



CITY OF SAINT PAUL
Melvin Carter, Mayor

*25 West Fourth Street
Saint Paul, MN 55102*

*Telephone: 651-266-6700
Facsimile: 651-228-3220*

TRANSPORTATION COMMITTEE OF THE PLANNING COMMISSION

Monday, March 25, 2019, 4:30 p.m. – 6:00 p.m.
*All meetings are held in the City Hall Annex 13th floor
Conference room at 25 West 4th Street in Saint Paul*

1. Allianz Field Transportation Management Plan – Pat Corkle and Tom Sachi (SRF Consulting) 45 minutes
2. Saint Paul Pedestrian Plan: review public comment and make recommendation – Fay Simer (Public Works) 40 minutes
3. St. Anthony Ave./Concordia Ave. outreach update – Fay Simer and Luke Hanson (Public Works) 5 minutes

Upcoming Transportation Committee Meetings

- April 8
- April 22

Meetings are open to the public. The Chair may allow five minutes for informal public comment (from non-committee members) at the beginning of each agenda as needed. Additional time may be allocated for comments or further discussion at the discretion of the Chair. Meetings will be cancelled if there is not a quorum expected, or if there are no agenda items. For additional information on the Transportation Committee of the Planning Commission, please visit our website at bit.ly/StPaulTC or contact Bill Dermody at Bill.Dermody@ci.stpaul.mn.us or 651-266-6617.



CITY OF SAINT PAUL
Melvin W. Carter, Mayor

1500 City Hall Annex

Fax: 651-266-6222

25 W. Fourth Street
Saint Paul, MN 55102-1660

DATE: March 13, 2019
TO: Saint Paul Transportation Committee
FROM: Fay Simer, Pedestrian Safety Advocate
SUBJECT: Review of Public Comments on February 8, 2019 Draft of the Pedestrian Plan

BACKGROUND

The Planning Commission released the draft *Saint Paul Pedestrian Plan* for public testimony on December 14, 2018 and set a public hearing date of February 8, 2019. Two people spoke at the hearing. Before the record closed on February 11, 2019, six organizations submitted letters to the City and approximately 65 individuals commented via the City's website.

WHAT WE HEARD

In general, people expressed support from the draft plan. We heard:

1. A pedestrian plan is an important first step in making walking safer and easier in Saint Paul
2. The plan reflects the right vision, goals, and key priorities for Saint Paul
3. Objective prioritization is important to ensuring that resources for pedestrian infrastructure and programming are distributed equitably

We also heard that there are a few things the plan should address further:

1. The role of trees and the urban forest in making a comfortable walking environment
2. The importance of "non-sidewalk" infrastructure in supporting walking, including stairs, cut-throughs, parking lot design, and driveway openings
3. The importance of personal security to people's comfort while walking
4. The importance of lighting in making pedestrians visible, especially at crossings
5. The need to address pedestrian needs at specific locations outside of High Priority Areas for Walking Investments.
6. The importance of educating pedestrians about safe crossing behaviors

A few general themes emerge from the comments:

1. Affirmation: At least 15 comments were submitted indicating overall support for the plan and its goals.
2. Coordination with other travel modes: Commenters expressed concern about pedestrian safety around other modes that use sidewalks and crosswalks, including bicycles and scooters.



An Affirmative Action Equal Opportunity Employer



Need this translated? Call us at 651-266-6100
266-6100

Necesita esta traducción? Comuníquese con nosotros al 651-

Ma u baahan tahay tar jamadaan Naga soo wac 651-266-6100 Xav tau qhov no txhais los? Hu rau peb ntawm 651-266-6100

3. Land Use and Zoning: Commenters expressed a need to address pedestrian safety and comfort through design decisions on private property, e.g. driveway openings, “eyes on the street,” and parking lot design.
4. Priority Areas: In general, commenters affirmed that data-driven prioritization is important to making walking more equitable. However, many people had concerns about specific locations that were not in High Priority Areas for Walking Investments and wondered how or when they would be addressed.
5. Sidewalks: Filling sidewalk gaps is important, as are maintenance of our sidewalks system and good sidewalk design.
6. Street crossings: Pedestrians need to be visible at street crossings. In addition to infrastructure treatments, motorist speeds, motorist behaviors, and pedestrian behaviors compromise pedestrians’ safety at street crossings.

STAFF RESPONSES TO COMMENTS

Staff entered all 188 unique comments into a matrix (attached). For each comment; the following information is presented:

- who made the comment;
- a response to the comment;
- whether a change in the draft plan is recommended; and
- if a change is recommended, what it is (proposed new language).

To facilitate Committee review of the matrix, the attached spreadsheet includes two tabs:

1. The complete matrix, with all comments and responses.
2. An abridged version showing only those comments where a change in the draft plan is recommended.

Four additional action items are proposed based on public testimony. They are highlighted here:

- *Request that Ramsey County and MnDOT review local cost participation policies for consistency with their adopted multimodal policy goals.*
- *Work with state agency partners to identify needs and strategies for increased education about safe walking behaviors.*
- *Increase opportunities for community collaboration on street design and implementation in partnership with Saint Paul District Councils and other interested organizations.*
- *Pursue opportunities to enhance pedestrian connectivity in places where streets do not connect across natural features or major pedestrian barriers.*

Staff also recommends revisions to three action items. Proposed new language is *italicized* below:

- Action 1-1: ~~Support access to transit stops by supporting safe crossings and waiting environments.~~ *Work with partners to support safe walking environments through initiatives such as Crime Prevention through Environmental Design, lighting improvements, neighborhood walks, and litter pickup.*
- Action 1.4: Ensure visibility of pedestrian crossings. Review *street lighting*, sign placement, street furniture, bus shelters, foliage growth and parking restrictions at intersections as part of all reconstruction projects and requests for crossing improvements.

- Action 2-8: Develop a public awareness campaign to educate residents, businesses, *and other property owners* about the city snow removal ordinance and encourage people to report violations.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Staff recommends that the Transportation Committee endorse the Draft Saint Paul Pedestrian Plan, with the proposed revisions in the attached spreadsheet, and forward their recommendation to the Planning Commission.

TRANSPORTATION COMMITTEE AND PLANNING COMMISSION SCHEDULE FOR REVIEW

Below is the proposed schedule for review and adoption of the Saint Paul Pedestrian Plan. This schedule is subject to change.

March 25	Transportation Committee reviews staff response to public testimony; forwards recommendation to Planning Commission
April 5	Planning Commission approves recommended changes; directs staff to prepare final draft Saint Paul Pedestrian Plan and forward to the Mayor and City Council

Attachments:

1. All Written Comments
2. Comment Matrix (2 tabs)

Draft Saint Paul Pedestrian Plan Comments - December 14, 2018 - February 11, 2019

	Signature	Location	Created At	Name	Address	Comment	Category	Response	Proposed Revisions
72	Barb Thoman	inside Ward 4	1/30/2019 10:50	Barb Thoman	2157 Roblyn Avenue, St. Paul, MN 55104	9. Why does Ramsey County not pay 100 percent of the cost of sidewalk replacement (page 38)? Please list the county policy on cost-sharing in the plan. Maybe the city should advocate with the county to change this policy.	Sidewalks	See proposed revision.	<p>9. Add link to https://www.ramseycounty.us/sites/default/files/Roads%20and%20Transit/2018-2022%20TIP-%201-11-18.pdf</p> <p>Add plan action: Request that Ramsey County and MnDOT review local cost participation policies in in response to their adopted multimodal policy goals.</p>
73	Barb Thoman	inside Ward 4	1/30/2019 10:50	Barb Thoman	2157 Roblyn Avenue, St. Paul, MN 55104	<p>8. Please identify the amount and types of investments in pedestrian infrastructure/programs from the \$42.5 million 8-80 Vitality Fund (page 10)? Was all this funding spent on pedestrian and bicycle infrastructure and programs?</p> <p>10. Section 2-4 of city code requires property owners to install sidewalks adjacent to all streets abutting properties undergoing site redevelopment (table on page 7, item 2-4). Are there exceptions? No sidewalk was installed at a recent redevelopment on east side of Cleveland just south of I-94.</p> <p>11. What is the cost in city staff time of Paint the Pavement (page 54)? I question whether this program should be a high priority. Does the paint go into the storm sewer and the river when it flakes off?</p> <p>12. Does St Paul still have federal money to continue the Stop for Me campaign in 2019? This was not clear to me.</p>	Clarification	See proposed revisions.	<p>8. Add weblink https://www.stpaul.gov/news/city-council-passes-8-80-vitality-fund</p> <p>10. Public Works staff is unaware of this example. Please follow up with details about the specific location in question and Public Works staff is happy to research past project decisions pertaining to this property.</p> <p>11. Administrative staff time for this program is currently limited, but would need to increase in order to fulfill the actions of the plan. The cost for operations staff to support Paint the Pavement are included in program fees.</p> <p>12. Add sentence about current Stop for Me funding with program years identified.</p>
123	Payne Phalen District Council		2/8/2019			d. Likewise, we suggest adding Ramsey County and MnDOT to the list entities that will need to be coordinated in order to ensure that these goals and priorities are met when implementing the plan.	Clarification	See proposed revision.	Add Action 3-3 to Table 3: "Maximize impact of capital projects through coordination with partner jurisdictions such as Ramsey County, MnDOT and Metro Transit. Define internal structure for managing external partnerships and identifying opportunities to maximize use of resources during capital projects."
3	Name not available		2/11/2019 12:26	M. Vance	428 Fry Street	What is the plan for enforcing compliance with pedestrian laws? Pedestrians running out in front of cars, who have the right away green light, to catch transportation is something I observe ever day. Usually multiple times per day.	Pedestrian Education	See proposed revision.	Add action item under Goal 1: Work with state agency partners to identify needs and strategies for increased education about safe walking behaviors.
41	John Eischens	inside Ward 2	12/17/2018 12:08	John	333 Sibley St.	Please make education on pedestrian laws a higher priority and begin to more strictly enforce jaywalking laws. Even in areas of downtown St. Paul where there are plenty of defined pedestrian crosswalks, many people continue to jaywalk, eeven when they're less than 20 feet from a marked crosswalk. I can't even count the number of times I've nearly hit a jaywalker in downtown St. Paul as it's a near weekly occurrence. Because of this, I'm less optimistic about some of these improvements, as jaywalkers will continue to jaywalk, even when safer options are provided. While it's great to enforce vehicle laws regarding stopping pedestrians in crosswalks, jaywalking laws should be equally enforced.	Pedestrian Education	See proposed revision.	Add action item under Goal 1: Work with state agency partners to identify needs and strategies for increased education about safe walking behaviors.
51	Greg Kammier	outside Saint Paul	1/12/2019 23:12	Greg Kammier	Circle Pines, Mn.	Watching out for pedestrians is the first most important thing everyone driving should do, but I would like to say that when I was growing up I was taught to stop! at the curb as a pedestrian, and look both ways before stepping out into the street to make sure it was Clear! to cross. I think pedestrians now, because of the freedom given with the law, that they are just stepping out into traffic cause they think that the vehicle has to stop for them. Yes! That vehicle has to stop, but so many people step out now right in front of cars because of the law. You should not step out in front of vehicles until it is Clear! Period! Waiting to cross and making sure you have time enough to cross must be reminded to the public by signs, and law enforcement. People are stopping traffic more than ever now, and it is wrong! Thank you for your time!.	Pedestrian Education	See proposed revision.	Add action item under Goal 1: Work with state agency partners to identify needs and strategies for increased education about safe walking behaviors.

99	Dave Hafner	outside Saint Paul	12/19/2018 18:46	Dave Hafner 1037	Dear Sirs: Having attended numerous safety meetings and considering myself to be a legitimate safety advocate, I believe I have a very good understanding and grasp of the challenges that we face, and the factors that make	Coordination with other travel modes	This plan is intended to specifically address the needs of pedestrians. The Transportation Chapter of the	Add action item under Goal 1: Work with state agency partners to identify needs and strategies for increased education about safe walking behaviors.
112	Stacey Von Wald	inside Ward 3	12/17/2018 10:59	Stacey Von Wald	1902 Sheridan Ave. 55116 What the plan the city is proposing lacks, is pedestrian knowledge. I see every day people who believe that because of the pedestrian laws that makes them impermeable to cars and trucks. They believe that because the law is on their side, they don't have to take the precautions that I do. To not have any pedestrian knowledge/training in the plan makes me truly marvel at the naiveté of those who believe in it. And it's dangerous. Too many people believe that because the law is on their side, they have the right to cross the street even if a car is coming or while they're on their cell phone or while they're chatting with their friends. Really? If pedestrians were "trained" as I am, there would literally be no car/pedestrian accidents. Isn't that what we're really looking for? How can this be considered a comprehensive plan when there is very little responsibility on the part of the pedestrian?	Pedestrian Education	See proposed revision.	Add action item under Goal 1: Work with state agency partners to identify needs and strategies for increased education about safe walking behaviors.
113	Name not available		12/17/2018 10:43	Regina rippel	690 Lawson ave e I strongly believe that walking and driving safely go hand in hand I have nearly gotten killed on xwalks. And I see people deliberately walking on the street expecting traffic to stop for them much more education needs to happen for both drivers and walkers.	Pedestrian Education	See proposed revision.	Add action item under Goal 1: Work with state agency partners to identify needs and strategies for increased education about safe walking behaviors.
121	District 1 Community Council		2/4/2019		We recommend training for pedestrians too. Just like in drivers ed — we learn about defensive driving, because you can't always trust the other driver. That is even more important when it is pedestrian vs car because the pedestrian is almost always the loser. Yes, drivers should always follow the rules and watch for pedestrians but empowering them with safe habits would be good too.	Pedestrian Education	See proposed revision.	Add action item under Goal 1: Work with state agency partners to identify needs and strategies for increased education about safe walking behaviors.
188	Payne Phalen District Council		2/8/2019		Not all pedestrian facilities are sidewalks that parallel existing city streets. In many parts of the city there is a need to connect interrupted parts of the grid; places where vehicular connections may not be crucial but where new or improved pedestrian connections are essential for good access by walking.	Other		Add action to Goal 2 Pursue opportunities to enhance pedestrian connectivity in places where streets do not connect through natural features or across major pedestrian barriers.
181	Payne Phalen District Council		2/8/2019		Page 7, Table 1: Please consider including language that indicates the need for, and benefits of coordinating with St. Paul's Community Councils on the various design and development efforts in this list. For the Payne-Phalen Community Council, we would very much like to collaborate with the City as improvements are being contemplated, designed, and implemented. a. For instance, how do these activities fit into the City's new Capital Budget process? b. Also, it would be good to know more specifically how District Councils can be helpful by ensuring strong engagement advice and consultation on this list of actions? Page 11: In regard to "engagement practices," please consider adding language that indicates how St. Paul's Community Councils can be helpful and included.	Other	Comment acknowledged.	Add action to Goal 3 Increase opportunities for community collaboration on street design and implementation in partnership with Saint Paul District Councils and other interested organizations.
186	Payne Phalen District Council		2/8/2019		Chapter 6, page 59: Please consider including language that indicates the need for and benefits of coordinating with St. Paul's Community Councils in the process of monitoring progress on the walking network.	Other		Add action to Goal 3 Increase opportunities for community collaboration on street design and implementation in partnership with Saint Paul District Councils and other interested organizations.
189	Payne Phalen District Council		2/8/2019		There is an important consideration that could or should be amplified in this plan – future development. The plan itself is very strong in identifying existing shortfalls in the pedestrian system and recognizing the deficit in existing conditions. But in the course of the next ten or twenty years, a great deal of growth and redevelopment is expected – redevelopment that might help to transform parts of the city that could be so much more than they are today. Unfortunately, this plan doesn't have a strong sense of anticipation of those future needs. More importantly, the plan could be strengthened to anticipate the future benefits of redevelopment around TOD locations as well as intended investments to the transportation infrastructure.	Land Use and Zoning	The methodology to determine High Priority Areas for Walking Investment included neighborhood nodes, locations where land use redevelopment is anticipated. Future transitways are not included in the methodology, because precise stop locations where unknown at the time of the plan's development. Details on the methodology are available at: https://www.stpaul.gov/sites/default/files	Add further detail in a paragraph on pg 84 explaining that priorities can change as they city develops. Transitways and site development bring great opportunities (and increased demand) to corridors and the pedestrian network should be responsive to these trends.

69	Barb Thoman	inside Ward 4	1/30/2019 10:50	Barb Thoman	2157 Roblyn Avenue, St. Paul, MN 55104	Please add a discussion of the importance of good zoning to walking including Crime Prevention Through Environmental Design principals, aesthetics, placement of windows, driveways and parking, etc. I would list the City's Draft Comprehensive Plan as a relevant plan on page 16.	Land Use and Zoning	Comment acknowledged. Page 16 includes a detailed description of the draft comprehensive plan and its relationship to the pedestrian plan.	Add link to Comp Plan in paragraph on page 16.
101	Jeanne Gehrman	inside Ward 7	12/19/2018 10:15	Jeanne Gehrman	1963 Nortonia Avenue	2. P. 4 - (Quote): The Saint Paul Police Department (SPPD) maintains a database of bicycle and pedestrian crashes and makes this data available online. (Unquote) So how about giving us a clue as to approximately or maybe even exactly where that is on the SPPD portion of the City's web site? Please simply give us a link, thank you very much.	Clarification	See proposed revision.	Add link to page 4: https://www.stpaul.gov/departments/police/pedestrian-and-bike-crash-data-city-st-paul
122	Payne Phalen District Council		2/8/2019			Page 20 and 21: The graphs depicting survey responses indicate percentages, but they do not add up to 100. Does that matter? It seems a bit confusing. a.It would be helpful if these maps were numbered as they are in the previous parts of the document.	Clarification	See proposed revision.	Add note indicating that survey respondents could select more than one answer.
67	Barb Thoman	inside Ward 4	1/30/2019 10:50	Barb Thoman	2157 Roblyn Avenue, St. Paul, MN 55104	The Metropolitan Council's Travel Behavior Inventory reports that that 12 percent of auto trips by residents of the Minneapolis/St Paul region are less than one mile and 26 percent are less than two miles. For St. Paul residents, the percentages are 15 and 32 percent. I would list these numbers in the plan to demonstrate the opportunity to increase the percentage of trips by walking including walking to transit. (See attached table with Met. Council data).	Climate change	Comment acknowledged.	Add reference on page 16 to Saint Paul's Climate Action Plan (underway)
49	Pat Thompson	inside Ward 4	2/8/2019 13:47	Pat Thompson	1496 Raymond Avenue, Saint Paul, MN 55108	Third, South St. Anthony Park is marked as a high-priority area for walking investment, and again, we agree with that. This is an area with many sidewalk gaps, increasing housing density, and a lot of transit connections from buses and two Green Line stations. The only two specific stretches that make it onto the Pedestrian Plan's numbered priority list, however, are not the gaps we would prioritize, and are not near those areas of housing density and transit. We don't disagree with adding sidewalks on Pierce Butler Route or Kasota Ave. (we want sidewalks everywhere) but our priority would be to make Territorial Road from the Minneapolis line to Vandalia safe for pedestrians, especially the area around the highway 280 ramps and the most likely path from Seal Hi-Rise to Raymond Station. We can share details on these areas from community input. Our second priority would be some of the private streets and passageways immediately adjacent to the Raymond and Westgate Stations that don't have sidewalks, such as Carleton one block north of Raymond Station (connecting to Long) and LaSalle south of University, or the two possible passageways from Ellis to University between Emerald and Curfew, which are the most obvious connections between the multifamily housing south of Franklin (now under construction) and the Westgate Station.	Priority Areas	Exclusion of the sidewalk gap on Territorial was an oversight and will be corrected in the final plan.	Add Territorial to Table 18 Add action to Goal 2 Pursue opportunities to enhance pedestrian connectivity in places where streets do not connect through natural features or across major pedestrian barriers.
13	Name not available		2/8/2019 8:57	Jeff Zaayer	1750 Saunders Ave	Visibility of crossing pedestrians is very important the guidelines for sign placement often obstructs visibility of pedestrians. Placement of trees and street furniture need to be carefully placed as well to not obstruct visibility of and for crossing pedestrians.	Street crossings	See action 1.4: Ensure visibility of pedestrian crossings. Review sign placement, street furniture, bus shelters, foliage growth and parking restrictions at intersections as part of all reconstruction projects and requests for crossing improvements.	Amend action 1.4: Ensure visibility of pedestrian crossings. Review street lighting, sign placement, street furniture, bus shelters, foliage growth and parking restrictions at intersections as part of all reconstruction projects and requests for crossing improvements.
17	Monica Rasmussen	inside Ward 4	2/7/2019 15:20	Monica Rasmussen	409 Roy St N	I would like to be more visible. When I get off the EB Snelling station and cross University to head South, I am shielded by a bunch of signs. Left turning drivers don't see me or any group of people crossing there. It is especially dangerous with a stroller. There are many intersections like that in this city, not just at Green Line stations. Sometimes pedestrians are occluded by signs, sometimes by large trees. Where a person will stand to cross should be considered when landscaping and placing signage. The fence at the University ALine station also greatly affects mobility and increases the distance just to cross the street. What should be there instead is a nice accessible crossing area like what Snelling and Charles has. Hawk lights at major unsignaled intersections would also greatly improve safety. And at major signalized intersection that have high pedestrian counts (like Selby-Snelling), pedestrian scramble lights should be installed.	Street crossings	Action 1-4: Ensure visibility of pedestrian crossings. Review sign placement, street furniture, bus shelters, foliage growth and parking restrictions at intersections as part of all reconstruction projects and requests for crossing improvements."	Amend action 1.4: Ensure visibility of pedestrian crossings. Review street lighting, sign placement, street furniture, bus shelters, foliage growth and parking restrictions at intersections as part of all reconstruction projects and requests for crossing improvements.

79	Michelle Jwanouskos	outside Saint Paul	1/7/2019 12:57	Michelle Jwanouskos	879 Crestview Dr. So.	<p>Just wanted to share my perspective. Living off of McKnight Road, 2 miles south of where people were just hit by cars, I have to say that, when I saw these crosswalks pop up, with no flashing lights, I shook my head at the lack of forethought of their implementation. The ones added between Londin Lane and I94 were so incredibly ill-conceived it angered me and honestly, I was not surprised when I heard the news of this tragedy.</p> <p>Let's just ignore that we have a HUGE issue with distracted drivers. And dismiss the fact that 95% of the people who walk around these areas are covered from head-to-toe in dark clothing...I can't tell you how many times I've been startled by people walking on the side of the road that I didn't see until I was 5 feet from them. You can't fix stupid, but honestly, it's decisions like this that anger me with regard to government...the lack of common sense that people think painting lines on the road and adding signs would have no unintended consequences. ESPECIALLY where these people were killed...where there are 4 lanes of traffic!</p> <p>The problems I see is that first, you have them right next to bus stops, so as a driver, I can't tell when someone's waiting for a bus or waiting to cross. Second, every time I've stopped for pedestrians at the spot just south of I94...where it's 4-lanes, the cars traveling in the lane to my right never stop, forcing me to honk my horn to alert both the car and those crossing...which I bet money is what happened.</p> <p>From my perspective, these cross walks should ALWAYS be built with crossing lights like they have on Lake Road in Woodbury. While it will obviously cost more, it would most likely save lives which seems to have escaped the minds of those who pushed these things forward.</p>	Street crossings		Amend action 1.4: Ensure visibility of pedestrian crossings. Review street lighting, sign placement, street furniture, bus shelters, foliage growth and parking restrictions at intersections as part of all reconstruction projects and requests for crossing improvements.
124	District 1 Community Council		2/4/2019			Increased lighting at major intersections with higher density populations, and near bus stops is absolutely needed (note this comment was originally drafted before the crash/death at McKnight south of Burns).	Street crossings	See proposed revision.	Amend action 1.4: Ensure visibility of pedestrian crossings. Review street lighting, sign placement, street furniture, bus shelters, foliage growth and parking restrictions at intersections as part of all reconstruction projects and requests for crossing improvements.
6	Name not available		2/4/2019 17:24	2163 Randolph Ave.		I appreciate your including the issue of clearing snow and ice. I have to say that the St. Paul Public Schools facilities are some of the very worst at clearing ice and snow. Their buildings often have several blocks of bordering sidewalks, which usually are not shoveled/plowed, and become caked with ice and snow for weeks in the winter. Schools should NOT be exempt from the requirement to clear the sidewalks. There must be some consequence for this negligence.	Snow and ice	Comment acknowledged.	Amend action 2-8: Develop a public awareness campaign to educate residents, businesses, and other property owners about the city snow removal ordinance and encourage people to report violations.
190	Staff recommendation		11/9/2018			Action 2-12. Is identified as "Explore ways to accelerate corner clearing after snowfalls, especially in High Priority Areas for Walking Investments" which is a laudable goal/action - I hope that you can identify it both as a Program initiative and an Operations initiative. I believe that there is good consideration of a program basis for this work that could be different than (or at least parallel) to an Operations initiative that could be very effective.	Snow and ice		Amend Table 9 and 16 to check both "operations" and "programs" for Action 2-12.
150	North End Neighborhood Organization		2/5/2019			the downloadable draft of the SPPP is not ADA compliant, creating accessibility challenges for visually impaired users NENO requests that the final version of the SPPP is composed and checked for ADA compliance, to include graphics, image metadata, and colors that visually impaired stakeholders can use more easily.	Clarification	The final draft of the Saint Paul Pedestrian Plan will be checked for ADA compliance using Adobe's Accessibility Checker.	Complete ADA Compliance check with Adobe Accessibility Checker prior to release of final materials.
102	Jeanne Gehrman	inside Ward 7	12/19/2018 10:15	Jeanne Gehrman	1963 Nortonia Avenue	P. 73, Item # 1-2. "Advocate for a statewide reduction in urban street limits as part of the city's legislative agenda." What are "urban street limits" please & thanks.	Clarification	See proposed revision.	Correct all references to state urban speed limits
125	North End Neighborhood Organization		2/5/2019			Furthermore, the SPPP does not account for visually impaired persons: "People walking should clearly indicate that they would like to cross by making eye contact with approaching drivers and standing at the edge of the roadway" (page 31). Analysis: This problematic statement indicates that the authors of the SPPP did not consider (1) that visually impaired persons cannot make eye contact with drivers, and (2) that eye contact is not used the same way in many cultures, and (3) that eye contact is an easily misconstrued physical communication method that is entirely inadequate for signaling a need to cross. NENO also recommends that the SPPP uses the physical act of a pedestrian standing on a corner or crosswalk as the only necessary body language to communicate to drivers that the pedestrian is going to cross the street.	Clarification	Comment acknowledged	Delete last sentence from text box on page 31
187	Payne Phalen District Council		2/8/2019			For Table 18-23 on pages 85-89: Please consider adding a column that locates each project based on the corresponding name or number of the District Council in which the project lies. This will improve legibility and clarity for neighborhoods across the city.	Clarification	Comment acknowledged.	Include district council boundaries and ward boundaries in map package when pedestrian plan data is made available on Open St Paul.

168	Payne Phalen District Council	2/8/2019		e. With regards to the naming of the cluster, we suggest this should be called the "Payne-Phalen, Dayton's Bluff, and Swede Hollow cluster." I think the neighborhood directly north of the capital building is called "Capital Heights" (i.e. in the vicinity of Mt. Airy and Jackson Streets).	Clarification	See proposed revision.	Pg 71, 90 and 91 Revise from Swede Hollow and Capitol Heights to "Swede Hollow and Payne-Phalen"
169	Payne Phalen District Council	2/8/2019		a. It would be helpful if these maps were numbered as they are in the previous parts of the document.	Clarification	See proposed revision.	Repeat Figure number in map titles on pages 65-71
92	Name not available	12/24/2018 12:24	Visitor from Fresno, Out of Town California	1. Sidewalks without public safety is not really doing any good by providing sidewalks all over the City of St. Paul. Many elders are afraid to walk because of their concerns for safety. I have visited St. Paul many times and I have asked why my relatives do not go out to walk, their replies have always been, NO SAFETY. Public safety should also be part of this planning.	Other	Comment acknowledged	Revise 1-11 to say "Work with partners to support safe walking environments through initiatives like Crime Prevention through Environmental Design, lighting improvements, neighborhood walks, and trash cleanup."
171	District 1 Community Council	2/4/2019		We support sidewalks for every part of Saint Paul but we believe we have a higher percentage of streets without sidewalks. The southern side of Suburban should be one of the highest priority sidewalks in the district. The semi-rural and suburban-style developments of the southern part of our district are way under-sidewalked and there's probably push-back from folks complaining about how they feel the right of way is theirs to use. It isn't! A non-car based city must have sidewalks. Some of these areas are 3-6 miles from downtown and yet they're still treated as either second-class parts of the city or like a suburb, even where there are multi-unit dwellings and high residential density.	Sidewalks	Comment acknowledged.	Revise list of priority sidewalk gaps to include Suburban
172	North End Neighborhood Organization	2/5/2019		Although the SPPP shows some transparency in the lengthy descriptions of the development of the High Priority Areas for Walking Investments, the SPPP fails to explain in any significant detail how the "constructability" of projects were determined, devoting only a few sentences in the last appendix (Appendix D): "The constructability rating was assigned by Saint Paul Public Works staff based on general estimates of existing conditions such as right-of-way availability and current conditions within the right-of-way like slopes, trees, railways and utility structures that impact construction costs. Constructability ratings range from 1 to 5, with gaps rated 1 as the easiest to construct and gaps rated 5 as having the most design constraints." (SPPP, page 84) The SPPP continues to place the North End's pedestrian network as a lower priority to other areas because of an opaque "constructability" determination by nameless "city staff." By burying this "rating" in the furthest appendix and using two sentences to describe the process, the authors of the SPPP have effectively hidden their plans behind the seemingly transparent public outreach and analysis. More disturbing is that this "rating" is buried in the last appendix within the SPPP and was not presented to the NENO Board or North End residents during the City's public presentation during the November NENO board meeting. The "constructability rating" continues to reinforce the city's historic lack of investment in the North End's sidewalks and justifies it by summarily indicating that low hanging fruit (short distances with simple solutions) should be picked first. The problem with picking low hanging fruit is that the SPPP will continue to put off the needs of the North End while improving other areas simply because the North End has unique challenges. If funding or political will dries up, the North End will have no improvements, and continued lack of investment puts North End residents in worse shape than other parts of the city that have better connected sidewalk networks. To ensure full transparency, NENO requests a direct and public response from the SPPP steering committee and project team addressing how the final SPPP will not repeat the City's historic failures of avoiding building sidewalks in the North End, to include a complete and transparent accounting of the process behind the "constructability" determination, to include rubrics, scoring guidelines, and results. NENO requests that the rubrics, if they exist, and any other decision making aids and scoring of the "constructability" determination of specific projects be made public, attached to the SPPP, and presented and explained in the body of the SPPP in the same or greater detail than the current GIS analysis.	Sidewalks	Comment acknowledged	Revise pages 83-91 to clarify that no sidewalk infill projects are proposed as part of the plan. The plan identifies sidewalk gaps in high priority locations and potential program options for delivery of these sidewalks should funding be made available.
173	Payne Phalen District Council	2/8/2019		f. For the map of clusters identified on page 71, is there and anticipated time table for when and in what order each of these will be addressed?	Sidewalks	See proposed revision.	Revise pages 83-91 to clarify that no sidewalk infill projects are proposed as part of the plan. The plan identifies sidewalk gaps in high priority locations and potential program options for delivery of these sidewalks should funding be made available.

177	District 1 Community Council		2/4/2019			Page 40: There are few sidewalks in some of the south part of our district, and yet it didn't make it on the list of "stand alone" suggested projects.	Sidewalks	The methodology to determine High Priority Areas for Walking Investment included measures of equity, safety, connectivity, health, density, transit use, and destinations. Details on the methodology are available at: https://www.stpaul.gov/sites/default/files/Media%20Root/Public%20Works/Prioritization%20Methodology%2011.5.18_reduced.pdf	Revise pages 83-91 to clarify that no sidewalk infill projects are proposed as part of the plan. The plan identifies sidewalk gaps in high priority locations and potential program options for delivery of these sidewalks should funding be made available.
42	Patricia Teiken	inside Ward 5	2/8/2019 11:00	Patricia Teiken	1672 Macubin Street	We are opposed to being forced to add sidewalks to all of the properties in our association. Cohansey Street is a quiet cul-de-sac; the properties on Mackubin have the Elmhurst Cemetery across the street which is gated with a locked entry that is rarely open to Mackubin. The sidewalk placement will most likely interfere with buried utilities and mature landscape. According to your documentation, property owners will bear the cost of this project.	Sidewalks	The Draft Pedestrian Plan identifies locations where sidewalk gaps exist and areas of the city that are identified as high priority areas for walking investments. The plan does not propose specific projects for sidewalk infill; it prioritizes locations for projects should future funding become available.	Revise pages 83-91 to clarify that no sidewalk infill projects are proposed as part of the plan. The plan identifies sidewalk gaps in high priority locations and potential program options for delivery of these sidewalks should funding be made available. Revise text on pages 37-39 to include recent changes to sidewalk assessment practices.
43	Patricia Teiken	inside Ward 5	2/8/2019 11:00	Patricia Teiken	1672 Macubin Street	It is important for you as a planning commission to fully understand the tax implications for associations, who have strict requirements regarding both operating and reserve budgets UNDER STATE LAW, and the associations governing documents, including the declaration. Any forced payment or cost is in conflict with these documents (in breach of the legal documents), as they do not allow for anything to be spent outside of budgeted operating costs, reserves for replacement of EXISTING common area infrastructure or owner dwellings and require a vote of a majority of owners to pass any other type of assessment to pay for anything the association may be tasked with from the city to pay. This can be problematic and push associations in a corner with how to pay. If the recent trash change is any reflection of how this project will be administered, our membership has little faith there will not be major issues connected with this project.	Sidewalks	The Draft Pedestrian Plan identifies locations where sidewalk gaps exist and areas of the city that are identified as high priority areas for walking investments. The plan does not propose specific projects for sidewalk infill; it identifies potential locations for projects should future funding become available.	Revise pages 83-91 to clarify that no sidewalk infill projects are proposed as part of the plan. The plan identifies sidewalk gaps in high priority locations and potential program options for delivery of these sidewalks should funding be made available. Revise text on pages 37-39 to include recent changes to sidewalk assessment practices.
45	Margaret Kaplan	inside Ward 2	2/7/2019 12:58	Margaret Kaplan	382 Banfil Street	First, I want to commend the city for this work. Pedestrian safety is so important and it is something that we can make real progress on. Overall I think that the plan is a great start. My only concern is that under this plan critical traffic calming and pedestrian safety issues on W7th will not be undertaken in the near term. The traffic volume on 7th is very high, very fast, and not all all attentive to pedestrians. I understand that the city has to prioritize and start somewhere and the high priority areas identified make a lot of sense. I am wondering, however, if there is a way to include some of the major arterial roads like W7th that have documented pedestrian safety issues along with the more clustered high priority neighborhoods. Thank you for this important work and the opportunity to comment.	Priority Areas	Action 1-5 "Establish a consistent process for reviewing, improving and prioritizing pedestrian crossings." The draft plan does not identify or prioritize specific intersections for treatment. However, all requests for pedestrian improvements will be evaluated in a consistent way by Public Works as a result of this action item.	Revise paragraph on page 25: "This prioritization does not mean that the city will not work to address walking needs in low and medium priority areas. Pedestrian improvements will be considered in all areas of the city in conjunction with street projects and site redevelopment projects, or in response to measured use by pedestrians. Should additional funding become available through external grants or budget increases, the map provides a framework for identifying where walking investments are likely to have the greatest impact on advancing equity and safety goals."
48	Pat Thompson	inside Ward 4	2/8/2019 13:47	Pat Thompson	1496 Raymond Avenue, Saint Paul, MN 55108	North St. Anthony Park is generally marked in the plan as a medium-priority area for walking investment, and I agree with that with one exception. On Eustis Street, south of Como, there are no sidewalks on either side. This is where traffic from the 280 ramps enters and exits. A few blocks south on Eustis are several apartment buildings. It is very common to see people walking this stretch in the street and it's very unsafe. Eustis is the only connection to two bus routes that run along Como, plus the HealthPartners Clinic and the only walking route to Minneapolis and Lauderdale. The land on either side of Eustis is owned by MnDOT and St. Paul Public Schools, mostly. It's going to take some kind priority for this lack of sidewalks to ever change.	Priority Areas	Comment acknowledged.	Revise paragraph on page 25: "This prioritization does not mean that the city will not work to address walking needs in low and medium priority areas. Pedestrian improvements will be considered in all areas of the city in conjunction with street projects and site redevelopment projects, or in response to measurable use by pedestrians. Should additional funding become available through external grants or budget increases, the map provides a framework for identifying where walking investments are likely to have the greatest impact on advancing equity and safety goals."

47	Pat Thompson	inside Ward 4	2/8/2019 13:47	Pat Thompson	1496 Raymond Avenue, Saint Paul, MN 55108	On page 90 and on the map on page 71, the plan refers to Lower St. Anthony Park. Please correct that name to South St. Anthony Park.	Clarification	See proposed revision.	Revise text and labels on pages 71 and 90 from Lower St. Anthony Park to South St. Anthony Park.
50	Sarah Thompson	inside Ward 6	2/11/2019 12:10	Sarah Thompson	2018 Hawthorne Avenue E	This is the first I've heard of this plan and I've been a Saint Paul resident for 13 years. I have no idea who you surveyed but it wasn't me because I've never heard of this before. I wish the city council and the mayor would remind themselves on a daily basis that their budget comes directly out of the pockets of hardworking property owners in this city. As I read this proposal, all I could see is dollar signs. It is quite a frustrating system we have in place with property assessments going to property owners for improvements that we didn't ask for and for which we have no say in the quality of the work done. Then we foot the bill for whatever new whim the city council has now. It's inexplicable to me that "improvements" don't come out of regular property taxes but instead are passed along to homeowners as additional fees (assessments), which we get very little advanced notice of, so it's not as if you can even budget ahead of time. How about spending more time/money on actually using salt to reduce ice on side streets on the east side. My street is icy all winter. It is only plowed if a snow emergency is declared. People routinely skid through the stop sign by my house. In November a car that skidded through it totaled my car and did \$13,000 in damage to my garage. Since they drove away it's now my responsibility. But your plan is to enforce ice removal on sidewalks?! It's just a bit disingenuous for a city that does a terrible job at removing ice/snow on the streets to fine property owners for doing the same on the sidewalks you force us to have and pay for in the first place. How about lead by example. If you do a better job on the streets and learn how to live within a budget instead of treating property owners like your own personal piggy bank, perhaps the responsible people that will actually clear their sidewalks without fines & repercussions will stop fleeing Saint Paul for the suburbs.	Snow and ice	The city's property assessment practices for sidewalks have changed since the release of the draft plan and text will be updated accordingly. Street plowing practices are beyond the scope of this plan.	Revise text on page 37-38 to reflect changing policies on property owner assessments. As of 2019, the city does not issue assessments to property owners for sidewalks unless property owners agree to the assessment.
174	Payne Phalen District Council		2/8/2019			For the third goal, "Get it done..." we applaud the intention and strong purpose in this statement. Please consider adding St. Paul's Community Councils to the list in the statement about parties for coordinating activities.	Other	See proposed revision.	Revise text on page 4, 16 and 79 to emphasize importance of partner collaboration
175	Payne Phalen District Council		2/8/2019			For the second goal, "connect vibrant communities..." we encourage you to consider that while a strong pedestrian circulation system connects vibrant communities, it is also critical for strengthening communities that are not yet so vibrant or may have lost some of their vibrancy over the last forty or fifty years of the automobile era. In other words, a well-designed pedestrian system is very much a part of bringing forth revitalization of places that exist now as well as those places that are envisioned in the city's future but are not yet developed or built.	Clarification	See proposed revision.	Revise text on pages 4 and 15 to imply that walking brings vibrancy, rather than assuming it exists
176	Payne Phalen District Council		2/8/2019			c. Based on their respective titles, it's not clear what the difference is between the map on page 69 and the one on page 70.	Clarification	See proposed revision.	Revise title of map on page 70