

**ACTION MINUTES OF THE HERITAGE PRESERVATION COMMISSION
CITY OF SAINT PAUL, MINNESOTA
City Hall/Court House, 15 Kellogg Boulevard West, Council Chambers**

June 03, 2019

Present: Barbara Bezat, Teresa Kimker, Bill Lightner Richard Dana, Michael Justin, Leetta Douglas, Steve George, Robert Lubke, Paul Nelson, Joe Peroutka, Casie Radford

Absent: Stuart MacDonald, David Wagner

Staff Present: George Gause, Allison Suhan

Number of Public Present: 12

I. Call to Order 3:30pm

II. Adoption of the Agenda *Commissioner Dana moved to adopt the agenda.
Commissioner George seconded the motion. **Motion passed 10-0.***

III. Conflicts of Interest *None.*

IV. Minutes

Minutes for May 6, 2019 were reviewed.

*Commissioner Lubke moved to recommend approval of the minutes. Commissioner Dana seconded the motion. **Motion passed 10-0.***

V. Public Hearing

5 Heather Place – Historic Hill Heritage Preservation District – Public hearing for review for construction of a three-stall garage. (Suhan 266-6643)

There was a procedural question concerning pre-app vs public hearing.

A concern was raised about the stone proposed.

There were questions concerning setbacks and front vs. rear.

Commission asked if the garage needed to be 3-bays

Commission asked about the existing site walls

The HPC heard support and opposition concerning the proposal.

Commissioner Dana explained that no less than three Clarence Johnston and three Cass Gilbert design structures were within 150' of the proposed construction.

Commission discussed Heather Place being the front of the structure.

Commissioners expressed that the garage was sensitively designed.

Commissioners discussed the other garages found on Heather Place.

Commissioner stated that Grand Avenue was an exposed façade.

Commissioner Dana moved to deny the application for construction of a three-stall garage because of the potential adverse effect such construction would have on a significant historic structure and the historic district. Commissioner Nelson seconded.

Motion failed 2-8 (Against: Kimker, Lightner, Justin, Douglas, George, Lubke, Peroutka, Radford)

*Commissioner Lubke moved to conditionally approve the application to construct a three-stall detached garage at 5 Heather Place as per the findings of fact, presented testimony, submitted documentation and information provided in the staff report with the 8 conditions. Commissioner George seconded. **Motion passed 8-2** (Against: Dana, Nelson)*

VI. Old Business

Hill State and National Historic District context grant update

Staff read a prepared statement:

Saint Paul Heritage Preservation along with staff from the Department of Planning and Economic Development (PED) applied and was awarded a \$24,000 Certified Local Government (CLG) grant from the State Historic Preservation Office (SHPO) in the fall of 2018. The grant was to hire a consultant to update the existing Saint Paul Historic Context Studies and develop new contexts within the boundaries of the State and National Register Historic Hill Districts (Districts). Historic contexts provide the framework to help determine if a resource is historically significant and worthy of preservation.

Due to internal delays, including the introduction of a new financial software system for the City of Saint Paul, the timeline for completion of the project was greatly reduced. The department did not receive any responses to the released request for proposals (RFP) for the study. The grant funds will be returned to the SHPO.

VII. New Business

HPC CLG Consultation-National Historic Preservation Act
FTA Rush Line.

Commissioners discussed the inclusion of the Hamm's and 3M potential historic districts.

*Commissioner Justin moved to recommend that the APE be expanded to include the potentially eligible Hamm's Historic District and the potentially eligible 3M Campus Historic District both near the Arcade Street & Phalen Boulevard intersection in Saint Paul and to concur with the phase 1 work submitted for the Metro Transit's Metro Transit Rush Line BRT and looks forward to being involved with the architecture & history survey of downtown Saint Paul including the Lowertown Historic District as per presented testimony, submitted documentation and information provided in the staff report. Commissioner Dana seconded. **Motion passed 10-0***

VIII. Guidelines Discussion

Roofing. The Commission continued a year-long series of discussions on the Legislative Code Chapter 74 Preservation Plans, otherwise know as the design guidelines. This was an informal discussion that will provide the initial thoughts on direction of any possible rewrite of the guidelines and focus for future public, professional and trades input.

Commissioner discussion:

We should include less specificity, roofing protects the resource from damage. Alternative materials may be acceptable in certain circumstances if it visually matches. Alternative products must match color, texture, profile, size, sheen, etc. With cool or green roofing, the commission should adopt the Secretary of the Interiors Standards for Sustainability.

IX. Adjourn 5:20pm