



CITY OF SAINT PAUL
Christopher B. Coleman, Mayor

*25 West Fourth Street
Saint Paul, MN 55102*

*Telephone: 651-266-6700
Facsimile: 651-266-6549*

DATE: December 1, 2017
TO: Heritage Preservation Commission
FROM: Jake Reilly, PED Staff (266-6618/jake.reilly@stpaul.gov)
SUBJECT: Heritage Preservation Chapter of the 2040 Saint Paul Comprehensive Plan

BACKGROUND

What is the Comprehensive Plan?

The Comprehensive Plan is Saint Paul's "blueprint" for guiding development for the next 20 years. It addresses city-wide physical development, and contains chapters on Land Use, Transportation, Parks and Recreation, Housing, Historic Preservation and Water Resources. While the policy focus is on physical development, the Plan's core values, goals and policies reflect an understanding that how we arrange the physical elements of our city – streets, parks, housing, public infrastructure – impacts and is impacted by the people in our city. The current update of the Comp Plan also has several overarching issues integrated into each chapter, including racial and social equity, aging in community, community/public health, economic development, sustainability/resiliency and access to healthy food. The policies contained in the Comp Plan are based on Saint Paul's core values; history; community priorities; and emerging social, economic and environmental trends.

In Saint Paul, several other plans have been adopted periodically as addenda to the Comp Plan, including the *Central Corridor Development Strategy*, station area plans, master plans, area plans and district plans. These documents are not required by the Metropolitan Council to be updated every 10 years; they are updated as needed at any time.

Legal Framework

The state Metropolitan Land Planning Act requires that every municipality and other local government in the seven-county metropolitan region have a Comp Plan, and that it be updated every 10 years consistent with the Metropolitan Council's regional plan and system plans for transportation, parks and water. The guiding regional document for this update of Saint Paul's Comp Plan is *Thrive MSP 2040*. The Metropolitan Council also has a Housing Policy Plan that is not required by statute, but provides guidance to municipalities as they prepare their own Housing chapters. The mandated planning time frame for this update of the Comp Plan is 2040.

Thrive MSP 2040 is one of the guiding documents the Saint Paul Comp Plan must respond to, in addition to regional growth projections in population, housing units and employment. The

following projections have been established for Saint Paul to 2040: an increase of 40,000 residents, 20,000 households and 30,000 jobs. We have to show how we will accomplish this growth, as well as how our local policies will implement regional policies. In its review, the Metropolitan Council also considers our Comp Plan's compatibility with the plans of neighboring municipalities and agencies with jurisdiction over our development (e.g. watershed districts, Ramsey County, MnDOT). Saint Paul is designated as an "Urban Center" in *Thrive MSP 2040*.

Planning Commission Role in Review and Adoption

One of the core responsibilities of the Planning Commission is to oversee the preparation of the Comprehensive Plan, and to recommend it to the City Council for adoption. Once the City Council has adopted the Plan, it is sent to the Metropolitan Council for final approval. For three chapters – Transportation, Parks & Recreation and Historic Preservation – a Planning Commission committee or other City commission will review the relevant draft chapter first, and then recommend it to the Planning Commission. A public hearing on the complete draft Comp Plan will be held at the Planning Commission and likely at the City Council prior to adoption. The role of the Planning Commission is to ensure that the chapters of the Comp Plan respond to our regional mandate for growth, maintain a city-wide perspective, are consistent with one another and reflect the city's core values.

2010 HERITAGE PRESERVATION CHAPTER

The existing Heritage Preservation Chapter of the Comprehensive Plan contains 71 pages with seven (7) strategies and 70 policies. This was the first time a Heritage Preservation Chapter was included, and it was produced by the 106 Group, along with a 17-member task force, working with a cross-disciplinary core team. In the process of writing the draft chapter, City staff and the working group have reviewed the existing policies to determine which should remain, which should be modified, and which should be eliminated. While many are still relevant, the specificity of the plan made it unwieldy and not suitable for the high-level policy vision to which the City aspires in this iteration.

COMMUNITY ENGAGEMENT

Extensive community engagement – far more than in a typical process – has been undertaken to set the community vision and priorities for the Comp Plan, and to identify issues to address in it. The engagement approach has been to reach as many people as possible; be genuine about the role of engagement; and be representative by race, age and geography. Major engagement kicked off in May 2016 with three broadly-advertised open house events, and continued throughout 2016 into 2017 with attendance at community festivals, pop-up meetings in public locations, district council meetings, City department meetings, policymaker interviews, radio interviews on WEQY (Voice of the East Side) and KMOJ (The People's Station), Open Saint Paul online input, and discussions with experts and advocacy organizations. As of this writing, staff has spoken with over 2,200 people at 67 events, generating over 3,700 comments. At least one event was held and at least 25 people were engaged in each of Saint Paul's 17 planning districts, with an average of three events and 100 people per district. During the big engagement push of May-September 2016, the over 800 people of color engaged represented approximately 50% of the total participants compared to a city-wide population proportion of 40% (in 2010). The age of participants was also mostly representative of the city-wide population, if somewhat older.

Nine themes and priorities emerged from the community engagement. In December 2016 and January 2017, staff sent an e-blast of the preliminary themes and priorities, and posted them in 81 strategically-selected “third places” (gathering spaces like coffee shops, libraries, and community centers) to invite feedback. Seventy-one comments were received, mostly confirming the themes and priorities, with the most commonly suggested additions relating to climate change resiliency and adaptation. Responding to this feedback, “sustainability” was added to create a modified final list of nine themes:

- **Livability, equity and sustainability.** When we asked about regional themes established by the Metropolitan Council, a majority said livability and equity are the most important for Saint Paul. Further public input established sustainability as also being vitally important. Other regional themes to be incorporated into the updated Comp Plan include prosperity and stewardship.
- **Parks and open space.** Parks and open space, from Como Park to Swede Hollow to the Mississippi River to local playgrounds, were consistently identified throughout the city as cherished places that we should preserve and enhance.
- **Sense of community.** Many people identified social connections, diversity and their neighborhood’s character – whether “vibrant” or “quiet” – as key advantages of living in Saint Paul.
- **Public safety.** People want to be safe and feel safe in their communities, and to have positive relationships with police officers. Strategic investment and thoughtful design can improve public safety. While this issue goes beyond typical development policies covered in the Plan, other ways to meaningfully incorporate this deep concern will be explored.
- **Road safety for pedestrians and bicycles.** Pedestrian safety at crossings and improved facilities were frequently identified as issues, as were bicycle facility improvements and safety.
- **Invest in people.** Whether job training or programming at recreation centers (especially for youth), people identified this as an important issue for Saint Paul. Many commented that these investments pay dividends for livability, prosperity and public safety.
- **Jobs.** People said we need more and better jobs to allow people to provide for their families and lift up the entire community.
- **Quality affordable housing.** People said we need more affordable housing, and that existing housing must be well-maintained.
- **Saint Paul is full of opportunity sites.** The range of “places with potential” identified was astounding, including major projects like Snelling-Midway (soccer stadium area) and the Ford site, large geographies like “the East Side,” “the Green Line” or “the riverfront,” commercial corridors like White Bear Avenue or Selby Avenue, and individual sites throughout the city. People said there are gems throughout the city, ready for (re)discovery and investment.

HERITAGE PRESERVATION CHAPTER PROCESS

The draft chapter was created by a combination of an interdepartmental staff team and a Heritage Preservation staff working group to evaluate the existing chapter vis-à-vis the goals established for this iteration of the Comprehensive Plan. Over the course of several working sessions, the staff team reviewed and edited the policies to the version included with this memo. During the period of staff team review, team members were assigned a “lens” or two through which to read the draft and propose revisions. The lenses include: racial and social equity, aging in community, community/public health, economic development, sustainability/resiliency and

urban design. The insights gained from this process have been integrated into the draft policies. Overall, discussion was robust for almost every policy. While changes are expected, the staff team believes this is a strong foundation upon which the Commission can begin discussion.

HERITAGE PRESERVATION COMMISSION ROLE IN REVIEW AND ADOPTION

City Staff gave updates to the Heritage Preservation Commission in the fall of 2016 and in September and November 2017 to describe the process and inform them of progress and next steps. The Commission will review and discuss the draft policies at the December 7 meeting, prior to the first full meeting of the Comprehensive Planning Committee of the Planning Commission. Staff will summarize this review and recommendations at the December 12 meeting of the Comprehensive Planning Committee. The Heritage Preservation Commission will continue to be involved in the process, including in the new year as the public engagement and review process begins. The Heritage Preservation Commission's involvement has been conducted in the same way as the Parks Commission.

DRAFT CHAPTER HIGHLIGHTS

The draft Heritage Preservation Chapter organizes policies around five goals:

- 1. A leader in the use of best practices towards an equitable and sustainable approach to the preservation, conservation, rehabilitation, restoration and reconstruction of publicly-owned cultural and historic resources**
- 2. The preservation and protection of built, cultural and natural environments that express the identity and sense of place of Saint Paul**
- 3. The consideration of cultural and heritage preservation goals and priorities in all City departments, initiatives, policies, practices and processes**
- 4. City investments in built, cultural and natural environments and in cultural and historic resources that reflect broader City priorities**
- 5. Broad stakeholder understanding and application of cultural and heritage preservation planning tools and resources**

It recognizes the importance of Cultural and Heritage Preservation activities in Saint Paul. The policies are intended to preserve and protect cultural and heritage assets through supporting public and private investment; stakeholder education; survey and designation; and integration throughout City departments, policies, practices and processes.

The goals of this plan are focused on ensuring Saint Paul continues to be a leader in preserving cultural and historic resources; engages all stakeholders in education and evaluation activities that are inclusive, responsive, practical and respectful; and continues to integrate preservation and related activities into the work of all departments. Our goal is to support the economy, sustainability, and built and natural environments in Saint Paul.

NEXT STEPS

The Comprehensive Planning Committee will review this chapter (and all the chapters) before authorizing staff to release the entire draft plan for public comment in early 2018. Upon revising to respond to public comment at that time, staff will then return to the Comprehensive Planning Committee to request that a formal public hearing be set in front of the Planning Commission in

April 2018. The plan document is anticipated to be before the City Council in June 2018 for a public hearing and adoption.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION:

The proposed Heritage & Cultural Preservation Chapter of the Comprehensive Plan draft complies with the standards, practices and core values for historic preservation in Saint Paul. Staff proposes the Commission recommends approval of the chapter to the Planning Commission.

Suggested Motion:

I move to recommend approval of the proposed Heritage & Cultural Preservation Chapter of the Comprehensive Plan draft based on the submitted document, staff memo, presented testimony and commission deliberations.

Attachment:

Draft Heritage Preservation Chapter (December 1, 2017)

Heritage & Cultural Preservation Chapter of the Comprehensive Plan

CURRENT DRAFT AS OF 12/01/17

INTENT STATEMENT

The Heritage & Cultural Preservation Chapter sets policy for the preservation and celebration of architecturally, culturally and historically significant buildings, districts, sites and views in Saint Paul. The purpose of this plan is to provide a guiding vision for sustainable and equitable cultural and heritage preservation in Saint Paul. It formalizes City policy regarding cultural and heritage preservation, guides public and private investment to further City preservation goals, advocates for cultural and heritage preservation, and sets a policy direction for the Heritage Preservation Commission (HPC). The policies are intended to preserve and protect cultural and heritage assets through supporting public and private investment; stakeholder education; survey and designation; and integration throughout City departments, policies, practices and processes. The City's activities associated with preservation, rehabilitation, restoration, and reconstruction should improve the quality of life for all residents and visitors, and express a sense of place and pride, regardless of age, background or ability. The core value of this chapter is that the City embrace a preservation ethic in all facets of its work.

INTRODUCTION

While first established as Minnesota's capital in 1858, the lands within what is now known as the city of Saint Paul have been used by humans for thousands of years. The wealth of history and cultural resources in the area, and the fact that many of those resources – natural and built – are preserved and conserved, is due to the leadership of City staff and advocacy groups. This is a legacy this chapter seeks to continue. Demographic, climate, investment and technological changes require that the City respond accordingly and carefully plan to address these issues when considering the built and natural environments in a historical and cultural context.

Existing structures are important actors in sustainable economic development, and the cultural landscapes that are part-and-parcel of the city inherently connect this chapter with others. The goals of this plan are focused on ensuring Saint Paul continues to be a leader in preserving cultural and historic resources; engages all stakeholders in education and evaluation activities that are inclusive, responsive, practical and respectful; and continues to integrate preservation and related activities into the work of all departments. Our goal is to support the economy, sustainability, and built and natural environments in Saint Paul.

GOALS

- 1. A leader in the use of best practices towards an equitable and sustainable approach to the preservation, conservation, rehabilitation, restoration and reconstruction of publicly-owned cultural and historic resources**
- 2. The preservation and protection of built, cultural and natural environments that express the identity and sense of place of Saint Paul**
- 3. The consideration of cultural and heritage preservation goals and priorities in all City departments, initiatives, policies, practices and processes**
- 4. City investments in built, cultural and natural environments and in cultural and historic resources that reflect broader City priorities**
- 5. Broad stakeholder understanding and application of cultural and heritage preservation planning tools and resources**

POLICIES

Goal 1: A leader in the use of best practices towards an equitable and sustainable approach to the conservation, preservation, rehabilitation, restoration and reconstruction of publicly-owned cultural and historic resources

- Policy HP-1.** Prioritize publicly-owned facilities – particularly those owned, maintained or supported by the City and related development authorities – for evaluation, designation and preservation.
- Policy HP-2.** Preserve, rehabilitate and maintain City-owned historic resources through recognized preservation standards.
- Policy HP-3.** Pursue funding to evaluate, maintain, renovate and preserve City-owned eligible and potentially eligible property, and assist private owners to do the same.
- Policy HP-4.** Ensure City codes are progressive and responsive to changes in technology, practices, Federal guidance and community need, to advance and support preservation activities.
- Policy HP-5.** Incorporate historic and cultural resources into cultural tourism efforts.

Goal 2: The preservation and protection of built, cultural and natural environments that express the identity and sense of place of Saint Paul

- Policy HP-6.** Maintain and preserve designated and determined eligible cultural and historic resources.
- Policy HP-7.** Be proactive in the identification, evaluation, survey and designation of cultural and historic resources throughout the city to ensure a consistent and equitable approach to preservation that is time-sensitive and responsive to community needs.
- Policy HP-8.** Develop new, and expand existing, historic themes and contexts to allow for continual identification of cultural and historic resources that is time-sensitive and responsive to community needs.
- Policy HP-9.** Prioritize the protection of properties and districts designated for heritage preservation from destruction or alteration that would compromise the integrity of their character-defining features.

Goal 3: The consideration of cultural and heritage preservation goals and priorities in all City departments, initiatives, policies, practices and processes Incorporate City cultural and heritage preservation goals when updating ordinances, policies, and other regulations, including the Saint Paul Administrative and Legislative Codes, and as part of planning, development and design processes.

- Policy HP-10.** Ensure that City officials and staff at all levels have a working understanding and consider the importance of designation, preservation, and protecting

cultural and historic resources, focusing on recognized cultural and heritage preservation principles.

Goal 4: City investments in built, cultural and natural environments and in cultural and historic resources that reflect broader City priorities

Policy HP-11. Prioritize the retention of designated/listed cultural and historic resources (or those determined eligible for designation) over demolition when evaluating projects that require or request City action, involvement or funding, or those of related development authorities.

Policy HP-12. Use the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties when City or other development authority action, involvement or funding is requested or required.

Policy HP-13. Include preservation-related funding programs as part of the resource allocation process for funding requests for preservation-related projects.

Policy HP-14. Utilize cultural and historic resources to:

- improve pedestrian safety, mobility and visibility;
- foster economic development;
- support neighborhood revitalization and reinvestment, particularly along transit corridors;
- prevent or minimize displacement of area residents and businesses;
- provide affordable housing; and
- celebrate the city's rich and diverse cultures and heritage.

Policy HP-15. Balance preservation of a historic and/or cultural resource and new development by considering the:

- significance of the resource;
- impact of a proposed development action on the character-defining features of the resource;
- potential for displacement of area residents and businesses;
- evolution of the neighborhood and how neighborhood change is occurring;
- long-term benefit-cost analysis and impact; and
- appropriateness of mitigation activities should the resource be compromised or lost.

Goal 5: Broad stakeholder understanding and application of cultural and heritage preservation planning tools and resources

Policy HP-16. Ensure that property owners, real estate professionals and community members have a working understanding of cultural and heritage preservation regulations, principles and related available resources.

Policy HP-17. Consult with, include and educate communities regarding cultural and heritage preservation activities, benefits, funding and resources.

Policy HP-18. Prioritize the recognition of historically-underrepresented communities and their histories in:

- the designation of significant buildings, sites and districts;
- funding that supports the preservation and retention of designated historic and cultural resources; and
- community engagement so that those whose histories are being celebrated are involved in creating the narrative.

SIDEBARS (listed in no particular order)

Sidebar 1: The charge of the HPC

The council of the City of Saint Paul hereby declares as a matter of public policy that the preservation, protection, perpetuation and use of areas, places, buildings, structures and other objects having a special historical, community or aesthetic interest or value is a public necessity and is required in the interest of the health, prosperity, safety and welfare of the people. The purposes of this chapter are to:

- (1) Safeguard the heritage of the City of Saint Paul by preserving sites and structures which reflect elements of the city's cultural, social, economic, political or architectural history;
- (2) Protect and enhance the City of Saint Paul's attraction to residents, tourists and visitors, and serve as a support and stimulus to business and industry;
- (3) Enhance the visual and aesthetic character, diversity and interest of the City of Saint Paul;
- (4) Foster civic pride in the beauty and notable accomplishments of the past; and
- (5) Promote the use and preservation of historic sites and structures for the education and general welfare of the people of the City of Saint Paul.

Other sidebars:

Sidebar 2a: economic benefits of preservation, including practical/real examples of positive relationships between preservation and investment/value

Sidebar 2b: economic benefits of and concept of cultural tourism;

Sidebar 3: definitions of key terms, such as, "preservation," rehabilitation, "theme," or "context" etc

Sidebar 4: What cultural and historic resources are (e.g. buildings, structures, objects, etc.)

Sidebar 5: Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation

Graphics: photos, maps of districts, photographic links to resources, and "then in now" images?