

**ACTION MINUTES OF THE HERITAGE PRESERVATION COMMISSION
CITY OF SAINT PAUL, MINNESOTA
City Hall/Court House, 15 Kellogg Boulevard West, Council Chambers**

July 1, 2019

Present: Barbara Bezat, Teresa Kimker, Steve George, Paul Nelson, Robert Lubke, Joe Peroutka, Casie Radford, Richard Dana, Leetta Douglas, David Wagner, Michael Justin

Absent: Bill Lightner, Stuart MacDonald

Staff Present: George Gause

Number of Public Present: 5

I. Call to Order 3:30pm

II. Adoption of the Agenda *Commissioner Dana moved to adopt the agenda. Commissioner Peroutka seconded the motion. **Motion passed 9-0.***

III. Conflicts of Interest *None.*
(Commissioner Justin arrives)

IV. Minutes

Minutes for June 3, 2019 were reviewed.
*Commissioner Dana moved to recommend approval of the minutes. Commissioner Lubke seconded the motion. **Motion passed 10-0.***

V. Public Hearing

A. 294 Laurel Avenue, Riley Row-Historic Hill Heritage District. Application to remove stone sidewalks and replace with concrete. (Gause 266-6714)

Commissioners questioned the extent of the replacement; just the sidewalk or also the associated walkways.

Commissioners questioned how to factor in cost of materials.

Commissioners questioned if Public Works should be involved in this proposal.

Technical details about the existing stone was questioned.

Applicant explained that Public Works required estimates for all options.

Applicant explained that safety, cost and future maintenance were the issues.

HOA President: Safety is the major concern.

Building resident: The sidewalk is dangerous.

Commissioner questioned that design guidelines are clear to maintain stone sidewalks, why go against this?

Discussion about safety.

Discussion about retaining good panels.

Discussion about use of stone as a sidewalk material.

Commissioner George moved approve the replacement of the sandstone sidewalk with concrete sidewalk with a tooled joint in a square grid pattern which matches area grid patterns at 286-94 Laurel Avenue and 123-7 Nina Street per the findings of fact, presented testimony, submitted documentation and information provided in the staff report with the four conditions. Commissioner Wagner seconded the motion.

Motion passed, 6-4 (Against-Kimker, Lubke, Nelson, Peroutka)

VI. New Business

Economic Hardship discussion/guidelines (part 1)

Commissioners discussed:

Hardship should be tied to reasonable use of the property

Need to define taking, reasonable use and diminishing the value of a property

Difficult to determine financial burdens, we don't have that expertise

Have we had an actual economic hardship case, or issues with cost differences?

Economic hardships and cost differentials are two different issues

Commissioner Kimker moved for staff to pursue financing to fund an economic impact study heritage preservation in Saint Paul. Commissioner Lubke seconded the motion.

Motion passed, 10-0

VII. Adjourn 5:10pm