CITY OF SAINT PAUL HERITAGE PRESERVATION COMMISSION STAFF REPORT

FILE NAME: 539 Holly Avenue – Parisons House APPLICANT: Todd Johnson, owner **OWNER:** Todd Johnson **ARCHITECT:** Randy Stramel DATE OF APPLICATION: February 13, 2017 DATE OF PUBLIC HEARING: March 23, 2017 HPC SITE/DISTRICT: Historic Hill Heritage Preservation District **CATEGORY:** Contributing **WARD:** 1 **DISTRICT COUNCIL: 8 INVENTORY NUMBER: RA-SPC-6977 CLASSIFICATION:** Building Permit PERIOD OF SIGNIFICANCE: 1858-1930 BUILDING PERMIT #: N/A STAFF INVESTIGATION AND REPORT: Allison Suhan DATE OF REPORT: March 17, 2017

A. SITE DESCRIPTION: The Mr. and Mrs. Parisons house is a two story stick-style residence constructed circa 1880 in an irregular plan with a course limestone foundation and two intersecting gabled roofs. The front façade features a two story oriel window projection on the front left bay with sawtooth detailing. An "L" shaped enclosed front porch has a separate truncated roof and length extends from the entry door on right to halfway of the east façade.

B. PROPOSED CHANGES: The applicant proposes to demolish the two early rear additions (built before 1926) and build a new addition with a 30' x 28' footprint that will relate to the original style of the house. It will be constructed using split-faced concrete block for the foundation, 4" James Hardie smooth fiber cement siding, wood Jeld-Wen double hung windows with matching wood storms. The existing front half of the home will also receive Hardie Board fiber cement siding and new Jeld-Wen double hung windows and matching wood storms. The foundation will also be tuckpointed. The altered, nonoriginal front porch is also proposed to be demolished and be rebuilt as an open porch with a similar footprint with a wood floor, wood railings, wood stairs, and wood beadboard ceiling. The existing trim of the house will be reused where possible and install new matching trim where needed. All exterior detailing on the front facade will be saved and repaired or replaced in kind if necessary. The stick-style detailing that is outlined through shadow lines will be milled to match the existing dimensions. A new roof will also be installed using Owens Corning Tru-Definition Duration Architectural shingles and half round gutters will be installed and hung by straps with downspouts coming off of the side (non-primary) elevations. An air conditioning unit will also be installed on the west side yard, be connected through the new addition foundation, and be screened by landscaping.

Agenda Item IV.B. File # 17-009 **C. BACKGROUND:** The applicant received approval for exploratory demo of the asbestos siding and while wood siding was uncovered as well as some architectural details and shadow lines, extensive water damage was also uncovered (HPC File #16-052359). Staff has met with the applicant on site twice and in PED twice to discuss the project and provide guidance in the application process.

D. GUIDELINE CITATIONS:

Hill Historic District Design Review Guidelines

Sec. 74.64. - Restoration and rehabilitation.

(a) *General Principles:* The Historic Hill District design guidelines for restoration and rehabilitation are based on the ten (10) standards for rehabilitation developed by the National Park Service, United States Department of the Interior. In addition to the standards themselves, the pamphlet contains examples of recommended approaches to rehabilitation. The ten (10) standards are as follows:

(1) Every reasonable effort shall be made to provide a compatible use for a property which requires minimal alteration of the building, structure, or site and its environment, or to use a property for its originally intended purpose.

(2) The distinguishing original qualities or character of a building, structure, or site and its environment shall not be destroyed. The removal or alteration of any historic material or distinctive architectural features should be avoided when possible.

(3) All buildings, structures and sites shall be recognized as products of their own time. Alterations that have no historical basis and which seek to create an earlier appearance shall be discouraged.

(4) Changes which may have taken place in the course of time are evidence of the history and development of a building, structure, or site and its environment. These changes may have acquired significance in their own right and this significance shall be recognized and respected.

(5) Distinctive stylistic features or examples of skilled craftsmanship which characterize a building, structure or site shall be treated with sensitivity.

(6) Deteriorated architectural features shall be repaired rather than replaced, whenever possible. In the event replacement is necessary, the new material should match the material being replaced in composition, design, color, texture and other visual qualities. Repair or replacement of missing architectural features should be based on accurate duplications of features, substantiated by historic, physical or pictorial evidence rather than on conjectural designs or the availability of different architectural elements from other buildings or structures.

(7) The surface cleaning of structures shall be undertaken with the gentlest means possible. Sandblasting and other cleaning methods that will damage the historic building materials shall not be undertaken.

(8) Every reasonable effort shall be made to protect and preserve archaeological resources affected by or adjacent to any project.

(9) Contemporary design for alterations and additions to existing properties shall not be discouraged when such alterations and additions do not destroy significant historical, architectural or cultural material, and such design is compatible with the size, scale, color, material and character of the property, neighborhood or environment.

(10) Wherever possible, new additions or alterations to structures shall be done in such a manner that if such alterations were to be removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the structure would be unimpaired.

(b) Masonry and Foundations:

(1) Whenever possible, original masonry and mortar should be retained without the application of any surface treatment. Masonry should be cleaned only when necessary to halt deterioration and always with the gentlest method possible, such as low-pressure water and soft natural bristle brushes. Brick and stone surfaces should not be sandblasted because it erodes the surface of the material and accelerates deterioration. Chemical cleaning products which could have an adverse chemical reaction with the masonry material should not be used.

(2) Original mortar joint size and profile should be retained and replacement mortar should match the original mortar in color and texture. Materials and ingredient proportions similar to the original mortar should be used when repointing, with replacement mortar softer than the masonry units and no harder than the historic mortar. This will create a bond similar to the original and is necessary to prevent damage to the masonry units. Repointing with mortar of high portland cement content often creates a bond stronger than is appropriate for the original building materials, possibly resulting in cracking or other damage. Mortar joints should be carefully washed after setup to retain the neatness of the joint lines and keep extraneous mortar off of masonry surfaces.

(3) The original color and texture of masonry surfaces should be retained. While unpainted masonry surfaces should not be painted, paint should not be indiscriminately removed from masonry surfaces because some brick surfaces were originally meant to be painted.

(c) Siding and Surface Treatment:

(1) Deteriorated siding materials should be replaced with material used in original construction or with materials that resemble the appearance of the old as closely as possible. Resurfacing frame buildings with new material such as artificial stone, artificial brick veneer, or asbestos and asphalt shingles is inappropriate and should not be done. Four-inch lap vinyl, metal or hardboard siding may be used in some cases to resurface clapboard structures, especially structures categorized as noncontributive to the district, if well detailed, well designed and in keeping with the historic character of the structure. Ventilation must be carefully provided when using these products to prevent damage to the original wood fabric by trapping moisture. The width, pattern and profile of the original siding should be duplicated. Residing should not alter the profile of bordering trim such as drip caps, frieze boards and corner boards; if replacement is necessary, they should be matched.

(2) Color is a significant design element and paint colors should be appropriate to the period and style of the structure. Building permits are not required for painting and, although the heritage preservation commission may review and comment on paint color, paint color is not subject to commission approval.

(d) Roofs:

(1) Original roofing materials should be retained unless deteriorated. When partially reroofing, deteriorated roof coverings should be replaced with new materials that match the old in composition, size, shape and texture. When entirely reroofing, new materials which differ to such an extent from the old in composition, size, shape, color or texture that the appearance of the building is altered should not be used.

(2) Wood shingles in the nineteenth century were often dipped in creosote to preserve them, giving them a very dark brown color. Victorians often stained wood shingles deep red or dark green to complement rather than match the color of the house. When asphalt shingles began to be used in the 1890's, the most common colors were solid, uniform, deep red and solid, uniform, dark green. A weathered-wood color may be acceptable for new asphalt shingles because it is neutral and blends in. Black may be acceptable for Colonial Revival houses built after the 1920's, but it should be avoided for Victorian houses.

(3) The original roof type, slope and overhangs should be preserved. New dormers may be acceptable in some cases if compatible with the original design. Modern skylights are a simple way to alter a roof to admit light and air without disrupting its plane surface, are less noticeable than dormers, and may also be acceptable. Skylights should be flat and as close to the roof plane as possible. They should not be placed on the front roof plane.

(e) Windows and Doors:

(1) Existing window and door openings should be retained. New window and door openings should not be introduced into principal elevations. Enlarging or reducing window or door openings to fit stock window sash or new stock door sizes should not be done. The size of window panes or sash should not be altered. Such changes destroy the scale and proportion of the building.

(2) Window sash, glass, lintels, sills, architraves, doors, pediments, hoods, steps and all hardware should be retained. Discarding original doors and door hardware, when they can be repaired and reused in place, should be avoided.

(3) The stylistic period(s) a building represents should be respected. If replacement of window sash or doors is necessary, the replacement should duplicate the material, design and hardware of the older window sash or door. Inappropriate new window and door features such as aluminum storm and screen window combinations, plastic or metal strip awnings, or fake shutters that disturb the character and appearance of the building should not be used. Combination storm windows should have wood frames or be painted to match trim colors.

(f) Porches and Exterior Architectural Features:

(1) Porches and steps which are appropriate to the building and its development should be retained. Porches and additions reflecting later styles of architecture are often important to the building's historical integrity and, whenever possible, should be retained. Porches and steps removed from the building should be reconstructed, using photographic documentation and historical research, to be compatible in design and detail with the period and style of the building. In replacing porch railings, it is important to maintain the original spacing, section and profile of the balustrades.

(2) Decorative architectural features such as cornices, brackets, railings, and those around front doors and windows should be preserved. New material used to repair or replace, where necessary, deteriorated architectural features of wood, iron, cast iron, terracotta, tile and brick should match the original as closely as possible.

(3) Shutters should not be used on buildings not designed for them. If used, they should be large enough to cover the entire window area, should be functional and operable, and should not look as if they were simply flat-mounted on the wall.

(4) Deck and firestair additions may be acceptable in some cases, but should be kept to the rear of buildings where they will be the most inconspicuous and detract the least from the historical context. The detailing of decks and exterior stairs should be compatible with the period and style of the building.

(Ord. No. 17815, § 3(II) 4-2-91)

Sec. 74.65. - New construction.

(a) *General Principles:* The basic principle for new construction in the Historic Hill District is to maintain the district's scale and quality of design. The Historic Hill District is architecturally diverse within an overall pattern of harmony and continuity. These guidelines for new construction focus on general rather than specific design elements in order to encourage architectural innovation and quality design while maintaining the harmony and continuity of the district. New construction should be compatible with the size, scale, massing, height, rhythm, setback, color, material, building elements, site design, and character of surrounding structures and the area.

(b) *Massing and Height:* New construction should conform to the massing, volume, height and scale of existing adjacent structures. Typical residential structures in the Historic Hill District are twenty-five (25) to forty (40) feet high. The height of new construction should be no lower than the average height of all buildings on both block faces; measurements should be made from street level to the highest point of the roofs. (This guideline does not supersede the city's zoning code height limitations.)

(c) *Rhythm and Directional Emphasis:* The existence of uniform narrow lots in the Historic Hill District naturally sets up a strong rhythm of buildings to open space. Historically any structure built on more than one (1) lot used vertical facade elements to maintain and vary the overall rhythm of the street rather than interrupting the rhythm with a long monotonous facade. The directional expression of new construction should relate to that of existing adjacent structures.

(d) Material and Details:

(1) Variety in the use of architectural materials and details adds to the intimacy and visual delight of the district. But there is also an overall thread of continuity provided by the range of materials commonly used by turn-of-the-century builders and by the way these materials were used. This thread of continuity is threatened by the introduction of new industrial materials and the aggressive exposure of earlier materials such as concrete block, metal framing and glass. The purpose of this section is to encourage the proper use of appropriate materials and details.

(2) The materials and details of new construction should relate to the materials and details of existing nearby buildings.

(3) Preferred roof materials are cedar shingles, slate and tile; asphalt shingles which match the approximate color and texture of the preferred materials are acceptable substitutes. Diagonal and vertical siding are generally unacceptable. Imitative materials such as asphalt siding, wood-textured metal or vinyl siding, artificial stone, and artificial brick veneer should not be used. Smooth four-inch lap vinyl, metal or hardboard siding, when well installed and carefully detailed, may be acceptable in some cases. Materials, including their colors, will be reviewed to determine their appropriate use in relation to the overall design of the structure as well as to surrounding structures.

(4) Color is a significant design element, and paint colors should relate to surrounding structures and the area as well as to the style of the new structure. Building permits are not required for painting and, although the heritage preservation commission may review and comment on paint color, paint color is not subject to commission approval.

(e) *Building Elements:* Individual elements of a building should be integrated into its composition for a balanced and complete design. These elements of new instruction should complement existing adjacent structures as well.

(1) Roofs:

a. There is a great variety of roof treatment in the Historic Hill District, but gable and hip roofs are most common. The skyline or profile of new construction should relate to the predominant roof shape of existing adjacent buildings.

b. Most houses in the Historic Hill District have a roof pitch of between 9:12 and 12:12 (rise-to-run ratio). Highly visible secondary structure roofs should match the roof pitch of the main structure, and generally should have a rise-to-run ratio of at least 9:12. A roof pitch of at least 8:12 should be used if it is somewhat visible from the street, and a 6:12 pitch may be acceptable in some cases for structures which are not visible from the street.

c. Roof hardware such as skylights, vents and metal pipe chimneys should not be placed on the front roof plane.

(2) Windows and doors:

a. The proportion, size, rhythm and detailing of windows and doors in new construction should be compatible with that of existing adjacent buildings. Most

windows on the Hill have a vertical orientation, with a proportion of between 2:1 and 3:1 (height to width) common. Individual windows can sometimes be square or horizontal if the rest of building conveys the appropriate directional emphasis. Facade openings of the same general size as those in adjacent buildings are encouraged.

b. Wooden double-hung windows are traditional in the Historic Hill District and should be the first choice when selecting new windows. Paired casement windows, although not historically common, will often prove acceptable because of their vertical orientation. Sliding windows, awning windows, and horizontally oriented muntins are not common in the district and are generally unacceptable. Vertical muntins and muntin grids may be acceptable when compatible with the period and style of the building. Sliding glass doors should not be used where they would be visible from the street.

c. Although not usually improving the appearance of building, the use of metal windows or doors need not necessarily ruin it. The important thing is that they should look like part of the building and not like raw metal appliances. Appropriately colored or bronze-toned aluminum is acceptable. Mill finish (silver) aluminum should be avoided.

(3) Porches and decks:

a. In general, houses in the Historic Hill District have roofed front porches, while in most modern construction the front porch has disappeared. Front porches provide a transitional zone between open and closed space which unites a building and its site, semiprivate spaces which help to define the spatial hierarchy of the district. They are a consistent visual element in the district and often introduce rhythmic variation, clarify scale or provide vertical facade elements. The porch treatment of new structures should relate to the porch treatment of existing adjacent structure. If a porch is not built, the transition from private to public space should be articulated with some other suitable design element.

b. Open porches are preferable, but screened or glassed-in porches may be acceptable if well detailed. Most, but not all, porches on the Hill are one (1) story high. Along some streets where a strong continuity of porch size or porch roof line exists, it may be preferable to duplicate these formal elements in new construction. The vertical elements supporting the porch roof are important. They should carry the visual as well as the actual weight of the porch roof. The spacing of new balustrades should reflect the solid-to-void relationships of adjacent railings and porches. Generally, a solid-to-void proportion between 1:2 and 1:3 is common in the Historic Hill.

c. Decks should be kept to the rear of buildings, should be visually refined, and should be integrated into overall building design. A raised deck protruding from a single wall usually appears disjointed from the total design and is generally unacceptable.

- (f) Site:
 - (1) Setback. New buildings should be sited at a distance not more than five (5)

percent out-of-line from the setback of existing adjacent buildings. Setbacks greater than those of adjacent buildings may be allowed in some cases. Reduced setbacks may be acceptable at corners. This happens quite often in the Historic Hill area and can lend delightful variation to the street.

(2) Landscaping:

a. Typically, open space in the Historic Hill District is divided into public, semipublic, semiprivate and private space. The public space of the street and sidewalk is often distinguished from the semipublic space of the front yard by a change in grade, a low hedge or a visually open fence. The buildings, landscaping elements in front yards, and boulevard trees together provide a "wall of enclosure" for the street "room." Generally, landscaping which respects the street as a public room is encouraged. Enclosures which allow visual penetration of semipublic spaces, such as wrought-iron fences, painted picket fences, low hedges or limestone retaining walls, are characteristic of most of the Historic Hill area. This approach to landscaping and fences is encouraged in contrast to complete enclosure of semipublic space by an opaque fence, a tall "weathered wood" fence or tall hedgerows. Cyclone fence should not be used in front yards or in the front half of side yards. Landscape timber should not be used for retaining walls in front yards.

b. For the intimate space of a shallow setback, ground covers and low shrubs will provide more visual interest and require less maintenance than grass. When lots are left vacant as green space or parking area, a visual hole in the street "wall" may result. Landscape treatment can eliminate this potential problem by providing a wall of enclosure for the street. Boulevard trees mark a separation between the automobile corridor and the rest of the streetscape and should be maintained.

- (3) Garages and parking:
 - a. If an alley is adjacent to the dwelling, any new garage should be located off the alley. Where alleys do not exist, garages facing the street or driveway curb cuts may be acceptable. Garage doors should not face the street. If this is found necessary, single garage doors should be used to avoid the horizontal orientation of two-car garage doors.
 - b. Parking spaces should not be located in front yards. Residential parking spaces should be located in rear yards. Parking lots for commercial uses should be to the side or rear of commercial structures and have a minimum number of curb cuts. All parking spaces should be adequately screened from the street and sidewalk by landscaping. The scale of parking lots should be minimized and the visual sweep of pavement should be broken up by use of planted areas. The scale, level of light output and design of parking lot lighting should be compatible with the character of the district.
- (g) Public infrastructure:
 - (1) The traditional pattern of public streets, curbs, boulevards and sidewalks in the area should be maintained. Distinctive features of public spaces in the area such

as brick alleys, stone slab sidewalks, granite curbs and the early twentieth century lantern-style street lights should be preserved. The same style should be used when new street lights are installed. New street furniture such as benches, bus shelters, telephone booths, kiosks, sign standards, trash containers, planters and fences should be compatible with the character of the district.

(2) Brick alleys and stone slab sidewalks generally should be maintained and repaired as necessary with original materials; asphalt and concrete patches should not be used. When concrete tile public sidewalks need to be replaced, new poured concrete sidewalks should be the same width as the existing sidewalks and should be scored in a two-foot square or 18-inch square pattern to resemble the old tiles; expansion joints should match the scoring. Handicap ramps should be installed on the inside of curbs as part of the poured concrete sidewalk; where there is granite curbing, a section should be lowered for the ramp.

(3) Electric, telephone and cable TV lines should be placed underground or along alleys, and meters should be placed where inconspicuous.

(Ord. No. 17815, § 3(III), 4-2-91)

E. FINDINGS:

1. On April 2, 1991, the most recent expansion of the Historic Hill Heritage Preservation District was established under Ordinance No. 17815, § 3(II), reflecting today's boundaries. The Heritage Preservation Commission shall protect the architectural character of heritage preservation sites through review and approval or denial of applications for city permits for exterior work within designated heritage preservation sites §73.04.(4).

2. The Mr. and Mrs. Parisons house was constructed circa 1880 and is contributing to the Historic Hill Heritage Preservation District.

3. Sec. 74.64 Restoration and Rehabilitation (a) General Principles: While the new addition requires the removal of two rear additions, it will not destroy significant historical, architectural or cultural material, and is compatible with the size, scale, color, material and character of the property. The new addition will also have a 1' 6" reveal between the existing house and new addition to delineate the historic from the new. Deteriorated architectural features are proposed to be repaired where possible and where necessary, new will be installed to match the existing, complying with the guideline. The stick-style detailing proposed on the front façade is substantiated by physical evidence through the exposure of the shadow lines after the asbestos siding was removed.

4. Sec. 74.64 (b) *Masonry and Foundations:* The limestone foundation will be tuckpointed to *match the original mortar in color and texture.* Mortar specifications were not provided with the application, but will need to be no stronger than Type N.

5. Sec. 74.64 (c) *Siding and Surface Treatment:* After careful exploratory demo of the asbestos siding and evaluation of the remaining wood siding, it was determined that the water damage and condition of the 4" lap wood siding is too severe to be repaired. The

house is proposed to be resided in James Hardie 4" smooth fiber cement siding that will match the *width, pattern, and profile of* the wood siding and will not *alter the profile of bordering trim*

6. Sec. 74.64 (d) *Roofs:*. The proposed Owens Corning architectural asphalt shingles in Estate Gray comply with the guideline and the *original roof slope and overhangs* will be preserved.

7. Sec. 74.64 (e) *Windows and Doors:* The historic windows show many areas of rot and deterioration. While a repair estimate was not provided, the proposed new Jeld-Wen custom double-hung all wood exterior windows with custom built wooden storms *duplicate the material* and *design of the older window sash* and will not *enlarge or reduce window openings*. The existing historic window trim will be reused.

The proposed front door is Jeld-Wen Custom wood door model 444 with ½ view single pane glass and complies with the guideline. It will have an operable, double-paned, 2-lite, awning wood transom above.

8. Sec. 74.64 (f) Porches and Exterior Architectural Features: The existing enclosed front porch is proposed to be demolished and a new porch will be constructed. While the footprint of the new porch is larger than what is shown in the 1925 Sanborn Fire Insurance Map, the existing porch proposed to be demolished is also larger than the historic porch's footprint and the new porch will better relate to the house and surrounding residential buildings. The new porch design does not match the footprint of the historic porch, but the increased footprint will not adversely impact the building as the design elements are compatible with those of the historic home.

Decorative architectural features around the windows will be preserved. New material used to repair or replace, where necessary, is proposed to match the original as closely as possible, thus complying with the guideline.

9. Sec. 74.65 New Construction (b) Massing and Height: The proposed new addition is similar in massing and volume to the house, and generally conforms to the scale of existing adjacent structures. The proposed height is compatible with that of the neighboring houses, and consistent with the proposed design and roof style.

10.Sec. 74.65 (c) *Rhythm and Directional Emphasis:* The property is located midblock and the rear addition will not have an impact on the block's *rhythm of buildings to open space*. It is also sited behind the main portion of the house.

11.Sec. 74.65 (d) *Materials and Details: Siding and Trim:* The James Hardie 4" smooth fiber cement siding *relates to the materials and details of existing nearby buildings* and will match the dimensions of the existing, damaged, 4" lap wood siding. The fascia, soffit, and trim will match the existing on the house.

12.Sec. 74.65 (d) *Materials and Detail: Roof.* The proposed Owens Corning architectural asphalt shingles in Estate Gray comply with the guidelines for new

construction.

13.Sec. 74.65 (e) (1) Building Elements: Roof. The cross-gabled roof relates to the predominant roof shape of the house and existing adjacent residential buildings.

14. Sec. 74.65 (e) (2) *Building Elements: Doors and Windows.* The guidelines state "Wooden double-hung windows are traditional in the Historic Hill District and should be the first choice when selecting new windows." The Jeld-Wen custom double-hung all wood exterior windows with custom built wood storms complies with the guideline. No mutins are proposed. The windows maintain a vertical orientation, with a proportion of between 2:1 and 3:1.

The back door proposed is a Jeld-Wen Aurora custom fiberglass exterior door style A110 and complies with the guideline.

15.Sec. 74.65 (e) (3) *Building Elements: Porches and Decks.* The proposed rear porch relates to the porch treatment of existing adjacent structures. The vertical elements supporting the porch roof are important. The porch columns carry the visual as well as the actual weight of the porch roof to grade. The wood stairs, skirting, decking, and balustrade all comply with the guideline. The proposed rear porch on the new addition is constructed in a similar style as the proposed reconstructed front porch and complies with the guideline.

16. The foundation for the addition will be a split-faced concrete block veneer that relates to the limestone foundation of the house.

17.Sec. 74.65 (f) (1) *Setback.* The proposed setback of the addition will not exceed the setback of the existing house. The new addition will also have a 1' 6" reveal between the existing house and new addition to delineate the historic from the new.

18.Sec. 74.65 (g) The guideline states, *"electric, telephone and cable TV lines should be placed underground or along alleys, and meters should be placed where inconspicuous."* The air conditioning unit is proposed to be in the rear half of the west side yard and will be screened by plantings and complies with the guideline.

19. The proposal to demolish the rear additions and front porch, construct a new rear addition, construct an open front porch, replace the windows, and reside the house at 539 Holly Avenue will not adversely affect the Program for the Preservation and architectural control of the Historic Hill Heritage Preservation District (Leg. Code §73.06 (e)) so long as the conditions are met.

E. STAFF RECOMMENDATION:

Based on the findings, staff recommends approval of the building permit application with the following conditions:

- 1. The work shall be painted within one year of permit issuance.
- 2. All final materials, colors and details shall be submitted to the HPC and/or staff for final

review and approval.

- 3. Any revisions to the approved plans shall be reviewed and approved by the HPC and/or staff.
- 4. The HPC stamped approved plans shall remain on site for the duration of the project.

F. ATTACHMENTS:

- 1. HPC Design Review Application
- 2. Project Description
- 3. Exterior Product Index
- 4. Plans
- 5. Photos
- 6. Sanborn Map



Saint Paul Heritage Preservation Commission Department of Planning and Economic Development 25 Fourth Street West, Suite 1400 Saint Paul, MN 55102 Phone: (651) 266-9078 ApplyHPC@stpaul.gov

Heritage Preservation Commission Design Review Application

PROCESS

This application must be completed in addition to required city permit applications for individually designated Heritage Preservation Sites and properties located within Heritage Preservation Districts.

Design review applications are reviewed and approved by either heritage preservation staff or the Heritage Preservation Commission (HPC) at a public hearing. HPC staff are authorized to approve work that complies with adopted design review guidelines and preservation programs, available at our website <u>www.stpaul.gov/hpc</u>, while the HPC reviews projects that are significant alterations, demolitions, additions, new construction or proposals that do not comply with HPC guidelines. The decision of whether a proposal may be reviewed and approved by HPC staff or must be reviewed by the HPC at a public hearing is made once a complete application is submitted.

The HPC public hearing schedule is viewable here: https://www.stpaul.gov/departments/planning-economic-development/heritage-preservation/heritage-preservation-commission

A complete application consists of:

- 1) An application form
- 2) Required attachments that adequately describe the proposed work (see attached checklist)

An incomplete application will be put on hold and staff will contact you for additional information. If an application is incomplete for 30 days after it was received, it will be returned to the applicant.

Complete applications will be reviewed in the order they are received. Applications are not entered in queue to be reviewed until staff has determined them to be complete. Once reviewed, a Certificate of Approval will be issued along with any conditions for the proposed work. You will be notified by staff when the Certificate of Approval has been issued and a copy will be sent to the Department of Safety and Inspections (DSI) to complete the HPC process of obtaining the necessary permit(s).

1. CATEGORY		
Please check the category t	hat best describes the propos	ed work
□ Repair/Rehabilitation □ Moving □ Demolition	 New Construction/Addition/ Alteration Pre-Application Review Only 	
2. PROJECT ADDRESS		
Street and number: 539 H	Iolly Avenue	Zip Code: _55102

3. APPLICANT INFORMATION	
Name of contact person: Todd Johnson	
Company: N/A	
Street and number. 539 Holly Avenue	
City: Saint Paul	55102
	todd.r.johnson11@gmail.com
4. PROPERTY OWNER(S) INFORMATION	(If different from applicant)
Name:	(in unicient from appreant)
Street and number	
Citru	
City: State:	Zip Code:
Phone number: e-mail:	
S. TROJECT ARCHITECT (II applicable)	
Contact person:	
Company:	
Street and number:	
City: State:	Zip Code:
Phone number: e-mail:	
6. PROJECT DESCRIPTION	
Completely describe ALL exterior changes being of affected existing exterior features and chan	proposed for the property. Include description
doors, siding, railings, steps, trim, roof, foundation	on or porches. Attach specifications for doors,
Please see attached Word document for do	e, including color and material samples.
information for materials.	scription, material list, and sample
Total Project Value: 150.000	Attach additional sheets if necessary



7. ATTACHMENTS & DESIGN REVIEW CHECKLIST

Please refer to the following checklist section(s) that relate to your proposed scope of work and check next to the items that are attached to your application. Attach all checked items listed to this application or attach in an email to <u>ApplyHPC@stpaul.gov</u>

Staff may contact you for additional information or materials.

If your project or work type is not included in this checklist, please contact the staff by calling 651-266-9078 or sending an e-mail to <u>applyhpc@stpaul.gov</u> for assistance on how to complete an application.

<u>Applicant</u> <u>Submitted</u>	<u>Staff</u> <u>Received</u>	<u>Date</u> <u>Received</u>	
			Restoration /Repair/Rehabilitation
			Three (3) copies of scaled and dimensioned plans which note all materials, finishes, and dimensions on plan (2 copies will be forwarded to the Dept. of Safety and Inspections).
			Photographs of all features and areas affected by proposed work.
			If an existing architectural feature is being replaced, please provide detailed drawings of the existing feature.
			Historic photographs (if any) that inform the restoration/rehabilitation/repair work.
			Sign/Awning:
			Photographs of location of proposed signage on structure/property.
	Π.		Photographs of structure and all exterior sides affected by proposed work.
			Three (3) copies of plans that note materials, dimensions, colors, and method of attachment.
			Section drawing showing point of installation, method of installation, awning profile and projection.
			Illumination plan.
			Photographs or elevation of the building showing location of proposed sign in relation to the building and, if applicable, other signage on the building.
			New Construction/Addition/Exterior Alteration:
\checkmark			Three (3) copies of construction level plans which note all materials, finishes, and dimensions on plan (2 copies will be forwarded to the Dept. of Safety and Inspections). Show how the addition(s) relates to the existing structure.
\checkmark			Photographs of all features and areas affected by proposed work.
\checkmark		-	Site plan showing lot dimensions, location of any existing buildings, and proposed addition(s), elevation plans, section and detail drawings as necessary. All plans must be scaled and dimensioned.
\checkmark			Digital copies of the plans and photos submitted on CD or USB.



<u>Applicant</u> <u>Submitted</u>	<u>Staff</u> <u>Received</u>	<u>Date</u> <u>Received</u>	
			Fencing/Retaining Wall:
			A site plan showing the location of the fence/wall in relation to property lines and any structures with measurements.
			An elevation drawing or photo of the proposed fence/wall.
			Roofing:
\checkmark			Sample or description of existing material(s).
\checkmark			Sample or specifications of proposed material(s).
\checkmark			Sample colors.
\checkmark			Photographs of all exterior sides affected by the proposed work.
			Photographs of the building and roof showing existing conditions of roof, coping, flashing, affected masonry, parapet, siding, existing skylights, and/or dormers. Also include any other critical intersections where the roof meets the historic fabric, and sightline drawings when a change in slope or other potentially visible change is proposed.
			Heating, Ventilating, and Air Conditioning Equipment
\checkmark			Site plan showing location of condenser in relation to the building(s) and property lines.
\checkmark			Photographs of the proposed location of any condensers or venting.
\checkmark			Photographs demonstrating that the proposed unit is not visible from the street.
\checkmark			A screening plan if a condenser is in the side yard.
			Drawing or photograph demonstrating where and how conduit will be attached to the building.
			Window/Sash Replacement:
\checkmark			Statement describing in detail why windows need replacement as well as a description of weatherization efforts and copy of window repair estimates
\checkmark			Existing window design and dimensions.
\checkmark			Proposed window design, dimensions, and manufacturer's specifications including shop drawings.
\checkmark			Existing type of exterior storm windows.
\checkmark			Proposed style of exterior storm windows.
\checkmark			Existing exterior window trim material.
\checkmark			Proposed exterior window trim material and style.
\checkmark			Photographs of all exterior sides where window replacement is being proposed.
\checkmark			Photographs of existing features/conditions which support window replacement proposal.



<u>Applicant</u> <u>Submitted</u>	<u>Staff</u> <u>Received</u>	<u>Date</u> <u>Received</u>	
			Other Items Requested by HPC Staff:
	Will any f Are you a	federal m pplying f	oney be used in this project?YESNOFor the Investment Tax Credits?YESNO
	I, the unde the affecte must be su work will l	rsigned, u d property bmitted by be require	nderstand that the Design Review Application is limited to the aforementioned work to I further understand that any additional exterior work to be done under my ownership y application to the St. Paul Heritage Preservation Commission. Any unauthorized d to be removed.
in the second	Signature Fyped nar	of applic	ant: Date: 3/2/17 licant: Todd Johnson
2	Signature Fyped nan	of owner ne of own	Date: 3/2//7

Send completed application with the necessary attachments to <u>ApplyHPC@stpaul.gov</u> or to:

Saint Paul Heritage Preservation Commission Department of Planning and Economic Development 25 Fourth Street West, Suite 1400 Saint Paul, MN 55102

You may also click the button below to attach the completed application to an email that will go directly to <u>ApplyHPC@stpaul.gov</u>. **Please attach supporting documents to the email** as well.

Submit Application



FOR HPC OFFICE USE ONLY

Address:	539	Holly	Avenue
----------	-----	-------	--------

Date received: _____

Date complete:

District:_____/Individual Site:_____

Pivotal/Contributing/Non-contributing/New Construction/Parcel

□ Requires staff review

Supporting data: YES NO Complete application: YES NO The following condition(s) must be met in order for application to conform to preservation program:

□ Requires Commission review

Submitted:

- □ 3 Sets of Plans
- 15 Sets of Plans reduced to 8 ½" by 11" or 11" by 17"
- Photographs
- □ CD of Plans (pdf) & Photos (jpg)
- □ City Permit Application
- Complete HPC Design Review application

Hearing Date set for: _____

HPC Staff Notes

It has been determined that the work to be performed pursuant to the application does not adversely affect the program for preservation and architectural control of the heritage preservation district or site (Ch.73.06).

HPC staff approval

Date _____



FILE NO.

City Permit # _____ - _____

To Who It May Concern,

I'm writing this in regards to my housing renovation project located at 539 Holly Avenue. After researching, siding investigation, and subsurface investigation while using deductive reasoning, it is our belief that the Cedar siding that was uncovered after removal of the asbestos siding is, in fact, not the original house siding from when the home was built. We believe this due to the following logical reasons.

The project architect Randy Stramel and I have extensive experience with historic buildings. We have been part of multiple historical renovations while I have extensive hands on construction experience and ongoing maintenance experience with historical projects.

1. After examining the house as a whole, the north or rear side has been a mix of additions at different times, yet the whole house matches in the siding and trim. We believe it would have been very difficult to match siding and trim exactly prior to the late 1930's when the asbestos siding was installed. Something that even today's contractors and builders struggle to do.

According to our research, Asbestos cement siding was developed by Austrian engineer Ludwig Hatschek in 1907 for use in Europe. It didn't become available in the U.S. until the 1920's when the National Board of Fire Underwriters recommended that asbestos siding and roofing replace wood because of its superior fire resistance properties. This dramatically boosted sales.

The Sanborn Fire insurance map dated in the 1920's, which includes 539 Holly Ave. lists the subject property as wood siding. National Forest Service research indicates that only smooth surfaced asbestos siding was available during the 1920's and 30's. Textures did not become available until 1937. The siding on the subject property is textured and therefore couldn't have been installed until at least the late 1930's.

- 2. The rear-side porch, seems to have originally been an open-air porch that was later framed in. See photo 1 showing that the porch featured ¾" tongue and groove trim towards the top that was covered up when they framed the side walls. See photo 2 to see that the studs were notched and filler boards added to then install the Cedar siding and trim to match the rest of the home. It is highly unlikely that the siding and trim would match during two distinct additions.
- 3. All the siding and trim is Western Red Cedar, not the lighter cedar that is found in the surrounding area. We do not believe that homebuilders would have shipped Western Cedar to Saint Paul instead of just using locally grown pine on this very modest house. That would make more sense for the grand, mansion homes in the Ramsey Hill Neighborhood whose owners probably had the financial resources to pay for this upgrade. My house is one of the smaller and modest houses in the area and represents a less affluent owner.
- 4. The Cedar siding which was uncovered has a single layer of paint on the surface, with no stain or varnish underneath this single layer of paint, see photo 3. We do not believe that one coat of paint applied roughly in 1885 could somehow last until the late 1930's when the asbestos siding would most likely have been installed. That is roughly 50 years for a single layer of paint to last, something that would be extremely unlikely. Usually with old paint surfaces on wood you will

see layer after layer of paint applied to try to preserve the wood, that is completely absent on this Cedar siding.

5. The siding profile and cuts are extremely uniform from piece to piece with very little difference. Something that leads us to think the siding is more modern than the roughly 1885 build date for my house.

Those are the reasons why we believe the Cedar siding is not original to the home.

We believe that the current condition and future maintenance leads us to the conclusion to install Hardie Board cement siding and new energy efficient historical replica windows to match the profile and style of the current windows for the following reasons.

 Due to the poor structure of the two rear additions, which are currently falling down, I will demolish the rear half of the home and build a new addition matching the style and charm of the original house. This new addition will have Hardie Board cement 4" lap siding to match the original historical look while offering less maintenance issues. We will install new energy efficient, double pane windows that have a historical reproduction look to match the style and appearance of the existing windows.

While having half the home having these modern, maintenance free products on the addition the front having the original siding and windows will present myself as well as next owner(s) with two completely different maintenance schedules. I will not be able to have matching paint on these distinctly different products, while Cedar wood siding needs to have new paint every 2-3 years while the Hardie Board is every 7-8 years. Due to fading and weathering these two paint cycles will never truly "match".

The maintenance required to keep the Cedar siding and existing windows in excellent shape will take ongoing intensive maintenance. I would have a much better knowledge and ability to complete this maintenance, thanks for my prior experience maintaining a building on the National Historic Registry for 15 years with my family, than a typical homeowner. I worry what will happen when the next owner(s) take over, it wouldn't take long for the house to fall back into being an eyesore for the neighborhood and its condition to deteriorate.

2. Even with the Asbestos siding covering the Cedar siding since the late 1930's there is extensive water damage that will require replacement of a large amount of the existing siding. Please review the highlighted areas on the elevations where siding has to be replaced, including a square footage estimation. While removing plaster from the interior walls in multiple areas it shows extensive water damage to the substrate. See photos 4,5, and 6 that show from the inside of the home, moisture damage that has reached the substrate behind the Cedar siding. By allowing us to remove the existing Cedar siding, we will uncover and correct any substrate or structural damage to the house. We would also be able to insulate, minimize air leakage, and apply a modern moisture barrier to better protect the structure for the future as well as improving the energy efficiency of the home. This will set the home to be in better shape in the future not only for myself but the next owners as well.

- 3. The existing Cedar siding now contains countless nail holes from the removed asbestos siding and a number of holes drilled through the siding to blow loose insulation into the walls at some point, see photo 7. The nail holes are a source of moisture penetration and the insulation drill holes are unsightly and will require a number of boards to be replaced, see the elevation drawings. These nail holes will continue to be a source of moisture penetration through the future and if not properly dealt with could lead to very serious damage.
- 4. Utilizing modern building products on the original portion of the house including installing energy efficient, double pane windows, wall insulation, moisture barrier, and sealing air gaps will make the whole home be a much more energy efficient "green" home. No longer will the owner need to purchase window insulation kits that take away from the historical appeal of the home, see photo 8.
- 5. From close inspection of the interior and exterior surface of the existing windows they are in very rough shape from years of minimal to no maintenance performed by previous homeowners, see photos 9 and 10. To repair these windows, it will be very time intensive and costly. The window framing of the house is keeping the windows intact, by trying to repair them the risk of further damage is very high. By replacing these windows with historical replica wood exterior windows and custom wood storm windows the home will have the exact same historical look while being more energy efficient and "green". This will also allow the home to look seamless from the original to the new rear addition.
- 6. Having the original wood windows in the front and new windows in the back addition will create the same maintenance schedule issue as the siding. The old windows would need much more frequent maintenance and new paint causing the home to have mismatched paint shades and weathering.

Project Description:

My housing project will be a complete renovation and addition. The backside of the home, a mix of different additions that are structurally falling down will be demolished. In their place a single addition will be constructed to match the front of the home with slight changes to show it is not original. This addition will have exposed split-face concrete block on the foundation, James Hardie fiber cement siding, and fully custom all wood Jeld-Wen historical replica double hung windows that will match existing windows. The windows will have custom wood storm windows to match the historical period installed as well. The existing half of the home current siding and windows will be removed due to the poor current condition as explained above.

While the siding and windows are being removed the interior of the home will be brought down to the studs and framing. At this point, we will repair and correct any substrate or structural issues that are uncovered. Then we will seal all air leakage, install a modern moisture barrier, and properly insulate the home to make it an energy efficient, green home.

Due to the poor structure and deteriorated framing of the front porch it will be demolished and rebuilt to be historically accurate open air porch with wood floor, wood railings, wood stairs, and a

wood beadboard ceiling. The porch will have the wood floor boards run perpendicular to the length of the porch, per a conversation with Allison Suhan. We will install new James Hardie fiber cement beveled siding with a 4" reveal to match the existing wood siding and garage fiber cement siding. This will be the same siding as the addition.

We will also install fully custom all wood Jeld-Wen double hung historical replica windows to match the existing windows as best as possible. These windows will also have custom wood storm windows installed. We will use existing trim where we are able and replicate it with matching wood trim where needed. All the exterior detailing, mostly on the front of the home, will try to be saved. We will repair as necessary or replace with matching wood as needed. We believe the majority of this detailing will be able to be saved.

Both the existing and addition will have a new roof using Owen Corning Tru-Definition Duration Architectural shingles. We will add in historical half-moon seamless gutters installed with straps and historical downspouts. These will only be on the side of the home. The existing home's foundation will be tuckpointed by a licensed mason using correct mortar to preserve the limestone foundation. We will work with the HPC staff to determine the correct mortar and give them the information to have on file for the future. The air conditioning condenser will be located in the West side yard tucked into the narrow "waist" of the addition, see basement plan, and will be properly screened with landscaping. Connection details will be made in the addition foundation, not the original home's limestone foundation.

The goal of this project is to bring the home up to the standard of the neighborhood and have it no longer be an eyesore for this wonderful area. We hopefully have shown our willingness to work with HPC up to this point of the project and don't want to end our relationship or conversations with the official start of this project. We wish to be able to discuss any possible issues that come up and find solutions within the guidelines with the help of HPC. We wish to not only renovate for my enjoyment but to successfully set this home up for future owners as well so it continues to be up to the standard of the other homes in the area.

Exterior Product Index

Shingles: Owens Corning TruDefinition Duration Shingles-Estate Gray Color

Windows: Jeld-Wen Fully Custom Double Hung All Wood Exterior Window with custom built wood storm windows

Window, Door, Exterior Detail Trim: Custom wood replicated to original where replacement is needed. We believe most of this detailing will be able to be saved and preserved.

Door (Front): Jeld-Wen Custom All Wood Exterior Door Model 444 with ½ View Single Pane Glass, Chapo Finish Color

Door (Rear): Jeld-Wen Aurora Custom Fiberglass Exterior Door-A110 Oak Woodgrain Panel Door, Chapo Finish Color

Siding: James Hardie HardiePlank Lap Siding Smooth Finish with 4" reveal

Gutters: Half-moon style seamless gutters, attached with straps, and historical replica downspouts on the Side of home only.

Exposed Foundation on Rear Addition: Split-Face concrete block veneer

Front Porch: See detailed drawings for design. All material will be real wood including the stairs, railings, floor, beadboard ceiling, and side skirt.

CONSTRUCTION BLOCK Revised: September 2015

General Information



Midwest Manufacturing wants to be your one-stop supplier for construction blocks. The blocks listed in this program are the most commonly used shapes and styles in the masonry industry. We offer everything from stretchers to bond beams to bullnose and we offer these shapes in many different sizes as well. If there is something you need that is not listed in this program, please contact us.

- Block descriptions vary from region to region, therefore they can become confusing. To overcome this, we have included line illustrations with our descriptions and sku information to give a better idea of what the blocks look like. Actual blocks may vary slightly in shape. All dimensions are nominal.
- All colors, including standard gray, vary slightly from run to run. Therefore color matching can not be guaranteed. All shapes and skus listed in this program are standard gray color unless otherwise indicated. Some of our shapes are also available in tan. If you would like to request a color other than what is listed in this program, please contact us for special order pricing.
- ASTM specifications are available upon request and also available on our web site.

MSDS information is available upon request.



SIZES: 2" & 4"



SIZES: 2" & 4"

HardiePlank[®] Lap Siding

HardiePanel[®] Vertical Siding

HardieShingle[®] Siding



SMOOTH

Countrylane Red

Carda

View all HardiePlank Lap Siding Products



*9.25 in. and 12 in. only available primed.

COLOR

PRODUCTS

ABOUT JAMES HARDIE

Roofing (/roofing) / Pick Your Shingles (/roofing/shingles) / Duration (/roofing/shingles/trudefinition-duration)

TruDefinition® **DURATION**® SHINGLES

BOLD CONTRAST. DEEP DIMENSION. OUTSTANDING PERFORMANCE.

TruDefinition Duration Shingles are specially formulated to provide dramatic color contrast and dimension to any roof and are available in all the popular colors. Beyond the impressive curb appeal, they also come with the advanced performance of patented SureNail[®] Technology—a technological breakthrough in roofing.

VIEW PHOTO GALLERY



COLOR OPTIONS

(/roofing/shingles duration/amber)	s/(tratifing/ishingle duration/brownw	s/(/ræbffirgi/ishingle: /odd)ation/chateau green)	s/(/ræbfing/shingles - duration/colonial- slate)	///cabfing/Ishingles ///cabfing/Ishingles - duration/desert- tan)	//ræðfinjifishingles/t duration/driftwood	trudefinition-	(/roofing/shingles duration/harbor- blue)	/(<i>fræbfingtishi</i> ngle: duration/onyx- black)	s/(/ratefingitishingles/tr duration/quarry- gray)
(/roofing/shingles duration/shasta- white)	s/(tradifingtishingles duration/sierra- gray)	s/(/ratifing/shingles duration/teak)	/trating/ishingles duration/terra- cotta)	s/trudefinition-					
TruDefinition D	Duration Shing	les							
FIND A CONTR	ACTOR								>

WHERE TO BUY

FAVORITE

>

 \heartsuit

CUSTOM WOOD GLASS PANEL EXTERIOR DOOR

Custom Wood Glass Panel Exterior Door

Price Range: \$\$\$



-Fully Custom Door -will only have a single piece of glass for 1/2 view door 444 -All wood

WAYS TO BUY THIS PRODUCT

FIND A STORE (/EN-US/FINDASTORE?URI=CATALOG/EXTERIOR-DOORS/CUSTOM/WOOD/GLASS-PANEL)

TECHNICAL DOCUMENTS

Visit our Pro Center for access to all technical documents (http://www.jeld-wen.com/professional/technical-documents/all-documents).

Search these documents										
Common searches: Installation, C	CSI, CAD									
Document Name	Filter by:	Format ALL V	Туре	ALL	V	F	Page:	12	of 4	Next
Additional Installation Instruction (http://f150722b1c22bcf979d5- 304dcbb5606a06b71e5035c1858 fire-ratings.pdf)	s for Fire-Rated 1a3b4.r36.cf1.	d Doors rackcdn.com/2228	pdf Fire Ratings 3/JII111_doo	s, Installation , r-	[/] Finishing					
Appropriate Protection for Exterio (http://c2456372.r72.cf0.rackcdn	r Doors 1.com/JGI030.p	df)	pdf Education							
CSI 3-Part Specs - Custom Wood (http://c2456372.r72.cf0.rackcdn	Exterior Doors com/139/JW_I	ExtDoors_CstmWc	doc 1_CS\$13_078174;	54P.eksc)						
CSI 3-Part Specs - Custom Wood (http://c2456372.r72.cf0.rackcdn	Exterior Folding	g Doors ExtDoors_CstmWc	doc bolastandag_s	ସି୭ <u>୩</u> _5081474.d	oc)					
Coastal Selections (http://9dc159 bd2073f7c8dbd16f36eed6397824 coastal-selections-brochure)	043a66b1fe0a4 193f0.r48.cf1.ra	49- ackcdn.com/2321/	jw-coastal-s jwfochure Brochures	elections-						
Coastal Selections (http://f15072 304dcbb5606a06b71e5035c1858 coastal-selections-brochure.pdf)	2b1c22bcf979d 1a3b4.r36.cf1.i	l5- rackcdn.com/3185	pdf /ßwochures							
Custom Door Homeowner's Manua (http://9dc159b43a66b1fe0a49- bd2073f7c8dbd16f36eed6397824 custom-wood-aurora-exterior-door	al 93f0.r48.cf1.ra s-brochure.pdf	ickcdn.com/jw-)	pdf Brochures							
Custom Wood & Aurora Custom Fi Doors (http://9dc159b43a66b1fe bd2073f7c8dbd16f36eed6397824 custom-wood-aurora-contemporar	iberglass Conte Da49- 93f0.r48.cf1.ra y-doors-brochu	mporary ickcdn.com/3613/j re.pdf)	pdf Brochures jw-							
Custom Wood - All Panel - 1 Panel (http://c2456372.r72.cf0.rackcdn	.com/1592/JW_	_CstmWd_AllPanel	pdf Domant Pressing n Options / Co	s Overview, El omponents, Sé	evations / Sec ection Details	tions, Elevat	ions,			
Custom Wood Contemporary Inter (http://9dc159b43a66b1fe0a49-	rior & Exterior [Doors	pdf Brochures, [Door Designs (Verview					



444 FLAT TOP

٤

Ę.

E.

ELEVATION NOTES



Insulated Glass



Custom Wood Window & Patio Door Features



AuraLast

AuraLast[®] wood protects against wood rot for as long as you own and occupy your home. Guaranteed.*

A JELD-WEN Exclusive - Only JELD-WEN makes window and door products with natural pine AuraLast wood that are built to last.

Surface-to-Core Protection - AuraLast wood delivers virtually 100% surface-tocore penetration of the protective ingredients.

Protects Against Wood Decay - AuraLast wood prevents damage and rot due to weather conditions, water saturation or termites.

Working with AuraLast Wood is Easy - AuraLast wood maintains its structural integrity despite what it's put through; it is colorless, stainable and odorless.

JELD-WEN® products made from pine AuraLast wood will not rot.







Visit jeld-wen.com/auralast for more information



AuraLast The Wood That Does Not Rot

Interlayer



IMPACT RESISTANT GLASS

www.jeld-wen.com/impactgard

This glass stands up to strong impacts from wind-borne debris as well as harsh coastal conditions. In fact, ImpactGard® glass features the industry's leading laminated glass technology that can withstand a nine-pound piece of lumber striking it head-on at approximately 34 miles per hour. It also reduces sound transmission, blocks up to 95 percent of harmful UV rays and enhances home security.

SAFE



Impact resistance to wind-borne debris





Forced–entry resistance for increased safety

SOUND



Decreased sound transmission

2

WOOD & METAL CLAD OPTIONS

Our Custom wood windows and patio doors are built from solid pine AuraLast® wood for lasting beauty, and each one comes standard with energy efficient LoE³-366 and Neat® glass. These windows and patio doors are also available with the greatest array of design options. To review our full range of styles and options, visit **www.jeld-wen.com**.



Custom paint and stain options available.

INTERIOR & EXTERIOR OPTIONS FOR WINDOWS & PATIO DOORS

ORS Interior: 🅕



42 EXTERIOR CLAD COLORS Custom color match available



Actual colors may vary from the samples displayed. Please visit your JELD-WEN dealer for actual samples.

SELECT FINISH

Choose to paint the exterior of the window instead of applying metal cladding.

3 EXTERIOR COPPER CLAD FINISHES





Exterior: 📳



Hand-Rubbed Patina Copper

Windows and patio doors installed within one mile of a saltwater source (or other corrosive environment) have specific maintenance requirements.

Copper

For details visit: www.jeld-wen.com/resources



3

TRIM & DIVIDED LITES

INTERIOR TRIM



EXTERIOR TRIM

(Additional interior and exterior trim options may be available. See your JELD-WEN dealer for details.)



Adams



Flat

Manchester

Pendleton

DIVIDED LITES



Simulated Divided Lites (SDL)



Precise Divided Lites (PDL)*



Grilles Between the Glass (GBG)



Full-Surround Wood Grilles (FS)

*Wood exterior only

**Available in all sizes shown

SAMPLING OF OUR SIMULATED DIVIDED LITE PROFILES



SAMPLING OF OUR TEXTURED AND TINTED GLASS OPTIONS

(Many other glass options available. See your JELD-WEN dealer for details.)



Obscure





Seedy Reamy



Gray



Rain



Narrow Reed



Optional: Opening Control Device limits sash opening to 3-3/4 inches for fall prevention.



PHANTOM SCREENS® TECHNOLOGY

Available to match interior wood species



These screens are designed to keep more insects outside, while letting more natural light inside.

ULTRAVUE™ SCREENS



View through regular fiberglass insect screen

View through UltraVue® insect screen (standard)

Please note: These images are for illustration purposes only. Actual screen may appear different.

WOOD SELECTION FOR CASEMENT AND AWNING WINDOW SCREENS*



out. They are not intended to stop children from falling through an open door or window. For additional protection, consider adding a Window Opening Control Device (WOCD) to the window.

Insect screens are intended to allow air and light in, while keeping insects

*Screens available in all species shown on page 3 with the exception of Reclaimed Fir

5

DECORATIVE GLASS

Featuring five popular standard glass collections, this program allows you to design endless decorative glass creations. Using combinations of patterns, colors, obscure glass and caming options, we can build nearly anything you can imagine.



CONTEMPORARY COLLECTION Modern and bold with a unique look certain to add style to modern-day homes.



ESTATE COLLECTION Fits many types of architecture and has straight bold lines adding to the decor of any home.



CLASSIC COLLECTION This elegant collection adds a distinct and timeless design element to any home.



CRAFTSMAN COLLECTION A tried and true design that represents a theme that has stood the test of time.



DIAMOND COLLECTION A classic Tudor style that evokes an old world charm.









CAMING SELECTIONS

Choose one of our five caming selections to determine how ornate, elegant or plain your decorative glass will appear.


DECORATIVE GRILLES BETWEEN THE GLASS

The JELD-WEN® Decorative Grille Program features custom capabilities to build your own creations. Using your sketches and combinations of patterns, we can build nearly anything you imagine.

Some of our most popular designs are shown below.





The JELD-WEN website is your ultimate resource for learning about our reliable windows and doors. It has all the product information and design advice you need. Visit us at **jeld-wen.com** today.



THE JELD-WEN PROMISE

JELD-WEN products create lasting value for your home. We are so confident that you will be pleased with our Custom wood windows and patio doors that each one carries our industry-leading warranty.

The Window & Patio Door Limited Warranty Includes:

- Lifetime Limited Warranty on AuraLast[®] wood; protects against wood rot for as long as you own and occupy your home
- 20-year coverage against defects in material and workmanship for most product components (such as insulating glass, metal and wood components, and hardware)
- 20-year coverage on clad finish
- Skilled labor coverage for warranty repairs for 2 years
- Coverage is transferable for 10 years

NOTE: The above information is a summary of key provisions of the **JELD-WEN Window & Patio Door Limited**. Warranty effective February 1, 2014. For a complete copy of the current warranty, see your sales associate or refer to **www.jeld-wen.com**.





© 2015, 2014, 2013 JELD-WEN, inc. All rights reserved. This publication and its contents are owned by JELD-WEN, inc. and are protected under the U.S. Copyright Act and other intellectual property laws. All trademarks, service marks, logos, and the like (whether registered or unregistered) are owned or controlled by JELD-WEN, inc. or others. Unauthorized use or duplication of JELD-WEN intellectual property is prohibited. JELD-WEN reserves the right to change product specifications without notice. Please check our website, jeld-wen.com, for current information.



No other windows convey the sense of traditional American design like our double-hung windows. They feature an upper and lower sash that slide vertically past each other in a single frame. The sash also tilt in for convenient cleaning. In addition, we offer double-hung sash replacement windows, which allow for easy installation.

We also offer large-scale Epic[®] series double-hung windows (shown below). They're ideal for either new projects or historic renovations, feature extruded sash components, and can be incorporated into new or existing rough openings that are up to 5'6" wide and 8'6" tall or up to 4'6" wide and 10'6" tall, respectively.



DOUBLE-HUNG FEATURES & OPTIONS



CONCEALED JAMB LINER

- » Replicates historic architecture
- » No exposed track
- Cover will match interior specie and finish



DELUXE CAM-LOCK WITH CONCEALED TILT LATCH

- Tilt Sash allows for easy cleaning from the inside of your home
- A single mechanism controls both the locking and tilting of the sash
- Tilt latches are concealed within the sash for a clean, streamlined appearance



DOUBLE-HUNG

Uses moving sash on top and bottom to increase usability and air circulation

AVAILABLE HARDWARE FINISHES*



*Finishes may appear different due to variations in printing **Oil-Rubbed Bronze will change in appearance over time +Available with optional PVD finish for increased resistance to wear and discoloration

Line Item Quantity

Product Description

Total Price

200-1 1

Rough Opening:	3' 2 1/2" X 6' 10 1/2"
Actual Size:	3' 1 1/2" X 6' 9 3/4"
Room:	None

Unit is viewed from the outside looking in.



Actual Stze - 5 1 1/2"

IWP Fiberglass Doors Entry Door Knock Down Series = Classic Collection Unit Type = Knock Down Door Custom Shape = Flat Top Swing Option = Left Inswing Door Skin = Oak Door Type = Panel Doors Door Thickness = 1 3/4" Door Custom Style = 110 Room Location = None Door Texture = None Door Finish Type = Stained Door Finish - Exterior Side = Caramel Door Finish - Interior Side = Caramel Door Bore = Double Bore Bore Backset = 2 3/8" Lockset Bore Position = 42 7/8" Dead Bolt Bore Position = 5 1/2" Bore Diameter = 2 1/8' Hinge Prep = 3-Hinge Prep Hinge Type = Concealed Bearing Hinge Finish = Oil Rubbed Bronze Hinge Size = 4" x 4" Hinge Decorative Tips = None Include Lockset = No Jamb Width = 4 9/16" Jamb Texture = Smooth Jamb Finish Type = Stain Jamb Specie = Oak Stain Grade Jamb Finish - Exterior Side = Caramel Jamb Finish - Interior Side = Caramel Door Bottom Seal = 1 3/4" Bronze Door Sweep Sill / Threshold Type = Bronze Adjustable Reorder = No Brickmould Type = None Interior Casing Type = None Interior Casing Finish Type = Stain Interior Casing Finish Color = Caramel

Price Breakdown Base Price Jamb System Price



A110 Panel FLAT TOP



Ŗ.



To Who It May Concern,

I'm writing this in regards to my housing renovation project located at 539 Holly Avenue. After researching, siding investigation, and subsurface investigation while using deductive reasoning, it is our belief that the Cedar siding that was uncovered after removal of the asbestos siding is, in fact, not the original house siding from when the home was built. We believe this due to the following logical reasons.

The project architect Randy Stramel and I have extensive experience with historic buildings. We have been part of multiple historical renovations while I have extensive hands on construction experience and ongoing maintenance experience with historical projects.

1. After examining the house as a whole, the north or rear side has been a mix of additions at different times, yet the whole house matches in the siding and trim. We believe it would have been very difficult to match siding and trim exactly prior to the late 1930's when the asbestos siding was installed. Something that even today's contractors and builders struggle to do.

According to our research, Asbestos cement siding was developed by Austrian engineer Ludwig Hatschek in 1907 for use in Europe. It didn't become available in the U.S. until the 1920's when the National Board of Fire Underwriters recommended that asbestos siding and roofing replace wood because of its superior fire resistance properties. This dramatically boosted sales.

The Sanborn Fire insurance map dated in the 1920's, which includes 539 Holly Ave. lists the subject property as wood siding. National Forest Service research indicates that only smooth surfaced asbestos siding was available during the 1920's and 30's. Textures did not become available until 1937. The siding on the subject property is textured and therefore couldn't have been installed until at least the late 1930's.

- 2. The rear-side porch, seems to have originally been an open-air porch that was later framed in. See photo 1 showing that the porch featured ¾" tongue and groove trim towards the top that was covered up when they framed the side walls. See photo 2 to see that the studs were notched and filler boards added to then install the Cedar siding and trim to match the rest of the home. It is highly unlikely that the siding and trim would match during two distinct additions.
- 3. All the siding and trim is Western Red Cedar, not the lighter cedar that is found in the surrounding area. We do not believe that homebuilders would have shipped Western Cedar to Saint Paul instead of just using locally grown pine on this very modest house. That would make more sense for the grand, mansion homes in the Ramsey Hill Neighborhood whose owners probably had the financial resources to pay for this upgrade. My house is one of the smaller and modest houses in the area and represents a less affluent owner.
- 4. The Cedar siding which was uncovered has a single layer of paint on the surface, with no stain or varnish underneath this single layer of paint, see photo 3. We do not believe that one coat of paint applied roughly in 1885 could somehow last until the late 1930's when the asbestos siding would most likely have been installed. That is roughly 50 years for a single layer of paint to last, something that would be extremely unlikely. Usually with old paint surfaces on wood you will

see layer after layer of paint applied to try to preserve the wood, that is completely absent on this Cedar siding.

5. The siding profile and cuts are extremely uniform from piece to piece with very little difference. Something that leads us to think the siding is more modern than the roughly 1885 build date for my house.

Those are the reasons why we believe the Cedar siding is not original to the home.

We believe that the current condition and future maintenance leads us to the conclusion to install Hardie Board cement siding and new energy efficient historical replica windows to match the profile and style of the current windows for the following reasons.

 Due to the poor structure of the two rear additions, which are currently falling down, I will demolish the rear half of the home and build a new addition matching the style and charm of the original house. This new addition will have Hardie Board cement 4" lap siding to match the original historical look while offering less maintenance issues. We will install new energy efficient, double pane windows that have a historical reproduction look to match the style and appearance of the existing windows.

While having half the home having these modern, maintenance free products on the addition the front having the original siding and windows will present myself as well as next owner(s) with two completely different maintenance schedules. I will not be able to have matching paint on these distinctly different products, while Cedar wood siding needs to have new paint every 2-3 years while the Hardie Board is every 7-8 years. Due to fading and weathering these two paint cycles will never truly "match".

The maintenance required to keep the Cedar siding and existing windows in excellent shape will take ongoing intensive maintenance. I would have a much better knowledge and ability to complete this maintenance, thanks for my prior experience maintaining a building on the National Historic Registry for 15 years with my family, than a typical homeowner. I worry what will happen when the next owner(s) take over, it wouldn't take long for the house to fall back into being an eyesore for the neighborhood and its condition to deteriorate.

2. Even with the Asbestos siding covering the Cedar siding since the late 1930's there is extensive water damage that will require replacement of a large amount of the existing siding. Please review the highlighted areas on the elevations where siding has to be replaced, including a square footage estimation. While removing plaster from the interior walls in multiple areas it shows extensive water damage to the substrate. See photos 4,5, and 6 that show from the inside of the home, moisture damage that has reached the substrate behind the Cedar siding. By allowing us to remove the existing Cedar siding, we will uncover and correct any substrate or structural damage to the house. We would also be able to insulate, minimize air leakage, and apply a modern moisture barrier to better protect the structure for the future as well as improving the energy efficiency of the home. This will set the home to be in better shape in the future not only for myself but the next owners as well.

- 3. The existing Cedar siding now contains countless nail holes from the removed asbestos siding and a number of holes drilled through the siding to blow loose insulation into the walls at some point, see photo 7. The nail holes are a source of moisture penetration and the insulation drill holes are unsightly and will require a number of boards to be replaced, see the elevation drawings. These nail holes will continue to be a source of moisture penetration through the future and if not properly dealt with could lead to very serious damage.
- 4. Utilizing modern building products on the original portion of the house including installing energy efficient, double pane windows, wall insulation, moisture barrier, and sealing air gaps will make the whole home be a much more energy efficient "green" home. No longer will the owner need to purchase window insulation kits that take away from the historical appeal of the home, see photo 8.
- 5. From close inspection of the interior and exterior surface of the existing windows they are in very rough shape from years of minimal to no maintenance performed by previous homeowners, see photos 9 and 10. To repair these windows, it will be very time intensive and costly. The window framing of the house is keeping the windows intact, by trying to repair them the risk of further damage is very high. By replacing these windows with historical replica wood exterior windows and custom wood storm windows the home will have the exact same historical look while being more energy efficient and "green". This will also allow the home to look seamless from the original to the new rear addition.
- 6. Having the original wood windows in the front and new windows in the back addition will create the same maintenance schedule issue as the siding. The old windows would need much more frequent maintenance and new paint causing the home to have mismatched paint shades and weathering.

Project Description:

My housing project will be a complete renovation and addition. The backside of the home, a mix of different additions that are structurally falling down will be demolished. In their place a single addition will be constructed to match the front of the home with slight changes to show it is not original. This addition will have exposed split-face concrete block on the foundation, James Hardie fiber cement siding, and fully custom all wood Jeld-Wen historical replica double hung windows that will match existing windows. The windows will have custom wood storm windows to match the historical period installed as well. The existing half of the home current siding and windows will be removed due to the poor current condition as explained above.

While the siding and windows are being removed the interior of the home will be brought down to the studs and framing. At this point, we will repair and correct any substrate or structural issues that are uncovered. Then we will seal all air leakage, install a modern moisture barrier, and properly insulate the home to make it an energy efficient, green home.

Due to the poor structure and deteriorated framing of the front porch it will be demolished and rebuilt to be historically accurate open air porch with wood floor, wood railings, wood stairs, and a

wood beadboard ceiling. The porch will have the wood floor boards run perpendicular to the length of the porch, per a conversation with Allison Suhan. We will install new James Hardie fiber cement beveled siding with a 4" reveal to match the existing wood siding and garage fiber cement siding. This will be the same siding as the addition.

We will also install fully custom all wood Jeld-Wen double hung historical replica windows to match the existing windows as best as possible. These windows will also have custom wood storm windows installed. We will use existing trim where we are able and replicate it with matching wood trim where needed. All the exterior detailing, mostly on the front of the home, will try to be saved. We will repair as necessary or replace with matching wood as needed. We believe the majority of this detailing will be able to be saved.

Both the existing and addition will have a new roof using Owen Corning Tru-Definition Duration Architectural shingles. We will add in historical half-moon seamless gutters installed with straps and historical downspouts. These will only be on the side of the home. The existing home's foundation will be tuckpointed by a licensed mason using correct mortar to preserve the limestone foundation. We will work with the HPC staff to determine the correct mortar and give them the information to have on file for the future. The air conditioning condenser will be located in the West side yard tucked into the narrow "waist" of the addition, see basement plan, and will be properly screened with landscaping. Connection details will be made in the addition foundation, not the original home's limestone foundation.

The goal of this project is to bring the home up to the standard of the neighborhood and have it no longer be an eyesore for this wonderful area. We hopefully have shown our willingness to work with HPC up to this point of the project and don't want to end our relationship or conversations with the official start of this project. We wish to be able to discuss any possible issues that come up and find solutions within the guidelines with the help of HPC. We wish to not only renovate for my enjoyment but to successfully set this home up for future owners as well so it continues to be up to the standard of the other homes in the area.

Exterior Product Index

Shingles: Owens Corning TruDefinition Duration Shingles-Estate Gray Color

Windows: Jeld-Wen Fully Custom Double Hung All Wood Exterior Window with custom built wood storm windows

Window, Door, Exterior Detail Trim: Custom wood replicated to original where replacement is needed. We believe most of this detailing will be able to be saved and preserved.

Door (Front): Jeld-Wen Custom All Wood Exterior Door Model 444 with ½ View Single Pane Glass, Chapo Finish Color

Door (Rear): Jeld-Wen Aurora Custom Fiberglass Exterior Door-A110 Oak Woodgrain Panel Door, Chapo Finish Color

Siding: James Hardie HardiePlank Lap Siding Smooth Finish with 4" reveal

Gutters: Half-moon style seamless gutters, attached with straps, and historical replica downspouts on the Side of home only.

Exposed Foundation on Rear Addition: Split-Face concrete block veneer

Front Porch: See detailed drawings for design. All material will be real wood including the stairs, railings, floor, beadboard ceiling, and side skirt.







	9/10 3/2/17 245	Johnson Residence 539 Holly Avenue St Paul, MN 55102
2		
FLP 0"		
0"		
FLP OII		100
FLP 0" DE 6"±		
FLP 0" DE 6"±		100

East side of view of side porch failing

CALL MARKEN

D

200

East side of view from sidewalk

1

East side of view of porch

Sec.

Front of home showing detailing

Front view of home

Interior corner rot and damage

Setting and a set of the set of t



Interior water damage 7









Interior water damage 9



Interior water damage

and

North side addition falling down



North side view



Porch framing

~ .

-

0



• • Porch framing





Side porch detail

- annothe



Side porch framing

4



Siding insulation holes





Siding paint detail









West side view from sidewalk

NATE.

TY YY





Window corner brace

a third strate ethnicity have





Window frame and sill deterioration





Window frame damage



Window frame showing black char damage



Window insulation





Window rot and damage





Insurance Maps of St. Paul, Minnesota - Volume 1 Publisher: Sanborn Map Co. 1903 revised through August 1925 Handwritten notations by St. Paul Planning Commission Digital Images Created 2007 by Historical Information Gatherers, Inc.

www.historicalinfo.com