

city of saint paul
planning commission resolution
file number _____
date _____

SNELLING-MIDWAY SOCCER STADIUM SITE PLAN

WHEREAS, Nate Pearson, Tegra Group, Inc., File#16-042321 has applied for a site plan review for a proposed 20,000 seat professional soccer stadium with expansion and standing room capacity to accommodate a maximum of 25,500 visitors and staff. This development is a first phase of what will eventually be a multi-phase redevelopment of the entire “super block” currently the site of former Metro Transit facilities and the Midway Shopping Center; and

WHEREAS the Planning Commission, on June 10, 2016, held a public hearing at which all persons present were given an opportunity to be heard pursuant to said application in accordance with the requirements of §61.303 of the Saint Paul Legislative Code; and

WHEREAS, the Saint Paul Planning Commission, based on the evidence presented to its Zoning Committee at the public hearing as substantially reflected in the minutes, made the following findings of fact that the site plan is consistent with:

1. *The City’s adopted comprehensive plan and development or project plans for sub-areas of the city.*

The proposed project is consistent with the Saint Paul Comprehensive Plan. The Snelling Station Area Plan (SSAP), part of the comprehensive plan, and the Land Use, Transportation, and Parks and Recreation chapters of the Saint Paul Comprehensive Plan were consulted to make this finding.

Snelling Station Area Plan (SSAP)

- The site is identified as an area of change in the SSAP, an area where change is welcome and should be encouraged whether through gradual infill and/or intensification or comprehensive redevelopment, page 13.
- The site is located in the mobility enhancement area in the SSAP, an area where a higher level of pedestrian activity is anticipated and a high quality pedestrian environment is key. A minimum of 14 foot wide sidewalks should be established in the mobility enhancement area, page 19.
- The vision of the SSAP calls for a vibrant commercial center, both a city-wide destination and local needs hub that successfully hosts and connects a multitude of uses. These could include corporate headquarters, retail stores, community services, local businesses, residential development, and cultural and entertainment destinations – all structured within a pattern of streets, blocks, and green gathering spaces that promote safer, more active streets and balanced options for movement and increased economic vitality, page 14.

moved by _____

seconded by _____

in favor _____

against _____

- The SSAP notes that future retail will include a significant entertainment component, possibly at the bus barn site, page 12.
- The SSAP calls for a string of gathering places connected by an improved hierarchy of public streets and development blocks that could improve the accessibility and connectivity of these spaces to surrounding neighborhoods, page 19.
- The SSAP adds that a green open space might support development of a significant new employment center, research park, institutional campus, urban format retail center, hotel, or entertainment uses on this site, page 19.
- The bus barn site is a strategic parcel that could lend itself to a variety of uses including an expanded retail area, major corporate employment hub, hotel or conference facility, residential development and entertainment uses, page 26.

Citywide Comprehensive Plan Chapters – The Land Use chapter of the Comprehensive Plan identifies the redevelopment site as a neighborhood center located along a mixed use corridor; the bus barn site is identified as an undeveloped opportunity site. The Transportation chapter notes that when redevelopment opportunities become available, the traditional street grid pattern should be reinstated to increase neighborhood connectivity. The Parks and Recreation chapter calls for: 1) ensuring convenient and equitable access to parks and recreation facilities; 2) ensuring attractive, functional, and engaging four-season public spaces; 3) requiring that location and design of parks, open space, and trails be an integral part of large-scale redevelopment projects; and 4) utilizing storm water as a sustainable resource when parks are constructed or redesigned.

2. ***Applicable ordinances of the City of Saint Paul.***

- Sec. 66.343 Traditional neighborhood district design standards.
The stadium development's conformance with the design standards in the T4 zoning district are addressed in the Snelling – Midway Master Plan staff report.
- Sec.66.342.(b)(3). Placement of parking(temporary parking lot on west side of stadium).
The current site plan shows a parking lot on the west side of the stadium. The future phases indicate this area will be developed for mixed-use office and retail buildings with one level of underground parking, with the rest of the parking on floors 2 and above. The proposed use of these parcels is intended for stadium event parking only and will not be used for off-street parking at other times. Staff encourages the development of the area west of the stadium for commercial office space and does not believe the long term use of this area for parking is appropriate. Consequently, staff is considering recommending that the parking be developed to a lesser standard than is required by City code; and stipulating a term limit as temporary use for parking, via an interim use permit. The City Council would need to approve the interim use permit. In any case the use of the area west of the stadium, as configured, does not meet T4 zoning for the same reasons as the eastern parking lot.
- Sec. 66.331(h) Maximum height of structures in the T4 district appears to be met.
The Stadium height is 71'2" and the "membrane roofing" slopes back at a slope of less than 1:1 so the proposed stadium height is less than the 75 ft. maximum allowed without a conditional use permit.

Off-Street Parking

- 63.207(b)(c)
The site is in a Traditional Neighborhood district located adjacent (within ¼ mile) of University Avenue. No parking is required for this development [63.207(b)]. The parking proposed includes 349 off-street spaces and 84 on-street spaces internal to the site. The parking

provided does not exceed the minimum required by more than 40% [63.207(c) - a 20,000 seat stadium would require 5000 parking spaces at the rate of 1space per every 4 seats] so a conditional use permit is not required. Given the above analysis, off-street parking, access to the stadium and related traffic issues are being evaluated as part of the AUAR process.

Parkland Dedication

- Sec. 69.511 (a) (b)

§ 69.511(a) *Parkland dedication requirement* provides that for platting of land for residential, commercial, or industrial development the City may require dedication of a reasonable portion of the buildable land for public use for parks and open space needed as a result of the plat, to a maximum of 9% of the total acreage of new lots for new residential or mixed-use development and to a maximum of 4% of the total acreage of new lots for new commercial or industrial development. This will be done as part of the platting process for the Snelling-Midway Redevelopment site.

§ 69.511(b) *One-time basis of parkland dedication requirements* provides that “once parkland has been dedicated or conveyed to the City under this section to meet the needs for parkland created by the plat, there shall be no further parkland dedication requirement under Sec. 63.701 at the time of building permits.”

Based on the draft master plan, 4% of the 7.9 acre stadium site itself is 0.32 acre and 9% of the other 14 acres of buildable land is 1.26 acres. Dedication of 1.6 acres of parkland as part of the platting process would be enough to provide for residential uses to potentially be part of development on all but the stadium block itself. It appears that the proposed Victory Plaza and Midway Square park areas, not including proposed street right-of-way, would be over 2 acres.

Drainage Dedication

- Sec. 69.504

§ 69.511(g)(2) *Dedication of Land* provides that land be reserved for storm water detention ponds in locations designated in the comprehensive plan or as designated by the director of public works such that their use will ... substantially reduce the costs of the storm water disposal system. The area shall be shown and marked on the plat.

The City’s comprehensive storm water management plan (SWMP) for the 34.4 acre site identified a central system to provide storm water management and rainwater reuse for all development sites including the stadium.

The Applicant developed a storm water management plan narrative (dated June 24, 2016) which identifies three scenarios for storm water management. The scenarios include a Base Plan designed for the Stadium site to meet the storm water standards for opening day, a comprehensive storm water management plan (CSMP), and a phased CSMP. The narrative acknowledges that a CSMP scenario would “eliminate the need for a majority of the Base Plan’s separate treatment facilities.” Current limitations noted for a CSMP scenario include land acquisition, easements, and environmental investigation. Other unresolved considerations identified in the narrative include long-term financing, operation and management of the CSMP, and how costs would be fairly distributed during ultimate development. This topic is currently being investigated by City staff as part of a national grant opportunity called City Accelerator.

There is sufficient information to consider the Base Plan satisfactory as a design contingency while continuing to evaluate and pursue the feasibility of a CSMP or phased CSMP scenario consistent with the intent of this ordinance.

Need for Zoning Variances Identified

As plans have developed for this project, staff has identified the need for variance of the minimum floor area ratio (FAR) requirement for the stadium and a variance of the Traditional Neighborhood standards regarding location of a parking facility associated with the stadium use [see bullet items below]. A separate public hearing for the variances is required. Pursuant to Sec. 61.202, the Planning Commission may act as the Board of Zoning Appeals and grant variances from the regulations of the code related to site plan approval when considered by the planning commission. The commission shall grant the variances in accordance with the findings for variance per section 61.601. These variances have been tentatively scheduled for public hearing at the July 28th Zoning Committee meeting.

- **Sec. 66.331(a) FAR (Floor Area Ratio) (Variance Required)**

The architect for the project estimates the FAR for the stadium at 0.195 based on the total area of “enclosed” spaces on Main Concourse, Club and Suite levels at 108,570 SF and a site area of 12.76 acres or 555,850 SF. The FAR was calculated as 108,570sf / 555,850sf or 0.195. *A minimum FAR of 1.0 is required.*

- **Sec. 66.342(b)(3) Placement of parking (Variance Required)**

St. Paul Leg. Code Sec. 66.342(b)(3) states that, “Surface parking may be located: On a separate lot, in compliance with section 63.304, provided that surface parking is not permitted as the principal use of a lot unless it is shared among multiple businesses or uses.” The applicant has indicated that the ultimate programming for this parking lot is not known, other than for use during stadium events. Since the parking is not shared with multiple uses, a variance must be obtained to allow the proposed location of the parking lot on a separate lot.

~~[Comp. Planning Com. recommended removing variance findings since the variance will require a separate hearing] The required findings for a variance, pursuant to Sec. 61.601, are listed below. It appears that these findings could be met.~~

~~1. **The variance is in harmony with the general purposes and intent of the zoning code.**~~

~~The concept of FAR (floor area ratio) is a way of addressing the intensity of use for property. Applying the concept of FAR is not a useful measurement in the case of an open air stadium. By its nature, the stadium has limited enclosed area for calculation of FAR but is nonetheless a robust structure regarding massing and intensity of use which is the desired objective of the master plan for this area. The variance is in keeping with the general purpose and intent of the zoning code~~

~~The proposed parking lot is in the same T4 zoning district in which the stadium is located and within 300 feet (~80 feet away from stadium), pursuant to Leg. Code Sec. 63.304 and as such, complies with the first part of Sec. 66.343(b)(3). Providing off-street parking is a customary use associated with a stadium. The proposed parking located on the lot, adjacent to the stadium is in keeping with the general purpose and intent of the zoning code.~~

~~2. **The variance is consistent with the comprehensive plan.** The proposed stadium development and the subject parking lot are included in the Snelling-Midway Redevelopment Site Master Plan and are consistent with the comprehensive plan for this area.~~

~~3. **The applicant has established that there are practical difficulties in complying with the provision, that the property owner proposes to use the property in a reasonable manner not permitted by the provision. Economic considerations alone do not constitute practical difficulties.**~~

~~The minimum FAR requirement in the Traditional Neighborhood requirements relates to achieving the traditional urban form. The proposed stadium is a unique structure with a~~

~~design purpose that presents practical difficulties in meeting urban design standards (i.e. FAR) on a unique large site adjacent to a freeway.~~

~~The master plan for the site includes the soccer stadium and also acknowledges the south east corner of the site at Pascal and St Anthony for off-street parking.~~

~~The proposed stadium development and off-street parking lot are reasonable uses of the property.~~

~~4. **The plight of the landowner is due to circumstances unique to the property not created by the landowner.**~~

~~The stadium, future mixed use developments, and introduction of public streets and open space anticipated with the master plan for the area, and the uniquely large site adjacent to a freeway, present unique challenges for the redevelopment of the site that are circumstance not created by the landowner.~~

~~5. **The variance will not permit any use that is not allowed in the zoning district where the affected land is located.**~~

~~The master plan for this area and proposed zoning amendment for outdoor stadiums, if approved, would permit a sports stadium on the subject property. An off-street parking facility at this site is a permitted use in the T4 zoning district where the property is located. The requested variances will not permit any use that is not allowed in the zoning district.~~

~~6. **The variance will not alter the essential character of the surrounding area.**~~

~~The site for the proposed stadium is part of a large regional commercial area adjacent to I-94 and Snelling and LRT transportation corridors.~~

~~The proposed parking lot is in a location that is currently a paved lot used for parking.~~

~~Redevelopment of this portion of the site for the stadium and accessory parking does not alter the essential character of the surrounding area.~~

3. ***Preservation of unique geologic, geographic or historically significant characteristics of the city and environmentally sensitive areas.***

The project site does not include any unique geologic, geographic or historically significant characteristics or environmentally sensitive areas.

4. ***Protection of adjacent and neighboring properties through reasonable provision for such matters as surface water drainage, sound and sight buffers, preservation of views, light and air, and those aspects of design which may have substantial effects on neighboring land uses.***

The site is well serve by utilities so access to adequate water, sewer, and power service should be met. There is further discussion on the location of public infrastructure, within the site, that is ongoing with the preliminary plat review for the stadium site. The location and siting of the stadium would not appear to present any particular impacts to views, light and air for the neighboring land uses. The Alternative Urban Areawide Review (AUAR) prepared for the redevelopment site states that calculated sound levels from the stadium are not expected to exceed the City's daytime noise level standard. During the nighttime hours, the sound system may exceed the allowable sound level limit, depending upon how long an event extends beyond 10:00 pm. The AUAR identifies mitigation measures to address the potential to exceed City noise level limits including scheduling sporting events so that regulation play is completed by 10:00 pm, or obtaining a sound level variance.

5. ***The arrangement of buildings, uses and facilities of the proposed development in order to assure abutting property and/or its occupants will not be unreasonably affected.***

The potential for impacts to abutting properties related to transportation of game day transportation is being evaluated as part of the environmental review process (AUAR). The draft AUAR and mitigation plan suggest strategies for management of game day transportation to get the majority of attendees to and from the stadium within an hour before and after games and to minimize impacts to the transportation network, including vehicular traffic, transit, and other modes. The draft AUAR and mitigation plan suggests formation of a transportation management committee—to include representatives from various public agencies, MN United FC, and the City of Saint Paul—to use the suggested strategies to develop detailed plans for managing game day transportation. This will include development of emergency response plans which are needed in conjunction with certifying the stadium for occupancy.

6. ***Creation of energy-conserving design through landscaping and location, orientation and elevation of structures.***

The proposed development is not obligated to meet the City's Sustainable Building Policy. The City has expressed a strong desire that the stadium comply with the Saint Paul Sustainable Building Policy and the applicant has expressed their interest in meeting, to the extent possible, the requirements set forth in the Policy. Additionally, the enclosed portion of the stadium structure will be required to meet energy code requirements of the MN State Building Code and the developer's designers have indicated they will incorporate energy- conservation in the stadium design.

7. ***Safety and convenience of both vehicular and pedestrian traffic both within the site and in relation to access streets, including traffic circulation features, the locations and design of entrances and exits and parking areas within the site.***

The site plan presents anticipated road ways for circulation within the site and access to the adjacent streets. City, county and local staff have found these to be generally acceptable and are working with the developer's designers to ensure that final plans will provide safe and convenient access for all users.

8. ***The satisfactory availability and capacity of storm and sanitary sewers, including solutions to any drainage problems in the area of the development.***

The City has adequate sanitary and storm sewer systems along with the necessary capacity to accommodate the proposed construction. The Sewer Utility does not anticipate any significant public sanitary sewer related issues that will affect the proposed construction.

9. ***Sufficient landscaping, fences, walls and parking necessary to meet the above objectives.***

A landscaping plan will need to be developed incorporating a design that meets the general landscaping requirements for parking facilities of Sec. 63.314 and the Traditional Neighborhood design standards of Sec. 66.343 governing landscaping for front yard, street trees, etc. The landscaping plan will need to include consideration for public art, compatibility with public use of space and surface storm water amenities.

10. ***Site accessibility in accordance with the provisions of the Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA), including parking spaces, passenger loading zones and accessible routes.***

The stadium building and all areas of the site where the public may travel will need to meet the accessibility requirement of MN State Building Code (which incorporate provision of the ADA). Accessibility requirements are mandated for both private and public spaces. Staff review of the construction level plans will be looked at for compliance with these requirements.

11. ***Provision for erosion and sediment control as specified in the Minnesota Pollution Control Agency's "Manual for Protecting Water Quality in Urban Areas."***

A Storm Water Pollution Prevention Plan (SWPPP) is required during construction. This document will need to be provided prior to final approval. The AUAR states to limit soil erosion, any construction plans will include measures that restrict and contain any soil erosion using a variety of methods including silt fencing, seeding, mulching, and limiting the exposure of open soils to wind and rain. Discharge of storm water will be managed in accordance with the City's National Pollutant Discharge Elimination System (NPDES) municipal separate storm sewer systems (MS4) Storm water Permit, and Storm water Pollution Prevention Plan (SWPPP) and Construction Site Storm water Permit to ensure that erosion is limited and that any runoff-receiving water bodies are protected.

Gravel is not an approved surface for parking lots. Sediment control from gravel surfaces is difficult and often creates nuisance conditions that degrade water quality. The surface parking lot proposed adjacent to Snelling and west of the Stadium will be temporary until the market can support appropriate transit-oriented development at that location. It is not clear what surface will be provided for parking at that location. Any potential supplemental applications for the temporary parking lot which propose gravel as an interim surface cover must include on-going provisions for erosion and sediment control including a written and funded street sweeping maintenance plan.

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED, that the Planning Commission recommends that the Mayor and City Council approve the Snelling-Midway Redevelopment Site Plan within the redevelopment area, subject to the following conditions:

1. Approval by the Mayor and City Council of the Snelling-Midway master plan, stadium site plan, and zoning clarification amendment.
2. The applicant shall apply for and obtain approval of variances of the two provisions of the zoning code identified in the staff report. Since the variances were identified in the context of the site plan review the Planning Commission, acting as the Board of Zoning Appeals, will need to conduct a separate public hearing to consider the variance requests.
3. The developer shall obtain City Council approval of an interim use permit to allow a temporary parking lot to be developed on the west side of the stadium fronting on Snelling Avenue.

4. General Site Plan Elements Needing Further Detail:

- a) Bicycle parking shall be provided, in accordance with Leg. Code 63.210 a minimum of one (1) secure bicycle parking space for every twenty (20) motor vehicle parking spaces. The developer's designers have indicated the site plan shows bike parking locations that will accommodate 420 bicycle parking spaces.
- b) The developer's designers shall work with the City in formulating their design of the plaza north of the stadium and the pedestrian walk on the south side of the stadium along St. Anthony Avenue, between Pascal and Snelling.
- c) Pedestrian-scale lighting shall be provided within parking areas. Light standards shall be no more than twenty-five (25) feet in height in parking lots and sixteen (16) feet in height along interior sidewalks and walkways, and have a downcast glow.
[Comp. Planning Com. recommended adding this condition]
- d) As discussed in the master plan staff report, the planning for infrastructure in the Snelling-Midway urban village shall include provision for broadband development.

5. Public Works Transportation Planning and R.O.W.

- a) Complete design for the location and type of infrastructure elements within the proposed public rights-of-way (e.g. lane configuration, appropriately sized pedestrian walks, bike, vehicle travel and parking lanes, lighting, street trees, etc.). Note: Once the site plan is approved, public improvements shall be constructed under an Ordinance Permit issued by Public Works. Plans for an Ordinance Permit need to be at higher level of detail and would include details such as pavement thickness, pavement specs, etc.
- b) Provide updated plat coinciding with final alignments for the public rights-of-way planned for the site.
- c) Continue discussion with City, County and State transportation agencies in finalizing the design for site access to local, county and state roads adjacent to the site. Obtain all necessary permits and approvals.
- d) The developer will need to provide a game/event day Traffic Management Plan more specific to the stadium site than the information contained in the Transportation Plan of the AUAR.
- e) Provide plans for pedestrian and bike circulation access. Plans should include design approach for transit access and associated pedestrian queueing for LRT and buses on game days.
- f) Since the stadium will be online prior to other site development taking place, continue to work with the City with respect to identifying motorized and non-motorized traffic impacts specific to the soccer stadium.

6. Public Works Sewers

- a) Detailed plan & profile design of the proposed sanitary and storm sewer construction will need to be reviewed and approved by the Sewer Utility.
- b) The Sewer Utility is aware of the ongoing efforts of having a comprehensive storm water management plan for the entire site. When the detailed plan & profile design for the storm sewer construction, along with the chosen storm water management plan become available, they will need to be reviewed by the Sewer Utility.
- c) Developer to submit geotechnical and environmental investigation reports.
- d) The design for the publicly-owned storm sewers within the development shall be for the 10-year storm event, 24-hr duration.
- e) Site elements proposed to be maintained by Public Works will require the development and submittal of an Operations and Maintenance Manual from the Developer identifying activities and frequency. Further agreements may also be necessary.

7. Water Utility

Develop plans for the water service needs for this development and obtain all necessary reviews, approvals and permits from the Saint Paul Regional Water Utility.

8. Parkland Dedication

At least ~~4.60~~0.32 acres of the site be dedicated for parkland as condition of final plat approval.

9. Water Resource

- a) The project will be affecting more than one acre. No land disturbance activity for the project is allowed until state and watershed storm water permits are obtained and provided to the Department of Safety and Inspections.
- b) If gravel is used as surface cover for the interim use parking, the parking operator/owner shall provide the Department of Safety and Inspections a written street sweeping maintenance plan for implementation as an on-going provision for erosion and sediment control.
- c) Engineering design towards a Comprehensive Storm Water Management Plan (CSMP) scenario must progress concurrent with engineering design for a Base Plan scenario in order to support timely infrastructure implementation for the CSMP possibility.

- d) Rainwater harvesting of the entire stadium roof must be explored and more details on the sources, uses and treatment approach for rainwater reuse (Base Plan and CSMP) must be reviewed with the Department of Safety and Inspections prior to City Council action.

10. City Forestry

- a) Street trees shall be incorporated into the design for the public streets within this site. The landscape designer for this project shall consult with the City Forester, regarding species, size and location of the trees to be placed in the boulevards. The planting of trees on the public boulevard require a permit from the City Forester.
- b) Parking lots not designated as temporary shall meet internal landscaping standards and include tree planting to meet parking lot design standards. This would apply to the parking lot located at the southeast corner of the site as the parking lots to the west of the stadium would be temporary in nature until future development occurs. One tree for every five parking stalls is required as well as internal landscaping equal to 15% of the parking lot area.
- c) Trees shall be provided along the east/west street serving the southeast parking lot.

11. Building Code Requirements

- a) This proposal will require a building permit to proceed. The building permit is issued only after plans have been approved by City staff. Architectural, mechanical plans are required to be submitted under the general building permit application. In addition to the building permit, separate permits are required for any plumbing, electrical, mechanical work and elevator installation and any sprinkler modifications. These permits must be obtained and the work performed by City licensed contractors in each of the respective trades.
- b) Two sets of complete construction documents (including floor plans and any structural or mechanical ventilation plans) must be submitted with the building permit application to the plan review group in DSI.
 - i. The construction documents must include architectural and any structural plans signed and stamped by design professionals, registered in the State of Minnesota, in the each of the respective disciplines. Architect shall provide code analysis.
 - ii. Mechanical ventilation, plumbing and electrical plans will need to be prepared by design professionals, registered with the State of Minnesota, in each of the respective disciplines.
- c) Additional comments from the Building Official and Fire Engineer on plans submitted with stadium:
 - Identify occupant use on the field to account for total exiting requirements out of the site.
 - Need civils showing design for unobstructed exit path to the public way.
 - The building permit will not be issued until all signoffs are received. Include energy calculation in construction documents with building permit application.

12. Fire Prevention

Fire Department vehicle access shall extend to within 150 feet of every portion of the exterior of the building. Access shall occur on public right of way or private drives on the same parcel as the building. Access shall have 20 feet of clear width and 13.5 feet of clear height.

13. SAC, or Service Availability Charge

The propose project will need a SAC determination before a building permit can be issued. The applicant much submit a copy of the plans to the Metropolitan Council Environmental Services (MCES) for a SAC determination. If MCES determines that a SAC fee is owed, the City will collect that payment under the building permit fee.