Sustainable “To Go” Food Packaging Initiative

2nd group meeting 11/21/16
Agenda

- Welcome and Introductions
- Overview and Scope of Work Group
- Review of research
- Next Steps
Overview and Scope of Work Group

Scope:

Evaluate, research, and develop recommendations for a sustainable “To Go” food packaging initiative for the City of Saint Paul.

“To Go” references foods intended for immediate consumption.
Presentations:

- Bulk Buying – Miriam Holsinger, Eureka Recycling
- Small Business Success Stories & Challenges – WasteWise
- Community Outreach – Mary Gleich-Matthews, DSI
- Packaging Options – Rhea Hale, WestRock
- Partnerships – Mike Levy, ACC PFPG
- Economically Viable Product Alternatives – MN Restaurant Association
- Regional Regulatory Comparisons – DSI
- Education (Consumer and Business)
- Marketing – Paris Dunning, East Side Area Business Association
Eureka’s Products Co-Operative Purchasing:

- The co-operative purchasing program has been operating since 1998.
  - 100% ASTM 6400
  - 6868 certified compostable products
  - 100% post-consumer recycled printing paper

This allows consumers to gain access to products that are vetted for quality and environmental benefit at a lower cost because of the bulk purchasing.

- Overhead: cost of operating it, while we do enjoy the bulk discount for our own recycled printing papers and compostable product needs.

Upstream and Downstream Benefits:
- Compostable products help consumers get food waste to composting
- Reduce our need for fossil fuel based production (when bio-based)

We suggest that the ordinance include compostable utensils, as there are now several viable options in the marketplace for compostable options and the commonly polystyrene versions are not recyclable.
Poly coated ASTM certified materials

- Cups, plates etc. are widely used at events and in other venues
- The amount of education to try to clear up this confusion would be costly
- The result of the cross contamination would negate environmental goals and could result in plastic in the compost or a degradation of the recycled paper.

The technical and economic viability of recycling polycoated papers has not been conclusively determined.
- Paper markets have historically stipulated restrictions on the inclusion of coated papers in the recycling program based on the impact it has on the quality of the recycled paper.
- Mechanisms used to filter out these energy used to collect and transport those items.

Recycling programs now more than ever cannot rely on a single market for any commodity including paper. Eureka Recycling requires at least two economically viable and stable markets for the material.

**Note:** Black plastic, Poly Styrene and PLA should not be accepted as an alternative since they do not have any long term, economically viable markets. These items end up as a residual at the MRF or in bales at end markets, adding transportation, collection and processing costs to the City, which are not sustainable, while sustainable alternatives are available.
Education Opportunities

**Eureka** will strongly support all education efforts to increase the success of the Ordinance’s goals. Packaging fairs and outreach events are critical prior to roll out to assist retailers, restaurants and others.

Eureka’s experience at Zero Waste Events and in commercial composting may be useful to the city to support training to help businesses understand how key decisions can lower disposal costs helping to offsetting cost of sustainable products and/or composting services, while meeting their unique business needs.

**Encourage Reuse and Reduction:**
The current ordinance specifically encourages reuse we strongly support and encourage additional opportunities to prioritize reuse and reduction by finding creative ways to help businesses by financially supporting investments such as dishwashers, reusable plates, etc.
Serve Ware Implementation Trends
- Install dishwasher and switch over to reusable serve ware
- Set up in house organics diversion program
- Purchase and use compostable serve ware for in house use
- If business uses compostable serve ware in house, they’re much more likely to purchase compostable to-go packaging.
- Most business with locations in the City of Minneapolis are not using or are in the process of switching to compostable to-go packaging.
- In the past couple of years, the message of the health risks associated with using Styrofoam type packaging seems to be resonating more with businesses.

Real and Perceived Barriers to Recycling Implementation
Documented by Waste Wise in 2015

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Barrier Type</th>
<th>Frequency of Barrier</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Lack Information/Knowledge</td>
<td>196</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cost</td>
<td>147</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Space</td>
<td>94</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tenant or Staff Participation</td>
<td>77</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hassle/Separation</td>
<td>76</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Volume</td>
<td>60</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Availability of Options</td>
<td>51</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Shared Bins</td>
<td>51</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Landlord</td>
<td>42</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Language/ESL</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Smell/Critters</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Contamination</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Poor Service Experience</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Community Outreach

• Small Business Listening Sessions
  • Dayton's Bluff - East Side Enterprise Center
    • 1/3, 1/4 or 1/6 10:00am
  • Rondo Community Center
    • January 3rd and 4th (before 5:30), or 5th (before 4pm)

• Skyway Walk

• Community Listening Session
  • Combined with Short-Term Rental session
INCREASING THE RECOVERY OF FSP

FPI’s overall goal is to develop and promote economically viable and sustainable recovery solutions for foodservice packaging.

City Of St. Paul, Sustainable “To Go” Food Packaging - Rhea Hale, WestRock

- Paper Recovery Alliance (PRA)
- Plastics Recovery Group (PRG)
- Foam Recycling Coalition (FRC)
Where does FSP end up?

- Industrial, Commercial or Institutional: 25%
- Public Space: 3%
- Home: 44%
- In Store: 28%
What is Foodservice Packaging?

Single-use foodservice ware & packaging used by foodservice establishments.

Specifically, our work focuses on:

- Cups (including sleeves)
- Containers, including:
  - Beverage Carriers
- Boxes
- Paper bags
How much FSP is generated?

Total: ~5.5 million tons in U.S.

- Clay Coated Paper
- Poly Coated Paper
- Other Coated Paper
- Napkins
- Paper Bags
- OCC
- Molded Pulp
- PS/PP/PET/PLA
- EPS

In a city of 250,000 people, roughly 3,000 tons generated annually.

- A 10% recovery rate would mean the addition of about 300 tons annually for the facility = approximately 240 tons of paper and 60 tons of plastic.
Community Partnership – Prerequisites

- **MRF Acceptance**
  - Operations
- **MRF Acceptance**
  - End Markets (impact, options, location)
- **Haulers**
  - Community contracts, Suite of materials collected
- **Community Engagement**
  - Director of Public Works, Solid Waste
  - Director, Solid Waste/Recycling Staff
- **Market Assurances**
  - Trade Association and Oversight Organization support
- **End Markets**
  - What can they handle? Volume, quality, overall impact?
Additional studies

Food residue / contamination studies
MRF flow study
Bale composition audits
Bale impact projections
Community Access
Resident messaging survey
Tool kit
Foodservice Packaging Recovery Toolkit

Recovering Foodservice Packaging (FSP) can have substantial benefits in cost-saving waste reduction, revenue generation, reduction of environmental impact and positive expectations from residents and customers. No matter what role you play in recovering foodservice packaging, this Toolkit has something for everyone.

This Recovery Toolkit presents lessons learned in successful recovery of foodservice packaging. It is a comprehensive resource on what foodservice packaging is currently being recovered, collected, processed and marketed. Let's get started!
Establish and fund a proactive, multi-year grant program to...
- Increase public access to post-consumer foam recycling through curbside and/or drop off programs
- Drive actual recovery of foam (increased tons)
- Generate success stories to document and leverage in communications to variety of stakeholders

Grants will provide:
- Foam recycling equipment.
- Technical assistance to grant recipients and others interested in adding foam to their curbside recycling programs.
Resident Messaging Survey

Conducted Summer 2016
Speaking Their Language

How does the language on outreach material impact curbside behavior?
Term Tip: Avoid industry specific terms when referring to recyclables.

- Plastic container: 61%
- Clamshell container: 19%
- Take-out container: ...
- Produce container: 4%
- Hinged container:...

61% of residents call this a “plastic container”
19% say “clamshell container”
Effective Recycling Instructions

Before

Nearly 40% of residents said that “cups should be empty & clean” was clearest

After

More clear than “clean” or “empty” alone

Guideline Tip: Use the terms “empty & clean” are clearest when referring to recycling paper cups
Reliable Recycling Resources

Where do residents go to find out what’s recyclable?
Is it Recyclable?

Where do residents look **first** to find out if an item is recyclable?

**Outreach Tip:** Educate residents on recycling symbols on packaging.
Recycling Flyer Format

Which flyer format do residents find clearest?

**Flyer 1**
Images grouped by Recycling, Compost, Garbage

**Flyer 2**
Images grouped by category-paper, plastic, glass and metal

**Flyer 3**
Images appear individually, not sorted by category
Overall, **85%** of residents said that Flyer 2 was **clearest** in describing how to recycle this container.

Flyer Design Tip:
Categorize your recyclables, and use clear images with short text descriptions.
City of Saint Paul – Sustainable “To Go” Food Packaging Initiative

Partnerships: Successful approaches to reduce litter & waste (case studies)

Nov 21, 2016 Working Group: Mike Levy, ACC PFPG
Partnership Case Studies
Litter & Waste Reduction Case Studies

• Partnership approach – deals with litter/waste reduction for packaging without impacting specific products

• Industry/City Partnerships – ACC experience
  • Honolulu (Oahu), Hawaii
  • Baltimore, MD
  • Los Angeles, CA
  • Moore Recycling/industry associations – web resources for recycling
2016 Activities

• Honolulu – Implementing Litter Abatement Programs

1. Kupu Intern – Litter
2. Litter Index - Including Storm Drain Inlets
3. Ala Moana - Lidded Receptacles Pilot Program
4. Environmental Court Training - Focus on Litter and Stormwater Trash
Ala Moana Park – Lids make a difference to prevent blowing litter than becomes packaging waste in ocean

*KHIB (Keep Hawaiian Islands Beautiful) and KAB (Keep America Beautiful)* - KHIB, KAB and the William S. Richardson Law School in Honolulu is development and presenting enforcement training materials based on local ordinances and state laws related to litter, illegal dumping, marine debris and storm water trash. Training to law and code enforcement officials, prosecutors and justices will also explain how litter-related problems negatively impact Honolulu as a community as well as the vitality of its tourism industry.

*Local Hawaiian Restaurants* - Hawaiian local restaurants play a special role in Hawaii culture. Led by Zippy’s and several other local restaurants, with the guidance of ACC consultants, they have developed a local restaurant pledge based on *Aloha Aina* (Love of the Land), called “Malama 808” to take measures to prevent trash and litter from leaving their establishments. “Malama” is the Hawaiian word for “care for” or “take care of,” and 808 is Hawaii’s area code.

*KUPU*, whose mission is to empower youth to serve their communities through character-building, service learning, and environmental stewardship opportunities that encourage integrity (pono) with God (Ke Akua), self and others, is working with KHIB in an intern program to help foster positive litter prevention and education messages.

*Commercial Harbor (implementing EPA and Hawaii Department of Health/HDOH)* ERP will coordinate with KHIB to develop materials for and conduct a workshop to educate harbor tenants on and help them implement best practices for reducing harbor litter and storm water trash that can become marine debris. This training and promoting tenant’s participation in the Adopt-a-Harbor program will show that the Harbor and its tenants are making good faith efforts to comply with the HDOT Consent Decree of 2014.
Importance of Good Litter Science
Baltimore, MD Partnership - 2013

• Baltimore city wanted to adopt zero waste policy by banning visible littered products
• ACC and City discussed positive solution approach
• City asked to get neighborhoods engaged to take litter ownership (packaging)
• ACC sponsored “Clean Community Competition”
  o $24,000 in award money to winners
• Mayor/City/community benefited
• Waste Management sponsored similar event
  o continuity now
Los Angeles City and County Partnership to address zero waste – recycling promotion efforts

- City of L.A. sought education for “New to the Blue” recycling program
  - ACC contributed $250,000 to help citizens with identification of plastics
- Litter (packaging) prevention programs.
  - For 10 years, ACC has sponsored Friends of the L.A. River (FoLAR) and the L.A. Conservation Fund (education group) to collect, measure and clean up L.A. River
    - measuring how much waste reduced year by year
- ACC teamed with California Restaurant Association (CRA) to promote “Rinse and Recycle” program with restaurants to recycle polystyrene and other plastics foodservice.
  - Over a thousand restaurants put posters and education materials to encourage customers who take home food Packaging to “rinse and recycle”
LA Conservation Corps and ACC

The Plastics Division of the American Chemistry Council is proud of our decade-long history of promoting recycling and environmental responsibility to youth in the Los Angeles region.

We are especially proud to have supported the LA Conservation Corps River Corp program since its inception to help teach responsible consumer behavior toward the environment through education and clean up. Thank you for all you do!
Availability of Recycling Study Update: Material Specific Update

- Add material specific drop-offs to availability study
- Original study did not capture them
- Very common for foam PS recycling
Foam PS Map and Webpage

- Regularly Updated
- Add new locations quarterly (489 locations)
- Immediately remove bad locations
- Spot-check website links regularly

http://www.recyclemoreplastic.org/plastics/eps_map.html
Foam PS listings: PlasticsMarkets.org

- Plastics Markets:
  - 9 suppliers
  - 19 buyers

Also quick search:

Companies who [buy] this resin: [PS] [Go]
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Product</th>
<th>Quantity Per Case</th>
<th>Case Price</th>
<th>Unit Price</th>
<th>Source</th>
<th>Manufacturer</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>16 o. PE lined paper hot cup</td>
<td>1000</td>
<td>$32.99</td>
<td>$0.0330</td>
<td>Webstaurant Supply</td>
<td>Choice</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10 oz. PE lined paper hot cup</td>
<td>1000</td>
<td>$42.33</td>
<td>$0.0423</td>
<td>Food Service Direct</td>
<td>International Paper</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16 oz. PE paper lined hot cup</td>
<td>1000</td>
<td>$38.99</td>
<td>$0.0390</td>
<td>Webstaurant Supply</td>
<td>Choice</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16 oz. hot cup - compostable</td>
<td>1000</td>
<td>$128.15</td>
<td>$0.1282</td>
<td>Webstaurant Supply</td>
<td>International Paper</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16 oz. hot cup - compostable</td>
<td>240</td>
<td>$54.14</td>
<td>$0.2256</td>
<td>Food Service Direct</td>
<td>World Centric</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16 oz. hot cup - compostable - ripple</td>
<td>500</td>
<td>$208.15</td>
<td>$0.4163</td>
<td>Food Service Direct</td>
<td>Nature House</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16 oz. hot cup - PE lined</td>
<td>1000</td>
<td>$89.35</td>
<td>$0.0894</td>
<td>Food Service Direct</td>
<td>International Paper</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20 oz. PE lined hot cup</td>
<td>600</td>
<td>$29.99</td>
<td>$0.0500</td>
<td>Webstaurant Supply</td>
<td>Choice</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PS lids - 16 OZ hot flat style</td>
<td>1000</td>
<td>$36.05</td>
<td>$0.0361</td>
<td>Food Service Direct</td>
<td>International Paper</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PS &quot;dome&quot; lids for hot cups</td>
<td>1000</td>
<td>$24.99</td>
<td>$0.0250</td>
<td>Webstaurant Supply</td>
<td>Choice</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PS &quot;dome&quot; lids for hot cups - black</td>
<td>1200</td>
<td>$24.99</td>
<td>$0.0208</td>
<td>Webstaurant Supply</td>
<td>Choice</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Compostable lid for hot cups - white</td>
<td>1000</td>
<td>$69.55</td>
<td>$0.0696</td>
<td>Food Service Direct</td>
<td>Ingeo</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Soup cup - 12 oz PE</td>
<td>500</td>
<td>$104.45</td>
<td>$0.2089</td>
<td>Food Service Direct</td>
<td>Solo</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Soup cup lids - PS</td>
<td>500</td>
<td>$125.05</td>
<td>$0.2501</td>
<td>Food Service Direct</td>
<td>Solo</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14 oz. PE lined cold cup</td>
<td>1000</td>
<td>$29.49</td>
<td>$0.0295</td>
<td>Webstaurant Supply</td>
<td>Choice</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>32 oz. PE lined cold cup</td>
<td>500</td>
<td>$35.49</td>
<td>$0.0710</td>
<td>Webstaurant Supply</td>
<td>Choice</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>21 oz. PE lined &quot;Coke&quot; brand cold cup</td>
<td>1000</td>
<td>$44.99</td>
<td>$0.0450</td>
<td>Webstaurant Supply</td>
<td>Dart Solo</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16 - 18 oz PE lined &quot;Coke&quot; brand cold cup</td>
<td>1000</td>
<td>$39.49</td>
<td>$0.0395</td>
<td>Webstaurant Supply</td>
<td>Dart Solo</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16 - 18 oz. wax treated cold cup</td>
<td>1000</td>
<td>$73.99</td>
<td>$0.0740</td>
<td>Webstaurant Supply</td>
<td>Dart Solo</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>21 oz. wax treated cold cup</td>
<td>1000</td>
<td>$97.99</td>
<td>$0.0980</td>
<td>Webstaurant Supply</td>
<td>Dart Solo</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16 oz. Compostable clear PLA</td>
<td>1000</td>
<td>$78.99</td>
<td>$0.0790</td>
<td>Webstaurant Supply</td>
<td>Fabri Kal</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12 oz. Compostable clear PLA</td>
<td>1000</td>
<td>$69.99</td>
<td>$0.0700</td>
<td>Webstaurant Supply</td>
<td>Fabri Kal</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20 oz. Clear PLA cold cups</td>
<td>1000</td>
<td>$243.55</td>
<td>$0.2436</td>
<td>Food Service Direct</td>
<td>Eco-Products</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Regional Comparisons
Education –
What is happening now, what needs to happen in the future?

- Consumer Education
- Business Education
Marketing Opportunities

• **Green Star Business Benefits - Eco-Cycle**
  • Green Star Business Benefits Consulting and Concierge Support. In-depth sustainability assessment on all aspects of your organization and facility.

• **Recyclebank**
  • Recyclebank rewards people for taking everyday green actions with discounts and deals from local and national businesses.
Where are the gaps?
Next Assignments
Questions and Answers