

## City of Saint Paul – Department of Safety and Inspections

### Site Plan Review Report

**Date of Report:** November 9, 2017

**SPR File #** 17-206385

**Address Location:** 1973-1977 Marshall Ave

**Project:** Marshall & Moore Apartments



Jon Schwartzman  
MCR Property Holdings, LLC  
10921 Excelsior Blvd., #106  
Hopkins, MN 55343

Paul Hanlon  
Pope Architects  
1295 Bandana Blvd., Ste 200  
St Paul, MN 55108

Eric Meyers  
Larson Engineering  
3524 Labore Rd  
White Bear Lake, MN 55110

On November 7, 2017, you met with City staff to discuss the site plan for the Marshall & Moore Apartment building project including 16 units and 32 off-street parking spaces. The comments from that meeting are summarized below.

#### 1. Site Plan Process

- a) Site Plan Review is a function delegated by the St Paul Planning Commission to City staff, however, a Site Plan may be referred to Planning Commission for public hearing.
- b) For this project the overall Site Plan will receive a public hearing at the Zoning Committee of the Planning Commission. The public hearing date is to be determined. The Planning Commission shall determine whether the submitted site plan is approved or denied per the findings in Leg. Code Sec. 61.402. - Site plan review by the planning commission (c) site plan review and approval.
- c) Planning Commission approval of the Site Plan must be obtained before staff can sign-off on the Site Plan.
- d) A Final Site Plan decision by the Planning Commission may be appealed within ten days after the date of the decision per Leg. Code Sec. 61.702 – Appeals to city council.
- e) Provide a pdf version of the updated Site Plan package for review by the Site Plan Review Committee prior to submittal to the Planning Commission.
- f) Per Minnesota State Statute 326, the final plans submitted shall be signed by the appropriate licensed Professional, i.e. PE, LA, RLS, etc., responsible for plan development.
- g) Building permits will not be issued until the Site Plan has final approval.

#### 2. Zoning

Reviewer: Tia Anderson/651-266-9086 [tia.anderson@ci.stpaul.mn.us](mailto:tia.anderson@ci.stpaul.mn.us)

Reviewer: Larry Zangs/651-266-9082 [larry.zangs@ci.stpaul.mn.us](mailto:larry.zangs@ci.stpaul.mn.us)

##### Comments:

- a) A development moratorium was approved by the City Council on October 18, 2017, on Marshall Avenue between Wheeler and Wilder Streets within the West Marshall Study Area. This project is within the moratorium area, however, a complete Site Plan application was submitted prior to the City Council public hearing on October 18, 2017.
- b) The proposed use of the property as Multi-family Housing is permitted at this location in a RM2 medium-density multiple-family residential Zoning District.
- c) *Please provide a description of the proposed office operations.* A leasing/maintenance office space serving the multi-family dwelling in which it is located would be considered an accessory use, which is permitted in an RM2 zoning district. However, an office serving multiple residential properties is a general commercial office use, and not permitted in any residential Zoning Districts.
- d) Tenants of multi-family residential units cannot exceed the definition of a family per Leg. Code Sec. 60.207. Family, which does not allow more than four un-related adults.
- e) RM2 setback requirements are as follows:
  - Minimum front setback is 29' 6" based on the average setback for the block.
  - Minimum side setback requirement is 9'.
  - Minimum rear setback requirement is 25'.

- f) RM2 Density standards are as follows:
  - Minimum lot area of 9,000 square feet is required for a multiple-family dwelling with 3 or more dwelling units.
    - One-half the width of a dedicated public alley adjoining the lot shall be considered as part of the lot, for the purpose of applying lot area and density requirements.
  - Minimum lot area per residential unit is 1,500 square feet. However, the lot area figure may be increased by three hundred (300) square feet for each parking space (up to two parking spaces per unit) within a multiple-family structure or otherwise completely underground.
    - The proposed accessory residential garages shall not be included in the lot area bonus calculation nor tandem spaces or other stacked parking.
- g) RM2 Dimensional standards are as follows:
  - *Update the Site Plan with the existing average grade based on the surveyed elevations.* Grade is the elevation established for the purpose of regulating the number of stories and the height of buildings. "Grade" shall be the mean level of the finished surface of the ground adjacent to the exterior walls of the buildings.
  - Maximum building height is 5 stories and 50', as measured from the established grade to the highest point of the roof surface for flat roofs.
    - Where a building is located on sloping terrain (e.g., Moore St elevation), the height may be measured from the average ground level of the grade at the building wall.
    - The existing grade of the property shall not be raised around a new building or foundation in order to comply with the height requirements of this code.
    - The height limitations of this code shall not apply to mechanical service stacks, tanks, ventilation equipment, and similar equipment.
  - *Update the Site Plan to clearly depict the building height and proposed elevations* in relation to the proposed structure in order to clarify average grade and height from all elevations.
- h) *Update the Site Plan with the lot coverage percentage.* In residential districts, principal buildings shall not cover more than thirty-five (35) percent of any zoning lot. The lot area may include One-half the width of the dedicated public alley adjoining the lot.
  - The green roof area exposed on the Moore Street side of the structure, shall be included in the lot coverage calculation.
  - Balconies shall be subject to setback and lot coverage requirements. However, per Leg. Code Sec. 63.105., an uncovered porch, deck or patio not exceeding two (2) feet in height is considered landscaping and is not subject to setback or lot coverage requirements.
- i) Attached vestibules or enclosed entrances may project up to twenty (20) square feet into a required front or rear yard and shall be included as part of the principal structure for lot coverage purposes.

### 3. Off-street Parking

- a) *Update the parking level plan with typical stall dimensions, maneuvering lane width, and number of parking spaces.* Workable parking spaces in the structured parking may be used for calculating the lot area density bonus.
- b) *Update the Site Plan analysis with number of residential units and bedrooms, and vehicle and bicycle parking required and provided.* The off-street parking requirement is based on number of residential units and number of bedrooms. 1.5 off-street parking space is required for 2 – 3 bedroom units, and 2 spaces for 4 bedroom units.
  - For dwelling units, a minimum of one secure bicycle parking space shall be provided for every 14 dwelling units.
  - Bicycle parking provided in excess of the minimum required bicycle parking may be substituted for up to 10 percent of minimum off-street vehicle parking requirements. For the purpose of calculating a substitution, 4 spaces in secure bicycle racks are the equivalent of one vehicle parking space.
- c) *Confirm location of secure bicycle parking.* Bicycle parking shall be provided in a convenient, safe, and secure location. The site plan included 16 bike racks in the rear of the property. However, at the November 7, 2017, Site Plan Review Committee meeting the project indicated they were considering bicycle parking in the underground parking area.
  - Outdoor bicycle parking shall be visible from the public right-of-way or from inside the building.

- Where motor vehicle parking spaces are monitored, covered or weather protected, required bicycle parking spaces shall be provided on the same basis.
- d) One ADA parking space is required for every 25 standard parking spaces. Parking spaces and passenger loading zones for persons with disabilities shall be designed in accordance with the provisions of the Accessibility Guidelines for Buildings and Facilities of the Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA).
- e) Accessory parking facilities may designate up to 50 percent of the spaces for compact cars. Compact spaces shall be designated by signs with a minimum of one sign per every four compact spaces. The submitted site plan currently includes 15 compact parking spaces.
- f) *Update the Site Plan to adhere to Zoning Code requirements for accessory structures* specifically as it pertains to the two proposed garages. Accessory buildings, structures or uses shall not be erected in or established in a required yard except a rear yard.
  - On corner lots, accessory structures shall be set back from the street a distance equal to that required of the principal structure.
  - When an accessory building, structure or use is constructed in a rear yard which adjoins a side yard or front yard, the accessory building, structure or use shall be set back from the interior lot line a distance equal to the minimum side yard required of the principal structure.
  - RM2 residential districts, accessory buildings on a zoning lot with residential use shall not exceed fifteen (15) feet in height, measured to the mid-point of the gable; provided, however, that accessory buildings with a flat or shed roof style shall not exceed twelve (12) feet in height.
  - Accessory buildings on a zoning lot may occupy up to thirty-five (35) percent of the rear yard. Rear yards which adjoin alleys may include half the area of the alley to calculate the area of the rear yard which may be occupied by accessory buildings.
  - An accessory building shall not be closer than one foot to an alley right-of-way.
  - Accessory buildings shall be located at least six (6) feet from the principal structure or shall be considered attached for purposes of the zoning code.
- g) *Update the Site Plan with dimensions and setbacks for the proposed off-street surface parking.* Off-street parking spaces shall not be within a required front or side yard and shall be a minimum of 4 feet from any lot line.
- h) At the November 7, 2017, Site Plan Review Committee meeting the project indicated that trash and recycling will be wheeled to the curb for pick-up.

#### 4. Building Design Standards

- a) *Update the site plan with the dimensions of the decorative overhangs.* Overhangs and decorative details may project into a required yard sixteen (16) inches plus two (2) inches for each foot of width of the required side yard.
- b) *Update the site plan with location of the service door* to the structured parking in order to meet egress requirements within the parking level.
- c) The project shall comply with building design standards per Leg. Code Sec. 63.110:
  - A primary entrance of principal structures shall be located within the front third of the structure; be delineated with elements such as roof overhangs, recessed entries, landscaping, or similar design features; and have a direct pedestrian connection to the street.
  - Building materials and architectural treatments used on sides of buildings facing an abutting public street should be similar to those used on principal facades.
  - *Provide the percentage of window and door openings on new facades on the Site Plan.*
    - For principal buildings, above grade window and door openings shall comprise at least fifteen (15) percent of the total area of exterior walls facing a public street or sidewalk.
    - In addition, for new principal residential buildings, above grade window and door openings shall comprise at least ten (10) percent of the total area of all exterior walls.
    - Windows shall be clear or translucent.
  - The visual impact of rooftop equipment shall be reduced through such means as location, screening, or integration into the roof design. Screening shall be of durable, permanent materials that are compatible with the primary building materials. Exterior mechanical equipment such as ductwork shall not be located on primary building facades.

## 5. Lighting

- a) Exterior lighting shall meet Zoning Code Sec. 63.116. - Exterior lighting.
- All outdoor lighting shall be shielded to reduce glare and shall be so arranged as to reflect lights away from all adjacent residential districts or adjacent residences in such a way as not to exceed three (3) footcandles measured at the residence district boundary.
  - All lighting in all districts used for the external illumination of buildings shall be placed and shielded so as not to interfere with the vision of persons on adjacent highways or adjacent property.

## 6. Landscaping for the Site and Exterior Parking Lot

- a) All required yards and any underdeveloped space shall be landscaped using materials such as trees, shrubs, sod, groundcover plants, or stormwater landscaping.
- b) For off-street parking facilities that abut a residential use or zoning district across an alley, one (1) of the following shall be provided and maintained as determined by the zoning administrator as part of site plan review:
- A visual screen 4.5 – 6.5' in height; or
  - An ornamental metal fence or other non-screening, durable fence where security concerns make this preferable to a visual screen.
- c) For any parking facility, landscaping shall be provided to buffer the facility from adjacent properties and from the public right-of-way; reduce the visual glare and heat effects of large expanses of pavement; and provide areas for the retention and absorption of stormwater runoff. The standards can be found in Sec. 63.313 and 63.314 of the Zoning Code.
- *Perimeter Landscape* - A landscaped yard at least four (4) feet wide along the public street or sidewalk.
  - *Screening Landscape* shall be provided consisting of a masonry wall or decorative fence (not including chain link) between 3' and 4.5' tall along public street or sidewalk supplemented with a landscape buffer.
  - *Tree plantings* – At least 1 shade tree shall be planted for every 5 surface parking spaces.

## 7. Parkland Dedication

As a part of this project, the City requires payment of a Parkland Dedication fee (*in lieu of the property owner needing to dedicate a portion of the property as park land*). The fee collected is used by the City for acquiring park land or other park capital improvements in the area.

Staff estimates a dedication fee of \$1689. The fee is calculated based on the number of residential units proposed, number of existing units, and value of the property. Payment is included with building and inspection fees when the building permit is issued.

## 8. Signs

Reviewer: Ashley Skarda/651-266-9013 [ashley.skarda@ci.stpaul.mn.us](mailto:ashley.skarda@ci.stpaul.mn.us)

### Comments:

Business signs require a separate review and Sign Permit from the Department of Safety and Inspections. Site plan approval does not constitute approval of signs shown on the site plan. Contact Ashley Skarda of DSI Zoning regarding signs.

## 9. Planning

Reviewer: Kady Dadlez/651-266-6619 [kady.dadlez@ci.stpaul.mn.us](mailto:kady.dadlez@ci.stpaul.mn.us)

### Comments:

- a) The applicant's property is zoned RM2. An apartment building is a permitted use in the RM2 zoning district.
- b) This stretch of Marshall Avenue is identified as a Residential Corridor in the Land Use Plan, a chapter of the Saint Paul Comprehensive Plan. Residential corridors are described in the plan as segments of street corridors that run through Established Neighborhoods and are predominantly characterized by medium density uses (4 to 30 units per acre). The land use plan adds that some portions of Residential Corridors could support additional housing.

- c) The lot area of the property is 15,169 square feet (14,171 square feet plus half of the alley, 998 square feet) or .35 acres. Using the ratio of 30 units per acre, .35 acres would yield 10.5 units. The applicant plans to obtain a density bonus by providing 25 structured parking spaces (25 spaces x 300 square feet), thereby increasing the lot area for density consideration purposes by 7,500 square feet for a total lot area of 22,669 square feet or .52 acres. Using the ratio of 30 units per acre, .52 acres would yield 15.6 units. Sixteen units are proposed.
- d) Generally speaking the comprehensive plan calls for increased density in residential corridors consistent with the prevailing character and overall density of the area. The Union Park Community Plan, an addendum to the comprehensive plan, calls for finding a balance that preserves desirable assets and neighborhood character while evolving to meet present and future needs. Please refer to the attached document for specific references to land use and housing policies of the comprehensive plan and Union Park Community Plan.

#### 10. District Council

The site is located in the District 13 Community Council. A copy of the site plan was provided to the District Council for comments. A letter from the District Council dated November 6, 2017, is attached for the project's consideration.

#### 11. Public Works Records and Mapping

Contact Number: 651-266-6150

##### Comments:

- a) Provide proof of filing of combination of contiguous lots with Ramsey County.
- b) Contact Public Works Records and Mapping at 651.266.6150 to determine the address for the building and apartment addresses for the individual units within the building. The building address can be odd numbers within the range of 1973 Marshall to 1979 Marshall.

#### 12. Public Works Construction

Reviewer: Scott Brimer/651-266-6225 [scott.brimer@ci.stpaul.mn.us](mailto:scott.brimer@ci.stpaul.mn.us)

##### Comments:

Curb at alley entrance must not be placed into alley right of way, but terminate at the property line. Match existing bituminous at alley.

#### 13. Public Works Transportation Planning

Reviewer: David Kuebler/651-266-6217

[david.kuebler@ci.stpaul.mn.us](mailto:david.kuebler@ci.stpaul.mn.us)

Reviewer: Colleen Paavola/651/266-6104

[colleen.paavola@ci.stpaul.mn.us](mailto:colleen.paavola@ci.stpaul.mn.us)

##### Comments:

- a) Please be advised that a Temporary Pedestrian Access Route (TPAR) and/or a Temporary Traffic Control (TTC) plan may be required as part of the Right-of-Way (ROW) permitting process. Said TTC or TPAR plans must be approved by the City prior to the ROW Permitting office issuing a permit(s).
- b) Per Minnesota State Statute 326, the final plans submitted must be signed by the appropriate licensed Professional, i.e. PE, LA, PLS, etc., responsible for plan development.
- c) On Plan Sheet S1 please include existing boulevard infrastructure, i.e. signs, lighting, etc. Also show the existing lane striping on Marshall.
- d) On Plan Sheet C1 please include notes regarding the protection of, or impacts to, the existing boulevard infrastructure such as street lighting, signs, etc.
- e) Please provide turning templates relative to accessing and exiting the proposed three stall garage, the two on-grade stalls and the two stalls in the garage as shown on Plan Sheet C2.
- f) Please provide detailed dimensions to Plan Sheet C2. The width dimension of the driveway at the ROW line is to be 22 feet unless turning movements indicate something wider is needed.
- g) On Plan Sheet C3.0 please provide a detail of the sidewalk/ramp relationship between ADA compliant ramp that starts at Marshall and parallels the Moore mainline sidewalk.
- h) On Plan Sheet C3.0 please provide catchbasin erosion control devices for the catchbasin at the NE quadrant of the Moore/Marshall intersection.



- i) On Plan Sheet C5 please update the detail for the driveway apron to a 1206D as can be provided by the City's Sidewalk office. Contact Al Czaia for said detail.
- j) For the plan sheets completed by Pope Architects, please include the ROW line in the elevation views and verify that what is shown in the elevation views represents what is shown in the Civil plan sheets. For example, the west elevation as provided is different than what is shown on plan sheet C3.0 in that the ADA ramp is not shown and the location of the walk-in door is on the wrong side of the overhead door.
- k) For the plan sheets completed by Pope Architects, the Garage Plan needs more detail such as grades, drainage information, turning movements showing how vehicles are able to negotiate the area, etc.
- l) Update the Site Plan with the following notes:
  - Change the NSPECTION CONTACT to "Dick Rohland at 651.485.1688".
  - As part of the ROW permitting process, two weeks before any work begins that impacts the ROW in any way the developer shall provide to the ROW Inspector the name and contact information of the Construction Project Manager or Construction Project Superintendent. If this information is not provided there may be a delay in obtaining permits for the work in the ROW. Said delays will be the sole responsibility of the developer
    - Replace the "ENCROACHMENT" note with the following:  
"ENCROACHMENTS: Per Chapter 134 of the Legislative Code, no person shall construct and maintain any projection or encroachment within the public right-of-way. Construction of the development that necessitates temporary use of the Right-of-Way (ROW) for construction purposes shall be limited to equipment, personnel, devices and appurtenances that are removable following construction. Encroachment permits will not be granted for devices such as tie backs, rock bolts, H-piles, lagging, timbers, sheet piling, etc. that the owner is seeking to abandon in the ROW.  
Section 3201.3 of the Minnesota Building Code defers final authority of encroachments into public rights-of-way/public property to the local authority. City Legislative Code governs management of the public rights-of-way. Provided such installations are approved by Public Works, footings may be allowed to encroach into City ROW no more than twelve (12) inches at depths below eight (8) feet as provided for in Minnesota Building Code Section 3202.1. Said encroachments would require an encroachment permit from the City per Chapter 134 of the Legislative Code.  
Encroachments into County or State ROW are not allowed unless authorization has been granted from said agency. Marshall Avenue is a County facility.
  - Change the contact name in the "NO PRIVATE FACILITIES IN THE RIGHT OF WAY" note to Don Bjorkman.
  - Access to signal controller and lighting cabinets must be maintained at all times. If fencing is required for a job site, a key or other means of access must be provided to the City of St. Paul's Traffic Operations Department. Contact John McNamara, General Foreman Signals and Lighting at 651.266.9780 for more information.
  - The paragraph that begins "As per the City's "Standard Specification for Street Openings" needs to be titled "ROADWAY RESTORATION".
  - Please include the following notes on the plans:
    - SIGNING: Signs regulating parking and/or traffic on private property shall be installed by the property owner or contractor outside of the public right-of-way (ROW). Removal of signs within the public ROW shall be completed by the City. New signs or the reinstallation of existing signs, as approved by Public Works Traffic Engineering, regulating parking and/or traffic in the public ROW for this development shall be installed by the City at the expense of the development. Contact Chris Gulden of Public Works 651-266-9778 two weeks in advance of needed sign work.
    - METERS: The City shall be contacted if development work affects the parking meter system. Said system includes meters, space numbers, pay stations and all appurtenances needed for the system to be operational. Removal of meter system elements within the public ROW shall be completed by the City and charged to the

developer. The installation of new meters or the reinstallation of removed meters shall also be completed by the City and charged back to the developer. The developer/contractor shall contact Chris Gulden at 651.266.9778 two weeks in advance of needed meter work. If two weeks' notice is not provided there may be a delay in obtaining permits for the work in the ROW. Said delays will be the sole responsibility of the developer.

m) CITY OF ST. PAUL PERMIT REQUIREMENTS:

- ORDERING OBSTRUCTION AND EXCAVATION PERMITS: Contact Public Works Right of Way Service Desk at (651) 266-6151. It is strongly recommended that contractors call for cost estimates prior to bidding to obtain accurate cost estimates.
- OBSTRUCTION PERMITS: The contractor must obtain an Obstruction Permit if construction (including silt fences) will block City streets, sidewalks or alleys, or if driving over curbs.
- EXCAVATION PERMITS: All digging in the public right of way requires an Excavation Permit. If the proposed building is close to the right of way, and excavating into the right of way is needed to facilitate construction, contact the utility inspector.
- FAILURE TO SECURE PERMITS: Failure to secure Obstruction Permits or Excavation Permits will result in a double-permit fee and other fees required under City of St. Paul Legislative Codes.

**14. Public Works Sidewalks**

Reviewer: Al Czaia/651-266-6108

[al.czaia@ci.stpaul.mn.us](mailto:al.czaia@ci.stpaul.mn.us)

Comments:

- a) Contractor is responsible for damage to the mainline sidewalk, curb, drive access and boulevard landscaping cause during the construction. Contractor advised to document pre-existing condition of the right of way prior to commencement of the construction.
- b) Sidewalk grades must be carried across driveways.
- c) Update the Site Plan with the following notes:
  - CONSTRUCTION IN RIGHT OF WAY: All work on curbs, driveways, and sidewalks within the public right of way must be done to City Standards and Specifications by a contractor licensed to work in the City right-of-way under a permit from Public Works Sidewalk Section (651-266-6108). Sidewalk grades must be carried across driveways.
  - RIGHT OF WAY RESTORATION: Restoration of asphalt and concrete pavements are performed by the Public Works Street Maintenance Division. The contractor is responsible for payment to the City for the cost of these restorations. The contractor shall contact Public Works Street Maintenance to set up a work order prior to beginning any removals in the street at 651-266-9700. Procedures and unit costs are found in Street Maintenance's "General Requirements - All Restorations" and are available at the permit office.

**15. Ramsey County**

Reviewer: Erin Laberee/651-266-7105 [erin.laberee@co.ramsey.mn.us](mailto:erin.laberee@co.ramsey.mn.us)

Comments:

A copy of the Site Plan was provided to Ramsey County for review. Ramsey County has no comments on the plan as submitted.

**16. Metro Transit**

Reviewer: Berry Farrington/612-349-7378 [berry.farrington@metrotransit.org](mailto:berry.farrington@metrotransit.org)

Comments:

- a) The plans show the developer is responsible for constructing a replacement boarding pad for the bus stop. At minimum it must be 5 feet wide by 8 feet deep and meet the standards identified by the Americans with Disabilities Act of 1990.
- b) The retaining wall is adjacent to a bus stop and the first level of the wall may be used as seating. Metro Transit suggests the wall design include surface for seating which will help protect the landscaping from damage.

- c) Please coordinate any needed short term lane closures with Metro Transit Street Operations, Greg Tuveson (612-349-5407 / [greg.tuveson@metrotransit.org](mailto:greg.tuveson@metrotransit.org))

## 17. Public Works Sewers

Reviewer: Anca Sima/651-266-6237 [anca.sima@ci.stpaul.mn.us](mailto:anca.sima@ci.stpaul.mn.us)

### Comments:

- a) Add a note on the demolition plan: removal permit for A11882 & 12719: cut off at the property line.
- b) Provide the detailed drainage map and the HydroCad calculations (some roof ponding)
- c) The EOF should be at least 1 ft. lower than FFE. Show the EOF on the plan.
- d) If the existing manhole for the proposed sanitary service connection is a brick construction, reconstruction of the manhole access may be required, please add the attached detail (2322e) for manhole reconstruction.
- e) The proposed man hole should be further than 50ft away from the existing one, if not, connect the proposed connection into an existing one.
- f) Add the city's standard plate with the connection at the main.
- g) If the storm pipe is less of 5" of building foundation, than is under the plumbing jurisdiction. It should be a steel pipe and you have to provide 5 pound air test.
- h) Show that all the storm water will be captured in the trench for 100 years event.
- i) Sanitary and/or storm sewer service passing within 10 feet of the building are governed by the MN Plumbing Code. Specification for pipe material selection and notes for required air test of the piping, compliant with the MN State Plumbing Code, must be shown on the plan.
- j) Update the Site Plan with the following notes:
  - SEWER REPAIR PERMIT: Plumbing Contractor to obtain "Repair Permits" from Public Works for proposed modification to the existing storm sewer connections. Call St Paul PW permit desk (651-266-6234) for information on obtaining this permit.
  - SEWER REMOVAL/ABANDONMENT PERMIT: Plumbing Contractor to obtain "Removal Permits" from Public Works to cut off existing sewer connections services to the property. Call St Paul PW permit desk (651-266-6234) for information on obtaining this permit.
  - SEWER CONNECTION PERMIT: License house drain contractor to obtain (Sewer Connection Permit) to construct new sanitary and storm connection in street from main to the property. Call St Paul PW permit desk (651-266-6234) for information on obtaining this permit.

## 18. Water Quality/Erosion Control

Reviewer: Wes Saunders-Pearce/651-266-9112 [wes.saunders-pearce@ci.stpaul.mn.us](mailto:wes.saunders-pearce@ci.stpaul.mn.us)

### Comments:

- a) Erosion control plan must show silt fence / perimeter controls within the private property not the public boulevard.
- b) Erosion control plan must add inlet protection to catch basins on Moore and Marshall.
- c) Provide more details on green roof including specific landscaping proposed and design cross section. Consider provisions for signage or fencing to prevent inadvertent impact by occupants.
- d) There must be 1 foot of separation from the 100-yr high water level and low floor.

## 19. Water Utility

Reviewer: Jeff Murphy/ 651-266-6813 [jeffrey.murphy@ci.stpaul.mn.us](mailto:jeffrey.murphy@ci.stpaul.mn.us)

### Comments:

- a) Show existing water services on Plan Sheet C1 or C4 to be cut off at the water main.
  - 1977 Marshall Ave – 1" CP – 30 S N Marshall / 28 E E Moore
  - 1973 Marshall Ave – 1" CP – 80 E E Moore
- b) The following work shall be performed by SPRWS on an actual cost basis. An estimate will be provided and payment in the amount of the estimate must be received before the work can be scheduled. Work of this type is currently being scheduled 4 to 6 weeks after payment and required signatures have been received:



- Pipework within right of way for 4" ductile iron domestic service.
  - Pipework within right of way for 6" ductile iron fire service.
  - Cut off of existing unused water services at the main.
  - Inspection of water facility work performed by owner's contractor.
- c) Plumbing permit applications to be made with SPRWS at 1900 Rice Street, Saint Paul, MN.
- d) Before construction of a new water service can be scheduled, SPRWS must receive a Water Service Contract signed by the owner and all required payments.
- e) Provide completed project data sheets to determine meter sizing.
- f) Furnish one set of interior fire suppression mechanical plans for review and approval by SPRWS plumbing inspection unit.
- g) Furnish one set of revised site plans for review. Following approval by SPRWS, furnish one set of approved plans.
- h) Provide the following on PLAN SHEET C4 under NOTES:
- Water services to be installed according to SPRWS "Standards for the Installation of Water Mains.
  - A four-sided trench box is required on all excavations deeper than 5 feet where underground work or inspection is to be performed by SPRWS. Ladders are required and must extend 3 feet above the surface of the trench. Sidewalks, pavements, ducts and appurtenant structures shall not be undermined unless a support system or another method of protection is provided. Trenches in excess of 20 feet in depth must be signed off by a registered professional engineer. Excavated material must be kept a minimum of 2 feet from the edge of the trench.
  - Pipe material for 8" Ductile Iron Pipe must be Class 52, Pipe material for 6" and 4" Ductile Iron Pipe must be Class 53. The exterior of ductile iron pipe shall be coated with a layer of arc-sprayed zinc per ISO 8179. The interior cement mortar lining shall be applied without asphalt seal coat.
  - Pipe must be wrapped in V-Bio Polywrap encasement.
  - Maintain 3 feet vertical separation between water and sewer pipes or a 12 inch separation with 4 inch high density insulation per SPRWS Standard Plate D-10 for typical water main offsets.
  - Refer to SPRWS "Standards for the Installation of Water Mains" Standard Plate D-11 for restrained pipe requirement.
  - All water service valve boxes within construction area must be exposed and brought to grade upon completion of construction.
  - All pipe work inside of property to be performed by a plumber licensed by the State of Minnesota and Certified by the City of Saint Paul. SPRWS requires separate outside and inside plumbing permits for each new water service.
  - All unused existing water services to be cut off by SPRWS. Excavation and restoration by owner's contractor. New water services will not be turned on until required cutoffs have been performed.
  - Water facility pipework within right of way to be installed by SPRWS. Excavation and restoration by owner's contractor.
  - The contractor providing excavation is responsible for obtaining all excavation and obstruction permits required by any governing authority.

## 20. Fire

Reviewer: Ann McLoughlin-651-266-9140

[ann.mcloughlin@ci.stpaul.mn.us](mailto:ann.mcloughlin@ci.stpaul.mn.us)

### Comments:

- a) Visibility of the Fire Department connection may be located on the N Moore St side of the building as close to Marshall Ave as possible in a visible, accessible location at all times without obstruction by fences, bushes, trees, walls, or other objects for a minimum of 3 feet to the front and each side. This requirement is applicable for the duration of the construction time as well.

- b) A metal sign or collar with raised letters at least 1 inch in size must be mounted on all Fire Department connections serving fire sprinklers, standpipes, or fire pump connections. Such signs shall read AUTOMATIC SPRINKLERS or STANDPIPES or TEST CONNECTION or a combination thereof as applicable.
- c) Automatic Fire Sprinkler System Required. Plans and permits required by licensed contractor. Flow test is required to determine adequacy of water service for proposed fire suppression system. The fire prevention section of the Dept. of Safety and Inspections reviews sprinkler plans, issues permits and does the necessary inspections of the installation. Contact Jeff Hemenway 651-266-8952 with questions on obtaining this permit and the procedure for arranging a time to perform this test.
- d) Update the Site Plan with the following notes:
  - Contractor to maintain access to the fire department connection for fire department personnel at all times during the construction period.

## 21. City Forestry

Reviewer: Zach Jorgensen/651-632-2437

[zach.jorgensen@ci.stpaul.mn.us](mailto:zach.jorgensen@ci.stpaul.mn.us)

### Comments:

- a) Street tree removals:
  - Review utility placement and impacts to street trees on Marshall. If excavation for underground utility lines will be within 8ft of the trunk of a tree then removal and replacement will be required. Demo and landscape plans are to be updated accordingly. Contact me with questions.
- b) Update the landscape plan:
  - Identify the tree types to be planted. Street trees are to be swamp white oak or hackberry.
  - Include a plant schedule.
  - Trees planted on the boulevard are to be 2" caliper and have a minimum one year warranty.
- c) Ensure tree protection fencing is maintained throughout the construction process.
- d) Existing street trees are to be protected at all times. Trees damaged or removed during construction shall be restored or replaced to the satisfaction of, and at no cost to, the City as determined by the Forestry manager.
- e) Boulevard restoration is to include the following:
  - Where driveways, sidewalks or other surface paving are removed all concrete, asphalt and base materials shall be removed.
  - Boulevard soils are to be protected during construction. Soil compaction due to construction activities shall be mitigated and soils loosened prior to final grading.
  - Boulevards shall be restored with a minimum of 4" of topsoil.
- f) Concrete washouts shall not be located within the drip line of a tree.
- g) Update the Site Plan with the following notes (notes are to be included on the demo and landscape plan sheets):
  - The removal, pruning, and/or planting of trees on the public boulevard requires an approved permit from the City Forester (651-632-2437). Any work must be completed by a licensed tree contractor.
  - Construction supplies, materials, spoils, equipment, and vehicles shall not be stored or operated within the drip line of any public street tree or on turf boulevards without prior written approval from the City Forester. If the boulevard must be used for construction activities, site access routes, material storage or other related activities, protective measures approved by the City Forester shall be taken to reduce soil compaction and protect tree(s) from damage.
  - Street trees shall be protected by establishing a tree protection zone using 4' tall fencing installed at the drip line of the tree. Tree protection fencing shall be installed prior to the start of any site work and maintained for the duration of the project. Proposed work within, or changes to the location of tree protection fencing shall be reviewed by the City Forester prior to alteration.
  - The location of tree protection fences shall be shown on the plan.
  - A tree protection fence detail shall be included in the plan set (see attached).

- Contractor shall contact the City Forester (651-632-2437), prior to demolition or other land disturbance associated with site construction, to verify tree protection measures.
- Tree planting details shall include the following:
  - Expose root flare and set at grade.
  - Remove burlap and ropes from top 1/3rd of root ball, cut wire basket down to second horizontal wire from the bottom, and dispose of off-site.
  - Contractor is responsible to maintain trees in a plumb position throughout the maintenance period.

## 22. Parks and Recreation

Reviewer: Paul Sawyer/651-266-6417

[paul.sawyer@ci.stpaul.mn.us](mailto:paul.sawyer@ci.stpaul.mn.us)

### Comments:

No concerns

## 23. Plumbing

Reviewer: Rick Jacobs/651-266-9051 [rick.jacobs@ci.stpaul.mn.us](mailto:rick.jacobs@ci.stpaul.mn.us)

### Comments:

- Contact Saint Paul Regional Water Services (SPRWS) for questions, permits, fees, inspections, specifications, plans, or information that may be required for the water service and/or the water meter.
- No utilities must run under any accessory structures.
- The accessory buildings used to store or house vehicles must not have drains and the floors must be pitched toward the outside via the opening for overhead garage door.
- Sanitary and/or storm sewer service passing within 10 feet of the building are governed by the MN Plumbing Code. Specification for pipe material selection and notes for required air test of the piping, compliant with MN State Plumbing Code 4714 Section 1109.0, must be shown on the plan. This system must be reviewed and approved by Rick Jacobs, Senior Plumbing Inspector (651-266-9051) at the time of the Plumbing Plan review to ensure that it meets Plumbing Code standards.
- Contact the City of Saint Paul Department of Public Works Sewer Division for questions, permits, fees, inspections, specifications, plans, or information that may be required for sewer and storm piping work performed outside the building, including "retention systems".
- All primary roof drains shall be piped internally to below grade, exit the building, and be connected to the storm sewer. MPC 4714.1101.1.
- Secondary Roof Drainage shall drain to an approved place of disposal in the form of Secondary Roof Drains installed per MPC 4714.1101 & 1102, and Minnesota State Building Code 1503.4 1-5. Secondary roof drainage must discharge onto permeable soils and cannot drain onto the sidewalk. MPC 4714.1101.1. An approved place of disposal that can be approved by the Authority Having Jurisdiction for secondary roof drainage is in the form of secondary roof drains piped internally, down to within 18 inches of grade, through the outside wall, onto a splash block installed per MPC 1101.5.3, and laid over permeable soils of an adequate amount where saturation of the soil will not occur.
- The "green roof" design will require approval of an Alternate Code Compliance under MPC 4714 301.2 as it is not a design approved by the plumbing code. Provide a proposed design and completed DSI Alternate Code Compliance form to the DSI Plumbing Section for approval prior to site plan approval. All discharge to the "green roof" area must be included in the total drainage calculations of the green roof.

## 24. Building Code Requirements

Reviewer: James Williamette/651-266-9077 [james.williamette@ci.stpaul.mn.us](mailto:james.williamette@ci.stpaul.mn.us)

### Comments:

- This proposal will require a demolition permit to remove the existing structures and a building (grading) permit to proceed with any grading activity.
- This proposal will require a building permit to proceed. The building permit is issued only after all necessary city staff have approved and signed off on the proposed design. In addition to the building permit, separate permits are required for any plumbing, electrical and mechanical work,

elevator installation and any fire sprinkler modifications. These permits must be obtained and the work performed by city licensed contractors in each of the respective trades.

- c) One PDF and two sets of complete construction documents stamped by public works must be submitted with the building permit application to the DSI Main Office/ Permit Desk.
- The construction documents shall include architectural, structural, mechanical, electrical and plumbing plans signed and stamped by design professionals registered in the State of Minnesota. The architect shall provide a complete code analysis and a color-coded exit plan showing all fire rated walls and shafts and include exit access and travel distances. The plans shall have the energy code noted on the plans along with the compliance path chosen. The submittal should include compliance documents detailing how the energy code requirements are met.
  - Plans must be dimensioned, drawn to scale and sufficiently detailed to denote the scope of work to be performed and the method of construction.
  - Mechanical ventilation plans will need to be prepared by a mechanical engineer, registered with the State of Minnesota. In some cases, a "Master in the Trade" may prepare plans. The ventilation contractor should contact our senior warm air inspector Gary Reinsberg (651-266-9064) or by e-mail at [Gary.reinsberg@ci.stpaul.mn.us](mailto:Gary.reinsberg@ci.stpaul.mn.us) The Energy code and path must be noted on these plans also.
  - The plumbing and electrical contractors for this project should contact our office if they have questions about whether engineered plans need to be submitted with their permit request. The senior plumbing inspector is Rick Jacobs at 651-266-9051 [Rick.jacobs@ci.stpaul.mn.us](mailto:Rick.jacobs@ci.stpaul.mn.us) and the senior electrical inspector is Dan Moynihan at 651-266-9036 [Dan.monihan@ci.stpaul.mn.us](mailto:Dan.monihan@ci.stpaul.mn.us)

Note: **The building permit will not be issued until all signoffs are received** from Zoning, HPC, HVAC, Public Works, or other departments that are assigned to the project.

## 25. Service Availability Charge (SAC)

The proposed project will need a SAC determination before a building permit can be issued. You must submit a copy of the plans to the Metropolitan Council Environmental Services (MCES) for a SAC determination. Please see their website at <https://metro council.org> for additional information. If MCES determines that a SAC fee is due, the City will collect that payment with the building permit fee.

SAC Questions and Determination Review Submittal Information email:

[SACprogram@metc.state.mn.us](mailto:SACprogram@metc.state.mn.us) or call 651-602-1770 to speak to a SAC representative.

Report Prepared By:



Tia Anderson  
Senior City Planner  
Dept. of Safety and Inspection  
375 Jackson St - Suite 220  
Saint Paul MN. 55101-1806  
651-266-9086  
[tia.anderson@ci.stpaul.mn.us](mailto:tia.anderson@ci.stpaul.mn.us)

Cc: File, Site Plan Review Staff, Ramsey County, Metro Transit, City Council Ward 4 Office, District 13 Community Council

## **Marshall and Moore Apartments – 1973-1977 Marshall Avenue**

### **Planning Comments: November 9, 2017**

The applicant's property is zoned RM2. An apartment building is a permitted use in the RM2 zoning district. This stretch of Marshall Avenue is identified as a Residential Corridor in the Land Use Plan, a chapter of the Saint Paul Comprehensive Plan. Residential corridors are described in the plan as segments of street corridors that run through Established Neighborhoods and are predominantly characterized by medium density uses (4 to 30 units per acre). The land use plan adds that some portions of Residential Corridors could support additional housing.

The lot area of the property is 15,169 square feet (14,171 square feet plus half of the alley, 998 square feet) or .35 acres. Using the ratio of 30 units per acre, .35 acres would yield 10.5 units. The applicant plans to obtain a density bonus by providing 25 structured parking spaces (25 spaces x 300 square feet), thereby increasing the lot area for density consideration purposes by 7,500 square feet for a total lot area of 22,669 square feet or .52 acres. Using the ratio of 30 units per acre, .52 acres would yield 15.6 units. Sixteen units are proposed.

Generally speaking the comprehensive plan calls for increased density in residential corridors consistent with the prevailing character and overall density of the area. The Union Park Community Plan, an addendum to the comprehensive plan, calls for finding a balance that preserves desirable assets and neighborhood character while evolving to meet present and future needs. Please refer to the attached document for specific references to land use and housing chapters of the comprehensive plan and Union Park Community Plan.

### ***Land use chapter of the comprehensive plan***

Land Use Policy 1.1 states, this policy is intended for the development of housing in residential corridors consistent with the prevailing character and overall density of the area. The density goal is 4-30 dwelling units per acre in residential corridors.

The proposed site is located along an existing transit line and is less than a mile to a fixed transit way (Green Line along University Avenue) and an arterial bus rapid transit (BRT) line (A Line on Snelling Avenue).

Land Use Policy 1.5 comment states, the City should maintain the character of Established Neighborhoods.

The area is a mix of residential and institutional uses including single family homes and apartment buildings of up to three stories as well as churches and schools. A variety of commercial uses are located one block to the west.



Land Use Policy 1.8 states encourage the development of townhouse and smaller multi-family developments, compatible with the character of Established Neighborhoods. The policy comment states, these developments should occur at the intersections of two streets, either arterials or collectors, located on a transit route.

Land Use Policy 1.9 states encourage the development of medium density multi-family housing along Residential Corridors.

### ***Housing chapter of the comprehensive plan***

The stretch of Marshall Avenue in which the proposed housing development is located is identified in the housing plan as an opportunity area for potential new housing, Figure H-K.

In light of the need to add more housing units to accommodate an increasing population the housing chapter acknowledges that new market rate housing development and the protection and enhancement of existing neighborhoods are absolutely necessary to maintain and enhance the tax base so vital to the City's ability to fund essential services and infrastructure, page 1.

...greater housing density will be the hallmark of the next 20-30 years. In recognition of the importance of the stability of existing neighborhoods to Saint Paul's future, this density should primarily be geographically focused on transit and commercial corridors such as the Central Corridor, high amenity areas such as Downtown and the Mississippi River Corridor, and a few large scale redevelopment sites such as the Ford assembly plant site, page2.

Saint Paul must build upon its strengths in the metropolitan housing market by encouraging housing that appeals to expanding demographics, uses land efficiently, takes advantage of our amenities, supports transportation choice, and fosters tax base growth, page 7.

Housing Policy 1.1 states increase housing choices across the city to support economically diverse neighborhoods.

Housing Policy 1.3 states revitalize the city by developing land-efficient housing.

### ***Union Park Community Plan***

The goal of Union Park Community Plan is to find the balance that preserves desirable assets and neighborhood character while evolving to meet present and future needs. Specific land use policies of the plan include:

LU2. Preserve the well-kept, traditional feel and scale of the neighborhood.

LU2.2 Encourage the continued use and rehabilitation of existing structures, districts, and landscapes to preserve the historic character of residential and commercial districts.

LU2.3 Ensure that new development fits within the character and scale of adjacent neighborhoods.

The housing section of the plan states that it seeks to maintain the District's unique character by promoting intelligent development, encouraging upkeep, preserving character, and adopting a collaborative approach to addressing student housing needs. Specific housing policies of the plan include:

H1. Preserve Union Park's pedestrian-scale neighborhoods, while promoting a range of housing types and affordability to meet the needs of people at different life stages with different housing needs.

H2. Preserve and improve the character and maintenance of Union Park's neighborhoods for the next 10 years and beyond.

H2.2 Encourage rehabilitation of existing housing stock.

H2.2a New residential construction shall be consistent with the character of the surrounding homes, while minimizing impact on the neighborhood.

H3. Recognize and accommodate student-housing needs while respecting the rights and concerns of all community stakeholders (students, families, colleges, landlords, businesses, etc.).

H3.5 Prioritize the development of multi-unit student housing in mixed-use corridors over the expansion of single-family rental units in traditional neighborhoods.

HP1. Integrate historic significance into Union Park's housing, environmental, land use, and economic development decision-making processes, supporting preservation over demolition.



CITY OF SAINT PAUL  
*Christopher B. Coleman, Mayor*

375 Jackson Street, Suite 220  
Saint Paul, Minnesota 55101-1806

Telephone: 651-266-8989  
Facsimile: 651-266-9124  
Web: [www.stpaul.gov/dsi](http://www.stpaul.gov/dsi)

December 14, 2017

Jon Schwartzman  
MCR Property Holdings, LLC  
10921 Excelsior Blvd., #106  
Hopkins, MN 55343

RE: Application for Site Plan Review – SPR #17-206385 – Marshall & Moore Apartments at 1973 – 1977 Marshall Avenue – Notice to extend the time limit for decision under Minnesota Statute 15.99

Dear Mr. Schwartzman,

This letter is to inform you that the City is extending the site plan review period to February 15, 2018.

MN Statute 15.99 (1995) requires the City of Saint Paul to approve or deny zoning applications within 60 days of submission, but allows the City to “extend the time line ... by providing written notice of the extension to the applicant. The notification must state the reasons for the extension and its anticipated length, which may not exceed 60 days unless approved by the applicant.”

On October 18, 2017, you applied for site plan review to develop a new multi-family residential building. Site Plan Review is a function delegated by the St Paul Planning Commission to City staff. However, a Site Plan may be referred to Planning Commission for public hearing if any staff decision on the site plan is likely to be appealed to the Planning Commission. The recommended public hearing date with the Planning Commission for the Site Plan is January 4, 2018.

The City’s present deadline to act on the site plan review application is December 17, 2017. Because this deadline is prior to the January 4, 2018 hearing date, the City elects to extend the deadline for the additional 60 days allowed under Minnesota Statute 15.99. The additional 60-day period takes effect immediately upon the expiration of the initial 60-day period. Therefore, the deadline to make a final decision on your application is February 15, 2018.

If you have any questions regarding this matter, please contact me at 651-266-9086 or [tia.anderson@ci.stpaul.mn.us](mailto:tia.anderson@ci.stpaul.mn.us).

Regards,

Tia Anderson  
Senior City Planner

cc: File, Zoning Administrator, Planning Manager, Ward 4 Council Office, Union Park District Council

12-14-2017



Tia Anderson  
Senior City Planner  
City of Saint Paul- Department of Safety and Inspections – Zoning Division  
375 Jackson Street, Suite 220  
Saint Paul, MN, 55101-1806

**Re: Site Plan Review Report Response Letter, Marshall & Moore Apartments – MCR Property Holdings, LLC  
PAI Project No. 51666-17088**

Dear Ms. Anderson:

Please see the responses below in italic, for the Site Plan Review Report prepared by the City of Saint Paul dated November 9, 2017.

## 2. Zoning

Reviewer: Tia Anderson/651-266-9086

[tia.anderson@ci.stpaul.mn.us](mailto:tia.anderson@ci.stpaul.mn.us)

Reviewer: Larry Zangs/651-266-9082

[larry.zangs@ci.stpaul.mn.us](mailto:larry.zangs@ci.stpaul.mn.us)

### Comments:

- a) A development moratorium was approved by the City Council on October 18, 2017, on Marshall Avenue between Wheeler and Wilder Streets within the West Marshall Study Area. This project is within the moratorium area, however, a complete Site Plan application was submitted prior to the City Council public hearing on October 18, 2017.

***Response: All statements are correct.***

- b) The proposed use of the property as Multi-family Housing is permitted at this location in a RM2 medium-density multiple-family residential Zoning District.

***Response: This statement is correct.***

- c) *Please provide a description of the proposed office operations.* A leasing/maintenance office space serving the multi-family dwelling in which it is located would be considered an accessory use, which is permitted in an RM2 zoning district. However, an office serving multiple residential properties is a general commercial office use, and not permitted in any residential Zoning Districts.

***Response: The Owner has stated that the leasing/ maintenance office space will serve the proposed multi-family building in which it is located, to conform to the definition of accessory use.***

- d) Tenants of multi-family residential units cannot exceed the definition of a family per Leg. Code Sec. 60.207. Family, which does not allow more than four un-related adults.

***Response: The Owner has been informed of this Code Section.***

- e) RM2 setback requirements are as follows:

- Minimum front setback is 29' 6" based on the average setback for the block.
- Minimum side setback requirement is 9'.
- Minimum rear setback requirement is 25'.

***Response: These setbacks are correct and are being met with this proposed project.***

POPE ARCHITECTS, INC.

f) RM2 Density standards are as follows:

- Minimum lot area of 9,000 square feet is required for a multiple-family dwelling with 3 or more dwelling units.
  - One-half the width of a dedicated public alley adjoining the lot shall be considered as part of the lot, for the purpose of applying lot area and density requirements.

Minimum lot area per residential unit is 1,500 square feet. However, the lot area figure may be increased by three hundred (300) square feet for each parking space (up to two parking spaces per unit) within a multiple-family structure or otherwise completely underground.

***Response: Please refer to the Site Plan for Unit, Parking, and Lot Area Data.***

- The proposed accessory residential garages shall not be included in the lot area bonus calculation nor tandem spaces or other stacked parking.

***Response: The accessory residential garages have been eliminated from this proposed project. No tandem spaces or stacked parking spaces are proposed for this project.***

g) RM2 Dimensional standards are as follows:

*Update the Site Plan with the existing average grade based on the surveyed elevations.* Grade is the elevation established for the purpose of regulating the number of stories and the height of buildings. "Grade" shall be the mean level of the finished surface of the ground adjacent to the exterior walls of the buildings.

***Response: The Architectural Site Plan has been updated with the existing average grade elevation.***

- Maximum building height is 5 stories and 50', as measured from the established grade to the highest point of the roof surface for flat roofs.
  - Where a building is located on sloping terrain (e.g., Moore St elevation), the height may be measured from the average ground level of the grade at the building wall.
  - The existing grade of the property shall not be raised around a new building or foundation in order to comply with the height requirements of this code.
  - The height limitations of this code shall not apply to mechanical service stacks, tanks, ventilation equipment, and similar equipment.

*Update the Site Plan to clearly depict the building height and proposed elevations in relation to the proposed structure in order to clarify average grade and height from all elevations.*

***Response: The Architectural Site Plan and Elevations have been updated with the proposed building height and proposed grade elevations.***

h) *Update the Site Plan with the lot coverage percentage.* In residential districts, principal buildings shall not cover more than thirty-five (35) percent of any zoning lot. The lot area may include one-half the width of the dedicated public alley adjoining the lot.

***Response: Please refer to the Site Plan for Lot Area Data.***

The green roof area exposed on the Moore Street side of the structure, shall be included in the lot coverage calculation.

***Response: The green roof area exposed on the Moore Street side of the structure has been eliminated from this proposed project.***



Balconies shall be subject to setback and lot coverage requirements. However, per Leg. Code Sec. 63.105., an uncovered porch, deck or patio not exceeding two (2) feet in height is considered landscaping and is not subject to setback or lot coverage requirements.

***Response: Balconies are not proposed in the required setbacks and have been included in the Lot Area Data.***

- i) Attached vestibules or enclosed entrances may project up to twenty (20) square feet into a required front or rear yard and shall be included as part of the principal structure for lot coverage purposes.

***Response: Acknowledged.***

### 3. Off-street Parking

- a) *Update the parking level plan with typical stall dimensions, maneuvering lane width, and number of parking spaces.* Workable parking spaces in the structured parking may be used for calculating the lot area density bonus.

***Response: The parking level plans have been updated with the typical stall dimensions, maneuvering lane widths, and number of parking stalls.***

- b) *Update the Site Plan analysis with number of residential units and bedrooms, and vehicle and bicycle parking required and provided.* The off-street parking requirement is based on number of residential units and number of bedrooms. 1.5 off-street parking space is required for 2 – 3 bedroom units, and 2 spaces for 4 bedroom units.

- For dwelling units, a minimum of one secure bicycle parking space shall be provided for every 14 dwelling units.

Bicycle parking provided in excess of the minimum required bicycle parking may be substituted for up to 10 percent of minimum off-street vehicle parking requirements. For the purpose of calculating a substitution, 4 spaces in secure bicycle racks are the equivalent of one vehicle parking space.

***Response: The Unit, Parking (including bicycle parking), and Lot Area Data have been updated on the Site Plan.***

- c) *Confirm location of secure bicycle parking.* Bicycle parking shall be provided in a convenient, safe, and secure location. The site plan included 16 bike racks in the rear of the property. However, at the November 7, 2017, Site Plan Review Committee meeting the project indicated they were considering bicycle parking in the underground parking area. Outdoor bicycle parking shall be visible from the public right-of-way or from inside the building.

Where motor vehicle parking spaces are monitored, covered or weather protected, required bicycle parking spaces shall be provided on the same basis.

***Response: The secure bicycle parking is located in the two levels of enclosed parking.***

- d) One ADA parking space is required for every 25 standard parking spaces. Parking spaces and passenger loading zones for persons with disabilities shall be designed in accordance with the provisions of the Accessibility Guidelines for Buildings and Facilities of the Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA).

***Response: Two ADA and code compliant van accessible spaces with a shared accessible aisle are located in the upper level of enclosed parking.***

- e) Accessory parking facilities may designate up to 50 percent of the spaces for compact cars. Compact spaces shall be designated by signs with a minimum of one sign per every four compact spaces. The submitted site plan currently includes 15 compact parking spaces.

***Response: Signage complying with this requirement will be installed in the two levels of enclosed parking.***

- f) *Update the Site Plan to adhere to Zoning Code requirements for accessory structures specifically as it pertains to the two proposed garages. Accessory buildings, structures or uses shall not be erected in or established in a required yard except a rear yard.*
- On corner lots, accessory structures shall be set back from the street a distance equal to that required of the principal structure.
  - When an accessory building, structure or use is constructed in a rear yard which adjoins a side yard or front yard, the accessory building, structure or use shall be set back from the interior lot line a distance equal to the minimum side yard required of the principal structure.
  - RM2 residential districts, accessory buildings on a zoning lot with residential use shall not exceed fifteen (15) feet in height, measured to the mid-point of the gable; provided, however, that accessory buildings with a flat or shed roof style shall not exceed twelve (12) feet in height.
  - Accessory buildings on a zoning lot may occupy up to thirty-five (35) percent of the rear yard. Rear yards which adjoin alleys may include half the area of the alley to calculate the area of the rear yard which may be occupied by accessory buildings.
  - An accessory building shall not be closer than one foot to an alley right-of-way. Accessory buildings shall be located at least six (6) feet from the principal structure or shall be considered attached for purposes of the zoning code.

***Response: The two detached accessory parking structures have been eliminated from this proposed project.***

- g) *Update the Site Plan with dimensions and setbacks for the proposed off-street surface parking.* Off-street parking spaces shall not be within a required front or side yard and shall be a minimum of 4 feet from any lot line.

***Response: The Site Plan has been updated with dimensions and setbacks for the proposed off-street surface parking.***

- h) At the November 7, 2017, Site Plan Review Committee meeting the project indicated that trash and recycling will be wheeled to the curb for pick-up.

***Response: Refuse and recycling will be wheeled from the lower level of enclosed parking to the curb for pick-up.***

#### 4. Building Design Standards

- a) *Update the site plan with the dimensions of the decorative overhangs.* Overhangs and decorative details may project into a required yard sixteen (16) inches plus two (2) inches for each foot of width of the required side yard.

***Response: The Site Plan has been updated with the dimensions of the decorative overhangs.***

- b) *Update the site plan with location of the service door to the structured parking in order to meet egress requirements within the parking level.*

***Response: The Site Plan has been updated with the service door to provide required egress from the lower level of enclosed parking.***

- c) The project shall comply with building design standards per Leg. Code Sec. 63.110:

- A primary entrance of principal structures shall be located within the front third of the structure; be delineated with elements such as roof overhangs, recessed entries, landscaping, or similar design features; and have a direct pedestrian connection to the street.

***Response: The primary entrance is located on the Marshall Avenue elevation. The front entry is recessed with an overhang. There is direct pedestrian connection via an exterior concrete stair from the Marshall sidewalk and a walking surface from the easterly driving surface.***

- Building materials and architectural treatments used on sides of buildings facing an abutting public street should be similar to those used on principal facades.

***Response: Exterior finish materials are proposed as masonry, metal panel, and painted fiber cement panel siding.***

- *Provide the percentage of window and door openings on new facades on the SitePlan.*

- For principal buildings, above grade window and door openings shall comprise at least fifteen (15) percent of the total area of exterior walls facing a public street or sidewalk.
- In addition, for new principal residential buildings, above grade window and door openings shall comprise at least ten (10) percent of the total area of all exterior walls.
- Windows shall be clear or translucent.

***Response: The Exterior Elevations have; South Elevation=17.21% window and door openings, West Elevation=21.02% window and door openings, North Elevation=19.72% window and door openings, East Elevation=20.68% window and door openings. The six overhead doors are not included as window and door openings.***

- The visual impact of rooftop equipment shall be reduced through such means as location, screening, or integration into the roof design. Screening shall be of durable, permanent materials that are compatible with the primary building materials. Exterior mechanical equipment such as ductwork shall not be located on primary building facades.

***Response: Acknowledged.***

## 5. Lighting

- a) Exterior lighting shall meet Zoning Code Sec. 63.116. - Exterior lighting.

- All outdoor lighting shall be shielded to reduce glare and shall be so arranged as to reflect lights away from all adjacent residential districts or adjacent residences in such a way as not to exceed three (3) footcandles measured at the residence district boundary.
- All lighting in all districts used for the external illumination of buildings shall be placed and shielded so as not to interfere with the vision of persons on adjacent highways or adjacent property.

***Response: Please refer to Sheets E0.2 and E0.2A that demonstrate compliance with these requirements.***

## 6. Landscaping for the Site and Exterior Parking Lot

- a) All required yards and any underdeveloped space shall be landscaped using materials such as trees, shrubs, sod, groundcover plants, or stormwater landscaping.

**Response: Appropriate landscaping materials are proposed for this project.**

- b) For off-street parking facilities that abut a residential use or zoning district across an alley, one (1) of the following shall be provided and maintained as determined by the zoning administrator as part of site plan review:

- A visual screen 4.5 – 6.5' in height; or
- An ornamental metal fence or other non-screening, durable fence where security concerns make this preferable to a visual screen.

**Response: A compliant visual screen consisting of coniferous shrubs or fencing is proposed for this project.**

- c) For any parking facility, landscaping shall be provided to buffer the facility from adjacent properties and from the public right-of-way; reduce the visual glare and heat effects of large expanses of pavement; and provide areas for the retention and absorption of stormwater runoff. The standards can be found in Sec. 63.313 and 63.314 of the Zoning Code.

- *Perimeter Landscape* - A landscaped yard at least four (4) feet wide along the public street or sidewalk.
- *Screening Landscape* shall be provided consisting of a masonry wall or decorative fence (not including chain link) between 3' and 4.5' tall along public street or sidewalk supplemented with a landscape buffer.
- *Tree plantings* – At least 1 shade tree shall be planted for every 5 surface parking spaces.

**Response: Appropriate perimeter landscaping, screening landscaping, and one shade tree will be provided if the two surface parking stalls are constructed.**

## 7. Parkland Dedication

As a part of this project, the City requires payment of a Parkland Dedication fee (*in lieu of the property owner needing to dedicate a portion of the property as park land*). The fee collected is used by the City for acquiring park land or other park capital improvements in the area.

Staff estimates a dedication fee of \$1689. The fee is calculated based on the number of residential units proposed, number of existing units, and value of the property. Payment is included with building and inspection fees when the building permit is issued.

**Response: The Owner has been informed of this fee.**

## 8. Signs

Reviewer: Ashley Skarda/651-266-9013

[ashley.skarda@ci.stpaul.mn.us](mailto:ashley.skarda@ci.stpaul.mn.us)

### Comments:

Business signs require a separate review and Sign Permit from the Department of Safety and Inspections. Site plan approval does not constitute approval of signs shown on the site plan. Contact Ashley Skarda of DSI Zoning regarding signs.

**Response: The Owner has been informed of this separate review and permitting for signage.**

## 9. Planning

Reviewer: Kady Dadlez/651-266-6619

[kady.dadlez@ci.stpaul.mn.us](mailto:kady.dadlez@ci.stpaul.mn.us)

### Comments:

- a) The applicant's property is zoned RM2. An apartment building is a permitted use in the

RM2 zoning district.

***Response: These statements are correct.***

- b) This stretch of Marshall Avenue is identified as a Residential Corridor in the Land Use Plan, a chapter of the Saint Paul Comprehensive Plan. Residential corridors are described in the plan as segments of street corridors that run through Established Neighborhoods and are predominantly characterized by medium density uses (4 to 30 units per acre). The land use plan adds that some portions of Residential Corridors could support additional housing.

***Response: These statements are correct.***

- c) The lot area of the property is 15,169 square feet (14,171 square feet plus half of the alley, 998 square feet) or .35 acres. Using the ratio of 30 units per acre, .35 acres would yield 10.5 units. The applicant plans to obtain a density bonus by providing 25 structured parking spaces (25 spaces x 300 square feet), thereby increasing the lot area for density consideration purposes by 7,500 square feet for a total lot area of 22,669 square feet or .52 acres. Using the ratio of 30 units per acre, .52 acres would yield 15.6 units. Sixteen units are proposed. ***Response: Please see the corrections in red, bold, and underlined.***

“The lot area of the property is 15,169 square feet (14,171 square feet plus half of the alley, 998 square feet) or .35 acres. Using the ratio of 30 units per acre, .35 acres would yield 10.5 units. The applicant plans to obtain a density bonus by providing **30** structured parking spaces (**30** spaces x 300 square feet), thereby increasing the lot area for density consideration purposes by **9,000** square feet for a total lot area of **24,169** square feet or **.55** acres. Using the ratio of 30 units per acre, **.55** acres would yield **16.5** units. Sixteen units are proposed.”

- d) Generally speaking the comprehensive plan calls for increased density in residential corridors consistent with the prevailing character and overall density of the area. The Union Park Community Plan, an addendum to the comprehensive plan, calls for finding a balance that preserves desirable assets and neighborhood character while evolving to meet present and future needs. Please refer to the attached document for specific references to land use and housing policies of the comprehensive plan and Union Park Community Plan.



**10. District Council**

The site is located in the District 13 Community Council. A copy of the site plan was provided to the District Council for comments. A letter from the District Council dated November 6, 2017, is attached for the project's consideration.

**Response: Acknowledged.**

**11. Public Works Records and Mapping**

Contact Number: 651-266-6150

Comments:

- a) Provide proof of filing of combination of contiguous lots with Ramsey County.

**Response: Proof of filing of combination of contiguous lots will be provided.**

- b) Contact Public Works Records and Mapping at 651.266.6150 to determine the address for the building and apartment addresses for the individual units within the building. The building address can be odd numbers within the range of 1973 Marshall to 1979 Marshall.

**Response: Public Works Records and Mapping will be contacted to determine the address of the building and apartment addresses for the individual units within the building.**

**12. Public Works Construction**

Reviewer: Scott Brimer/651-266-6225 [scott.brimer@ci.stpaul.mn.us](mailto:scott.brimer@ci.stpaul.mn.us)

Comments:

Curb at alley entrance must not be placed into alley right of way, but terminate at the property line. Match existing bituminous at alley.

**Response: The Site Plan has been updated with this requirement.**

**13. Public Works Transportation Planning**

Reviewer: David Kuebler/651-266-6217

[david.kuebler@ci.stpaul.mn.us](mailto:david.kuebler@ci.stpaul.mn.us)

Reviewer: Colleen Paavola/651/266-6104

[colleen.paavola@ci.stpaul.mn.us](mailto:colleen.paavola@ci.stpaul.mn.us)

Comments:

- a) Please be advised that a Temporary Pedestrian Access Route (TPAR) and/or a Temporary Traffic Control (TTC) plan may be required as part of the Right-of-Way (ROW) permitting process. Said TTC or TPAR plans must be approved by the City prior to the ROW Permitting office issuing a permit(s).

**Response: A TPAR and TTC plan will be provided by the Contractor with the ROW permit application.**

- b) Per Minnesota State Statute 326, the final plans submitted must be signed by the appropriate licensed Professional, i.e. PE, LA, PLS, etc., responsible for plan development.

**Response: Plans sign by Eric Meyer, P.E. or Larson Engineering**

- c) On Plan Sheet S1 please include existing boulevard infrastructure, i.e. signs, lighting, etc. Also show the existing lane striping on Marshall.

**Response: An updated survey is enclosed.**

- d) On Plan Sheet C1 please include notes regarding the protection of, or impacts to, the existing boulevard infrastructure such as street lighting, signs, etc.

**Response: See "Demolition Note" #10 on sheet C1**

- e) Please provide turning templates relative to accessing and exiting the proposed three stall garage, the two on-grade stalls and the two stalls in the garage as shown on Plan Sheet C2.

**Response: Car path maneuvers are provided for review.**

**POPE ARCHITECTS, INC.**

- f) Please provide detailed dimensions to Plan Sheet C2. The width dimension of the driveway at the ROW line is to be 22 feet unless turning movements indicate something wider is needed.

**Response: Dimensions are added to C2.**

- g) On Plan Sheet C3.0 please provide a detail of the sidewalk/ramp relationship between ADA compliant ramp that starts at Marshall and parallels the Moore mainline sidewalk.

**Response: A ramp to the lower level is not required and had been removed.**

**Lower level access is provided by a sidewalk adjacent to the drive.**

- h) On Plan Sheet C3.0 please provide catch basin erosion control devices for the catch basin at the NE quadrant of the Moore/Marshall intersection.

**Response: Inlet protection added to the catch basin at the intersection of Moore and Marshall.**

- i) On Plan Sheet C5 please update the detail for the driveway apron to a 1206D as can be provided by the City's Sidewalk office. Contact Al Czaia for said detail.

**Response: Detail added to sheet Sheet C5.**

- j) For the plan sheets completed by Pope Architects, please include the ROW line in the elevation views and verify that what is shown in the elevation views represents what is shown in the Civil plan sheets. For example, the west elevation as provided is different than what is shown on plan sheet C3.0 in that the ADA ramp is not shown and the location of the walk-in door is on the wrong side of the overhead door.

**Response: See Pope Architects Sheets.**

- k) For the plan sheets completed by Pope Architects, the Garage Plan needs more detail such as grades, drainage information, turning movements showing how vehicles are able to negotiate the area, etc.

**Response: See Pope Architects Sheets.**

- l) Update the Site Plan with the following notes:

- Change the INSPECTION CONTACT to "Dick Rohland at 651.485.1688".

**Response: Contact updated on Sheet C1.**

- As part of the ROW permitting process, two weeks before any work begins that impacts the ROW in any way the developer shall provide to the ROW Inspector the name and contact information of the Construction Project Manager or Construction Project Superintendent. If this information is not provided there may be a delay in obtaining permits for the work in the ROW.

Said delays will be the sole responsibility of the developer

- Replace the "ENCROACHMENT" note with the following:

"ENCROACHMENTS: Per Chapter 134 of the Legislative Code, no person shall construct and maintain any projection or encroachment within the public right-of-way.

Construction of the development that necessitates temporary use of the Right-of-Way (ROW) for construction purposes shall be limited to equipment, personnel, devices and appurtenances that are removable following construction.

Encroachment permits will not be granted for devices such as tie backs, rock bolts, H-piles, lagging, timbers, sheet piling, etc. that the owner is seeking to abandon in the ROW.

Section 3201.3 of the Minnesota Building Code defers final authority of encroachments into public rights-of-way/public property to the local authority. City

Legislative Code governs management of the public rights-of-way. Provided such installations are approved by Public Works, footings may be allowed to encroach into City ROW no more than twelve (12) inches at depths below eight (8) feet as provided for in Minnesota Building Code Section 3202.1.

Said encroachments would require an encroachment permit from the City per Chapter 134 of the Legislative Code.

Encroachments into County or State ROW are not allowed unless authorization has been granted from said agency. Marshall Avenue is a County facility.

**Response: Notes updated on Sheet C1.**

- Change the contact name in the “NO PRIVATE FACILITIES IN THE RIGHT OF WAY” note to Don Bjorkman.

**Response: Notes updated on Sheet C1.**

- Access to signal controller and lighting cabinets must be maintained at all times. If fencing is required for a job site, a key or other means of access must be provided to the City of St. Paul's Traffic Operations Department. Contact John McNamara, General Foreman Signals and Lighting at 651.266.9780 for more information.

**Response: Notes updated on Sheet C1.**

- The paragraph that begins “As per the City’s “Standard Specification for Street Openings” needs to be titled “ROADWAY RESTORATION”.

**Response: Notes updated on Sheet C1.**

- Please include the following notes on the plans:
  - SIGNING: Signs regulating parking and/or traffic on private property shall be installed by the property owner or contractor outside of the public right-of-way (ROW). Removal of signs within the public ROW shall be completed by the City. New signs or the reinstallation of existing signs, as approved by Public Works Traffic Engineering, regulating parking and/or traffic in the public ROW for this development shall be installed by the City at the expense of the development. Contact Chris Gulden of Public Works 651-266-9778 two weeks in advance of needed sign work.

**Response: Notes updated on Sheet C1.**

- METERS: The City shall be contacted if development work affects the parking meter system. Said system includes meters, space numbers, pay stations and all appurtenances needed for the system to be operational. Removal of meter system elements within the public ROW shall be completed by the City and charged to the developer. The installation of new meters or the reinstallation of removed meters shall also be completed by the City and charged back to the developer. The developer/contractor shall contact Chris Gulden at 651.266.9778 two weeks in advance of needed meter work. If two weeks’ notice is not provided there may be a delay in obtaining permits for the work in the ROW. Said delays will be the sole responsibility of the developer.

**Response: Notes updated on Sheet C1.**

m) CITY OF ST. PAUL PERMIT REQUIREMENTS:

- ORDERING OBSTRUCTION AND EXCAVATION PERMITS: Contact Public Works Right of Way Service Desk at (651) 266-6151. It is strongly recommended that contractors call for cost estimates prior to bidding to obtain accurate cost estimates.

**Response: Notes updated on Sheet C1.**

- OBSTRUCTION PERMITS: The contractor must obtain an Obstruction Permit if construction (including silt fences) will block City streets, sidewalks or alleys, or if driving over curbs.  
**Response: Notes updated on Sheet C1.**
- EXCAVATION PERMITS: All digging in the public right of way requires an Excavation Permit. If the proposed building is close to the right of way, and excavating into the right of way is needed to facilitate construction, contact the utility inspector.  
**Response: Notes updated on Sheet C1.**
- FAILURE TO SECURE PERMITS: Failure to secure Obstruction Permits or Excavation Permits will result in a double-permit fee and other fees required under City of St. Paul Legislative Codes.  
**Response: Notes updated on Sheet C1.**

#### 14. Public Works Sidewalks

Reviewer: Al Czaia/651-266-6108 [al.czaia@ci.stpaul.mn.us](mailto:al.czaia@ci.stpaul.mn.us)

Comments:

- a) Contractor is responsible for damage to the mainline sidewalk, curb, drive access and boulevard landscaping cause during the construction. Contractor advised to document pre-existing condition of the right of way prior to commencement of the construction.  
**Response: Notes updated on Sheet C1.**
- b) Sidewalk grades must be carried across driveways.  
**Response: Notes updated on Sheet C1.**
- c) Update the Site Plan with the following notes:
  - CONSTRUCTION IN RIGHT OF WAY: All work on curbs, driveways, and sidewalks within the public right of way must be done to City Standards and Specifications by a contractor licensed to work in the City right-of-way under a permit from Public Works Sidewalk Section (651-266- 6108). Sidewalk grades must be carried across driveways.  
**Response: Notes updated on Sheet C1.**
  - RIGHT OF WAY RESTORATION: Restoration of asphalt and concrete pavements are performed by the Public Works Street Maintenance Division. The contractor is responsible for payment to the City for the cost of these restorations. The contractor shall contact Public Works Street Maintenance to set up a work order prior to beginning any removals in the street at 651- 266-9700. Procedures and unit costs are found in Street Maintenance's "General Requirements - All Restorations" and are available at the permit office.  
**Response: Notes updated on Sheet C1.**

#### 15. Ramsey County

Reviewer: Erin Laberee/651-266-7105 [erin.laberee@co.ramsey.mn.us](mailto:erin.laberee@co.ramsey.mn.us)

Comments:

A copy of the Site Plan was provided to Ramsey County for review. Ramsey County has no comments on the plan as submitted.

#### 16. Metro Transit

Reviewer: Berry Farrington/612-349-7378 [berry.farrington@metrotransit.org](mailto:berry.farrington@metrotransit.org)

Comments:

- a) The plans show the developer is responsible for constructing a replacement boarding pad for the bus stop. At minimum it must be 5 feet wide by 8 feet deep and meet the standards identified by the Americans with Disabilities Act of 1990.

**Response: See concrete pad place at the northeast corner of the Marshall/Moore Intersection.**

- b) The retaining wall is adjacent to a bus stop and the first level of the wall may be used as seating. Metro Transit suggests the wall design include surface for seating which will help protect the landscaping from damage.

**Response: The retaining wall is adjacent to the sidewalk and will be at 19" tall to accommodate seating.**

- c) Please coordinate any needed short term lane closures with Metro Transit Street Operations, Greg Tuveson (612-349-5407 / [greg.tuveson@metrotransit.org](mailto:greg.tuveson@metrotransit.org))

**Response: Notes updated on Sheet C1.**

**17. Public Works Sewers**

Reviewer: Anca Sima/651-266-6237

[anca.sima@ci.stpaul.mn.us](mailto:anca.sima@ci.stpaul.mn.us)

Comments:

- a) Add a note on the demolition plan: removal permit for A11882 & 12719: cut off at the property line.

**Response: Notes updated on Sheet C1.**

- b) Provide the detailed drainage map and the HydroCad calculations (some roof ponding)

**Response: See attached drainage map and HydroCAD calculations.**

- c) The EOF should be at least 1 ft. lower than FFE. Show the EOF on the plan.

**Response: Underground Stormwater storage lowered to maintain at least 1 ft of separation.**

- d) If the existing manhole for the proposed sanitary service connection is a brick construction, reconstruction of the manhole access may be required, please add the attached detail (2322e) for manhole reconstruction.

**Response: The '2322F Manhole Reconstruct' was added to the plans, from the city website. If "e" is required please provide the necessary detail, as it is not on the website.**

- e) The proposed man hole should be further than 50ft away from the existing one, if not, connect the proposed connection into an existing one.

**Response: The Storm sewer line was changed to an 8" PVC in hope of a wye/saddle connection to the existing 21" RCP.**

- f) Add the city's standard plate with the connection at the main.

**Response: See connection detail added to Sheet C5**

- g) If the storm pipe is less of 5" of building foundation, than is under the plumbing jurisdiction. It should be a steel pipe and you have to provide 5 pound air test.

**Response: No storm pipe is within 5" of building**

- h) Show that all the storm water will be captured in the trench for 100 years event.

**Response: A capacity calculation for the trench drain is included in the stormwater calculations. At 1" depth the drain has a capacity of 4.6 cfs and the runoff from the entire site in a 100-year event (before the stormwater system) is 1.52 cfs.**

- i) Sanitary and/or storm sewer service passing within 10 feet of the building are governed by the MN Plumbing Code. Specification for pipe material selection and notes for required air test of the piping, compliant with the MN State Plumbing Code, must be shown on the plan.  
**Response: Notes are provided on the plan for the storm sewer testing requirements.**

j) Update the Site Plan with the following notes:

- SEWER REPAIR PERMIT: Plumbing Contractor to obtain "Repair Permits" from Public Works for proposed modification to the existing storm sewer connections. Call St Paul PW permit desk (651-266-6234) for information on obtaining this permit.  
**Response: See permitting notes added to Sheet C4.**
- SEWER REMOVAL/ABANDONMENT PERMIT: Plumbing Contractor to obtain "Removal Permits" from Public Works to cut off existing sewer connections services to the property. Call St Paul PW permit desk (651-266-6234) for information on obtaining this permit.  
**Response: See permitting notes added to Sheet C4.**
- SEWER CONNECTION PERMIT: License house drain contractor to obtain (Sewer Connection Permit) to construct new sanitary and storm connection in street from main to the property. Call St Paul PW permit desk (651-266-6234) for information on obtaining this permit.  
**Response: See permitting notes added to Sheet C4.**

#### 18. Water Quality/Erosion Control

Reviewer: Wes Saunders-Pearce/651-266-9112 [wes.saunders-pearce@ci.stpaul.mn.us](mailto:wes.saunders-pearce@ci.stpaul.mn.us)

Comments:

- a) Erosion control plan must show silt fence / perimeter controls within the private property not the public boulevard.  
**Response: Silt Fence has been moved to within the property lines.**
- b) Erosion control plan must add inlet protection to catch basins on Moore and Marshall.  
**Response: Inlet protection was added to 4 catch basins at the intersection of Moore/Marshall**
- c) Provide more details on green roof including specific landscaping proposed and design cross section. Consider provisions for signage or fencing to prevent inadvertent impact by occupants.  
**Response: The green roof has been changed to surface pavement for access to main floor parking.**
- d) There must be 1 foot of separation from the 100-yr high water level and low floor.  
**Response: Underground Stormwater storage lowered to maintain at least 1 ft of separation.**

#### 19. Water Utility

Reviewer: Jeff Murphy/651-266-6813 [jeffrey.murphy@ci.stpaul.mn.us](mailto:jeffrey.murphy@ci.stpaul.mn.us)

Comments:

- a) Show existing water services on Plan Sheet C1 or C4 to be cut off at the water main.
- 1977 Marshall Ave – 1" CP – 30 S N Marshall / 28 E E Moore
  - 1973 Marshall Ave – 1" CP – 80 E E Moore
- Response: Water services are shown on the plan.**
- b) The following work shall be performed by SPRWS on an actual cost basis. An estimate will be provided and payment in the amount of the estimate must be received before the work can be



scheduled. Work of this type is currently being scheduled 4 to 6 weeks after payment and required signatures have been received:

- Pipework within right of way for *4" ductile iron domestic service*.
- Pipework within right of way for *6" ductile iron fire service*.
- Cut off of existing unused water services at the main.
- Inspection of water facility work performed by owner's contractor.

**Response: acknowledged, no plan changes needed.**

- c) Plumbing permit applications to be made with SPRWS at 1900 Rice Street, Saint Paul, MN.

**Response: acknowledged, no plan changes needed.**

- d) Before construction of a new water service can be scheduled, SPRWS must receive a Water Service Contract signed by the owner and all required payments.

**Response: acknowledged, no plan changes needed.**

- e) Provide completed project data sheets to determine meter sizing.

**Response: acknowledged, no plan changes needed.**

- f) Furnish one set of interior fire suppression mechanical plans for review and approval by SPRWS plumbing inspection unit.

**Response: acknowledged. Final plans will be provided when complete.**

- g) Furnish one set of revised site plans for review. Following approval by SPRWS, furnish one set of approved plans.

**Response: acknowledged. Final plans will be provided when mechanical design is complete.**

- h) Provide the following on PLAN SHEET C4 under NOTES:

- Water services to be installed according to SPRWS "Standards for the Installation of Water Mains.
- A four-sided trench box is required on all excavations deeper than 5 feet where underground work or inspection is to be performed by SPRWS. Ladders are required and must extend 3 feet above the surface of the trench. Sidewalks, pavements, ducts and appurtenant structures shall not be undermined unless a support system or another method of protection is provided. Trenches in excess of 20 feet in depth must be signed off by a registered professional engineer. Excavated material must be kept a minimum of 2 feet from the edge of the trench.
- Pipe material for 8" Ductile Iron Pipe must be Class 52, Pipe material for 6" and 4" Ductile Iron Pipe must be Class 53. The exterior of ductile iron pipe shall be coated with a layer of arc-sprayed zinc per ISO 8179. The interior cement mortar lining shall be applied without asphalt seal coat.
- Pipe must be wrapped in V-Bio Polywrap encasement.
- Maintain 3 feet vertical separation between water and sewer pipes or a 12 inch separation with 4 inch high density insulation per SPRWS Standard Plate D-10 for typical water main offsets.
- Refer to SPRWS "Standards for the Installation of Water Mains" Standard Plate D-11 for restrained pipe requirement.
- All water service valve boxes within construction area must be exposed and brought to grade upon completion of construction.
- All pipe work inside of property to be performed by a plumber licensed by the State of

Minnesota and Certified by the City of Saint Paul. SPRWS requires separate outside and inside plumbing permits for each new water service.

- All unused existing water services to be cut off by SPRWS. Excavation and restoration by owner's contractor. New water services will not be turned on until required cutoffs have been performed.
- Water facility pipework within right of way to be installed by SPRWS. Excavation and restoration by owner's contractor.
- The contractor providing excavation is responsible for obtaining all excavation and obstruction permits required by any governing authority.

**Response: See updated "Utility Notes" on Sheet C4.**

## 20. Fire

Reviewer: Ann McLoughlin-651-266-9140 [ann.mcloughlin@ci.stpaul.mn.us](mailto:ann.mcloughlin@ci.stpaul.mn.us)

### Comments:

- a) Visibility of the Fire Department connection may be located on the N Moore St side of the building as close to Marshall Ave as possible in a visible, accessible location at all times without obstruction by fences, bushes, trees, walls, or other objects for a minimum of 3 feet to the front and each side. This requirement is applicable for the duration of the construction time as well.

**Response: The Architectural Site Plan has been updated with these requirements**

- b) A metal sign or collar with raised letters at least 1 inch in size must be mounted on all Fire Department connections serving fire sprinklers, standpipes, or fire pump connections. Such signs shall read AUTOMATIC SPRINKLERS or STANDPIPES or TEST CONNECTION or a combination thereof as applicable.

**Response: The Architectural Site Plan has been updated with this requirement.**

- c) Automatic Fire Sprinkler System Required. Plans and permits required by licensed contractor. Flow test is required to determine adequacy of water service for proposed fire suppression system. The fire prevention section of the Dept. of Safety and Inspections reviews sprinkler plans, issues permits and does the necessary inspections of the installation. Contact Jeff Hemenway 651-266- 8952 with questions on obtaining this permit and the procedure for arranging a time to perform this test.

**Response: Acknowledged**

- d) Update the Site Plan with the following notes:

Contractor to maintain access to the fire department connection for fire department personnel at all times during the construction period.

**Response: The Architectural Site Plan has been updated with this note.**

## 21. City Forestry

Reviewer: Zach Jorgensen/651-632-2437 [zach.jorgensen@ci.stpaul.mn.us](mailto:zach.jorgensen@ci.stpaul.mn.us)

### Comments:

- a) Street tree removals:

- Review utility placement and impacts to street trees on Marshall. If excavation for underground utility lines will be within 8ft of the trunk of a tree then removal and replacement will be required. Demo and landscape plans are to be updated accordingly. Contact me with questions.

**Response: Utilities moved to minimize demolition of existing trees.**

- b) Update the landscape plan:
- Identify the tree types to be planted. Street trees are to be swamp white oak or hackberry.
  - Include a plant schedule.
  - Trees planted on the boulevard are to be 2" caliper and have a minimum one year warranty.

**Response: See updated Sheet C2.**

- c) Ensure tree protection fencing is maintained throughout the construction process.

**Response: See updated Demolition Note" #8 on sheet C1.**

- d) Existing street trees are to be protected at all times. Trees damaged or removed during construction shall be restored or replaced to the satisfaction of, and at no cost to, the City as determined by the Forestry manager.

**Response: See updated Demolition Note" #8 on sheet C1.**

- e) Boulevard restoration is to include the following:

- Where driveways, sidewalks or other surface paving are removed all concrete, asphalt and base materials shall be removed.
- Boulevard soils are to be protected during construction. Soil compaction due to construction activities shall be mitigated and soils loosened prior to final grading.
- Boulevards shall be restored with a minimum of 4" of topsoil.

**Response: See updated "Landscaping Notes" on sheet C2**

- f) Concrete washouts shall not be located within the drip line of a tree.

**Response: See "Erosion Control Notes" #21 on Sheet C3.**

- g) Update the Site Plan with the following notes (notes are to be included on the demo and landscape plan sheets):

- The removal, pruning, and/or planting of trees on the public boulevard requires an approved permit from the City Forester (651-632-2437). Any work must be completed by a licensed tree contractor.

**Response: See updated "Demolition Notes" #6 on Sheet C1.**

- Construction supplies, materials, spoils, equipment, and vehicles shall not be stored or operated within the drip line of any public street tree or on turf boulevards without prior written approval from the City Forester. If the boulevard must be used for construction activities, site access routes, material storage or other related activities, protective measures approved by the City Forester shall be taken to reduce soil compaction and protect tree(s) from damage.

**Response: See updated "Demolition Notes" #7 on Sheet C1.**

- Street trees shall be protected by establishing a tree protection zone using 4' tall fencing installed at the drip line of the tree. Tree protection fencing shall be installed prior to the start of any site work and maintained for the duration of the project. Proposed work within, or changes to the location of tree protection fencing shall be reviewed by the City Forester prior to alteration.

**Response: See updated "Tree Protection Detail" on Sheet C5 and updated "Demolition Notes" #8.**

- The location of tree protection fences shall be shown on the plan.

**Response: See updated Demolition Plan on Sheet C1.**

- A tree protection fence detail shall be included in the plan set (see attached).

**Response: See updated “Tree Protection Detail” on Sheet C5**

- Contractor shall contact the City Forester (651-632-2437), prior to demolition or other land disturbance associated with site construction, to verify tree protection measures.

**Response: See updated “Demolition Notes” #9.**

- Tree planting details shall include the following:
  - Expose root flare and set at grade.
  - Remove burlap and ropes from top 1/3rd of root ball, cut wire basket down to second horizontal wire from the bottom, and dispose of off-site.
  - Contractor is responsible to maintain trees in a plumb position throughout the maintenance period.

**Response: See updated planting note on Sheet C5.**

## 22. Parks and Recreation

Reviewer: Paul Sawyer/651-266-6417 [paul.sawyer@ci.stpaul.mn.us](mailto:paul.sawyer@ci.stpaul.mn.us)

### Comments:

No concerns

## 23. Plumbing

Reviewer: Rick Jacobs/651-266-9051 [rick.jacobs@ci.stpaul.mn.us](mailto:rick.jacobs@ci.stpaul.mn.us)

### Comments:

- a) Contact Saint Paul Regional Water Services (SPRWS) for questions, permits, fees, inspections, specifications, plans, or information that may be required for the water service and/or the water meter.

**Response: Acknowledged**

- b) No utilities must run under any accessory structures.

**Response: Accessory buildings have been removed from the project**

- c) The accessory buildings used to store or house vehicles must not have drains and the floors must be pitched toward the outside via the opening for overhead garage door.

**Response: Accessory buildings have been removed from the project**

- d) Sanitary and/or storm sewer service passing within 10 feet of the building are governed by the MN Plumbing Code. Specification for pipe material selection and notes for required air test of the piping, compliant with MN State Plumbing Code 4714 Section 1109.0, must be shown on the plan. This system must be reviewed and approved by Rick Jacobs, Senior Plumbing Inspector (651-266- 9051) at the time of the Plumbing Plan review to ensure that it meets Plumbing Code standards.

**Response: Acknowledged**

- e) Contact the City of Saint Paul Department of Public Works Sewer Division for questions, permits, fees, inspections, specifications, plans, or information that may be required for sewer and storm piping work performed outside the building, including “retention systems”.

**Response: Acknowledged**

- f) All primary roof drains shall be piped internally to below grade, exit the building, and be connected to the storm sewer. MPC 4714.1101.1.

**Response: Acknowledged**

- g) Secondary Roof Drainage shall drain to an approved place of disposal in the form of Secondary Roof Drains installed per MPC 4714.1101 & 1102, and Minnesota State Building Code 1503.4 1-5. Secondary roof drainage must discharge onto permeable soils and cannot drain onto the sidewalk. MPC 4714.1101.1. An approved place of disposal that can be approved by the Authority Having Jurisdiction for secondary roof drainage is in the form of secondary roof drains piped internally, down to within 18 inches of grade, through the outside wall, onto a splash block installed per MPC 1101.5.3, and laid over permeable soils of an adequate amount where saturation of the soil will not occur.

**Response: Acknowledged**

- h) The “green roof” design will require approval of an Alternate Code Compliance under MPC 4714 301.2 as it is not a design approved by the plumbing code. Provide a proposed design and completed DSI Alternate Code Compliance form to the DSI Plumbing Section for approval prior to site plan approval. All discharge to the “green roof” area must be included in the total drainage calculations of the green roof.

**Response: The “green roof” has been eliminated from this proposed project.**

## 24. Building Code Requirements

Reviewer: James Williamette/651-266-9077 [james.williamette@ci.stpaul.mn.us](mailto:james.williamette@ci.stpaul.mn.us)

### Comments:

- a) This proposal will require a demolition permit to remove the existing structures and a building (grading) permit to proceed with any grading activity.

**Response: Acknowledged**

- b) This proposal will require a building permit to proceed. The building permit is issued only after all necessary city staff have approved and signed off on the proposed design. In addition to the building permit, separate permits are required for any plumbing, electrical and mechanical work, elevator installation and any fire sprinkler modifications. These permits must be obtained and the work performed by city licensed contractors in each of the respective trades.

**Response: Acknowledged**

- c) One PDF and two sets of complete construction documents stamped by public works must be submitted with the building permit application to the DSI Main Office/ Permit Desk.

- The construction documents shall include architectural, structural, mechanical, electrical and plumbing plans signed and stamped by design professionals registered in the State of Minnesota. The architect shall provide a complete code analysis and a color-coded exit plan showing all fire rated walls and shafts and include exit access and travel distances. The plans shall have the energy code noted on the plans along with the compliance path chosen. The submittal should include compliance documents detailing how the energy code requirements are met.
- Plans must be dimensioned, drawn to scale and sufficiently detailed to denote the scope of work to be performed and the method of construction.
- Mechanical ventilation plans will need to be prepared by a mechanical engineer, registered with the State of Minnesota. In some cases, a “Master in the Trade” may prepare plans. The ventilation contractor should contact our senior warm air inspector Gary Reinsberg (651-266- 9064) or by e-mail at [Gary.reinsberg@ci.stpaul.mn.us](mailto:Gary.reinsberg@ci.stpaul.mn.us) The

Energy code and path must be noted on these plans also.

- The plumbing and electrical contractors for this project should contact our office if they have questions about whether engineered plans need to be submitted with their permit request. The senior plumbing inspector is Rick Jacobs at 651-266-9051 [Rick.jacobs@ci.stpaul.mn.us](mailto:Rick.jacobs@ci.stpaul.mn.us) and the senior electrical inspector is Dan Moynihan at 651-266-9036 [Dan.monihan@ci.stpaul.mn.us](mailto:Dan.monihan@ci.stpaul.mn.us)

**Response: Acknowledged**

Note: **The building permit will not be issued until all signoffs are received** from Zoning, HPC, HVAC, Public Works, or other departments that are assigned to the project.

**Response: Acknowledged.**

#### **25. Service Availability Charge (SAC)**

The proposed project will need a SAC determination before a building permit can be issued. You must submit a copy of the plans to the Metropolitan Council Environmental Services (MCES) for a SAC determination. Please see their website at <https://metro council.org> for additional information. If MCES determines that a SAC fee is due, the City will collect that payment with the building permit fee.

SAC Questions and Determination Review Submittal Information email:

[SACprogram@metc.state.mn.us](mailto:SACprogram@metc.state.mn.us) or call 651-602-1770 to speak to a SAC representative.

***Response: The City of Saint will need to report the demolition of the two existing properties to the Metropolitan Council. Pope Architects will submit for a new determination for the proposed multi-family building.***

Sincerely,

**POPE ARCHITECTS, INC.**

Paul Hanlon  
Project Architect

cc: File, Jon Schwartzman, Eric Meyers



CITY OF SAINT PAUL  
Christopher B. Coleman, Mayor

375 Jackson Street, Suite 220  
St Paul, Minnesota 55101-1806

Telephone: 651-266-8989  
Facsimile: 651-266-9124  
Web: [www.stpaul.gov/dsi](http://www.stpaul.gov/dsi)

December 20, 2017

Jon Schwartzman  
MCR Property Holdings, LLC  
10921 Excelsior Blvd., #106  
Hopkins, MN 55343

Paul Hanlon  
Pope Architects  
1295 Bandana Blvd., Ste 200  
St Paul, MN 55108

Eric Meyers  
Larson Engineering  
3524 Labore Rd  
White Bear Lake, MN 55110

RE: **Updated Site Plan 17-206385** – Marshall & Moore Apartments at 1973 – 1977 Marshall Ave – Site Plans with revisions through 12/14/2017.

Mr. Schwartzman, Mr. Hanlon, and Mr. Meyers,

A majority of the Site Plan Review Committee has had an opportunity to review the updated plan set and provide feedback. Below is a summary of the outstanding requirements or issues identified. Any subsequent feedback will be forwarded in a revised memo.

### General Comments

1. Prior to Final Site Plan Approval, the following shall be required:
  - Per Minnesota State Statute 326, the final plans submitted shall be signed by the appropriate licensed Professional, i.e. PE, LA, RLS, etc., responsible for plan development.
  - Final plans shall not be marked “preliminary” or “not for construction.”
  - Provide proof of filing of combination of contiguous lots with Ramsey County.
  - Contact Public Works Records and Mapping at 651.266.6150 to determine the address for the building and apartment addresses for the individual units within the building. The building address can be odd numbers within the range of 1973 Marshall to 1979 Marshall.

### Zoning

Tia Anderson/651-266-9086 [tia.anderson@ci.stpaul.mn.us](mailto:tia.anderson@ci.stpaul.mn.us)

Larry Zangs/651-266-9082 [larry.zangs@ci.stpaul.mn.us](mailto:larry.zangs@ci.stpaul.mn.us)

2. It would be helpful to letter or number the Architectural Plan Sheets for ease of reference.
3. Update the Data on the Site Plan sheet as follows:
  - Under “parking required” 3 – 3BR units is listed instead of 6 – 3BR units
  - Indicate amount of bicycle parking provided (as referenced in the 12/14/17 Response letter)
4. Clearly label the Garage Plan and Ground Floor Plan sheets with typical parking dimensions, maneuvering lanes, and location of bicycle parking.



- On the 12/14/17 Garage Plan there appears to be extra lines on the North side of the drawing, and a 9' parking stall dimension on the South side that is located incorrectly.
  - Update the maneuvering lane width for the stall near the elevator lobby. The minimum width is 20'. A 22' dimension is shown for the adjoining stall.
5. Update the West and South elevations to identify the building height to the top of the roof deck. For purposes of presenting to the Planning Commission, it may be useful to depict the height from both the existing average grade as well as the proposed grade.
  6. Update C2 with key dimensions, including: setbacks, driveway access widths, ground level driveway width.
  7. Paving and landscaping shall be consistent between the Architectural Site Plan, Site Plan, and C2 sheets.
    - Currently the rear yard snow storage area/slab and paving near the front sidewalk are inconsistent between the plan sheets.
    - The Architectural Site Plan includes a 4' 6" wood screening fence; C2 includes a 6' composite screening fence. Visual screen locations shall conform with front yard setback lines in residential districts. Please add a detail for the proposed fence.
    - The Architectural Site Plan refers to a retaining wall on the northeast property line near the snow storage with a note to "see Civils." The wall is not referred to on the Civil plan sheets. Please add a detail of the wall.
  8. The dimensions of the proposed decorative overhang at the building entrance may need to be modified. Overhangs and decorative details may project into a required yard sixteen (16) inches plus two (2) inches for each foot of width of the required side yard, which for this property is 9', allowing for up to a 34" overhang.
  9. Confirm whether the proposed surface parking shall remain prior to Final Site Plan Approval. Based on the current unit size and mix, 29 off-street parking spaces are required. A decision on the surface parking may be impacted by Accessibility Code requirements. Note that the stormwater drainage calculations may need to be updated to reflect the final decision.

### Public Works Transportation Planning

David Kuebler/651-266-6217 [david.kuebler@ci.stpaul.mn.us](mailto:david.kuebler@ci.stpaul.mn.us)

10. Please provide turning movement templates as requested in the 11/09/2017 Site Plan Review Report. Turning templates should be provided for maneuvering within all parking areas.
11. Please see the attached documents for redlines of the revised plans for the Marshall & Moore Apartments as well as applicable redlined pages of the 11/9/17 Site Plan Review Report.

### Public Works Sewers

Anca Sima/651-266-6237 [anca.sima@ci.stpaul.mn.us](mailto:anca.sima@ci.stpaul.mn.us)

12. The 12/14/17 site plan is still under review. Any additional comments or questions will be forthcoming.

### Plumbing

Rick Jacobs/651-266-9051 [rick.jacobs@ci.stpaul.mn.us](mailto:rick.jacobs@ci.stpaul.mn.us)

13. Please add the following notes to the Site Plan Notes:
  - Contact Saint Paul Regional Water Services (SPRWS) for questions, permits, fees, inspections, specifications, plans, or information that may be required for the water service and/or the water meter.

- Sanitary and/or storm sewer service passing within 10 feet of the building are governed by the MN Plumbing Code. Specification for pipe material selection and notes for required air test of the piping, compliant with MN State Plumbing Code 4714 Section 1109.0, must be shown on the plan. This system must be reviewed and approved by Rick Jacobs, Senior Plumbing Inspector (651-266-9051) at the time of the Plumbing Plan review to ensure that it meets Plumbing Code standards.
- Contact the City of Saint Paul Department of Public Works Sewer Division for questions, permits, fees, inspections, specifications, plans, or information that may be required for sewer and storm piping work performed outside the building, including “retention systems”.
- All primary roof drains shall be piped internally to below grade, exit the building, and be connected to the storm sewer. MPC 4714.1101.1.
- Secondary Roof Drainage shall drain to an approved place of disposal in the form of Secondary Roof Drains installed per MPC 4714.1101 & 1102, and Minnesota State Building Code 1503.4 1-5. Secondary roof drainage must discharge onto permeable soils and cannot drain onto the sidewalk. MPC 4714.1101.1. An approved place of disposal that can be approved by the Authority Having Jurisdiction for secondary roof drainage is in the form of secondary roof drains piped internally, down to within 18 inches of grade, through the outside wall, onto a splash block installed per MPC 1101.5.3, and laid over permeable soils of an adequate amount where saturation of the soil will not occur.

### Water Utility

Jeff Murphy/ 651-266-6276 [jeffrey.murphy@ci.stpaul.mn.us](mailto:jeffrey.murphy@ci.stpaul.mn.us)

14. Per the 11/09/2017 SPR Report, show existing water services on Plan Sheet C1 or C4 to be cut off at the water main.
  - 1977 Marshall Ave – 1" CP – 30 S N Marshall / 28 E E Moore
  - 1973 Marshall Ave – 1" CP – 80 E E Moore

### Forestry

Zach Jorgensen/651-632-2437 [zach.jorgensen@ci.stpaul.mn.us](mailto:zach.jorgensen@ci.stpaul.mn.us)

15. The existing street trees on Marshall Avenue are not consistently shown in the updated plan set (architectural and civils). Please include the trees in the site plan and indicate whether they will be removed/replaced or protected during construction.

### Metro Transit

Berry Farrington/612-349-7378 [berry.farrington@metrotransit.org](mailto:berry.farrington@metrotransit.org)

16. Consider adding a cap to the retaining wall adjacent to the sidewalk near the corner at Marshall and Moore. A cap of up to 24" deep would help protect the private landscaping from damage that could occur from people sitting on the wall.

If you have questions, please contact me at 651-266-9086 or [tia.anderson@ci.stpaul.mn.us](mailto:tia.anderson@ci.stpaul.mn.us).



Tia Anderson  
Senior City Planner

cc: File

December 28, 2017

Tia Anderson  
Senior City Planner  
City of Saint Paul – Department of Safety and Inspections – Zoning Division  
375 Jackson Street, Suite 220  
Saint Paul, MN 55101-1806

**RE: Site Plan Review Report Response Letter, Marshall & Moore Apartments at 1975 Marshall Avenue. MCR Property Holdings, LLC. Site Plans with revisions through 12/14/2017.**

Ms. Anderson,

Please see the responses below in bold italics for the Site Plan Review Report prepared by the City of Saint Paul dated December 20, 2017

A majority of the Site Plan Review Committee has had an opportunity to review the updated plan set and provide feedback. Below is a summary of the outstanding requirements or issues identified. Any subsequent feedback will be forwarded in a revised memo.

General Comments

1. Prior to Final Site Plan Approval, the following shall be required:
  - Per Minnesota State Statute 326, the final plans submitted shall be signed by the appropriate licensed Professional, i.e. PE, LA, RLS, etc., responsible for plan development.  
***Response: The final plans have been signed by the appropriate licensed professional***
  - Final plans shall not be marked “preliminary” or “not for construction.”  
***Response: Final plans are not marked “Preliminary” or “Not For Construction”.***
  - Provide proof of filing of combination of contiguous lots with Ramsey County.  
***Response: Proof of filing of combination of contiguous lots will be provided.***

- Contact Public Works Records and Mapping at 651.266.6150 to determine the address for the building and apartment addresses for the individual units within the building. The building address can be odd numbers within the range of 1973 Marshall to 1979 Marshall.

***Response: Public Works Records and Mapping has been contacted. The address have been confirmed as 1975 Marshall Avenue with the sub-addresses for the Apartments as 101, 201, 202.....***

#### Zoning

Tia Anderson/651-266-9086 [tia.anderson@ci.stpaul.mn.us](mailto:tia.anderson@ci.stpaul.mn.us)

Larry Zangs/651-266-9082 [larry.zangs@ci.stpaul.mn.us](mailto:larry.zangs@ci.stpaul.mn.us)

2. It would be helpful to letter or number the Architectural Plan Sheets for ease of reference.

***Response: Architectural Plan Sheets have been numbered.***

3. Update the Data on the Site Plan sheet as follows:

- Under “parking required” 3 – 3BR units is listed instead of 6 – 3BR units

***Response: This information has been amended to 6-3BR units.***

- Indicate amount of bicycle parking provided (as referenced in the 12/14/17 Response letter)

***Response: The amount of bicycle parking has been added to the Site Plan Data.***

4. Clearly label the Garage Plan and Ground Floor Plan sheets with typical parking dimensions, maneuvering lanes, and location of bicycle parking.

***Response: Typical parking dimensions have been added and the location of bicycle parking has been noted. Seven pages have been added to demonstrate turning movements for the two levels of parking.***

- On the 12/14/17 Garage Plan there appears to be extra lines on the North side of the drawing, and a 9’ parking stall dimension on the South side that is located incorrectly.

***Response: These items have been amended.***

- Update the maneuvering lane width for the stall near the elevator lobby. The minimum width is 20’. A 22’ dimension is shown for the adjoining stall.

***Response: This item has been amended.***

5. Update the West and South elevations to identify the building height to the top of the roof deck. For purposes of presenting to the Planning Commission, it may be useful to depict the height from both the existing average grade as well as the proposed grade.

***Response: These items have been added to the West and South Elevations.***

6. Update C2 with key dimensions, including: setbacks, driveway access widths, ground level driveway width.

***Response: This information has been added to Sheet C2.***

7. Paving and landscaping shall be consistent between the Architectural Site Plan, Site Plan, and C2 sheets.

***Response: Information on the Design Site Plan, Architectural Site Plan, and the C2 Sheet has been coordinated.***

- Currently the rear yard snow storage area/slab and paving near the front sidewalk are inconsistent between the plan sheets.

***Response: This area has been coordinated.***

- The Architectural Site Plan includes a 4' 6" wood screening fence; C2 includes a 6' composite screening fence. Visual screen locations shall conform with front yard setback lines in residential districts. Please add a detail for the proposed fence.

***Response: A 6' high wood fence is proposed. A detail has been added.***

- The Architectural Site Plan refers to a retaining wall on the northeast property line near the snow storage with a note to "see Civils." The wall is not referred to on the Civil plan sheets. Please add a detail of the wall.

***Response: This retaining wall has been added to the Civil plan sheets and a detail has been added to the Civil plan sheets.***

8. The dimensions of the proposed decorative overhang at the building entrance may need to be modified. Overhangs and decorative details may project into a required yard sixteen (16) inches plus two (2) inches for each foot of width of the required side yard, which for this property is 9', allowing for up to a 34" overhang.

***Response: The overhang and the associated dimensions have been amended.***

9. Confirm whether the proposed surface parking shall remain prior to Final Site Plan Approval. Based on the current unit size and mix, 29 off-street parking spaces are required. A decision on the surface parking may be impacted by Accessibility Code requirements. Note that the stormwater drainage calculations may need to be updated to reflect the final decision.

***Response: The off-street surface parking has been eliminated from the proposed project.***

Public Works Transportation Planning

David Kuebler/651-266-6217 [david.kuebler@ci.stpaul.mn.us](mailto:david.kuebler@ci.stpaul.mn.us)

10. Please provide turning movement templates as requested in the 11/09/2017 Site Plan Review Report. Turning templates should be provided for maneuvering within all parking areas.

***Response: Seven pages have been added to demonstrate turning movements for the two levels of parking.***

11. Please see the attached documents for redlines of the revised plans for the Marshall & Moore Apartments as well as applicable redlined pages of the 11/9/17 Site Plan Review Report.

***Response: These redlines have been addressed.***

Public Works Sewers

Anca Sima/651-266-6237 [anca.sima@ci.stpaul.mn.us](mailto:anca.sima@ci.stpaul.mn.us)

12. The 12/14/17 site plan is still under review. Any additional comments or questions will be forthcoming.

***Response: Acknowledged***

Plumbing

Rick Jacobs/651-266-9051 [rick.jacobs@ci.stpaul.mn.us](mailto:rick.jacobs@ci.stpaul.mn.us)

13. Please add the following notes to the Site Plan Notes:

- Contact Saint Paul Regional Water Services (SPRWS) for questions, permits, fees, inspections, specifications, plans, or information that may be required for the water service and/or the water meter.
- Sanitary and/or storm sewer service passing within 10 feet of the building are governed by the MN Plumbing Code. Specification for pipe material selection and notes for required air test of the piping, compliant with MN State Plumbing Code 4714 Section 1109.0, must be shown on the plan. This system must be reviewed and approved by Rick Jacobs, Senior Plumbing Inspector (651-266-9051) at the time of the Plumbing Plan review to ensure that it meets Plumbing Code standards.
- Contact the City of Saint Paul Department of Public Works Sewer Division for questions, permits, fees, inspections, specifications, plans, or information that may be required for sewer and storm piping work performed outside the building, including “retention systems”.
- All primary roof drains shall be piped internally to below grade, exit the building, and be connected to the storm sewer. MPC 4714.1101.1.
- Secondary Roof Drainage shall drain to an approved place of disposal in the form of Secondary Roof Drains installed per MPC 4714.1101 & 1102, and Minnesota State Building Code 1503.4 1-5. Secondary roof drainage must discharge onto permeable soils and cannot drain onto the sidewalk. MPC 4714.1101.1. An approved place of disposal that can be approved by the

Authority Having Jurisdiction for secondary roof drainage is in the form of secondary roof drains piped internally, down to within 18 inches of grade, through the outside wall, onto a splash block installed per MPC 1101.5.3, and laid over permeable soils of an adequate amount where saturation of the soil will not occur.

***Response: These notes have been added to the Civil plan sheets.***

Water Utility

Jeff Murphy/ 651-266-6276 [jeffrey.murphy@ci.stpaul.mn.us](mailto:jeffrey.murphy@ci.stpaul.mn.us)

14. Per the 11/09/2017 SPR Report, show existing water services on Plan Sheet C1 or C4 to be cut off at the water main.

- 1977 Marshall Ave – 1" CP – 30 S N Marshall / 28 E E Moore
- 1973 Marshall Ave – 1" CP – 80 E E Moore

***Response: This information has been added to the Civil plan sheets.***

Forestry

Zach Jorgensen/651-632-2437 [zach.jorgensen@ci.stpaul.mn.us](mailto:zach.jorgensen@ci.stpaul.mn.us)

15. The existing street trees on Marshall Avenue are not consistently shown in the updated plan set (architectural and civils). Please include the trees in the site plan and indicate whether they will be removed/replaced or protected during construction.

***Response: The existing street trees on Marshall Avenue have been coordinated.***

Metro Transit

Berry Farrington/612-349-7378 [berry.farrington@metrotransit.org](mailto:berry.farrington@metrotransit.org)

16. Consider adding a cap to the retaining wall adjacent to the sidewalk near the corner at Marshall and Moore. A cap of up to 24" deep would help protect the private landscaping from damage that could occur from people sitting on the wall.

***Response: A 24" deep retaining wall cap has been added to the proposed project.***

Sincerely,

**POPE ARCHITECTS, INC.**

Paul Hanlon  
Project Architect

cc: File, Jon Schwartzman, Eric Meyers