CITY OF SAINT PAUL
HERITAGE PRESERVATION COMMISSION STAFF REPORT

ADDRESS: 466 Iglehart
APPLICANT: Habitat for Humanity; Mari Ojeda
DATE OF APPLICATION REVIEW: February 10, 2020
HPC DISTRICT: Historic Hill Heritage Preservation District
PERIOD OF SIGNIFICANCE: 1858-1930
CATEGORY: Vacant Lot **WARDS:** 1 **DISTRICT COUNCIL:** 8
CLASSIFICATION: Infill Construction Review
STAFF INVESTIGATION AND REPORT: George Gause

A. SITE DESCRIPTION: Vacant lot.

B. BACKGROUND:
In 2012, the house at 466 Iglehart Avenue was demolished. It was a two and one-half story, wood-frame residence in a Queen Anne rectilinear style constructed in 1905 for use as a duplex. The house was moved across the street from 455 Iglehart Avenue to 466 Iglehart Avenue in the late 1970's. According to City files, the structure was vacant building since 2005. An Order to Abate a Nuisance Building was posted on March 2012. The property had $13,200 in delinquent taxes. The owner never came forward to address the issues, taxes or repair orders. City Code Enforcement Officers estimate the cost to repair the structure would exceed $100,000. The estimated cost to demolish was $15,000.

HPC held a Public Hearing on June 14, 2012 regarding the demolition and recommended denial and alternatives be sought to reuse and rehabilitate the property. The City Council declined the HPC recommendation and ordered the building removed.

C. PROPOSED PROJECT: Construct a two and a half-story residential single-family residence with detached two-car garage. It will be sided with LP Smartside with a 4" reveal, asphalt roofing and Andersen vinyl windows.

D. STAFF COMMENTS:
This is a transition area from smaller to larger homes that has seen demolition and affects from the nearby construction of an interstate. Almost all of the structures on the north side of Iglehart Avenue are new construction built in the early 1980's. Typical form in the area is gable (65%) and hip (35%) roof forms, full front porches (65%), clapboard siding (89%) and two-story (48%) two and a half-story (41%) and three-story (11%).

The Commission had several concerns with the structure design during the pre-app meeting held in January. Habitat for Humanity has worked to address these comments. Siding has been changed from "cedar texture" to 4" reveal smooth. Foundation height has been increased, porch will sit at 30" above grade which is similar to nearby structures. Roof pitch has been increased to 9/12. Windows have been redesigned and a front gable has been added which is compatible with the area structures. The proposed structure falls within the established forms and materials found in this area of the district.

E. PRESERVATION PROGRAM CITATIONS:
Historic Hill Heritage Preservation District Legislative Code Sec. 74-65.

PRESERVATION PROGRAM CITATIONS	MEETS?	COMMENTS:
Historic Hill New Construction Guidelines		
74.65(f)(1) Setback*. New buildings should be sited at a distance not more than five (5) percent out-of-line from the setback of existing adjacent buildings.*	Yes	Proposed structure will be in the established setback line of the other buildings on the street.

***74.65(b)Massing and Height**: New construction should conform to the massing, volume, height and scale of existing adjacent structures. Typical residential structures in the Historic Hill District are twenty-five (25) to forty (40) feet high. The height of new construction should be no lower than the average height of all buildings on both block faces*	Yes	With the increase in roof pitch and foundation level the structure massing and height will correspond to area structures.
***74.65(e)(1)(a)Roofs**: There is a great variety of roof treatment in the Historic Hill District, but gable and hip roofs are most common. The skyline or profile of new construction should relate to the predominant roof shape of existing adjacent buildings.* ***74.65(e)(2)(b) Roofs:** Most houses in the Historic Hill District have a roof pitch of between 9:12 and 12:12 (rise-to-run ratio). A roof pitch of at least 8:12 should be used if it is somewhat visible from the street, and a 6:12 pitch may be acceptable in some cases for structures which are not visible from the street.*	Yes	Roof has been changed to a 9/12 pitch hip with a front façade gable which corresponds to this area of the neighborhood.
***74.65(d)(1) Material and Details**: Variety in the use of architectural materials and details adds to the intimacy and visual delight of the district. But there is also an overall thread of continuity provided by the range of materials commonly used by turn-of-the-century builders and by the way these materials were used. The materials and details of new construction should relate to the materials and details of existing nearby buildings.*	Yes	Siding has been changed to a 4" reveal which has precedent with contributing structures. Siding will be smooth.
***74.65(e)(2)(a) Windows and doors**: The proportion, size, rhythm and detailing of windows and doors in new construction should be compatible with that of existing adjacent buildings. Facade openings of the same general size as those in adjacent buildings are encouraged.*	Yes	Window design has been changed from paired to single windows matching typical area design.
***74.65(e)(3)(a) Porches and decks**: In general, houses in the Historic Hill District have roofed front porches. The porch treatment of new structures should relate to the porch treatment of existing adjacent structure.*	Yes	A basic full front porch that corresponds to area style is proposed.

F. STAFF RECOMMENDATIONS

Based on the draft resolution findings and 11 conditions, staff recommends approval of construction of the new single family residential structure with a detached two-car garage.

G. SUGGESTED MOTION:

I move to adopt the draft resolution which approves construction of the new single family residential structure with a detached two-car garage at 466 Iglehart Avenue as per the findings of fact, presented testimony, submitted documentation and information provided in the staff report.

- End -

CITY OF SAINT PAUL

HERITAGE PRESERVATION COMMISSION RESOLUTION

ADDRESS 466 Iglehart Avenue

DATE: February 10, 2020

Memorializing the Saint Paul Heritage Preservation Commission's February 10, 2020 decision approving the construction of a single family residential structure with detached two-car garage on the vacant lot at 466 Iglehart Avenue.

1. On April 2, 1991, the most recent expansion of the Historic Hill Heritage Preservation District was established under Ordinance No. 17815, § 3(II), reflecting today's boundaries. The Heritage Preservation Commission shall protect the architectural character of heritage preservation sites through review and authorization or denial of applications for city permits for exterior work within designated heritage preservation sites §73.04.(4).The new construction will conform to the massing, volume, height, facade proportions and scale of existing surrounding accessory structures.
2. The construction of a single family residential structure and detached two-car garage on the vacant lot at 466 Iglehart Avenue will not adversely affect the Program for the Preservation and architectural control of the Historic Hill Heritage District **[§73.06 (e)]** so long as the conditions are met.

DRAFT

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED, the Heritage Preservation Commission approves the construction of a single family residential structure with detached two-car garage at 466 Iglehart Avenue, subject to the following conditions:

1. Siding material to be smooth and free of knots, rough, unfinished appearance and other imperfections.

2. Any exposed concrete shall have a smooth finish, void of aggregate. Finish may include a light, one directional, broom finish.

3. Window and door glass shall be clear void of tint, color, or reflection.

4. Any metal, including flashing, valleys or drip edge, shall have a dark finish not glossy/shiny or a material that will achieve a dark patina within 24 months.

5. Roof material to be asphalt shingles installed in a traditional pattern.

6. Any venting shall be dark and have a low profile. Installation of venting is preferred on the non-visible portion of the roof.

7. Approval is written in conjunction with and referencing submitted application and approved plans. Conditions of this approval MAY supersede any contradictory notes or schedules found on project description or drawings. This approval is VOID if the approved description or plans are altered from the submitted application.

8. Work to be accomplished in accordance with submitted application and plans. Any deviation from is to be submitted to staff prior to construction.

9. All measurements and relationships of existing conditions and new construction shall be field checked for accuracy with submitted plans at the responsibility of the applicant. Inaccuracies or differences should be reported to LPC staff prior to commencement.

10. Work to be accomplished in accordance with all applicable zoning regulations and building codes, or Board of Zoning Appeals decision. This approval does <u>not</u> constitute or recommend a hardship for purposes of zoning review.

11. Further permits and approvals may be required. This approval signifies review and issuance based on the Heritage Preservation regulations and guidelines. No other city, state, or federal review and approval should be assumed or implied by this approval.

MOVED BY:

SECONDED BY:

IN FAVOR

AGAINST

ABSTAIN

Decisions of the Heritage Preservation Commission are final, subject to appeal to the City Council within 14 days by anyone affected by the decision. This resolution does not obviate the need for meeting applicable building and zoning code requirements, and does not constitute approval for tax credits.