for tax credits.