

**ACTION MINUTES OF THE HERITAGE PRESERVATION COMMISSION
CITY OF SAINT PAUL, MINNESOTA
City Hall/Court House, 15 Kellogg Boulevard West, Council Chambers
March 9, 2020**

Present: Steve George, Casie Radford, Barbara Bezat, Stuart MacDonald, Paul Nelson, Robert Lubke, Joseph Peroutka, David Wagner
Absent: Leetta Douglas, Teresa Kimker
Staff Present: George Gause
Number of Public Present: 7

- I. **Call to Order** 3:30pm

- II. **Adoption of the Agenda** *Commissioner Bezat moved to adopt the agenda. Commissioner Peroutka seconded the motion. **Motion passed 7-0.***

- III. **Conflicts of Interest** *None*

- IV. **Minutes**
*Minutes for February 10, 2020 were reviewed. Commissioner Lubke moved to recommend approval of the minutes. Commissioner Peroutka seconded the motion. **Motion passed 7-0.***

*Minutes for February 24, 2020 were reviewed. Commissioner Nelson moved to recommend approval of the minutes. Commissioner Bezat seconded the motion. **Motion passed 7-0.***

- V. **Public Hearing**
 - A. 156 Dale Street Auto-Shop Demolition; Historic Hill Heritage District

Commissioners questioned how they should consider economic values or effect. Commissioners asked staff if there are other similar garages in the district. Commissioners asked if there are historic photos of the structure. Commissioners asked if the building is considered historic.

Sylvia Frank with Carlsen & Frank Architects addressed the commission. They started the proposal to renovate the structure. Façade has been set back and the building altered. There is a structural concern with the roof joists. Windows along the alley could not be reinstalled due to Building Code. It would not be possible to bring the structure up to Energy Code. Existing building does not conform to the setbacks as required by the guidelines. The proposed structure will increase the vitality to the area. Height of new building will be 8' higher than corner historic building. Existing building doesn't have a lot of merit.

Commissioners asked about incorporating the structure into the larger project. Commissioners commented that the building is utilitarian, but elegant. There was agreement that Building Code and Energy Code can be overcome. Buildings such as this are renovated and rehabbed every day.

*Commissioner Bezat moved to approve the draft resolution to adopt the proposed resolution to deny the demolition of 156 Dale Street North per the findings of fact, presented testimony, submitted documentation and information provided in the staff report. Commissioner Lubke seconded the motion. **Motion passed 7-0.***

VI. Pre-Application

A. 594 Selby Avenue/156 Dale Street Pre-App Review New Infill Construction

Commissioners provided feedback on the pre-app review:

Building as proposed seems much higher than what is found in the area.

Street façade is properly divided storefronts.

Top 'top hat' floor of building seems too high and distracting.

This could change the rhythm along Selby and Dale.

Brick façade works.

Commissioners were mixed on window scale and size.

Color of top floor is distracting.

Auto access and curb-cut on Selby is an issue.

Selby façade should address the street and not in-set.

VII. Public Comment

Mason Riddle, historic preservation liaison with the Ramsey Hill Neighborhood Association commented on the length of operation of the auto shop at 156 Dale Street and rising new construction heights in the historic district.

VIII. Adjourn 4:55pm