

# CITY OF SAINT PAUL

## HERITAGE PRESERVATION COMMISSION STAFF REPORT

**FILE NAME:** 321 Irvine Avenue W.

**APPLICANT:** Rashad Kennedy

**DATE OF PER APPLICATION:** September 20, 2021

**HPC DISTRICT:** Hill Preservation District

**PERIOD OF SIGNIFICANCE:** 1858-1930

**CATEGORY:** Vacant Lot

**WARD:** 1

**DISTRICT COUNCIL:** 8

**CLASSIFICATION:** New Construction-Preapplication

**STAFF:** George Gause

**\*This is a pre-application discussion. The HPC will take no action on this item.\***

### A. SITE DESCRIPTION:

The site is currently vacant.

### B. BACKGROUND

The applicant is proposing to construct a new duplex structure.

### PROPOSED WORK:

A new, single family residential structure with attached garage is proposed for the vacant lot.

Height	40' 1"	Siding Material	LP Smart Siding
Width	52'	Window Material	Fibrex
Sq. Ft.	4,900	Roofing Material	Asphalt Shingle

### C. PRESERVATION PROGRAM CITATIONS:

#### *Hill Heritage Preservation District Legislative Code*

PRESERVATION PROGRAM CITATIONS	COMMENTS:
<b>§74.65 New Construction Guidelines</b>	
(a) <i>General Principles: The basic principle for new construction in the Historic Hill District is to maintain the district's scale and quality of design. The Historic Hill District is architecturally diverse within an overall pattern of harmony and continuity. These guidelines for new construction focus on general rather than specific design elements in order to encourage architectural innovation and quality design while maintaining the harmony and continuity of the district. New construction should be compatible with the size, scale, massing, height, rhythm, setback, color, material, building elements, site design, and character of surrounding structures and the area.</i>	The design does not maintain the districts scale and quality of design. The design is not compatible with the contributing structures in the district.
(b) <i>Massing and Height: New construction should conform to the massing, volume, height, and scale of existing adjacent structures. Typical residential structures in the Historic Hill District are twenty-five (25) to forty (40) feet high.</i>	The structure is at the extent of acceptable height (40').
(d) <i>Material and Details: (2) The materials and details of new construction should relate to the materials and details of existing nearby buildings.</i>	The use of sustainable materials is acceptable and preferred for new construction.

<i>(d) Material and Details: (3) Preferred roof materials are cedar shingles, slate and tile; asphalt shingles which match the approximate color and texture of the preferred materials are acceptable substitutes.</i>	Asphalt shingles are acceptable for the district.
<i>(e) Building Elements: (1) Roofs: a. There is a great variety of roof treatment in the Historic Hill District, but gable and hip roofs are most common. The skyline or profile of new construction should relate to the predominant roof shape of existing adjacent buildings.</i>	The roofline is a split design to avoid a height variance. The roofline as designed does not correspond with district.
<i>(e) Building Elements: (1) Roofs: b. Most houses in the Historic Hill District have a roof pitch of between 9:12 and 12:12 (rise-to-run ratio).</i>	Roof pitch as designed is 4/12, much lower than what is found in the district on primary structures.
<i>(2) Windows and doors: a. The proportion, size, rhythm and detailing of windows and doors in new construction should be compatible with that of existing adjacent buildings. Most windows on the Hill have a vertical orientation, with a proportion of between 2:1 and 3:1 (height to width) common.</i>	Window style is modern and not compatible with the district.
<i>(2) Windows and doors: b. Wooden double-hung windows are traditional in the Historic Hill District and should be the first choice when selecting new windows. Paired casement windows, although not historically common, will often prove acceptable because of their vertical orientation. Sliding windows, awning windows, and horizontally oriented muntins are not common in the district and are generally unacceptable. Sliding glass doors should not be used where they would be visible from the street.</i>	The casement window style is not common for the district. The guidelines do state that they are maybe acceptable, in this application it causes the structure to have a minimal appearance, not common to the Hill district.
<i>(2) Windows and doors: c. Although not usually improving the appearance of building, the use of metal windows or doors need not necessarily ruin it. The important thing is that they should look like part of the building and not like raw metal appliances. Appropriately colored or bronze-toned aluminum is acceptable.</i>	Fibrex is a combination material which has sustainability factors. The proper trim package for the windows will be required.
<i>(3) Porches and decks: a. In general, houses in the Historic Hill District have roofed front porches, while in most modern construction the front porch has disappeared. Front porches provide a transitional zone between open and closed space which unites a building and its site, semiprivate spaces which help to define the spatial hierarchy of the district. They are a consistent visual element in the district and often introduce rhythmic variation, clarify scale or provide vertical facade elements. The porch treatment of new structures should relate to the porch treatment of existing adjacent structure.</i>	The garage opening contains a small awning, but it is too small to be interpreted as a porch. No other porch element is contained on the structure.
<i>(3) Garages and parking: a. Where alleys do not exist, garages facing the street or driveway curb cuts may be acceptable. Garage doors should not face the street. If this is found necessary, single garage doors should be used to avoid the horizontal orientation of two-car garage doors.</i>	No alley exists in this area. The garage opening should be reduced to two garage doors each, to meet the guidelines.

-Continued-

**Irvine Avenue Development Plan (2003)**

**Goal/Vision:** *Irvine Avenue should remain a low-density residential area due to the steep slopes and the narrow roadway. Irvine Avenue should appear as a wooded lane punctuated by buildings and retaining walls. Any new buildings should blend into the historic and natural character of the area. Garage doors should be downplayed architecturally so that the street doesn't end up looking like an alley. Construction should be engineered to take into account the stability and hydrology of the slopes.*

**Historic Character**

*12. The north side of Irvine Avenue is within the Historic Hill District. The guidelines for the historic district should include a policy on preserving Irvine Avenue's historic character as a lane of homes and carriage houses, recognizing how distinct the street is from most of Ramsey Hill, irregular spacing of buildings; wide variation in setbacks from the street; naturalistic landscaping instead of lawns; and carriage houses facing the street.*

- End -